



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Learning in automated negotiation

Renting, B.M.

Citation

Renting, B. M. (2025, December 11). *Learning in automated negotiation*.
Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4284788>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4284788>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

What a ride it was! Before I started, someone told me that PhD life is not all sunshine and roses and I naively thought my experience would be different. I now understand why people say that, and why many PhD candidates (half-jokingly) dream of becoming baristas, bakers or farmers. These years have taught me a lot about myself, both my strengths and my pitfalls. It was challenging at times, but there were also plenty of rewarding moments and unforgettable memories. And now this milestone has been achieved and I hope there will be many more.

Holger often said that research is a group effort. That always resonated with me, not only because we “stand on the shoulders of giants”, but also because so many supervisors, mentors, colleagues, friends, and family are (directly or indirectly) part of the work and deserve to be acknowledged. So here we go.

First and foremost, my supervisors, Catholijn, Holger, and Thomas. Catholijn, your broad knowledge on topics even far beyond computer science was incredibly helpful. Thank you for the personal touch you had in your supervising style, often asking me how I was doing and celebrating my successes, more than I was capable of. Holger, I have always admired your strong scientific morals and your preciseness has made me a better scientist. You also shared your enjoyment of social gatherings with our group, fostering a group bond that made it a joy to be in the office everyday. Thank you for that. Thomas, I much needed someone appreciative of me barging in the door in Leiden. You always took time for me, even before you officially joined the supervision team, which helped me more than you might realise. Thank you for that and for the personal relationship we had.

Matthias, my longest and closest colleague. A PhD can be a lonely job. It makes having a great colleague sitting next to you all the more valuable. I have especially great memories of me and Annelot visiting you in Oxford. All the drinks at the Foo Bar and other bars, the festivals we attended together, the JiuJitsu classes we took, you visiting me in Edinburgh, me visiting you in Berlin. Thank you, as the PhD journey would have been a lot less fun without you.

Annelot, we also spent many days in the office and outside of it. Our week of combining a conference in Vienna with drinking cocktails in the sun on a rooftop bar and skipping a day to go to Prater with our supervisors will forever be a fond memory.

Michiel, my HI buddy at Leiden University. I remember the summer school in Berlin, the first trip after COVID, of which I have more memories of social activities than of lectures, going to Jacob Collier together in Munich, and being roommates on Ameland. Your endless optimism and capability to get a thousand things done is admirable. Thank you for being a great friend and colleague during these years.

Enrico and Mani, also part of the Berlin crew and the food club sequel. Enrico, we are lucky you still have not been found by the pasta police for your kimchi-

Gruyère risotto (to all readers: try it and be amazed). You are one brave Italian with a great sense of humour. Mani, for such a well-versed and thoughtful person, you somehow experience an incredible number of extremely random adventures. I will never forget your stories. Thank you both for all the fun, at work and beyond.

To my fellow members of the Leiden ADA group: Anna Latour, Marie, Koen, Mitra, Jan, Matthias, Annelot, Mike, Laurens, Julia, Andreas, Khashayar, and Can. And the members of RLG: Aske, Thomas, Álvaro, Andreas, Michiel, Andrius, Zhao, Matthias, Tom, Joost, Bernard, Alan, Annie, Felix, Koen, Lindsay. Daily life at the office became so normal, I will miss the chats, the laughter, coffee breaks, faculty bar drinks, and the Bonte Koe evenings. Also to the rest of the great staff at LIACS, thank you for making this the workplace it is, which felt like a tight-knit community. Special thanks also to Aske for showing me the business perspective on academia and for the light-hearted relationship we had.

To everyone in our Hybrid Intelligence research consortium, especially also the PhD students who started alongside me in COVID times and tried to make the best out of it. I feel privileged having been part of a national research consortium resulting in so many connections across universities. I sincerely enjoyed all the gatherings, conferences, and retreats we had, both academically and socially. A special thanks to Roel for being my mentor and providing me with outside perspectives on my PhD. To our sister research group at the RWTH Aachen, thanks for the great workshops we had. I have especially fond memories of the Christmas market evenings we had in Aachen.

Special thanks to my Master students: Thijs, Hadar, and Antonio. I enjoyed working with every one of you and it was great that we could also hang out outside of university. I am happy to see where you all ended up. Also thanks to Stefano and Kobi for allowing me to come to the University of Edinburgh for a research visit. My daily interactions in Edinburgh were mostly with the Autonomous Agents Research Group and the visiting researchers with whom I shared desks. I had an amazing, though way too short, time in Edinburgh, thank you all for that.

It is hard to know where to stop mentioning names, as there are so many people who have contributed to this journey, and I hope I have not overlooked anyone. If I did, please know that this gratitude is meant for you as well. One of the aspects of academia that was dear to me was the opportunity to travel, sometimes halfway across the globe, and walk into a conference or gathering to immediately recognise faces. People you might only see for a week each year, yet you intensively spend a week together with, explore a new place together, and then part ways again. That sense of slowly building and belonging to a global community, of feeling strangely at home while being far from it, was truly unique. To all those I connected with over the years, thank you for creating that feeling of community.

To my friends outside of the academic bubble: Thijs, Thijs, Jeroen, Maarten, Roland, Bart, Sander, Sebastiaan (and partners). Nothing beats spending a week in the Alps when it comes to resetting yourself. Our summer hut tours and winter ski trips were (and are) a welcome distraction from the PhD work and something I always looked forward to. Academics are often unable to talk about anything else than work, so having a group to casually hang out with is a blessing. This

gratitude also extends to my Club crew: Joost, Matthijs, Ron, Dave, Sebastiaan, Jeroen, Tijmen, and Suzanne, my Milan group: Amanda, Laura, and Jesse, and my Embedded buddies, Lourens, Jeroen, Vito, and Thijmen. Thank you all for being an awesome bunch to hang out with.

To my parents, Aaldert and Rian. You never really think about growing up. And then you turn 30 and you start to reflect, and you realise that your skills and curiosities were nurtured in your youth. I deeply appreciate my appreciation of many things in life, far beyond computer science. This dissertation is a result of how I was raised. You also taught me by example to put society's needs before one's own, sometimes a bit too much, but the world is a better place with people like you. To my sister and brother, Anneke and Kees. Thank you for riding the roller coaster of growing up with me and to Arnoud and Danielle for joining the ride. It is great to have people who have your back unconditionally. An imperturbability that is underestimated and certainly not a given. Special thanks to Kees for letting me abuse your house as a writing retreat.

And finally, to my partner, Suzanne. A decade together, of which nearly half was spent with me working on the PhD. You have seen it all, start to finish. It is difficult to keep work at the office when you do a PhD due to the heavy variable workload. I think we both realise that this did not always make me the most fun person. And yet you were always supportive when I needed it, enthusiastic when I decided to spend months abroad, and patient when I once again wanted to do too many things concurrently. You are an exceptionally kind person and I am lucky to have you. A mere "thank you" does not capture it, this one is for you. Ik hou van je.

CONTENTS

Summary	iii
Samenvatting	v
Acknowledgements	vii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Negotiation in multi-agent systems	2
1.1.1 Developing negotiation agents.	3
1.1.2 Evaluating negotiation agents	5
1.2 Research questions	6
1.3 Dissertation structure.	7
2 Background	9
2.1 Automated negotiation	10
2.1.1 Negotiation protocol.	10
2.1.2 Negotiation scenario.	12
2.1.3 Negotiation agents.	13
2.2 Algorithm configuration	15
2.2.1 Problem definition.	15
2.2.2 Configuration methods	16
2.2.3 Instance features.	17
2.3 Algorithm selection	17
2.3.1 Problem definition.	18
2.4 Reinforcement learning.	18
2.4.1 Markov decision process.	18
2.4.2 MDPs and automated negotiation	19
I Learning to Negotiate	21
3 Automated Configuration of Negotiation Strategies	23
3.1 Introduction	24
3.2 Problem description	24
3.2.1 Dynamic agent.	25
3.2.2 Problem definition.	26
3.3 Automated configuration	27
3.3.1 SMAC	28
3.4 Instance features	29
3.4.1 Scenario features.	29
3.4.2 Opponent features	30
3.4.3 Opponent utility function	32

3.5	Empirical evaluation	32
3.5.1	Method	33
3.5.2	Results	34
3.6	Conclusion	36
3.6.1	Configuration	38
3.6.2	Features	38
3.6.3	Next steps	38
4	Configuration of Strategy Portfolios	39
4.1	Introduction	40
4.2	Related work	40
4.3	Preliminaries	41
4.3.1	Problem definition	41
4.4	Portfolio creation	42
4.4.1	Portfolio creation	42
4.4.2	Hydra	42
4.5	Strategy selection	43
4.5.1	AutoFolio	44
4.5.2	Cross validation	44
4.5.3	Performance baselines	45
4.6	Empirical evaluation	45
4.6.1	Method	45
4.6.2	Results	48
4.7	Conclusion	52
5	Towards General Negotiation Strategies with End-to-End Reinforcement Learning	53
5.1	Introduction	54
5.2	Related work	55
5.3	Methods	55
5.3.1	Proximal Policy Optimisation	56
5.3.2	Graph neural networks	56
5.3.3	Implementation	57
5.4	Empirical evaluation	58
5.4.1	Fixed negotiation scenario	59
5.4.2	Random negotiation scenarios	59
5.5	Conclusion	61
II	Evaluating Learning Negotiation Agents	63
6	Analysis of Learning Agents in Automated Negotiation	65
6.1	Introduction	66
6.2	Related work	67
6.2.1	The automated negotiating agents competition	67
6.2.2	Learning agents in automated negotiation	68
6.2.3	Learning agents in ANL	68

6.3	ANL 2021	69
6.4	Competition setup of ANL 2022	70
6.4.1	Negotiation scenario	70
6.4.2	ANL 2022 challenge	71
6.4.3	Evaluation	71
6.4.4	Simulation specifics	72
6.5	Submissions to ANL 2022	72
6.5.1	Learning capabilities	72
6.5.2	Submitted agent strategies	73
6.6	Results & analysis	75
6.6.1	Differences to actual competition	75
6.6.2	Tournament results	75
6.6.3	Game-theoretical analysis of the agents	81
6.6.4	Analysis of the negotiation scenarios	83
6.7	Discussion	87
6.7.1	Learning in negotiation agents	88
6.7.2	Ranking negotiation agents	89
6.8	Conclusion	90
7	Multi-Agent Meeting Scheduling	93
7.1	Introduction	94
7.2	The meeting scheduling problem	95
7.2.1	Earlier formalisations	95
7.2.2	Characteristics	96
7.2.3	Performance criteria	98
7.3	Negotiation in meeting scheduling	99
7.3.1	Negotiation protocols	99
7.3.2	Human preferences	100
7.3.3	Learning to negotiate	100
7.4	Discussion	100
III	Conclusions	103
8	Conclusion	105
8.1	Research questions & contributions	106
8.2	Discussion	108
8.3	Limitations & future work	112
8.4	Closing remarks	115
	Curriculum Vitæ	135
	List of Publications	137