



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The political economy of immigration and welfare state reform: a collection of comparative political and economic essays on human mobility and social protection
Fenwick, C.E.

Citation

Fenwick, C. E. (2025, November 12). *The political economy of immigration and welfare state reform: a collection of comparative political and economic essays on human mobility and social protection*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4282600>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4282600>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

The Political Economy of Immigration and Welfare State Reform

*A collection of comparative political and economic essays on human mobility
and social protection*

The Political Economy of Immigration and Welfare State Reform

*A collection of comparative political and economic
essays on human mobility and social protection*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 12 november 2025
klokke 11.30 uur

door

Clare Elizabeth Fenwick

geboren te London, United Kingdom

in 1989

Promotores: prof. dr. O.P. van Vliet
 prof. dr. K.P. Goudswaard

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. M.A.H. van der Woude
 prof. dr. A.L. Dimitrova
 prof. dr. M.J. Siegel (Maastricht University)
 dr. A. Afonso

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2025 C.E. Fenwick

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Table of Contents

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS	VII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Setting the Scene: the dissertation in context	1
1.2 A Reader's Guide	6
2 THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF IMMIGRATION AND WELFARE STATE EFFORT: EVIDENCE FROM EUROPE	11
Abstract	11
2.1 Introduction	12
2.2 Literature review and hypotheses	13
2.2.1 The theoretical relationship between immigration and the welfare state	13
2.2.2 The empirical relationship between immigration and the welfare state	14
2.2.3 Hypotheses	16
2.3 Research Design: Data and Methods	17
2.3.1 Dependent Variable: operationalising welfare state effort	17
2.3.2 Explanatory Variable	19
2.3.3 Control Variables	20
2.3.4 Method and Model Specification	21
2.4 Results and Discussion	23
2.4.1 Welfare State Effort	23
2.4.2 Sensitivity Analysis	26
2.5 Concluding Remarks	31
2.6 Appendix A – Supporting figures	33
2.7 Appendix B – Phillips-Perron test	36
3 THE DEVIL IS IN THE DETAIL: MEASURING INTRA-EU LABOUR MIGRATION	37
Abstract	37
3.1 Introduction	38
3.2 Exploring intra-EU labour migration	39
3.3 Current migration datasets	41
3.4 Limitations of current data on migration	42
3.4.1 Who is a migrant?	42
3.4.2 Stock versus flow measures of migration	44
3.4.3 Disaggregating migration statistics	45
3.5 The European Union Labour Force Survey (EU-LFS): creating intra-EU labour migration indicators	46

3.5.1	The EU-LFS	46
3.5.2	Identifying migrants	48
3.5.3	Identifying labour migrants	48
3.6	Descriptive and Comparison Statistics	49
3.7	Conclusion	55
2.8	Appendix C	58
4	INTRA-EU LABOUR MOBILITY AND THE WELFARE STATE: AN EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF EMBEDDED LIBERALISM IN THE CONTEXT OF FREE MOVEMENT	63
	Abstract	63
4.1	Introduction	65
4.2	Literature and Hypotheses	67
4.2.1	Embedded Liberalism, immigration, and the welfare state	67
4.2.2	Welfare state effort and differentiating between types of mobility	70
4.2.3	Economic, political, and institutional factors	72
4.3	Data and Methods	73
4.3.1	Sample	73
4.3.2	Dependent Variables	74
4.3.3	Explanatory Variables – Measuring Intra-EU Labour Migration	76
4.3.4	Other Explanatory Variables	79
4.3.5	Method	80
4.4	Empirical Analysis	81
4.5	Robustness	87
4.6	Conclusion	93
5	INTRA-EU LABOUR MIGRATION AND ATTITUDES TOWARDS THE WELFARE STATE	95
	Abstract	95
5.1	Introduction	96
5.2	Immigration and redistributive preferences	97
5.2.1	Societal solidarity and redistributive preferences	98
5.2.2	Job insecurity and compensation	100
5.2.3	Different effects for different groups?	101
5.2.4	Theoretical Conceptualisation and Hypotheses	102
5.3	Method	104
5.4	Data	105
5.4.1	Dependent Variables	105
5.4.2	Explanatory Variables	106
5.5	Empirical Analysis	108
5.6	Additional Checks	113
5.7	Conclusion	117

6	CONCLUSION	119
6.1	Chapter Conclusions	119
6.2	Policy Implications	124
6.3	Future Research	126
	NEDERLANDSE SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	129
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	135
	CURRICULUM VITAE	147

Acknowledgements

Over the last nine years that I have been writing this dissertation, I have seen first-hand the way that globalisation, and the ever-increasing interdependence of people across national boundaries, is transforming the way we live, work, and communicate. I can live in the Netherlands with my British passport, work and communicate with researchers across Europe, and keep up to date with my friends and family around the globe. What's more, as the pandemic struck and Brexit began to function in earnest, I was cut-off from family in the United Kingdom and it became clearer to me that returning to a world without cross-border movement was not a future I was interested in. However, human mobility comes with both opportunities and challenges, and I hope this dissertation goes some way to addressing one such challenge – the effect of immigration on the welfare state – and in some small way, contributes to the future I hope to live in.

This dissertation would not have been possible without the support of a great many people. First, I would like to thank my supervisor Olaf van Vliet for his support and guidance during the PhD process and for undoubtedly strengthening the quality of my work, as well as Kees Goudswaard, my second supervisor, for his many thoughtful and helpful comments throughout. I would also like to thank the members of the reading committee for taking their time to read and comment on this dissertation, ensuring that it is a piece of research worth defending.

There are also a number of individuals outside my institution that have had a hand in shaping the chapters of this dissertation. There have been numerous attendees and discussants at conferences, symposia, and workshops who have commented on the various articles that make up this dissertation. Moreover, without the help of my colleagues answering my endless number of questions there would surely be many more mistakes in this dissertation.

Outside of academia, my family have played a crucial role in supporting me through this part of my life. They helped me to move internationally, again, and they were always on hand to provide their advice, love, and support. Thank you, Mum, Dad, Ceri, and Ewan, for being an important constant in this almost decade-long rollercoaster ride of a PhD.

Finally, I need to thank Tobias Broich. Over the course of this dissertation, you went from boyfriend to fiancé to husband, and now father to our curious, brilliant daughter Eila. While your status might have changed over

time, your unwavering support never has. You were there to share in the happiness of my successes and the despair of my failures. Without you I would have been lost amidst words and code and never have made it out the other side.