



Universiteit
Leiden

The Netherlands

The interpretation, application and incorporation of international law into South Africa's domestic law by South African courts, within the framework of the South African Constitution

Coutsoudis, A.

Citation

Coutsoudis, A. (2026, September 9). *The interpretation, application and incorporation of international law into South Africa's domestic law by South African courts, within the framework of the South African Constitution*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4309497>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4309497>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

The interpretation, application and incorporation of international law
into South Africa's domestic law by South African courts,
within the framework of the South African Constitution

The interpretation, application and
incorporation of international law into
South Africa's domestic law by South
African courts, within the framework of
the South African Constitution

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr. S. de Rijcke,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen woensdag 9 September 2026
klokke 14:30 uur

door

Andreas Coutsooudis

geboren te Durban, Republiek Zuid-Afrika

in 1980

Promotoren: Prof.dr. L.J. van den Herik
Dr. D.C. Peat

Promotiecommissie: Prof.dr. C. Stahn
Prof.dr. W.J.M. Voermans
Dr. G.R. den Dekker (Court of Appeal at
Arnhem-Leeuwarden)
Prof.dr. E. de Wet (University of Graz, Austria)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2026 A. Coutsoudis

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IX
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XI
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1 Realising the Constitution's Transformative Embrace of International Law in Post-Apartheid South Africa	1
2 Research Aim and Research Question	8
3 Structure	10
4 Methodology	12
5 Theoretical Context	16
5.1 The interaction between domestic law and international law – some theoretical reflections	16
5.2 Understanding the Constitution's openness to international law within its transformative agenda	23
2 CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW IS LAW IN SOUTH AFRICA — NOW WHAT? ANALYSING THE COURTS' IDENTIFICATION AND APPLICATION OF CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW OVER THE LAST DECADE	35
1 Introduction	35
2 Customary International Law and South African Law	36
2.1 Customary international law and its identification	36
2.2 Customary international law in the South African legal system	42
2.2.1 How South African law treats customary international law	42
2.2.2 The procedural issues in relation to customary international law	42
3 South African Courts' Engagement with Customary International Law	46
4 The Patterns in the Last Decade of Material Engagement with Customary International Law	50
5 Reflections on Where We Are and Recommendations for Navigating the Road Ahead	58
5.1 Erring in good company	58
5.2 Concerns about the courts' reliance on subsidiary means	60
5.3 Ways of moderating the adversarial limitations on courts	62
5.4 The need for meaningful engagement about how to identify customary international law	67
6 Conclusion	72

3	MAKING SENSE OF THE SOUTH AFRICAN COURTS' EVOLVING APPROACH TO THE APPLICATION OF UNINCORPORATED TREATIES	73
1	Introduction	73
2	How Are Treaties Made Applicable in South Africa?	75
2.1	The direct incorporation of treaties under section 231 of the Constitution	76
2.2	The slightly messier position in practice: interpretative instruments and back-door application	78
2.3	Summarising how treaties find application in South African law	80
3	From Azapo to Law Society: The Arc of the Court's Approach to the Application of Unincorporated Treaties	81
3.1	Azapo – The Constitutional Court's early affirmation of a strict 'dualist' approach	81
3.2	Glenister II – an evolving approach to unincorporated treaties	83
3.3	Law Society – from evolution to revolution?	89
3.3.1	Law Society's further constitutional hooks for the application of unincorporated treaty obligations	90
3.3.2	Analysing Law Society's constitutional hooks, their effect, and their constitutional pedigree	94
4	Post-Law Society – A New, More 'Monist' World? Or Merely a False Dawn?	106
4.1	The approach of the High Court	106
4.2	The Constitutional Court's approach since the Law Society decision	109
4.2.1	Sonke – two steps forward, one step back?	109
4.2.2	Zuma – from revolution to devolution?	114
4.2.3	Where next for the Constitutional Court?	121
5	Reflections for Navigating the Road Ahead	127
5.1	Grappling with the further constitutional hooks suggested in Law Society	130
5.2	Embracing section 231(4)'s domestication of self-executing treaty provisions	130
5.3	Avoiding conflicts between domestic and international obligations	131
5.4	Properly interpreting the unincorporated treaties being applied	132
6	Conclusion	135
4	TREATIES APPLY IN SOUTH AFRICAN LAW – NOW WHAT? ANALYSING THE COURTS' INTERPRETATION OF TREATIES OVER THE LAST HALF-DECADE	137
1	Introduction	137
2	How Should Treaties Be Interpreted?	139

3	How have South African Courts Interpreted Treaties over the Last Half-Decade?	147
3.1	No reference or application of the Vienna rules	149
3.2	No rigorous or consistently applied approach to the interpretation of treaties	151
3.3	Generally, no regard to subsequent state practice, but some recent exceptions	155
3.4	Relying on treaty bodies' pronouncements	160
3.5	Having regard to international and foreign judicial decisions	163
3.6	Mostly, no regard had to preparatory work	167
4	Recommendations for the Way Ahead: How to Interpret the Treaties Skilfully	170
4.1	Courts should expressly structure their interpretation of the treaties through the lens of the Vienna rules	170
4.2	Ensuring that materials made relevant by the Vienna rules are considered	171
4.3	A critical approach to the use of supplementary means	174
4.4	The courts should call for further submissions or do their own research where necessary	175
4.5	Properly interpreting treaties regardless of application	176
5	Conclusion	176
5	CONCLUSION	179
1	The Constitution's Integrative Vision and Ensuring that International Law's Well-Deserved Prominence is Embraced	179
2	Realising the Constitution's Transformative Embrace of International Law	181
3	Open but Superficial Approach to International Law	189
4	A Surprising Lack of Rigour given the Approach to Determination of Domestic Sources	194
5	The Surprising Persistence of a Superficial Approach to International Law	197
6	Properly Exploring and Utilising the Constitution's Variegated and Manifest Embrace of International Law	198
7	Towards Certainty and Rigour: Ensuring the Courts Fulfil the Constitution's International Law Vision	199
8	Recent Developments and Issues Left Unaddressed	205
8.1	Recent case developments	205
8.2	The questions left unanswered and areas for further engagement	215
9	Embracing the Promise: Realising the Constitution's Integrative Vision for International Law	223

APPENDIX	227
BIBLIOGRAPHY	229
Cases	229
South African cases	229
International and non-South African domestic cases	236
Treaties	238
South African legislation	239
Articles, books, and chapters	240
Other	251
SUMMARY	257
SAMENVATTING	261
CURRICULUM VITAE	267

Acknowledgements

Writing a PhD is like starting a long journey. Although the journey is one's own, many walk alongside, guiding, assisting, and encouraging along the way. It is they who enable one to finish the journey and to do so well. All of them deserve acknowledgement and my sincere thanks.

I would like to begin by thanking my supervisors, Professor Larissa van den Herik and Professor Daniel Peat. From the outset, they have consistently provided incisive, thoughtful, and helpful feedback at every stage of the writing process and on all the various drafts of the chapters that comprise this thesis. They have offered wise counsel and encouragement throughout the lengthy process of researching and writing this thesis.

I thank Professor John Dugard for kindly inviting me, some years ago, to co-author a chapter with him on the place of international law in the South African legal system. And for encouraging and advising me when I was considering whether, and where, to pursue a PhD. Both contributed to my decision to write this thesis and to choose Leiden University as the place to do so.

My thanks also go to Professor Max du Plessis. Over the years, in various capacities, he has been a source of inspiration and encouragement in writing, thinking about, and putting international law into practice, particularly in the domestic sphere: initially when supervising my international law dissertation in my first law degree, and later as a co-author and as a co-counsel in various international law matters. This played a significant role in shaping my decision to write this thesis.

Apart from the introductory chapter and the final concluding chapter, the chapters that comprise this thesis were published in law journals. They therefore benefited from the valuable comments of anonymous peer reviewers. The third chapter also benefited from discussions with participants at the *Constitutional Court Review* authors' conference, where I presented it in draft form, as well as from insightful comments and helpful discussions with the editors assigned to the article, Dr Sanya Samtani and Lauren Kohn. I thank them all.

The final thesis also benefited from the insightful written comments received from my PhD Committee (Dr Guido den Dekker, Professor Erika de Wet, Professor Carsten Stahn, and Professor Wim Voermans).

My family's love, support and encouragement throughout the PhD journey have been invaluable. In particular, I thank my wife, Paulette, who encouraged me from the first to pursue my PhD, supported me every step of the way, and was remarkably gracious in making space for me to research and write amidst the busyness of practice and the joys of a young family. I thank my children, Katie and Alexander, for their love, for reminding me of the important things in life, and for making time for me to work on this thesis. I also thank my mother, who offered ready assistance, not only by looking after my children at critical moments, but also by helping with proofreading and formatting, and providing sage advice. She also inspired me, by her own example, to pursue a PhD slightly later in life, even with a young family.

I dedicate this thesis to my father, who passed away in the month I began it. His love and prayers have been a constant source of strength and encouragement from my earliest years. He taught me perseverance, diligence, kindness, concern for others, and to trust in God. These have all been important in my PhD journey.

Andreas Coutsoudis
29 March 2026

List of Abbreviations

African Charter	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AJIL	American Journal of International Law
All SA	All South African Law Reports
AMCU	Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union
BCLR	Butterworth Constitutional Law Reports
BLLR	Butterworths Labour Law Reports
BRICS	A group of countries originally comprising Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa, and expanded to include other countries
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEDAW Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CERD Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CIL	Customary International Law
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CRPD Committee	Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
Constitution	Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996
Corruption Convention	United Nations Convention against Corruption
DIRCO	Department of International Relations and Cooperation (South Africa)
DTAs	Double Taxation Agreements
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
Geneva Conventions	Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field; Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea; Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War; and Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War

Genocide Convention	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide
GGATT Act	Geneva General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade Act
Hague Convention	Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction
HRC	Human Rights Committee
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICJ Reports	International Court of Justice Reports
ICJ Statute	Statute of the International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IIC	Oxford Reports on International Investment Claims
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
ILDC	Oxford Reports on International Law in Domestic Courts
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILO	International Labour Organization
Implementation Act	Implementation of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court Act 27 of 2002
Interim Constitution	Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act 200 of 1993
ITAC	International Trade Administration Commission (South Africa)
JDR	Juta's Unreported Judgments / Juta's Daily Reports
JIDS	Journal of International Dispute Settlement
JOL	Judgments Online (unreported judgment series, Lexis-Nexis)
LJIL	Leiden Journal of International Law
LR	Law Review
LJ	Law Journal
Marrakesh Treaty	Marrakesh Treaty to Facilitate Access to Published Works for Persons Who Are Blind, Visually Impaired or Otherwise Print Disabled
New York Convention	Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisations
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
Refugee Convention	Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees
SA / SALR	South African Law Reports
SACR	South African Criminal Reports (Law report series)

SADC	Southern African Development Community
SADC Tribunal	Tribunal of the Southern African Development Community
SADC Treaty	Treaty of the Southern African Development Community
SAFLII	Southern African Legal Information Institute (online repository of South African cases, accessed at saflii.org , previously saflii.org.za)
SAHRC	South African Human Rights Commission
SALC	Southern Africa Litigation Centre (previously Southern African Human Rights Litigation Centre)
SALJ	South African Law Journal
SARS	South African Revenue Service
SCA	Supreme Court of Appeal (South Africa)
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
TRC Act	The Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act 34 of 1995 — colloquially referred to as the Truth and Reconciliation Act
Treaty of Versailles	Treaty of Peace between the Allied and Associated Powers and Germany
2000 Tribunal Protocol / 2000 Protocol	Protocol on Tribunal in the Southern African Development Community, 2000
2014 Tribunal Protocol / 2014 Protocol	Protocol on the Tribunal in the Southern African Development Community, 2014
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
USA/US	United States of America
VCLT/Vienna Convention	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
1961 Vienna Convention	Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations, 1961
1963 Vienna Convention	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963
Vienna rules	Articles 31 and 32 of the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WTO	World Trade Organization