



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Shakespeare, Renan and Weber: an interdisciplinary study of the violence paradigm and what it means to law and the nation-state**

Brouwer, R.C.G.

### **Citation**

Brouwer, R. C. G. (2026, January 20). *Shakespeare, Renan and Weber: an interdisciplinary study of the violence paradigm and what it means to law and the nation-state*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4289960>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4289960>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

*Shakespeare, Renan and Weber*

# Shakespeare, Renan and Weber

An interdisciplinary study of the violence  
paradigm and what it means to law and the  
nation-state

## PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van (waarnemend) rector magnificus  
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 20 januari 2026  
klokke 11.30 uur

*door*

Reina Catherina Gusta Brouwer

Promotor: prof. dr. P.B. Cliteur

Co-promotor: prof. dr. A. Ellian

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. B.R. Rijpkema

prof. dr. H. Wilcox (University of Bangor,UK)

prof. dr. J. de Mul (Erasmus Universiteit)

dr. T.J.M. Slootweg

dr. P.C.C.M. Franssen (Universiteit van Utrecht)

Vormgeving binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest  
Drukwerk: Ipskamp – Amsterdam

ISBN 978 94 6473 969 5

© 2026 R.C.G. Brouwer

*Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden veeleelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.*

*Voor zover het maken van kopieën uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet 1912 dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, [www.reprorecht.nl](http://www.reprorecht.nl)).*

*Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in een bloemlezing, readers en andere compilatiewerken (artikel 16 Auteurswet 1912) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting Pro (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, [www.cedar.nl/stichtingen/stichting-pro](http://www.cedar.nl/stichtingen/stichting-pro)).*

*Hoewel aan de totstandkoming van deze uitgave de uiterste zorg is besteed, aanvaarden de auteurs, redacteur(en) en uitgever geen aansprakelijkheid voor eventuele fouten en onvolkomenheden, noch voor de gevolgen hiervan.*

*We must not make a scarecrow of the law, setting it up to fear the birds of prey.*  
W. Shakespeare

*Poor humanity! How you have suffered! How many trials still await you!*  
E. Renan



# Table of contents

|       |                                                                                                |    |
|-------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1     | INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS                                                            | 1  |
| 1.1   | Opening remarks                                                                                | 1  |
| 1.2   | Explanation of the title and delineation of the scope of this thesis                           | 1  |
| 1.3   | The interconnection between violence and the chosen thinkers/scholars explained in more detail | 3  |
| 1.3.1 | The Violence Paradigm                                                                          | 3  |
| 1.3.2 | The conjunction of the violence paradigm and Renan and Weber                                   | 4  |
| 1.4   | Interpretative difficulties                                                                    | 5  |
| 1.5   | Law and literature                                                                             | 8  |
| 1.6   | Methodology                                                                                    | 10 |
| 1.7   | Executive summary of the chapters                                                              | 11 |
| 1.7.1 | The chapter: executive                                                                         | 11 |
| 1.7.2 | Summary of the chapters                                                                        | 13 |
| 1.8   | Research questions                                                                             | 16 |
| 2     | RENAN AND WEBER; TIMEFRAME AND THOUGHT ON NATION AND STATE                                     | 17 |
| 2.1   | Introduction                                                                                   | 17 |
| 2.2   | The turbulent birth pangs of 19th century national consciousness in Europe                     | 17 |
| 2.3   | Renan                                                                                          | 19 |
| 2.4   | The nation and other forms of human coexistence                                                | 24 |
| 2.5   | Max Weber's concept of the state                                                               | 25 |
| 2.6   | The beginning of the nation                                                                    | 27 |
| 2.7   | The nation and forgetting                                                                      | 28 |
| 2.8   | Nations may differ                                                                             | 3  |
| 2.9   | The Nation and race                                                                            | 30 |
| 2.10  | Renan's "open" concept of nationhood                                                           | 32 |
| 2.11  | Language cementing a nation?                                                                   | 33 |
| 2.12  | Nation and will                                                                                | 33 |
| 2.13  | Nation and religion                                                                            | 35 |
| 2.14  | Religion is no basis for the nation; no state religion                                         | 35 |
| 2.15  | A Nation is not a "Zollverein"                                                                 | 38 |
| 3     | TRAGEDY AND VIOLENCE                                                                           | 43 |
| 3.1   | Introduction                                                                                   | 43 |
| 3.2   | The Greeks: the origin of tragedy                                                              | 44 |

|        |                                                                                                                                 |     |
|--------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.3    | The role of tragedy within the Grecian community                                                                                | 45  |
| 3.4    | The form of tragedy                                                                                                             | 45  |
| 3.5    | Violence in tragedy: format and content                                                                                         | 48  |
| 3.6    | The tragic hero and the non-tragic villain: Macbeth and Himmler                                                                 | 54  |
| 3.7    | The reception and appropriation of tragedy after the Greeks                                                                     | 57  |
| 3.8    | Renaissance                                                                                                                     | 60  |
| 3.9    | Neo-classicism                                                                                                                  | 60  |
| 4      | TRAGEDY FROM ROMANTICISM ONWARD                                                                                                 | 63  |
| 4.1    | Introduction                                                                                                                    | 63  |
| 4.2    | Romanticism                                                                                                                     | 63  |
| 4.3    | Nietzsche                                                                                                                       | 71  |
| 4.4    | Twentieth Century                                                                                                               | 82  |
| 5      | <i>THE TRAGEDY OF MACBETH</i>                                                                                                   | 91  |
| 5.1    | Introduction                                                                                                                    | 91  |
| 5.2    | The background of the play                                                                                                      | 92  |
| 5.3    | <i>Macbeth</i> and <i>Hamlet</i> : twin tragedies                                                                               | 93  |
| 5.4    | Discussion of <i>Macbeth</i> : the setting of the scene                                                                         | 94  |
| 5.5    | Oral tribal laws                                                                                                                | 96  |
| 5.6    | Who is Macbeth                                                                                                                  | 98  |
| 5.7    | Duncan, the Lady and the others in their interplay with Macbeth                                                                 | 100 |
| 5.8    | The reaction of bystanders on the violence                                                                                      | 104 |
| 5.9    | The result of violence                                                                                                          | 105 |
| 5.10   | How violence unfolds itself                                                                                                     | 105 |
| 5.11   | Crisis                                                                                                                          | 107 |
| 5.12   | Bloodlaw and revenge                                                                                                            | 108 |
| 5.13   | The process of the violence paradigm completed: forcing Macbeth to renewed self-definition – his rising above <i>sippenhaft</i> | 111 |
| 5.14   | The outcome                                                                                                                     | 114 |
| 5.15   | Evaluation                                                                                                                      | 117 |
| 5.15.1 | The violence paradigm, Renan's will and Nietzsche                                                                               | 119 |
| 5.15.2 | The practice and theory of succession of kings within the Nordic tradition and in Shakespeare's time                            | 121 |
| 6      | <i>THE TRAGEDY OF HAMLET. PRINCE OF DENMARK</i>                                                                                 | 127 |
| 6.1    | Introduction                                                                                                                    | 127 |
| 6.2    | Discussion of <i>Hamlet</i> : the setting of the scene                                                                          | 128 |
| 6.3    | King Claudius                                                                                                                   | 131 |
| 6.4    | Who is Hamlet; what is he up against                                                                                            | 132 |
| 6.5    | The state of affairs in Denmark                                                                                                 | 134 |
| 6.6    | Hamlet's reaction to his assignments                                                                                            | 135 |
| 6.7    | The task begins                                                                                                                 | 137 |
| 6.8    | Modelling a statesman's profession                                                                                              | 145 |
| 6.9    | The completion; the execution                                                                                                   | 155 |

|        |                                                                                     |     |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 6.10   | Evaluation                                                                          | 161 |
| 6.10.1 | The leadership and Bacon's wisdom of state                                          | 161 |
| 6.10.2 | The nation and the separation of powers                                             | 162 |
| 6.10.3 | How are violence and values interrelated                                            | 163 |
| 6.10.4 | Violence, value and nationhood: their mutual influence                              | 164 |
| 6.10.5 | The critics and the revenge aspect                                                  | 165 |
| 6.10.6 | The time argument                                                                   | 170 |
| 7      | SOME PRELIMINARIES ON <i>THE TRAGEDY OF JULIUS CAESAR</i>                           | 173 |
| 7.1    | Introduction                                                                        | 173 |
| 7.2    | The nation-state                                                                    | 173 |
| 7.3    | The Roman political construct – Cicero                                              | 174 |
| 7.4    | The erosion of a nation-state                                                       | 178 |
| 7.5    | The history of Rome as relevant for the play                                        | 178 |
| 7.6    | England during Shakespeare's life                                                   | 180 |
| 8      | <i>THE TRAGEDY OF JULIUS CAESAR: ANALYSIS</i>                                       | 183 |
| 8.1    | Introduction                                                                        | 183 |
| 8.2    | Setting off on a journey                                                            | 184 |
| 8.3    | Opening of the play                                                                 | 184 |
| 8.4    | Cassius and Brutus: who are they and how do they perceive Julius Caesar             | 187 |
| 8.5    | Recapitulation and assessment of values discussed so far                            | 191 |
| 8.6    | The other protagonist: Julius Caesar                                                | 193 |
| 8.7    | Julius and violence: the reaction of the bystanders                                 | 194 |
| 8.8    | Brutus                                                                              | 196 |
| 8.9    | Theocracy and Legal primitivism                                                     | 197 |
| 8.10   | The plot                                                                            | 200 |
| 8.11   | Philosophical Rome                                                                  | 203 |
| 8.12   | The escalation of the crisis                                                        | 205 |
| 8.13   | Violence, values, the nation-state and their reciprocity                            | 207 |
| 8.14   | The assassination and its aftermath                                                 | 212 |
| 8.15   | A personal showdown                                                                 | 217 |
| 8.16   | The final battle                                                                    | 222 |
| 9      | <i>THE TRAGEDY OF JULIUS CAESAR: EVALUATION</i>                                     | 229 |
| 9.1    | Political Shakespeare                                                               | 229 |
| 9.2    | Shakespeare's warning                                                               | 234 |
| 9.3    | Violence: "good" and "bad"                                                          | 235 |
| 9.4    | Renan, Weber and Cicero: evaluation of their conceptualizations of the nation-state | 237 |
| 9.5    | The liquidations by Hamlet and Brutus                                               | 238 |
| 9.6    | Tragic existentialist world view of Shakespeare; its secularity                     | 241 |

|    |                                       |     |
|----|---------------------------------------|-----|
| 10 | SOME CONCLUDING NOTES                 | 243 |
|    | SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)          | 249 |
|    | PERSONAL OBSERVATIONS                 | 251 |
|    | BIBLIOGRAPHY                          | 253 |
|    | APPENDICES                            | 265 |
|    | 1. Summary of <i>Macbeth</i>          | 267 |
|    | 2. Summary of <i>Hamlet</i>           | 269 |
|    | 3. Summary of <i>Julius Caesar</i>    | 271 |
|    | 4. A biography of William Shakespeare | 273 |
|    | CURRICULUM VITAE                      | 289 |