

Collective human rights as an (onto)logical solution to climate change: reconceptualizing, applying and proceduralizing an overlooked category of human rights

Holtz, J.I.

Citation

Holtz, J. I. (2025, October 16). *Collective human rights as an (onto)logical solution to climate change: reconceptualizing, applying and proceduralizing an overlooked category of human rights. Meijers-reeks.* Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4270733

Version: Publisher's Version

License: License agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the

Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4270733

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Collective Human Rights as an (Onto)Logical Solution to Climate Change

Collective Human Rights as an (Onto)Logical Solution to Climate Change

Reconceptualizing, Applying, and Proceduralizing an Overlooked Category of Human Rights

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden, op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl, volgens besluit van het college voor promoties te verdedigen op donderdag 16 oktober 2025 klokke 14:30 uur

door

Jolein Ilse Holtz

geboren te Leeuwarden

in 1994

Promotor: prof. dr. C. Stahn

Co-promotor: prof. dr. D.A. Dam-de Jong

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. H. Duffy

prof. dr. L.J. van den Herik

prof. dr. L.J. Kotzé (Wageningen University)

dr. M. Petersmann (London School of Economics, UK)

dr. M.A. Plagis

Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio – Delft

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio – Delft Drukwerk: Ipskamp Printing – Amsterdam

© 2025 J.I. Holtz

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

My PhD proposal was inspired by the lack of invocation and understanding of collective human rights and its potential in the climate context as well as a fascination with the idea of the collective and collective being. Solidarity, in my mind, would be vital for the climate challenge ahead. It was also solidarity and a collective of amazing people at my side that guided, supported and informed my PhD journey. Thank you to Margaretha Wewerinke-Singh and Fran Lambrick for reviewing my proposal and challenging my thinking early on. Moreover, Justine Taylor was the best cheerleader anyone could wish for and stimulated me to apply for the position, making me believe I could do it.

My gratitude also goes to my supervisors Daniëlla Dam-de Jong and Carsten Stahn, for providing me with feedback and ploughing through my sometimes (read: often) lengthy chapters and for sharing your knowledge with me. Thank you for setting personal and professional goals – I came out stronger. I would like to express my deep appreciation to the reading committee members – Louis Kotzé, Larissa van den Herik, Helen Duffy, Misha Plagis and Marie Petersmann – for reading and engaging with my research.

I was lucky enough to join the Centre for Climate Change Law and Governance of the University of Copenhagen for three months. Thank you to Bea for the warm welcome and to Amnon for the legal philosophy crash course. I immensely appreciate everyone at the Centre for making me feel like part of the team in such a short period of time. I want to thank Fede, who, thanks to our mutual love of food, became a fast friend. To my Copenhagen flatmates Jeanette, Kat and Hannah – I still cannot believe how lucky I was to get to live with people who are not only lovely but also appreciate a good ovenbaked broccoli.

Finishing my PhD would have been much more arduous were it not for the support of my colleagues who embraced my manic self and sticker obsession. To Ida and Anna, who were there from the beginning, keeping me sane with online catch-up sessions during the first pandemic-tainted year (and beyond). To Sophie, for being the wise oracle, always taking time to answer my questions. Misha was the best advocate anyone could ask for. To my office mates for the laughs, the wines and venting-sessions – Paula, Johanna and my little geese, the K1 and K2 to my K3, Lianne and Joni and to others joining such sessions – Annick, Eva, Fé, Joëlle. I was glad that Hilde joined Grotius my second year, whose unwavering support through online pomodoro

sessions, sage advice and the necessary fun distractions were much appreciated. Thank you for being you (and for agreeing to be my paranymph!).

I would not be here if it were not for my 'holy trinity' – Kimberley, Fardau and Marije. To have such incredible lifelong friends and to have your support throughout this journey just meant everything to me. Kim, my honorary third paranymph, thank you for your boundless optimism even when you were struggling yourself, for always putting trust in me, for the dances, the (campervan) adventures. Marije, thank you for always being a comfort, for the Italian adventures, Gilmore Girls nights, the chats and the laughs. Far, as my flatmate for most of this journey and my paranymph, you experienced all the ups and downs and were always there to listen, provide advice and hold me up. Thank you for letting me cook while you did the cleaning up, for being my pandemic hairdresser, OG writing partner and archeological guru (and much more).

While a certain human exceptionalism is expected for acknowledgments, I would be remiss considering my research to not also express gratitude to other vital parts of my collective experience – my adorable foster puppies that helped structure my days and the beautiful places that helped me find some inner peace during the many stress-reducing walks. Art and music were vital to my creative process, providing guidance through the rollercoaster of emotions of the PhD journey.

A special thanks goes to my father whose love and support mean everything to me – words cannot express how much you helped me to not only being able to finish this PhD but to become the person I am. And to Joke, whose listening ear and words of encouragement made all the difference. To my sister-in-law, Corian, and to my beautiful sister, Karlieke, who always welcomed me into their home and endured listening to me whine. Karlieke, while I tend to describe you as me but then the exact opposite with a similar nose, your calm, kind, supporting stability was, and is, essential to offset my dramatic side. Thank you both for creating my amazing, 'sterk en stoere' niece, Jente, who only came into my life in the second year of my PhD but whose life and future provides me with a daily reminder of the importance of my work, motivating me to keep going.

Jolein Holtz

December 2024

Table of Contents

	LIST C	F ABBRE	VIATIONS	XV
1	INTRO	DUCTION	1	1
1.1	Introd	luctory I	Remarks	1
1.2 Climate Change: A Super-Wicked Problem				4
	1.2.1		e Change as a Wicked Problem	5
	1.2.2		onal Characteristics of a Super-Wicked Problem	8
1.3	Soluti		ackle Climate Change: The Need for a Human Rights	
	Appro			11
	1.3.1		oposed Solution: The United Nations Framework	
		Conver	ntion on Climate Change	12
	1.3.2	Other A	Approaches to Tackle Climate Change	18
		1.3.2.1	Precaution and the Polluter Pays – an Environmental	
			Approach	19
		1.3.2.2	Market-Based Mechanisms – an Economic Approach	23
		1.3.2.3	Distributive and Corrective Justice – a Justice Approach	28
		1.3.2.4	The Human Rights Approach: Characteristics and Variety	
			of Forms	33
1.4	Clima	te Chan	ge as a Collective Human Rights Issue	41
	1.4.1	The Hu	ıman Rights Approach: Critiques	41
	1.4.2 The Advantages of Collective Human Rights		44	
1.5	Resea	rch Aim	, Scope and Questions	49
1.6	Resea	rch App	roach and Methodology	53
	1.6.1	Approa	aching the Research: Disciplinarity and Positionality	53
		1.6.1.1	Practice of Interdisciplinarity	54
		1.6.1.2	Positionality	54
	1.6.2	Method	dologies	56
		1.6.2.1	Dimension 1: Introduction to Collective Human Rights	
			and Climate Change	57
		1.6.2.2	Dimension 2: Collective Human Rights Solutions to	
			Substantive Climate Problems	58
		1623	Dimension 3: Adjudication of Collective Human Rights	59

x Table of Contents

2			Ontological Theory of Collective Human Rights: Problems and Interpretation Gaps	61
0.1				
2.1		ductory F		61
2.2			Human Rights Law	64
	2.2.1		ual Rights and Ontology	66
			Universalizing an Exclusionary Subject	67
			Universalizing the State and Governance	70
			Universalizing the Human/Nature Relationship	73
	222		Rights Ontology and Climate Change	76
	2.2.2		ive Rights and Ontology More-Than-Human-Worlds: Anthropology and the Collective	78 79
		2.2.2.2	From Universality to Particularity: Philosophy and the Collective	82
		2.2.2.3	Main Premises of Collective Rights	84
2.3	Alteri		ntologies in Human Rights Law	88
	2.3.1		nous Ontologies	89
			Relationality	91
			Place-Based Existence	92
		2.3.1.3	Circularity of Being	93
			Indigenous Rights Framework	95
			Buen vivir and the Rights of Nature	101
			Human Rights Law and Indigenous Ontology:	
			Assimilation or Expansion?	104
	2.3.2	African	Ontologies	106
		2.3.2.1	Personhood in African Philosophy	107
		2.3.2.2	Stuck Between an Alternative and Sovereign Model	110
		2.3.2.3	The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	112
	2.3.3		t Rights and Ontology	116
		2.3.3.1	Conceptualization of the 'Peasant'	117
		2.3.3.2	The UN Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and	
			Small-Scale Farmers	120
		2.3.3.3	Positioning Collective Rights on the Peasant	
			Continuum	126
2.4	A Ge	neral The	eory of Collective Rights: Common Ontological	
	Chara	acteristics	3	128
	2.4.1		llective as a Hybrid Object/Subject Construct	129
	2.4.2	The Co	llective and Beyond-the-State Duty Bearers	132
2.5	Testir		ory: Collective Human Rights Critiques	134
	2.5.1	A 'Thir	d Generation' of Rights: Real or Imagined?	135
	2.5.2	Harmo		136
2.6	An (C	Onto)Logi	ical Theory of Collective Human Rights and Climate	
	Chan	_		139
	2.6.1	From C	Global to Local: Spatiality and Climate Change	141
	2.6.2		and Climate Change	144
	2.6.3		e of Urgency? Temporality and Climate Change	145
2.7	Concl	uding Re	emarks	147

Table of Contents xi

3	_	N RIGHTS AND CLIMATE CHANGE: COLLECTIVE OPPORTUNITIES AND LENGES	151	
3.1	Introd	uctory Remarks	151	
3.2		ight to Self-Determination	153	
	3.2.1	The Ontological Contours of Self-Determination	156	
	3.2.2	The Right to Self-Determination and Climate Change	161	
		3.2.2.1 Early Explorations: the Inuit Petition	162	
		3.2.2.2 Self-Determination and Climate Change at UN Human		
		Rights Institutions	165	
		3.2.2.3 Self-Determination at the UNFCCC	171	
	3.2.3	Concluding Remarks	173	
3.3	The H	uman Right to Development	176	
	3.3.1	Ontological Contours of the Right to Development	178	
		3.3.1.1 The Draft Declaration on the Right to Development	180	
		3.3.1.2 Sustainable Development and Ontology	182	
		3.3.1.3 Alternative Development Paradigms and Ontology	184	
	3.3.2	The Right to Development and Climate Change	188	
		3.3.2.1 Regional Human Rights, Development and Climate		
		Change: Inuit and Beyond	189	
		3.3.2.2 A Right to Development and Climate Change at UN		
		Human Rights Institutions	191	
		3.3.2.3 The Right to Development and the UNFCCC	193	
	3.3.3	Concluding Remarks	196	
3.4	A Hu	man Right to a Safe, Clean, Healthy and Sustainable Environment	198	
	3.4.1	Ontological Contours of a Right to a Healthy Environment	200	
		3.4.1.1 Individual versus Collective Healthy Environments	201	
		3.4.1.2 Anthropocentricism versus Ecocentrism	203	
		3.4.1.3 Bottom-Up Development – Conceptual Lessons from		
		the Global South	204	
	3.4.2	The Right to a Healthy Environment and Climate Change	206	
		3.4.2.1 Regional Perspectives to the Right to A Healthy		
		Environment and Climate Change	207	
		3.4.2.2 Climate Change and the Right to a Healthy Environment		
		at the UN	208	
	3.4.3	Concluding Remarks	209	
3.5	Appra	isal of Substantive Collective Human Rights and Climate Change	212	
4	Colli	CTIVE HUMAN RIGHTS, CLIMATE CHANGE AND MEANS OF		
		TENCE	217	
4.1	Introd	uctory Remarks	217	
4.2	Positioning the Prohibition in International Human Rights Law: An			
	Analysis of Common Article 1(2) 221 4.2.1 The Free Disposal of Natural Resources: From a State's Right to			
		a Tool for Local Empowerment	222	
	4.2.2	Ontological Appraisal of the Free Disposal of Natural Resources	226	

xii Table of Contents

	4.2.3	The Inclusion of Means of Subsistence: Historical Overview	228
	4.2.4	In No Case: Content of the Absolute Character	231
1.3	Subsis	stence and Anthropology	235
	4.3.1	Early Anthropological Explorations	235
		Identifying Markers of the Subsistence Economy	237
1.4	Subsis	stence in International Law	238
	4.4.1	Subsistence as Economy	240
		4.4.1.1 Subsistence as Monetary Compensation	240
		4.4.1.2 Subsistence as Economic Autonomy	243
		4.4.1.3 Economic Deprivation: a State's Prerogative	245
	4.4.2	Subsistence as the Environment	246
		4.4.2.1 Subsistence and Land	247
		4.4.2.2 Subsistence and the Right to a Healthy Environment	249
		4.4.2.3 The Deprivation of the Environment	251
	4.4.3	Subsistence as Identity	252
		4.4.3.1 Subsistence as Survival: an Inter-American Approach	253
		4.4.3.2 Deprivation as Survival: Thresholds and Criteria	256
	4.4.4	Similarities and Differences: a Comparative Analysis	259
		4.4.4.1 Individual and Collective Subsistence	260
		4.4.4.2 Ontology and Subsistence: Two Sides of the Same Coin?	261
		4.4.4.3 Different Gradations of Deprivation	262
1.5		bsolute Right to Means of Subsistence and Climate Change	265
	4.5.1	0 ,	268
	4.5.2	` ' '	271
	4.5.3	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e	
		Island Peoples	274
		4.5.3.1 Deprivation of Small Island Peoples	274
		4.5.3.2 In No Case: Obligations	282
1.6	Concl	uding Remarks	283
5	Colli	ECTIVE HUMAN RIGHTS AND CLIMATE LITIGATION: PROCEDURAL	
		IS AND EPISTEMOLOGICAL FLEXIBILITY	285
5.1	Introd	luctory Remarks	285
5.2		Standing	288
·· -	5.2.1	The Restrictive Approach	290
	0.2.1	5.2.1.1 Collective Standing: Fitting an Individual Mold	291
		5.2.1.2 Restrictive No More? The Climate Expansion	295
		5.2.1.3 Epistemological Appraisal	300
	5.2.2	The Expansive Approach	303
		5.2.2.1 Collective Standing: Representational Space	304
		5.2.2.2 Climate Standing: Beyond Anthropocentrism	307
		5.2.2.3 Epistemological Appraisal	308
	5.2.3	The Collective Approach	310
		5.2.3.1 Hybridity and Standing	311
		5.2.3.2 Temporality and Standing	313
	5.2.4	Concluding Remarks	315

Tabl	le of Co	ntents	xiii
5.3	Extrat	territoriality	316
0.0	5.3.1	The State-Based Approach	318
	0.0.1	5.3.1.1 Effective Territorial Control	320
		5.3.1.2 Effective Individual Control	321
		5.3.1.3 Climate Extraterritoriality	323
		5.3.1.4 Epistemological Analysis	325
	5.3.2	Alternative Control Approach	327
	0.0.2	5.3.2.1 A Basis of Control	328
		5.3.2.2 A Climate Expansion	329
		5.3.2.3 Epistemological Analysis	331
	5.3.3	The Relational Approach	331
		5.3.3.1 Power as Control: A Relational Basis	332
		5.3.3.2 Alternative Territory and the Collective	334
		5.3.3.3 'Extraterritoriality' within Collective Rights	334
		5.3.3.4 Climate Advantages	336
	5.3.4	Concluding Remarks	337
5.4	Redre	<u> </u>	338
	5.4.1	State-Centric Redress	341
		5.4.1.1 The Individual and Collective Track	342
		5.4.1.2 Climate Redress: the Billy and KlimaSeniorinnen Cases	345
		5.4.1.3 Epistemological Appraisal	347
	5.4.2	Victim-Centric Redress	349
		5.4.2.1 The Individual and Collective Track	350
		5.4.2.2 Climate Redress: Prospects and Challenges	353
		5.4.2.3 Epistemological Appraisal	354
	5.4.3	A One-Track Approach: Epistemological Redress	356
		5.4.3.1 Heightened Obligations	357
		5.4.3.2 Cessation and Non-Repetition	358
	5.4.4	Concluding Remarks	359
5.5	Concl	luding Remarks	360
6	Conc	CLUSION	363
6.1	Settin	g the Scene	363
6.2		eptualization: A General Theory of Collective Human Rights	366
0	6.2.1		366
	0.2.2	6.2.1.1 Hybridity of Object and Subject	368
		6.2.1.2 A Global Problem Demanding a Local Solution	370
	6.2.2	Ontological Flexibility in Practice: Climate (dis)Advantages	373
	0	6.2.2.1 Spatial Scope: Resistance to Universalisations	373
		6.2.2.2 Hybridity: the Role of the Environment	376
		6.2.2.3 Added Collective Value within Human Rights	377
6.3	The P	Practice: A Closer Look at Substantive Provisions – Climate Change	
	& Means of Subsistence		
	6.3.1	An Overlooked Prohibition: Problems and Potential	379
	6.3.2	Threshold of Deprivation: Approaches and Parameters	380
	6.3.3	Small Island States, Climate Change and Self-Determination	382

xiv Table of Contents

6.4		Procedure: Collective Human Rights Climate Litigation: Jumping edural Hurdles?	5 383
	6.4.1	Standing Together, Stronger: A Collective Reading of Legal	300
	0.4.1	Standing Together, Stronger. A Conective Reading of Legar	384
		6.4.1.1 The Climate 'Victim' in Practice	384
		6.4.1.2 An Epistemological Flexible Reading of Standing	386
	6.4.2		387
	0.4.2	The Fallacy of 'Extra' Territory: A Discourse of Power 6.4.2.1 Climate Change and the Exercise of Extraterritorial	307
		Jurisdiction	387
		6.4.2.2 An Epistemologically Flexible Reading of	307
		Extraterritoriality	388
	6.4.3	Redressing Climate Harms	389
		6.4.3.1 A Variety of Forms of Climate Redress	390
		6.4.3.2 Epistemologically Consistent Remedies	391
	6.4.4	Cumulative Procedural Potential	392
6.5	Final	Reflections	392
	6.5.1	Addressing Super-Wicked Climate Change: The Role of	
		Collective Human Rights	392
	6.5.2	Collective Rights as a Shield	394
	6.5.3	Collective Rights as a Sword	397
SUM	IMARY		401
SAM	IENVAT	TING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	407
Bibl	IOGRAF	PHY	413
Cur	RICULU	JM VITAE	469

List of Abbreviations

ACHPR African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights

ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

ACmHPR African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACtHPR African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights

ADRIP American Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples

AO Advisory Opinion

ARSIWA Articles on the Responsibility of States for International Wrongful

Acts

CAT Committee Against Torture CBA Cost-Benefit Analysis

CBD Convention on Biological Diversity

CBDR Common but Differentiated Responsibilities and Respective

Capabilities

CCPR Human Rights Committee

CEDAW Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women

CERD Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

COB Concluding Observations
COP Conference of the Parties

CRC Committee on the Rights of the Child

CRPD Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
DCRD Draft Convention on the Right to Development
ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EMRIP Expert Mechanism on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples

EU European Union

FPIC Free, Prior and Informed Consent

GHG Greenhouse Gasses
HRC Human Rights Council
HRTBs Human Rights Treaty Bodies

IACmHR Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

ICRC International Convention on the Rights of the Child

ICJ International Court of Justice
IEL International Environmental Law
ILA International Law Association

ILO169 International Labour Organization's Indigenous and Tribal

Peoples Convention

IMF International Monetary Fund

IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change IPVI Indigenous Peoples in Voluntary Isolation

KP Kyoto Protocol

LCIP-P Local Communities and Indigenous Peoples Platform

LVC La Vía Campesina

NDCs Nationally Determined ContributionsNGO Non-Governmental OrganisationNIEO New International Economic Order

OHCHR Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights

PA Paris Agreement
PIL Public Interest Litigation

PSNR Permanent Sovereignty over Natural Resources

RHE Right to a Clean, Healthy and Sustainable Environment Rio Declaration The Rio Declaration on Environment and Development

RoN Rights of Nature RtD Right to Development

SIDS Small Island Developing States SPM Summary for Policymakers

TWAIL Third World Approaches to International Law UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights

UN United Nations

UNDRD United Nations Declaration on the Right to Development
UNDRIP United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
UNDROP United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Peasants and Other

People Working in Rural Areas

UNESC United Nations Economic and Social Council

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

UNGA United Nations General Assembly UNSR United Nations Special Rapporteur

UPR Universal Periodic Review US United States of America

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties