



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Countering online hate speech: how to adequately protect fundamental rights?

Nave, E.V.R.

Citation

Nave, E. V. R. (2025, July 3). *Countering online hate speech: how to adequately protect fundamental rights?*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4252655>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4252655>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Bibliography

LEGAL SOURCES

United Nations

- United Nations, General Assembly, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 217 A (III), 10 December 1948 (UDHR).
- United Nations, General Assembly, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, Treaty Series, vol. 660, 21 December 1965 (ICERD).
- United Nations, General Assembly, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Treaty Series, vol. 999, p. 171, 16 December 1966 (ICCPR).

Council of Europe

- Council of Europe, Statute of the Council of Europe, May 5, 1949, 87 U.N.T.S. 103.
- Council of Europe, European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, as amended by Protocols Nos. 11 and 14, ETS 5, 4 November 1950 (ECHR).
- Council of Europe, Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities and Explanatory Report, European Treaty Series – No. 157, Doc. H9510 (1995).
- Council of Europe, Protocol 12 to the European Convention on Human Rights, Nov. 4, 2000, E.T.S. 177.
- Council of Europe, Additional Protocol to the Convention on Cybercrime, concerning the criminalisation of acts of a racist and xenophobic nature committed through computer systems, Jan. 28, 2003, E.T.S. 189.
- Council of Europe, Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Domestic Violence, May 11, 2011, E.T.S. 210.

European Union Primary Law

- European Union, Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, OJ C 326, 26.10.2012, p. 391–407 (CFREU).
- European Union, Consolidated versions of the Treaty on European Union and the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union, Protocols Annexes to the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union Declarations annexed to the Final Act of the Intergovernmental Conference which adopted the Treaty of Lisbon, signed on 13 December 2007 Tables of equivalences, OJ C 202, 7.6.2016, p. 1–388.

EUROPEAN UNION SECONDARY LAW

Regulations of the European Parliament and of the Council

- European Union, Regulation (EU) 2016/679 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 27 April 2016 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Directive 95/46/EC (General Data Protection Regulation), OJ L 119, 4.5.2016, p. 1–88.
- European Union, Regulation (EU) 2021/784 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 Apr 2021 on addressing the dissemination of terrorist content online, OJ L 172, 17.5.2021, p. 79–109.
- European Union, Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on a Single Market For Digital Services (Digital Services Act) and amending Directive 2000/31/EC (DSA OJ L 277, 27.10.2022, p. 1–102.
- European Union, Regulation (EU) 2024/1689 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 June 2024 laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence and amending Regulations (EC) No 300/2008, (EU) No 167/2013, (EU) No 168/2013, (EU) 2018/858, (EU) 2018/1139 and (EU) 2019/2144 and Directives 2014/90/EU, (EU) 2016/797 and (EU) 2020/1828 (Artificial Intelligence Act, AI Act), OJ L, 2024/1689, 12.7.2024.

Directives of the European Parliament and of the Council

- European Union, Directive 2002/58/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 12 July 2002 concerning the processing of personal data and the protection of privacy in the electronic communications sector (Directive on privacy and electronic communications), OJ L 201, 31.7.2002, p. 37–47.
- European Union, Directive 2010/13/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 10 March 2010 on the coordination of certain provisions laid down by law, regulation or administrative action in Member States concerning the provision of audiovisual media services (Audiovisual Media Services Directive), OJ L 95, 15.4.2010, p. 1–24 (AVMSD).
- European Union, Directive 2012/29/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 25 October 2012 establishing minimum standards on the rights, support and protection of victims of crime, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2001/220/JHA, OJ L 315, 14.11.2012, p. 57–73 (Victims Directive).
- European Union, Directive (EU) 2016/680 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 27 April 2016 on the protection of natural persons with regard to the processing of personal data by competent authorities for the purposes of the prevention, investigation, detection or prosecution of criminal offences or the execution of criminal penalties, and on the free movement of such data, and repealing Council Framework Decision 2008/977/JHA, OJ L 119, 4.5.2016, p. 89–131.
- European Union, Directive (EU) 2024/1760 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 13 June 2024 on corporate sustainability due diligence and amending Directive (EU) 2019/1937 and Regulation (EU) 2023/2859, OJ L, 2024/1760, 5.7.2024 (CSDDD).

Council of the European Union

- European Union, Council Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA of 28 November 2008 on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law, OJ L 328, 6.12.2008, p. 55–58.
- European Union, Council Decision (CFSP) 2020/1999 of December 2020 concerning restrictive measures against serious human rights violations and abuses, OJ L 410I, 7.12.2020, p. 13–19.
- European Union, Council of the European Union, ‘Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act) and amending certain Union legislative acts – General approach’. Interinstitutional File 2021/0106(COD).

European Parliament

- European Union, European Parliament, ‘Amendments adopted by the European Parliament on 1 June 2023 on the proposal for a directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on Corporate Sustainability Due Diligence and amending Directive (EU) 2019/1937’ COM(2022)0071 – C9-0050/2022 – 2022/0051(COD).
- European Union, European Parliament, Resolution of 18 January 2024 on extending the list of EU crimes to hate speech and hate crime (2023/2068(INI)), OJ C, C/2024/5733, 17.10.2024.
- European Union, European Parliament, Compromise Amendments on the Draft Report Proposal for a regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council on harmonised rules on Artificial Intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act) and amending certain Union Legislative Acts (COM(2021)0206 – C9 0146/2021 – 2021/0106(COD)), adopted 14 June 2023.

European Commission

- European Union, European Commission, Code of Conduct to counter illegal hate speech online, 2016.
- European Union, European Commission, Recommendation (EU) 2018/334 of 1 March 2018 on measures to effectively tackle illegal content online, OJ L 63, 6.3.2018, p. 50–61.
- European Union, European Commission, Communication From The Commission To The European Parliament And The Council A more inclusive and protective Europe: extending the list of EU crimes to hate speech and hate crime, COM/2021/777 final.
- European Union, European Commission, Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on Corporate Sustainability Due Diligence and amending Directive (EU) 2019/1937, COM/2022/71 final.
- European Union, European Commission, Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and the Council on combating violence against women and domestic violence, COM/2022/105 final.

- European Union, European Commission, Proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down rules to prevent and combat child sexual abuse, COM/2022/209 final.
- European Union, European Commission, Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down rules to prevent and combat child sexual abuse and replacing Council Framework Decision 2004/68/JHA (recast), COM/2024/60 final.

Other Relevant Legal Sources

- United Kingdom, Parliament of the United Kingdom, Online Safety Act (2023), c. 50, 26 October 2023, available at <<https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2023/50/section/12/enacted>> accessed 11 August 2024.
- Germany, Act to Improve Enforcement of the Law in Social Networks (Network Enforcement Act), Ministry of Justice and Consumer Protection, 12 July 2017, English Version, available at: <https://www.bmj.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/Gesetzgebung/RefE/NetzDG_engl.pdf?__blob=publicationFile&> accessed 12 January 2025.

CASE LAW

*European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR)*¹

Judgements, decisions and advisory opinions of the “new” Court (as from 1 November 1998)

- Alekhina and Others v. Russia*, no. 22519/02, 13 April 2006, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0717JUD003800412.
- Association ACCEPT and Others v. Romania*, no. 19237/16, 1 June 2021, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2021:0601JUD001923716.
- Beizaras and Levoickas v. Lithuania*, no. 41288/15, 14 January 2020, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2020:0114JUD004128815.
- Belkacem v. Belgium*, no. 343667/14, 27 June 2017, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2017:0627DEC003436714.
- Budayeva and Others v. Russia*, nos. 15339/02 and 4 others, ECHR 2008 (extracts), ECLI:CE:ECHR:2008:0320JUD001533902.
- Ceylan v. Turkey* [GC], no. 23556/94, ECHR 1999-IV, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1999:0708JUD002355694.
- Delfi AS v. Estonia* [GC], no. 64569/09, ECHR 2015, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2015:0616JUD006456909.
- Dicle v. Turkey* (no. 2), no. 46733/99, 11 April 2006, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2006:0411JUD004673399.

1 This structure follows the citation style of the ECtHR; see ECtHR (2022) Note explaining the mode of citation of the case-law of the Court and the Commission, available at <https://www.echr.coe.int/documents/d/echr/note_citation_eng> accessed 27 November 2024.

- Erbakan v. Turkey*, no. 59405/00, 6 July 2006, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2006:0706JUD005940500.
- Erdoğan and İnce v. Turkey* [GC], nos. 25067/94 and 25068/94, ECHR 1999-IV, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1997:1211REP002506794.
- Feldek v. Slovakia*, no. 29032/95, ECHR 2001-VIII, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2001:0712JUD002903295.
- Féret v. Belgium*, no. 15615/07, 16 July 2009, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2009:0716JUD001561507.
- Garaudy v. France* (dec.), no. 65831/01, ECHR 2003-IX (extracts), ECLI:CE:ECHR:2003:0624DEC006583101.
- Gündüz v. Turkey* (dec.), no. 59745/00, ECHR 2003-XI (extracts), ECLI:CE:ECHR:2003:1204JUD003507197.
- İ.A. v. Turkey*, no. 42571/98, ECHR 2005-VIII, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2005:0913JUD004257198.
- Identoba and Others v. Georgia*, no. 73235/12, 12 May 2015, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2015:0512JUD007323512.
- Ivanov v. Russia*, no. 3436/05, 8 February 2007, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2007:0220DEC003522204.
- Kaboğlu et Oran v. Turkey*, nos. 1759/08, 50766/10 and 50782/10, 30 October 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:1030JUD000175908.
- Király and Dömötör v. Hungary*, no. 10851/13, 17 January 2017, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2017:0117JUD001085113.
- Le Pen v. France*, no. 18788/09, 20 April 2010, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2010:0420DEC001878809.
- Leroy v. France*, no. 36109/03, 2 October 2008, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2008:1002JUD003610903.
- Lilliendahl v. Iceland*, no. 29297/18, 12 June 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2020:0512DEC002929718.
- M'Bala M'Bala v. France* (dec.), no. 25239/13, ECHR 2015 (extracts), ECLI:CE:ECHR:2015:1020DEC002523913.
- Matthews v. the United Kingdom* [GC], no. 24833/94, ECHR 1999-I, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1999:0218JUD002483394.
- Medya FM Reha Radyo ve İletişim Hizmetleri A.Ş. v. Turkey* (dec.), no. 32842/02, 14 November 2006, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2006:1114DEC003284202.
- Nix v. Germany*, no. 38285/16, 13 Mar 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0313DEC003528516.
- Norwood v. the United Kingdom* (dec.), no. 23131/03, ECHR 2004-XI, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2004:1116DEC002313103.
- Ottan v. France*, no. 41841/12, 19 April 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0419JUD004184112.
- Özgür Gündem v. Turkey*, no. 23144/93, ECHR 2000-III, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2000:0316JUD002314493.
- Pastörs v. Germany*, no. 55225/14, 3 October 2019, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2019:1003JUD005522514.
- Perinçek v. Switzerland* [GC], no. 27510/08, ECHR 2015 (extracts), ECLI:CE:ECHR:2015:1015JUD002751008.
- PETA Deutschland v. Germany*, no. 43481/09, 8 November 2012, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2012:1108JUD004348109.
- Roj TV A/S v. Denmark*, no. 24683/14, 17 April 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0417DEC002468314.
- Sanchez v. France* [GC], no. 45581/15, 15 May 2023, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2023:0515JUD004558115.
- Savva Terentyev v. Russia*, no. 10692/09, 28 August 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0828JUD001069209.

- Schimaneck v. Austria*, no. 32307/96, 1 February 2000, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2000:0201DEC003230796.
- Seurot v. France* (dec), no. 57383/00, 18 May 2004, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2004:0518DEC005738300.
- Šimunić v. Croatia* (dec), no. 20373/17, 22 January 2019, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2019:0122DEC002037317.
- Smajić v. Bosnia & Herzegovina*, no. 48657/16, 16 January 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0116DEC004865716.
- Soulas and Others v. France*, no. 15948/03, 10 July 2008, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2008:0710JUD001594803.
- Sousa Goucha v. Portugal*, no. 70434/12, 22 March 2016, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2016:0322JUD007043412.
- Stomakhin v. Russia*, no. 52273/07, 9 May 2018, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2018:0509JUD005227307.
- Sürek and Özdemir v. Turkey* [GC], nos. 23927/94 and 24277/94, 8 July 1999, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1999:0708JUD002392794.
- Sürek v. Turkey* (no. 1) [GC], no. 26682/95, ECHR 1999-IV, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1999:0708JUD002668295.
- Sürek v. Turkey* (no. 4) [GC], no. 24762/94, 8 July 1999, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1999:0708JUD002476294.
- Vajnai v. Hungary*, no. 33629/06, ECHR 2008, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2008:0708JUD003362906.
- Vejdeland and Others v. Sweden*, no. 1813/07, 9 February 2012, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2012:0209JUD000181307.
- Vereinigung Bildender Künstler v. Austria*, no. 68354/01, 25 January 2007, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2007:0125JUD006835401.
- W.P. and Others v. Poland* (dec.), no. 42264/98, ECHR 2004-VII (extracts), ECLI:CE:ECHR:2004:0902DEC004226498.
- Williamson v. Germany*, no. 64496/17, 8 January 2019, ECLI:CE:ECHR:2019:0108DEC006449617.

Judgements of the "old" Court (from 1960 until 31 October 1998)

- *Glimmerveen and Hagenbeek v. the Netherlands*, nos. 8348/78 and 8406/78, 11 October 1979, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1979:1011DEC000834878.
- *Pine Valley Developments Ltd and Others v. Ireland* (Article 50), 9 February 1993, Series A no. 246-B, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1993:0209JUD001274287.
- *Lawless v. Ireland*, no. 332/57, 1 July 1961, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1961:0701JUD000033257.
- *Handyside v. the United Kingdom*, 7 December 1976, Series A no. 24, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1976:1207JUD000549372.
- *Tyrer v. the United Kingdom*, 25 April 1978, Series A no. 26, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1978:0425JUD000585672.
- *Airey v. Ireland* (Article 50), 6 February 1981, Series A no. 41, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1981:0206JUD000628973.
- *Case of Colossa v. Italy*, no. 9024/80, 12 February 1985, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1985:0212JUD000902480.
- *Jersild v. Denmark*, 23 September 1994, Series A no. 298, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1994:0923JUD001589089.

- *Honsik v. Austria*, no. 25062/94, 18 October 1995, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1995:1018DEC002506294.
- *Marais v. France*, no. 31159/96, 24 June 1996, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1996:0624DEC003115996.
- *Incal v. Turkey*, 9 June 1998, Reports of Judgments and Decisions 1998-IV, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1998:0609JUD002267893.
- *Nachtmann v. Austria*, no. 36773/97, 9 September 1998, ECLI:CE:ECHR:1998:0909DEC003677397.
- *B.H., M.W., H.P. and G.K. v. Austria*, no. 12774/87, 12 October 1989.

Decisions and reports of the Commission

- *German Communist Party and Others v. Federal Republic of Germany*, no. 250/57, 20 July 1957.

Court of Justice of the European Union

- European Court of Justice, Opinion of Advocate General Szpunar delivered on 8 June 2023 (1) Case C-376/22, ECLI identifier: ECLI:EU:C:2023:467.
- Judgment of the Court of 12 November 1969, *Erich Stauder v. City of Ulm – Sozialamt*, Reference for a preliminary ruling: Verwaltungsgericht Stuttgart – Germany, Case 29-69, ECLI identifier: ECLI:EU:C:1969:57.
- Judgment of the Court of 17 December 1970. *Internationale Handelsgesellschaft mbH v Einfuhr- und Vorratsstelle für Getreide und Futtermittel*. Reference for a preliminary ruling: Verwaltungsgericht Frankfurt am Main – Germany. Case 11-70, ECLI identifier: ECLI:EU:C:1970:114.
- Judgment of the Court of 11 July 1985. *Cinéthèque SA and others v Fédération nationale des cinémas français*. References for a preliminary ruling: Tribunal de grande instance de Paris – France. Distribution of films in the form of video recordings – National prohibitions. Joined cases 60 and 61/84, ECLI identifier: ECLI:EU:C:1985:329.
- Judgment of the Court (Grand Chamber) of 21 December 2016, *Tele2 Sverige AB v. Post- och telestyrelsen and Secretary of State for the Home Department v. Tom Watson and Others*, Joined Cases C-203/15 and C-698/15, ECLI:EU:C:2016:970.
- Joined Cases C-682/18 and C-683/18: Judgment of the Court (Grand Chamber) of 22 June 2021 (requests for a preliminary ruling from the Bundesgerichtshof – Germany) – *Frank Peterson v Google LLC, YouTube LLC, YouTube Inc., Google Germany GmbH (C-682/18) and Elsevier Inc. v Cyando AG (C-683/18)*, ECLI:EU:C:2021:503.
- Judgment of the Court (Grand Chamber) of 4 July 2023, *Meta Platforms Inc and Others v. Bundeskartellamt*, ECLI:EU:C:2022:704, Opinion of Advocate General Rantos delivered on 20 September 2022 (1) case C-252/21, ECLI:EU:C:2023:537.

Other Relevant Case Law

- *LICRA v. Yahoo! and Association “Union des Etudiants Juifs de France”, la “Ligue contre le Racisme et l’Antisémitisme”, le “MRAP” (intervenant volontaire) / Yahoo ! Inc. et Yahoo*

- France*, available at <https://www.iddn.org/cgi-iddn/french/affiche-jnet.cgi?droite=decisions/responsabilite/ord_tgi-paris_201100.htm> accessed 29 August 2024.
- *Twitter, Inc. v. Taameh* (05/18/2023) United States Supreme Court, *Twitter v. Taameh* 598 US (2023), available at <https://www.supremecourt.gov/opinions/22pdf/21-1496_d18f.pdf> accessed 12 January 2025.

POLICY DOCUMENTS

United Nations

- United Nations, High Commission for Human Rights, Annual Report 2023, A/HRC/22/17/Add.4 (Rabat Plan of Action).
- United Nations, High Commissioner for Human Rights, Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights on the Expert Workshops on the Prohibition of Incitement to National, Racial or Religious Hatred, U.N. Doc. A/HRC/22/17/Add.4 (Jan. 11, 2013).
- United Nations, High Commissioner for Human Rights: addendum, U.N. Doc. A/HRC/22/17/Add.4 (Jan. 11, 2013).
- United Nations, Human Rights Council, 'Report of the independent international fact-finding mission on Myanmar' (2018) A/HRC/39/64.
- United Nations, Human Rights Council, 'Report of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General on the Issue of Human Rights and Transnational Corporations and Other Business Enterprises, John Ruggie' (2011) A/HRC/17/31 (UNGPs).
- United Nations, Human Rights Council, Report of the Special Rapporteur on minority issues, Report on hate speech, social media and minorities, (2021) (A/HRC/46/57).
- United Nations, Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (2011) Relevant Council of Europe Standards and Policies on the Prohibition and Prevention of "Hate Speech", Prepared by Directorate General of Human Rights and Legal Affairs (DGHL).
- United Nations, Office of the High Commissioner, Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a Remedy and Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of International Human Rights Law and Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law, A/RES/60/147.
- United Nations, Office of the High Commissioner, Implementing the UN "Protect, Respect and Remedy Framework" (UNGPs Guide).
- United Nations, Office of the High Commissioner, The Corporate Responsibility to Respect Human Rights, An Interpretative Guide.
- United Nations, Report of the Special Rapporteur on minority issues (2021) A/HRC/46/57.
- United Nations, Report of the Special Rapporteur on the promotion and protection of the right to freedom of opinion and expression, A/74/486 (May 7, 2010).
- United Nations, Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 16 December 2005, Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a Remedy and Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of International Human Rights Law and Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law, A/RES/60/147, II(3).

- United Nations, Secretary-General, *Globalization and Its Impact on the Full Enjoyment of All Human Rights*, U.N. Doc. A/55/342 (Aug. 31, 2000).
- United Nations, Sub Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights' *Draft Norms on the Responsibilities of Transnational Corporations and other Business Enterprises with regard to Human Rights*' (2003) E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/12/Rev.2 (Aug 26, 2003).
- United Nations, World Conference on Human Rights, *Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action*, 1 30, U.N. Doc. A/CONF. 157/23 (June 25, 1993).

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

- OECD, 'OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises' (2011) available at <<http://mneguidelines.oecd.org/guidelines/>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- OECD, 'OECD Due Diligence Guidance for Responsible Business Conduct' (2018) available at <<https://www.oecd.org/investment/due-diligence-guidance-for-responsible-business-conduct.htm>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- OECD, Recommendation of the Council on Artificial Intelligence (2019) available at <<https://legalinstruments.oecd.org/en/instruments/OECD-LEGAL-0449#main-Text>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- OECD, 'Business and Finance Outlook 2021' available at <<https://www.oecd.org/finance/oecd-business-and-finance-outlook-26172577.htm>> accessed 6 April 2023.

COUNCIL OF EUROPE

Committee of Ministers, Recommendations

- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation No. R (97) 20 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on "hate speech", Adopted on 30 October 1997.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation No. R (97) 21 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the media and the promotion of a culture of tolerance, Adopted on 30 October 1997.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, Adopted on 31 March 2010.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2011)7 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on a new notion of media, Adopted on 21 September 2011.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)6 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on a Guide to human rights for Internet users, Adopted on 16 April 2014.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2016)3 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on human rights and business, Adopted on 2 March 2016.

- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers Recommendation CM/Rec(2018)2 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on the roles and responsibilities of internet intermediaries, Adopted on 7 March 2018.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, 'Declaration by the Committee of Ministers on the manipulative capabilities of algorithmic processes' (2019), Adopted on 13 February 2019.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2020)1 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on the human rights impacts of algorithmic systems, Adopted on 8 April 2020.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2022)16 https://search.coe.int/cm_-_ftn1 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on combating hate speech, Adopted on 20 May 2022.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Recommendation CM/Rec(2024)4 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on combating hate crime, Adopted on 7 May 2024.

Council of Europe, Recommendations' Explanatory Memoranda and Other Documents

- Council of Europe, Ministers' Deputies CM Documents CM(2014)31-addfinal, Recommendation CM/Rec(2014)6 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on a guide to human rights for Internet users – Explanatory Memorandum, Adopted on 16 April 2014.
- Council of Europe, Ministers' Deputies, CM Documents, CM(2005)80 final 17 May 2005, Action Plan.
- Council of Europe, European Ministerial Conferences on Mass Media Policy and Council of Europe Conferences of Ministers responsible for Media and New Communications Services, Strasbourg 2021, available at <<https://rm.coe.int/16806461fb>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Council of Europe, Committee of Ministers, Guidelines of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on upholding equality and protecting against discrimination and hate during the Covid-19 pandemic and similar crises in the future (2021), Adopted on 5 May 2021.
- Council of Europe, Steering Committee on Anti-Discrimination, Diversity and Inclusion (CDADI) and Steering Committee on Media and Information Society (CDMSI) – Recommendation CM/Rec(2022)16 of the Committee of Ministers to member States on combating hate speech – Explanatory Memorandum, Adopted 20 May 2022.

European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI)

- Council of Europe, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 6 on combating the dissemination of racist, xenophobic and antisemitic material via the Internet, adopted on 15 December 2000.
- Council of Europe, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 7 on national legislation to combat

- racism and racial discrimination, Adopted on 13 December 2002 and Amended on 7 December 2017.
- Council of Europe, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 11 on combating racism and racial discrimination in policing, Adopted on 29 June 2007.
 - Council of Europe, European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI), General Policy Recommendation (GPR) No. 15 on combating hate speech, Adopted on 8 December 2015.

Other Council of Europe Policy Documents

- Council of Europe, Keynote speech of Nils Muiznieks, Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, 'Freedom of Expression and Democracy in the Digital Age: Opportunities, Rights, Responsibilities' (November 7-8, 2013) available at <<https://www.statewatch.org/media/documents/news/2013/nov/coe-speech-freedom-of-expression.pdf>> accessed 6 April 2023.

EUROPEAN UNION

European Commission

- European Union, European Commission, Directorate-General (DG) Justice, Guidance Document related to the transposition and implementation of Directive 2012/29/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 25 October 2012 establishing minimum standards on the rights, support and protection of victims of crime, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2001/220/JHA, 12.2013, available at <https://commission.europa.eu/document/download/238cafb6-d5cd-4d1a-8624-a0bafb2cdfa3_en?filename=13_12_19_3763804_guidance_victims_rights_directive_eu_en.pdf> accessed 29 August 2024.
- European Union, European Commission, Report from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on the implementation of Council Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law, /* COM/2014/027 final */, 27.1.2014.
- European Union, European Commission, Communication from the Commission Guidelines on the practical application of the essential functionality criterion of the definition of a 'video-sharing platforms service' under the Audiovisual Media Services Directive 2020/C 223/02, OJ C 223, 7.7.2020, p. 3–9.
- European Union, Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council, A more inclusive and protective Europe: extending the list of EU crimes to hate speech and hate crime, COM/2021/777 final, Brussels, 9.12.2021.

European Parliament

- European Union, European Parliament resolution of 18 January 2024 on extending the list of EU crimes to hate speech and hate crime (2023/2068(INI)), available at

<https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-9-2024-0044_EN.pdf>
accessed 13 of January 2025.

POLICY SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS

United Nations

- United Nations, Definition of Gross and Large-scale Violations of Human Rights as an International Crime, Comm. on Human Rights, Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, Working paper submitted by Mr. Stanislav Chemichenko in accordance with Sub-Commission decision 1992/109, 14, U.N. Doc. E/CN.4/Sub.2/1993/10, 08.06.1993.
- United Nations, General Assembly, Independent International Fact-Finding Mission on Myanmar, 'Report of the detailed findings of the Independent International Fact-Finding Mission on Myanmar' (IIMM, Detailed findings), A/HRC/39/CRP.2, 12. 09.2018.
- United Nations, United Nations Women, Frequently Asked Questions: Trolling, stalking, doxing and other forms of violence against women in the digital age, 19.11.2024, available at <<https://www.unwomen.org/en/what-we-do/ending-violence-against-women/faqs/tech-facilitated-gender-based-violence>> accessed 18 November 2024.

Council of Europe

- Council of Europe, European Court of Human Rights, Press Release on Admissibility Decision of *Le Pen v. France* (App. No. 18788/2009), 07.05.2010.
- Council of Europe, Explanatory Report, Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence Against Women and Domestic Violence, May 11, 2011, E.T.S. 210, Istanbul, 11.V.2011.
- Council of Europe, European Court of Human Rights, Note explaining the mode of citation of the case-law of the Court and the Commission, Updated October 2022, available at <https://www.echr.coe.int/documents/d/echr/note_citation_eng> accessed 27 November 2024.
- Council of Europe, European Court of Human Rights, Guide on Article 7 of the European Convention on Human Rights, No punishment without law: the principle that only the law can define a crime and prescribe a penalty, updated on 2022, available at <https://ks.echr.coe.int/documents/d/echr-ks/guide_art_7_eng> accessed 11 April 2024.
- Council of Europe, European Union accession to the European Convention on Human Rights, Questions and Answers, available at <<https://www.coe.int/en/web/portal/eu-accession-echr-questions-and-answers>> accessed 11 April 2024.
- Council of Europe, European Court of Human Rights, Factsheet – Hate Speech, Press Unit, November 2023.
- Council of Europe, European Court of Human Rights, Guide on Article 13 of the ECHR Right to an effective remedy, Updated on 31 August 2024, available at

<https://ks.echr.coe.int/documents/d/echr-ks/guide_art_13_eng> accessed 28 May 2024.

EUROPEAN UNION

European Commission

- European Union, European Commission, Didier Reynders, Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers, 5th valuation of the Code of Conduct on Countering Illegal Hate Speech Online, June 4, 2020.
- European Union, European Commission, Press Release, EU Code of Conduct against illegal hate speech online: results remain positive but progress slows down, October 17, 2021, available at <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_21_5082> accessed 29 August 2024.
- European Union, European Commission, Press Release, IP/22/1533, International Women's Day 2022: Commission Proposes EU-Wide Rules to Combat Violence Against Women and Domestic Violence, March 8, 2022.
- European Union, European Commission, Press Release, 'Digital Services Act: Commission designates first set of VLOPs and Search Engines', April 25, 2023, available at <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/IP_23_2413> accessed 29 August 2024.
- European Union, European Commission, Press Release, 'No place for hate in Europe. Commission and High Representative launch call to action to unite against all forms of hatred', December 6, 2023, available at <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip_23_6329> accessed 29 August 2024.
- European Union, European Commission, Questions and answers on the Digital Services Act, February 23, 2024, available at <https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/QANDA_20_2348> accessed 29 August 2024.
- European Union, European Commission, Communications Networks, Content and Technology, Connect develops and implements policies to make Europe fit for the digital age, available at <https://commission.europa.eu/about/departments-and-executive-agencies/communications-networks-content-and-technology_en> accessed 26 August 2024.
- European Union, European Commission, Monitoring rounds of the Code of conduct on countering illegal hate speech online, available at <https://commission.europa.eu/strategy-and-policy/policies/justice-and-fundamental-rights/combating-discrimination/racism-and-xenophobia/eu-code-conduct-countering-illegal-hate-speech-online_en> accessed 10 April 2024.

European Parliament

- European Union, European Parliament, Legislative Train Schedule, Proposals to extend the list of EU crimes to all forms of hate crime and hate speech, 15.12.2024, available at <<https://www.europarl.europa.eu/legislative-train/theme-a-new-push-for-european-democracy/file-hate-crimes-and-hate-speech>> accessed 13 January 2025.

- European Union, European Parliament, Fact Sheets on the European Union, Sources and scope of European Union Law, available at <<https://www.europarl.europa.eu/factsheets/en/sheet/6/sources-and-scopeof-european-union-law>> accessed 28 August 2024.

Other EU Policy Supporting Documents

- European Union, EU Network of Independent Experts on Fundamental Rights, Commentary of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union, June 2006, available at <<https://sites.uclouvain.be/cridho/documents/Download.Rep/NetworkCommentaryFinal.pdf>> accessed 13 January 2025.
- European Union, EUROJUST, Third report of the observatory function on encryption, July 2, 2021, available at <<https://www.eurojust.europa.eu/publication/third-report-observatory-function-encryption>> accessed 21 February 2024.
- European Union, Agency for Fundamental Rights, “Online Content Moderation – Current Challenges in Detecting Hate Speech”, Vienna, 2023, available at <https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/fra-2023-online-content-moderation_en.pdf> accessed 26 November 2024.
- European Union, Agency for Fundamental Rights, Press Release, Harassment and violence against LGBTIQ people on the rise, May 14, 2024, available at <<https://fra.europa.eu/en/news/2024/harassment-and-violence-against-lgbtqi-people-rise>> accessed 18 November 2024.

Academic Literature

- Alegre, Susie (2022) *Freedom to Think: The Long Struggle to Liberate Our Minds*. Atlantic Books.
- Alkiviadou, Natalie (2018) ‘The Legal Regulation of Hate Speech: The International and European Frameworks,’ 55 *POLITIËKA MISAO* 203, 223.
- Alkiviadou, Natalie (2019) ‘Hate speech on social media networks: towards a regulatory framework?.’ *Information & Communications Technology Law* 28.1: 19-35.
- Appelman, Naomi, João Pedro Quintais and Ronan Fahy (2022), ‘Using Terms and Conditions to apply Fundamental Rights to Content Moderation’, *German Law Journal* 24.5 (2023): 881-911.
- Argyrou, Aikaterini (2017) ‘Making the case for case studies in empirical legal research.’ *Utrecht Law Review* 13.3: 95-113.
- Bartlett, Katharine T (2018) ‘Feminist Legal Methods,’ 103 *Harvard Law Review* 829-888.
- Bartlett, Katharine T and Rosanne Kennedy (1991) *Feminist Legal Theory, Readings in Law and Gender*, Routledge, 460.
- Bayer, Judit & Petra Bard (2020), ‘Hate Speech and Hate Crime in the EU and the Evaluation of Online Content Regulation Approaches,’ *Study requested by the LIBE committee, Policy Department for Citizens’ Rights and Constitutional Affairs Directorate-General for Internal Policies PE 655.135 – July 2020*, available at <[https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2020/655135/IPOL_STU\(2020\)655135_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2020/655135/IPOL_STU(2020)655135_EN.pdf)> accessed 21 Feb 2024.
- Bayer, Judit, Bernd Holznagel, Päivi Korpisaari (ex. Tiilikka), Lorna Woods, (2021) *Perspectives on Platform Regulation: Concepts and Models of Social Media Governance*

- Across the Globe*, Volume 1, Baden-Baden, Nomos, 601, available at <<https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748929789>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Bell, Derrick (2008), *And We Are Not Saved: The Elusive Quest For Racial Justice*, Basic Books.
- Ben-David, Anat and Ariadna Matamoros Fernández (2016), 'Hate speech and covert discrimination on social media: Monitoring the Facebook pages of extreme-right political parties in Spain'. *International Journal of Communication*, 10, 27.
- Bertolini, Andrea et al. (2021), 'Liability of Online Platform: Study for the European Parliament' *European Parliamentary Research Service* PE 656.318.
- Bodig, Matyas (2015), 'Legal Doctrinal Scholarship and Interdisciplinary Engagement,' *Erasmus Law Review*, Vol. 8: 43.
- Boyle, Kevin & Anneliese Baldaccini (2017) *A Critical Evaluation of International Human Rights Approaches to Racism*, 1st Edition, 2011, Routledge, 57.
- Bradford, Anu (2020), *The Brussels Effect: How the European Union Rules the World*, Oxford University Press, 27 February 2020.
- Braman, Sandra and Stephanie Roberts (2003) 'Advantage ISP: Terms of service as media law.' *New media & society* 5.3: 422-448.
- Buri, Ilaria and Joris van Hoboken (2021) 'The Digital Services Act (DSA) proposal: a critical overview.' *Digital Services Act (DSA) Observatory, Discussion paper – version of 28 October 2021*, available at <https://dsa-observatory.eu/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/Buri-Van-Hoboken-DSA-discussion-paper-Version-28_10_21.pdf> accessed 13 January 2025.
- Bursztein, Elle, Clarke, E., DeLaune, M., Eliff, D. M., Hsu, N., Olson, L., Shehan, J., Thakur, M., Thomas, K., & Bright, T. (2019). 'Rethinking the Detection of Child Sexual Abuse Imagery on the Internet.' *The World Wide Web Conference*, 2601–2607, available at <<https://doi.org/10.1145/3308558.3313482>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Carastathis, Anna (2016), *Intersectionality: Origins, Contestations, Horizons*, University of Nebraska Press, 312.
- Carbado, Devon W., Kimberlé Williams Crenshaw, Vickie M. Mays and Barbara Tomlinson (2013). Intersectionality, *Du Bois Review*, 10(2), 303–312, available at <<https://doi.org/10.1017/S1742058X13000349>> accessed 28 August 2024.
- Carlson, Caitlin Ring (2021), *Hate Speech*, MIT Press Essential Knowledge series, April 6, 2021.
- Chitra, Uthsav and Christopher Musco (2020) 'Analyzing the impact of filter bubbles on social network polarization.' *Proceedings of the 13th International Conference on Web Search and Data Mining*.
- Cohen-Almagor, Raphael (2019), Racism and Hate Speech – A Critique of Scanlon's Contractual Theory, 53 *First Amendment Studies* 1, 2.
- Combs, Gene (2019) 'White privilege: what's a family therapist to do?' *Journal of marital and family therapy* 45.1: 61-75.
- Cooper, Anna Julia (1892), *A Voice From The South*, Xenia, Ohio, The Aldine Printing House, 1892.
- Crawford, Kate (2021) *The atlas of AI: Power, politics, and the planetary costs of artificial intelligence*, Yale University Press.
- Crenshaw, Kimberlé (1990) 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color' *Stanford Law Review* 1241.

- Crenshaw, Kimberlé (2013) Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics, *Feminist legal theories*, Routledge, 2013, 23-51.
- De Hert, Paul and Serge Gutwirth (2006) 'Privacy, data protection and law enforcement. Opacity of the individual and transparency of power.' *Privacy and the criminal law*: 61-104.
- Delgado, Richard (1982) 'Words That Wound: A Tort Action for Racial Insults, Epithets, and Name-Calling', *17 Harvard Civil Rights Liberties Law Review* 133.
- Delgado, Richard and Jean Stefancic (2004) *Understanding Words That Wound*, Routledge 12-19, available at <<https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429503351>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Delmonaco, Daniel et al. (2024) "'What are you doing, TikTok?': How Marginalized Social Media Users Perceive, Theorize, and 'Prove' Shadowbanning." *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction* 8.CSCW1: 1-39.
- Deva, Surya (2012) 'Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights: Implications for Companies' 9(2) *European Company Law* 101.
- Deva, Surya (2023) 'Mandatory human rights due diligence laws in Europe: A mirage for rightsholders?' *Leiden Journal of International Law*. 2023;36(2):389-414.
- Di Gangi, Paul M and Molly M. Wasko (2016) 'Social media engagement theory: Exploring the influence of user engagement on social media usage.' *Journal of Organizational and End User Computing (JOEUC)* 28.2: 53-73.
- Dias Oliva, Thiago, Dennys Marcelo Antonialli and Alessandra Gomes (2021) 'Fighting Hate Speech, Silencing Drag Queens? Artificial Intelligence in Content Moderation and Risks to LGBTQ Voices Online', *Sexuality & Culture* 25, 700.
- Dittel, Alexander (2022) 'The UK's Online Safety Bill: The day we took a stand against serious online harms or the day we lost our freedoms to platforms and the state?.' *Journal of Data Protection & Privacy* 5.2: 183-194.
- Dragiewicz, Molly, Jean Burgess, Ariadna Matamoros-Fernández, Michael Salter, Nicolas P. Suzor, Delanie Woodlock, and Bridget Harris (2018) 'Technology facilitated coercive control: Domestic violence and the competing roles of digital media platforms' *Feminist Media Studies*, 18(4), 609-625.
- Dworkin, Ronald Myles (1999) *Freedom's law: the moral reading of the American constitution*, Oxford University Press, 1999.
- El-Tayeb, Fatima (2011) *European Others, Queering Ethnicity in Postnational Europe*, University of Minnesota Press, 2011.
- Feagin, Joe R. and Debra Van Ausdale (2001) *The first R: How children learn race and racism*, Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Fourie, Andria Naudé (2015) "Expounding the place of legal doctrinal methods in legal-interdisciplinary research." *Erasmus Law Review* 8: 95.
- Françoise Tulkens (2013) 'The hate factor in political speech: Where do responsibilities lie?', *Report of the Council of Europe Conference on "The hate factor in political speech: Where do responsibilities lie?"*, Warsaw, 18-19 September 2013, Doc. No. MCM(2013)002.
- Galvan, Justice Belen (2020) "Facebook's Legal Responsibility for the Rohingya Genocide". *USFL Rev.*, 55, 123.
- Gelber, Katharine (2002). *Speaking Back. The free speech versus hate speech debate*. John Benjamins Publishing Company, 117.

- Gelber, Katharine (2019) 'Differentiating hate speech: a systemic discrimination approach' *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*.
- Gelber, Katharine (2021) 'Differentiating hate speech: a systemic discrimination approach.' *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*, 24(4), 393–414.
- Genç-Gelgeç, Berrak (2022) 'Regulating Digital Platforms: Will the DSA Correct Its Predecessor's Deficiencies?' 18 *Croatian Yearbook of European Law and Policy* 25.
- Gerads, Janneke (2013) 'How to improve the necessity test of the European Court of Human Rights.' *International Journal of Constitutional Law* 11.2: 466-490.
- Gillespie, Tarleton (2018) *Custodians of the Internet: Platforms, content moderation, and the hidden decisions that shape social media*. Yale University Press.
- Gillespie, Tarleton (2020) 'Content moderation, AI and the question of scale,' *Big Data and Society*, 7.2 (2020): 2053951720943234.
- Gjøsteen, Kristian, Thomas Haines, Johannes Müller, Peter Rønne, and Tjerand Silde (2022) 'Verifiable decryption in the head', *Australasian Conference on Information Security and Privacy*, Springer International Publishing, 355-374.
- Goldman, Eric (2021) 'Content moderation remedies' *Mich. Tech. L. Rev.* 28: 1., 24.
- González-Fuster, Gloria, Rosamunde Van Brakel, and Paul De Hert (Eds.) (2022), *Research handbook on privacy and data protection law: values, norms and global politics*, Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Greer, Steven, Janneke Gerards, and Rose Slowe (2018), *Human rights in the Council of Europe and the European Union: achievements, trends and challenges*, Cambridge University Press, 2018.
- Greschbach, Benjamin, Kreitz, G., & Buchegger, S. (2012). 'The devil is in the metadata – New privacy challenges in Decentralised Online Social Networks.' *2012 IEEE International Conference on Pervasive Computing and Communications Workshops*, 333–339, available at <<https://doi.org/10.1109/PerComW.2012.6197506>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Griffin, Rachel (2023) 'Rethinking rights in social media governance: human rights, ideology and inequality' *European Law Open* 2.1: 30-56.
- Griffin, Rachel (2023). 'The Law and Political Economy of Online Visibility: Market Justice in the Digital Services Act.' *Technology & Regulation*, 2023, 69-79. available at <<https://doi.org/10.26116/techreg.2023.007>> accessed 28 August 2024.
- Gutman, Kathleen (2019) 'The Essence of the Fundamental Right to an Effective Remedy and to a Fair Trial in the Case-Law of the Court of Justice of the European Union: The Best Is Yet to Come?' *German Law Journal* 20.6: 884-903.
- Haimson, Oliver L. et al. (2021) 'Disproportionate removals and differing content moderation experiences for conservative, transgender, and black social media users: Marginalization and moderation gray areas.' *Proceedings of the ACM on Human-Computer Interaction* 5.CSCW2: 1-35.
- Hakim, Neema (2020) 'How social media companies could be complicit in incitement to genocide.' *Chi. J. Int'l L.* 21: 83.
- Hare, Ivan & James Weinstein (2009), *Extreme Speech And Democracy*, Oxford University Press, 720.
- Heller, Brittan and Joris van Hoboken (2019) 'Freedom of Expression: A Comparative Summary of United States and European Law' *Transatlantic High Level Working*

- Group on Content Moderation Online and Freedom of Expression Working Paper*, SSRN 4563882 (2019).
- Hoecke, Mark Van (2015) *Methodology of Comparative Legal Research, Law and Method*, *Pravovedenie* (2013): 121.
- Hörnle, Julia (2021). *Internet jurisdiction law and practice*. Oxford University Press.
- Husovec, Martin (2024) 'Rising Above Liability: The Digital Services Act as a Blueprint for the Second Generation of Global Internet Rules.' *Berkeley Technology Law Journal* 38.3.
- Husovec, Martin and Irene Roche Laguna (2023) *Digital services act: A short primer*, Martin Husovec and Irene Roche Laguna, Principles of the Digital Services Act, Oxford University Press.
- Hutchinson, M. R. (1999) 'The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine in the European Court of Human Rights,' *The International and comparative law quarterly*, 48 (3), 638–650.
- Jacobs, James B. & Kimberly Potter (2001), *Hate Crimes: Criminal Law And Identity Politics*, Oxford University Press, 2000.
- Jägers, Nicola (2011) 'UN Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights: Making headway towards real corporate accountability?' 29(2) *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights* 159–163.
- Jeffrey, James (2020). 'The smart feature phone revolution in developing countries: Bringing the internet to the bottom of the pyramid.' *The Information Society*, 36(4), 226–235.
- Joseph, Sarah and Joanna Kyriakakis (2023) 'From soft law to hard law in business and human rights and the challenge of corporate power' 36(2) *Leiden Journal of International Law* 335.
- Kaye, David (2019) *Speech police: The global struggle to govern the Internet*, Columbia Global Reports, 144.
- Khosravi, Ooryad, S. (2023). 'Alt-right and authoritarian memetic alliances: global mediations of hate within the rising Farsi manosphere on Iranian social media.' *Media, Culture and Society* 45.3 (2023): 487-510.
- Klamberg, Mark, ed. (2017) *Commentary on the law of the International Criminal Court*. Vol. 29. Torkel Opsahl Academic EPublisher.
- Klonick, Kate (2017) 'The new governors: The people, rules, and processes governing online speech.' *Harv. L. Rev.* 131: 1598.
- Klonick, Kate (2019) 'The Facebook Oversight Board: Creating an independent institution to adjudicate online free expression.' *Yale LJ* 129: 2418.
- Koehler, Daniel (2022) 'From superiority to supremacy: Exploring the vulnerability of military and police special forces to extreme right radicalization' *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism*: 1-24.
- Kosinova, Darina S. and Arsenii V. Paliuk (2021) 'Prohibition of Discrimination: Concepts, Features and Obligations of the State according to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms'. *L. & Innovative Soc'y*, 99.
- Labey, Eline and Valentina Golunova (2022). 'Judges of Online Legality: Towards Effective User Redress in the Digital Environment' *In European Yearbook on Human Rights* (1 ed., pp. 105-135). Intersentia.

- Laidlaw, Emily B. (2012) The responsibilities of free speech regulators: an analysis of the Internet Watch Foundation, *International Journal of Law and Information Technology*.
- Lane, Lottie (2021) 'A Human Rights Responsibility Primer for Businesses Developing AI: Part 2', *Medium*, 14 September 2021.
- Lane, Lottie (2022) 'Clarifying Human Rights Standards through Artificial Intelligence Initiatives: A multi-level comparative analysis' *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 74(1) 16.
- Lane, Lottie (2023) 'Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights: Corporate responsibility in AI governance initiatives' *Nordic Journal of Human Rights*.
- Lane, Lottie (2023) 'Artificial Intelligence and Human Rights: Corporate Responsibility Under International Human Rights Law', in Aleš Završnik and Katja Simonè (eds), *Artificial Intelligence, Social Harms and Human Rights*. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2023. 183-205.
- Lane, Lottie (2023), 'Preventing long-term risks to human rights in smart cities: a critical review of responsibilities for private developers of AI', *Internet Policy Review* 12.1 (2023).
- Lawrence, Charles R. (1987), 'The Id, the Ego, and Equal Protection: Reckoning with Unconscious Racism,' 39 *STAN. L. REV.* 317, 201.
- Lawrence, Frederick M. (1994) 'The Punishment of Hate: Toward a Normative Theory of Bias-Motivated Crimes,' 93 *MICH. L. REV.* 320, 342-343.
- Lee, Diana (2017) 'Germany's NetzDG and the threat to online free speech.' *Yale Media Freedom & Information Access Clinic Case Disclosed Blog*, October 10, 2017, available at <<https://law.yale.edu/mfia/case-disclosed/germanys-netzdg-and-threat-online-free-speech>> accessed 13 January 2025.
- Leerssen, Paddy (2020) 'The soap box as a black box: Regulating transparency in social media recommender systems.' *European Journal of Law and Technology* 11.2.
- Leerssen, Paddy (2023) 'An End to Shadow Banning? Transparency rights in the Digital Services Act between content moderation and curation' *Computer Law & Security Review* 48: 105790.
- Liwanga, Roger-Claude (2015) 'The Meaning of Gross Violation of Human Rights: A Focus on International Tribunals' Decisions over the DRC Conflicts,' 44 *Denv. J. Int'l L. & Pol'y* 67.
- Llorens, A., Tzovara, A., Bellier, L., Bhaya-Grossman, I., Bidet-Caulet, A., Chang, W. K., ... & Dronkers, N. F. (2021). 'Gender bias in academia: A lifetime problem that needs solutions,' *Neuron*, 109(13), 2047-2074.
- Locke, John, James H. Tully, and James Tully. *A letter concerning toleration*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1983.
- Love, Heather, 'Queer.' *Transgender studies quarterly* Volume1, Numbers 1-2 (2014): 172-176.
- Luca, Michael (2015) 'User-generated content and social media' *Handbook of media Economics*. Vol. 1. North-Holland, 563-592.
- Ludovic, Terren and Rosa Borge-Bravo Rosa Borge-Bravo (2021) 'Echo chambers on social media: A systematic review of the literature.' *Review of Communication Research* 9.
- Macchi, Chiara and Claire Bright (2020) 'Hardening Soft Law: The Implementation of Human Rights Due Diligence Requirements in Domestic Legislation' in Martina

- Buscemi et al (eds) *Legal Sources in Business and Human Rights : Evolving Dynamics in International and European Law*, Brill 218.
- Machado, Caio CV and Thaís Helena Aguiar, (2023) 'Emerging Regulations on Content Moderation and Misinformation Policies of Online Media Platforms: Accommodating the Duty of Care into Intermediary Liability Models.' *Business and Human Rights Journal* 8.2: 244-251.
- Machado, CCV, Aguiar TH (2023), Emerging Regulations on Content Moderation and Misinformation Policies of Online Media Platforms: Accommodating the Duty of Care into Intermediary Liability Models. *Business and Human Rights Journal*, 8(2):244-251.
- Mackinnon, Catharine A. (1993), *Only Words*, Harvard University Press, 1993.
- Matamoros-Fernández, Ariadna (2017) 'Platformed racism: The mediation and circulation of an Australian race-based controversy on Twitter, Facebook and YouTube.' *Information, Communication & Society* 20.6: 930-946.
- Matamoros-Fernández, Ariadna and Johan Farkas (2021) 'Racism, hate speech, and social media: A systematic review and critique.' *Television & new media* 22.2: 205-224.
- Mathew, Binny, Ritam Dutt, Pawan Goyal, and Animesh Mukherjee (2019) 'Spread of Hate Speech in Online Media,' *Proceedings 10th ACM Conf. on Web Science*.
- Matsuda, Mari J (1989) 'Public Response to Racist Speech: Considering the Victim's Story' *87 Michigan Law Review* 2320, 2335.
- Matsuda, Mari J, Charles R. Lawrence III, Richard Delgado and Kimberle Williams Crenshaw (1993) *Words That Wound Critical Race Theory, Assaultive Speech, And The First Amendment*, Routledge 114.
- McConville, Mike (2007) (ed) *Research Methods for Law*, Edinburgh University Press, 2017
- McCorquodale, Robert and Justine Nolan (2021) 'The Effectiveness of Human Rights Due Diligence for Preventing Business Human Rights Abuses' *68 Netherlands International Law Review* 455.
- McCoy, Henrika (2020), 'Black Lives Matter, and Yes, You Are Racist: The Parallelism of the Twentieth and Twenty-First Centuries,' *37 CHILD ADOLESC. SOC. WORK J.* 463, 464.
- McGonagle, Tarlach (2011) 'Minority Rights, Freedom of Expression and of the Media: Dynamics and Dilemmas' *Human Rights Research Series*, Vol. 44. Cambridge: Intersentia, 2011.
- McGonagle, Tarlach (2019) 'The Council of Europe and Internet Intermediaries: A Case Study of Tentative Posturing', 232, in Rikke Frank Jørgensen (eds), *Human Rights in the Age of Platforms*, Cambridge, Massachusetts and London, England, The MIT Press, 2019, pp. 227-253.
- McGonagle, Tarlach (2020) 'Free expression and respect for others', in Yasha Lange, Ed., *Living Together: a handbook on Council of Europe standards on media's contribution to social cohesion, intercultural dialogue, understanding, tolerance and democratic participation* (Strasbourg, Council of Europe Publishing, 2009), pp. 7-20.
- McGonagle, Tarlach, 'The Council of Europe against online hate speech: Conundrums and challenges', Expert paper, doc.no. MCM 2013(005), *the Council of Europe Conference of Ministers responsible for Media and Information Society*, 'Freedom of

- Expression and Democracy in the Digital Age: Opportunities, Rights, Responsibilities*, Belgrade, 7-8 November 2013.
- Mill, John Stuart (1859) *On Liberty And Other Essays*, John Gray ed., Oxford Univ. Press 1998.
- Mondon, Aurelien and Aaron Winter (2020) *Reactionary democracy: How racism and the populist far right became mainstream*. Verso Books.
- Moore, Martin and Tambini Damian (eds), (2022) *Regulating Big Tech: Policy Responses to Digital Dominance*, Oxford University Press, 2022.
- Müller, Karsten & Carlo Schwarz (2021) 'Fanning the Flames of Hate: Social Media and Hate Crime,' 19 *Journal of the European Economic Association*, 2131.
- Murray, Andrew D. (2011) 'Nodes and gravity in Virtual Space,' 208, *Legisprudence* 5.2 (2011): 195-221.
- Myers West, S. (2018). 'Censored, suspended, shadow banned: User interpretations of content moderation on social media platforms.' *New Media & Society*, 20(11), 4366-4383.
- O'Brien, Claire Methven and Jaques Hartmann (2022) 'The European Commission's proposal for a Directive on corporate sustainability due diligence: two paradoxes', *EJIL: Talk! Blog of the European Journal of International Law*, 19 May, 2022, available at <<https://www.ejiltalk.org/the-european-commissions-proposal-for-a-directive-on-corporate-sustainability-due-diligence-two-paradoxes/>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- Parekh, Bhikhu (2012) 'Is There a Case for Banning Hate Speech?,' 37 – 56, in Michael Herz & Peter Molnar (eds.). *The Content And Context Of Hate Speech: Rethinking Regulation And Responses*, Cambridge University Press, 2012.
- Pasquale, Frank. (2015) *The black box society: The secret algorithms that control money and information*. Harvard University Press, 2015.
- Pentney, Katie (2021) 'Licensed to kill... discourse? Agents provocateurs and a purposive right to freedom of expression' *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights*, Vol. 39(3) 241-27.
- Piątek, Wojciech (2019) 'The right to an effective remedy in European law: significance, content and interaction' *China-EU Law Journal* 6.3-4: 163-174.
- Pollicino, Oreste & Gabriella Romeo (Eds.), (2016), *The internet and constitutional law?: the protection of fundamental rights and constitutional adjudication in Europe*. Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.
- Pollicino, Oreste (2021) *Judicial Protection of Fundamental Rights on the Internet: A Road Towards Digital Constitutionalism?* (1st ed.). Hart Publishing.
- Quattrocchi, Walter, Antonio Scala, and Cass R. Sunstein (2016) 'Echo chambers on Facebook.' Available at SSRN <<https://ssrn.com/abstract=2795110>> or <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2795110>> accessed 13 January 2025.
- Quintais, João Pedro, Naomi Appelman, and Ronan Ó. Fathaigh, (2023) 'Using terms and conditions to apply fundamental rights to content moderation' *German Law Journal* 24.5: 881-911.
- Rahalkar, Chaitanya, and Anushka Virgaonkar. "SoK: Content Moderation Schemes in End-to-End Encrypted Systems." *arXiv preprint arXiv:2208.11147* (2022).
- Rapp, Kyle (2021) 'Social media and genocide: The case for home state responsibility.' *Journal of Human Rights* 20.4: 486-502.
- Rawls, Anne Warfield & Waverly Duck (2020) *Tacit Racism*, The University of Chicago Press, 248.

- Robert C Clark (1981) 'The interdisciplinary study of legal evolution.' *The Yale Law Journal* 90.5: 1238-1274.
- Rosenfeld, Michel (2002) 'Hate Speech in Constitutional Jurisprudence: A Comparative Analysis', 24 *CARDOZO L. REV.* 1523, 1565.
- Rubin, Edward L (1997) 'Law and the Methodology of Law.' *Wis. L. Rev.*: 521.
- Scanlon, Thomas (1979) 'Freedom of Expression and Categories of Expression Principles of Expression and Restriction: A First Amendment Symposium,' 40 *U. PITT. L. REV.* 519, 527.
- Scanlon, Thomas (2018) 'A Framework for Thinking about Freedom of Speech and some of its Implications,' UC Berkeley Law, available at <<https://www.law.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/Freedom-of-Speech-Berkeley.pdf>> accessed 13 January 2025.
- Schauer, Frederick (1981) 'Categories and the First Amendment: A Play in Three Acts,' 34 *VAND. L. REV.* 265, 270.
- Scheffler, Sarah, and Jonathan Mayer (2023) 'Sok: Content moderation for end-to-end encryption.' *arXiv preprint arXiv:2303.03979*.
- Scheffler, Sarah, Anunay Kulshrestha, and Jonathan Mayer. 'Public verification for private hash matching.' *2023 IEEE Symposium on Security and Privacy (SP)*. IEEE, 2023.
- Siapera, Eugenia and Paloma Viejo-Otero (2021) 'Governing hate: Facebook and digital racism.' *Television & New Media* 22.2: 112-130.
- Spohr, Dominic (2017) 'Fake news and ideological polarization: Filter bubbles and selective exposure on social media.' *Business information review* 34.3: 150-160.
- Stefancic, Jean, and Richard Delgado, eds. (2000) *Critical race theory: The cutting edge*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 2000.
- Stoica, Victor (2021) *Remedies before the International Court of Justice*. Cambridge University Press, 2021.
- Suzor, Nicolas (2020) 'Understanding content moderation systems: new methods to understand internet governance at scale, over time, and across platforms.' In *Computational Legal Studies*, pp. 166-189. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Suzor, Nicolas P., Sarah Myers West, Andrew Quodling, and Jillian York. (2019) 'What do we mean when we talk about transparency? Toward meaningful transparency in commercial content moderation.' *International Journal of Communication* 13: 18.
- Taylor, Damon Henderson (1999) 'Civil Litigation against Hate Groups Hitting the Wallets of the Nation's Hate-Mongers' *Buff. Pub. Int. LJ* 18: 95.
- Terren, Ludovic Terren Ludovic, and Rosa Borge-Bravo Rosa Borge-Bravo (2021) 'Echo chambers on social media: A systematic review of the literature.' *Review of Communication Research* 9.
- Trengove, Markus et al. (2022) 'A critical review of the Online Safety Bill.' *Patterns* 3.8.
- Tulkens, Françoise (2012) 'When to say is to do: Freedom of expression and hate speech in the case-law of the European Court of Human Rights', European Court of Human Rights – European Judicial Training Network, *Seminar on Human Rights for European Judicial Trainers*, 7 July 2015.
- Turillazzi, Aina, Mariarosaria Taddeo, Luciano Floridi, and Federico Casolari. (2023) 'The digital services act: an analysis of its ethical, legal, and social implications.' *Law, Innovation and Technology* 15.1: 83-106.

- Tworek, Heidi, and Paddy Leerssen. 'An analysis of Germany's NetzDG law.' *First session of the Transatlantic High Level Working Group on Content Moderation Online and Freedom of Expression* (2019).
- Udupa, Sahana. 'Decoloniality and extreme speech.' *65th e-seminar, Media Anthropology Network, European Association of Social Anthropologists*. 2020.
- Viejo Otero, Paloma. *Governing hate: Facebook and hate speech*. Diss. Dublin City University, 2022.
- Waldron, Jeremy (2014) *The Harm In Hate Speech*, Harvard University Press.
- Webley, Lisa (2010) 'Qualitative approaches to empirical legal research', In Peter Cane & Herbert M. Kritzer (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of empirical legal research*. New York: Oxford University Press (2010).
- William E. Donald. (2024) 'Merit beyond metrics: Redefining the value of higher education. Industry and Higher Education; Robin Cowan, Moritz Müller, Alan Kirman, Helena Barnard, Overcoming a legacy of racial discrimination: competing policy goals in South African academia,' *Socio-Economic Review*, Volume 22, Issue 3, July 2024, Pages 1413–1449.
- Williams, M. T. (2019) 'Adverse racial climates in academia: Conceptualization, interventions, and call to action.' *New Ideas in Psychology*. 55:58–67.
- Witting, Sabine (2020). *Child sexual abuse in the digital era?: Rethinking legal frameworks and transnational law enforcement collaboration*, available at <<https://scholarlypublications.universiteitleiden.nl/access/item%3A2966707/view>> accessed 13 January 2025.
- Witting, Sabine and Mark Leiser (2023) 'Outcome Report of the 2nd Expert Workshop on EU proposed Regulation on Preventing and Combatting Child Sexual Abuse,' Leiden University, available at <<https://www.universiteitleiden.nl/binaries/content/assets/rechtsgeleerdheid/instituut-voor-metajuridica/final-eu-workshop-report-csa-proposal-2nd-workshop-05042023.pdf>> accessed 17 October 2023.
- Witting, Sabine and Mark Leiser (2023) 'Outcome Reports of the 1st expert Workshop on Eu proposed Regulation on Preventing and Combatting Child Sexual Abuse Council of Europe, available at <<https://rm.coe.int/outcome-report-of-the-expert-workshop-on-eu-proposed-regulation-on-pre/1680aa00e4>> accessed 17 October 2022.
- Witting, Sabine K. and Gianclaudio Malgieri (2023) 'Voluntary detection order under the proposed EU Child Sexual Abuse Regulation violate EU (privacy) law,' *European Law Blog*, available at <<https://europeanlawblog.eu/2023/05/15/voluntary-detection-orders-under-the-proposed-eu-child-sexual-abuse-regulation-violate-eu-privacy-law/>> accessed 28 Aug 2023.
- Wolfsfeld, Gadi, Elad Segev, and Tamir Sheafer (2013) 'Social media and the Arab Spring: Politics comes first' *Journal of Press/Politics* 18(2): 115-137.
- York, Jillian (2022) *Silicon values: The future of free speech under surveillance capitalism*. Verso Books.
- Young, Iris Marion (2011) *Justice And The Politics Of Difference*, Princeton University Press.
- Zuboff, Shoshana (2019) *Surveillance capitalism and the challenge of collective action*. New labor forum. Vol. 28. No. 1. Sage CA: Los Angeles, CA: SAGE Publications.

Non-Governmental Organizations Reports

- Amnesty International (2016), Encryption A Matter of Human Rights, available at <https://www.amnesty.nl/content/uploads/2016/03/160322_encryption_-_a_matter_of_human_rights_-_def.pdf> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Amnesty International (2017), Attacks on human rights activities reach crisis point globally, available at <<https://www.amnesty.nl/actueel/attacks-on-human-rights-activists-reach-crisis-point-globally>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Amnesty International (2022), 'Myanmar: The social atrocity : Meta and the right to remedy for the Rohingya', available at <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/ASA16/5933/2022/en/>> accessed 28 May 2024.
- Article 19 (2021), At a glance: Does the EU Digital Services Act protect freedom of expression, available at <<https://www.article19.org/resources/does-the-digital-services-act-protect-freedom-of-expression/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Article 19 (2021), Europe: Artificial Intelligence Act Must Protect Free Speech and Privacy, ARTICLE19, available at <<https://www.article19.org/resources/europe-artificial-intelligence-act-must-protect-freedom-of-expression-and-privacy/>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Business and Human Rights Resource Centre (2021), Syria: New report highlights the complicity of multinational tech companies in the regime's human rights violations, available at <<https://www.business-humanrights.org/en/latest-news/syria-new-report-highlights-the-complicity-of-multinational-tech-companies-in-the-regimes-human-rights-violations/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Business for Social Responsibility (2022), Human Rights Impact Assessment: Meta's Expansion of End-to-End Encryption, available at <<https://www.bsr.org/reports/bsr-meta-human-rights-impact-assessment-e2ee-report.pdf>> and available at <<https://www.bsr.org/en/reports/metas-expansion-end-to-end-encryption>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Center for Democracy & Technology (2021), Outside looking In – Approaches to Content Moderation in End-to-End Encrypted Systems, available at <<https://cdt.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/08/CDT-Outside-Looking-In-Approaches-to-Content-Moderation-in-End-to-End-Encrypted-Systems-updated-20220113.pdf>> accessed 21 Feb 2024.
- Digital Services Act Observatory (2023), 'The Out-of-court Settlement Mechanism under the DSA: Questions and Doubts, available at <<https://dsa-observatory.eu/2023/10/26/the-out-of-court-settlement-mechanism-under-the-dsa-questions-and-doubts/>> accessed 29 May 2024.
- European Digital Rights (EDRi) (2014), 'EU Parliament calls for ban of public facial recognition, but leaves human rights gaps in final position on AI Act' (14 June 2023) available at <<https://edri.org/our-work/eu-parliament-plenary-ban-of-public-facial-recognition-human-rights-gaps-ai-act/>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- European Digital Rights (EDRi) (2020), "French Avia law declared unconstitutional: what does this teach us at EU level?", available at <<https://edri.org/our-work/french-avia-law-declared-unconstitutional-what-does-this-teach-us-at-eu-level/>> accessed 18 November 2021.

- European Digital Rights (EDRi) (2021), 'How Europol's reform enables 'NSA-style surveillance operations', available at <<https://edri.org/our-work/how-europols-reform-enables-nsa-style-surveillance-operations/>> accessed 17 October 2023.
- European Digital Rights (EDRi) (2022), A safe internet for all, Upholding private and secure communication, available at <<https://edri.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/10/EDRi-Position-Paper-CSAR.pdf>> accessed 7 Sep 2023, 24 and 25.
- European Digital Rights (EDRi) (2023) Online Safety Bill insecure: international organisations, academics and cyber experts urge UK government to protect encrypted messaging, available at <<https://edri.org/our-work/online-safety-bill-insecure-international-organisations-academics-and-cyber-experts-urge-uk-government-to-protect-encrypted-messaging/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Human Rights Watch (2020) Big Tech's Heavy Hand Around the Globe, Facebook and Google's dominance of developing-world markets has had catastrophic effects. US regulators should take note, available at <<https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/09/08/big-techs-heavy-hand-around-globe>> accessed 28 August 2024.
- Human Rights Watch (2023) Meta's Broken Promises, Systematic Censorship of Palestine Content on Instagram and Facebook, available at <<https://www.hrw.org/report/2023/12/21/metas-broken-promises/systemic-censorship-palestine-content-instagram-and>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Tech against terrorism (2021) 'Terrorism use of E2EE: State of Play, Misconceptions, and Mitigation Strategies Report', available at <<https://www.techagainstterrorism.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/TAT-Terrorist-use-of-E2EE-and-mitigation-strategies-report.pdf>> accessed 28 Aug 2023, 42-56.
- Tech Against Terrorism (2021) Submission to the United Kingdom Draft Online Safety Bill Consultation, available at <<https://www.techagainstterrorism.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/09/Tech-Against-Terrorisms-Response-%E2%80%93-Joint-Committee-OSB-call-for-written-evidence.pdf>> accessed 10 April 2024.

News Articles

- ABC News (2023) Donal Trump Supporters embrace Signal, Telegram and other 'free speech' apps, available at <<https://www.abc.net.au/news/2021-01-20/donald-trump-social-media-apps-free-speech-privacy/13071206>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Al Jazeera (2024) 'The Listening Post: Genocide in Gaza: Enabled by AI, powered by Big Tech', available at <<https://www.aljazeera.com/program/the-listening-post/2024/4/13/genocide-in-gaza-enabled-by-ai-powered-by-big-tech>> accessed 30 May 2024.
- Al Jazeera (7 December 2021) 'Rohingya sue Facebook for \$150bn for fuelling Myanmar hate speech', available at <<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/12/7/rohingya-sue-facebook-for-150bn-for-fuelling-myanmar-hate-speech>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- Al Jazeera, (25 October 2021) 'Facebook failing to check hate speech, fake news in India: Report', available at <<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/10/25/facebook-india-hate-speech-misinformation-muslims-social-media>> accessed 6 April 2023.

- Al Khatib, Hadi and Dia Kayyali (The New York Times, 23 October 2019) 'YouTube Is Erasing History', available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/10/23/opinion/syria-youtube-content-moderation.html>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- Allenbach-Ammann, Janos (EURACTIV, 2023) EU Parliament and member states reach deal on corporate due diligence law, , available at <<https://www.euractiv.com/section/economy-jobs/news/eu-parliament-and-member-states-reach-deal-on-corporate-due-diligence-law/>> accessed 5 Feb 2024.
- Angwin, Julia and Hannes Grassegger (ProPublica, 2027) "Facebook's secret censorship rules protect white men from hate speech but not black children" available at <<https://www.propublica.org/article/facebook-hate-speech-censorship-internal-documents-algorithms>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Angwin, Julia, ProPublica & Hannes Grassegger, Facebook's Secret Censorship Rules Protect White Men From Hate
- Arampatzis, Anastasios (2023) Homomorphic Encryption: What Is It and How Is It Used, available at <<https://venafi.com/blog/homomorphic-encryption-what-it-and-how-it-used/>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Arango, Tim, Nicholas Bogel-Burroughs & Katie Benner, Minutes Before El Paso Killing, Hate Filled Manifesto Appears Online, N.Y. TIMES (Aug. 3, 2019), available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/08/03/us/patrick-crusius-el-paso-shooter-manifesto.html>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Asher-Schapiro, Avi & Ban Barkawi (Reuters, 2020) 'Lost Memories': War crimes evidence threatened by AI moderation, available at <<https://www.reuters.com/article/us-global-socialmedia-rights-trfn-idUSKBN23Q2TO>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Bertuzzi, Luca (2024) EU countries give crucial nod to first-of-a-kind Artificial Intelligence law, EURACTIV, available at <<https://www.euractiv.com/section/artificial-intelligence/news/eu-countries-give-crucial-nod-to-first-of-a-kind-artificial-intelligence-law/>> accessed 5 Feb 2024.
- Brodkin, Jon (2022) "War upon end-to-end encryption": EU wants Big tech to scan private messages, available at <<https://arstechnica.com/tech-policy/2022/05/war-upon-end-to-end-encryption-eu-wants-big-tech-to-scan-private-messages/>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Cranz, Alex and Russell Brandom (The Verge, 2021) 'Facebook encourages hate speech for profit, says whistleblower', available at <<https://www.theverge.com/2021/10/3/22707860/facebook-whistleblower-leaked-documents-files-regulation>> accessed 28 Aug 2023;
- Danao, Monique (Forbes, 2023) What can someone do with your IP address? available at <<https://www.forbes.com/advisor/business/what-can-someone-do-with-ip-address/#:~:text=IP%20addresses%20can%20be%20used,where%20your%20device%20is%20located.>> accessed 5 Feb 2024.
- Davies, CJ (The Wired, 2009) The hidden censors of the internet, available at <<https://www.wired.co.uk/article/the-hidden-censors-of-the-internet>> accessed 5 Feb 2024.
- Dearden, Lizzie (Independent, 2018) Gab: Inside the social network where alleged Pittsburgh synagogue shooter posted final message, available at <<https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/americas/pittsburgh-synagogue-shooter-gab-robert-bowers-final-posts-online-comments-a8605721.html>> accessed 10 April 2024.

- Dearden, Lizzie, (The Independent, 2018) 'Gab: Inside the Social Network Where Alleged Pittsburgh Synagogue Shooter Posted Final Message', (Oct. 28, 2018, 8:10 PM) available at <<https://www.independent.co.uk/tech/pittsburgh-synagogue-shooter-gab-robert-bowers-final-posts-online-comments-a8605721.html>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Debre, Isabel and Fares Akram (2021) 'Facebook's language gaps weaken screening of hate, terrorism', available at <https://apnews.com/article/the-facebook-papers-language-moderation-problems-392cb2d065f81980713f37384d07e61f?utm_campaign=SocialFlow&utm_source=Twitter&utm_medium=AP> accessed 28 May 2024.
- Elliot, Larry (The Guardian, 2024) 'Big tech firm recklessly pursuing profits from AI, says UN head', available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/business/2024/jan/17/big-tech-firms-ai-un-antonio-guterres-davos>> accessed 28 May 2024.
- Facebook's Secret Censorship Rules Protect White Men From Hate Speech But Not Black Children (2017) available at <<https://www.propublica.org/article/facebook-hate-speech-censorship-internal-documents-algorithms>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Farmer, Ashely D., Organization of American Historians, available at <<https://www.oah.org/tah/history-for-black-lives/tracking-activists-the-fbis-surveillance-of-black-women-activists-then-and-now/>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Foreign Policy (2021) Are Telegram and Signal Havens for Right-Wing Extremists? available at <https://foreignpolicy.com/2021/03/13/telegram-signal-apps-right-wing-extremism-islamic-state-terrorism-violence-europol-encrypted/#cookie_message_anchor> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Fornetix (2022) End-to-End Social Media Encryption Strategies, available at <<https://www.fornetix.com/articles/end-to-end-encryption-strategies-becoming-the-norm-for-social-media/>> accessed 7 Sep 2023;
- Ganster, Allyson M 'Black women and digital resistance: The impact of social media on racial justice activism in Brazil and the United States' Diss. 2019, available at <<https://repositories.lib.utexas.edu/items/45168a42-b43d-47ea-800f-24cd7d2d04cc>> accessed 28 May 2024.
- Giansiracusa, Noah (Wired, 2021) 'Facebook Uses Deceptive Match to Hide its Hate Speech Problem', available at <<https://www.wired.com/story/facebooks-deceptive-match-when-it-comes-to-hate-speech/>> accessed 17 October 2023.
- Hao, Karen (MIT Technology Review, 2020) Artificial Intelligence, We read the paper that forced Timnit Gebru out of Google. Here's what it says, available at <<https://www.technologyreview.com/2020/12/04/1013294/google-ai-ethics-research-paper-forced-out-timnit-gebru/>> accessed 26 August 2024.
- Hao, Karen (MIT Technology Review, 2020) We read the paper that forced Timnit Gebru out of Google. Here's what it says. available at <<https://www.technologyreview.com/2020/12/04/1013294/google-ai-ethics-research-paper-forced-out-timnit-gebru/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Hao, Karen (MIT Technology Review, 2021) 'The Facebook whistleblower says its algorithms are dangerous. Here's why.', available at <<https://www.technologyreview.com/2021/10/05/1036519/facebook-whistleblower-frances-haugen-algorithms/>> accessed 28 Aug 2023
- Harper, Shaun (Forbes, 31 October 2022) 'Hate Speech Rises On Twitter After Elon Musk Takes Over, Researchers Find', available at <<https://www.forbes.com/sites/>>

- shaunharper/2022/10/31/elon-musk-twitter-takeover-leads-to-n-word-and-hate-speech-increase-lebron-james-calls-for-action/?sh=f28a381dd99a> accessed 6 April 2023.
- Kanu, Hassan (Reuters, 2022) Prevalence of white supremacists in law enforcement demands drastic change, available at <<https://www.reuters.com/legal/government/prevalence-white-supremacists-law-enforcement-demands-drastic-change-2022-05-12/>> accessed 7 Feb 2024.
- Kleinman, Zoe and Tom Gerken (2023) Twitter launches encrypted private messages, says Elon Musk, available at <<https://www.bbc.com/news/technology-65533021>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Koomen, Maria (Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 2021) 'The Encryption Debate in the European Union: 2021 Update', available at <<https://carnegieendowment.org/2021/03/31/encryption-debate-in-european-union-2021-update-pub-84217>> accessed 28 Aug 2023.
- Layug, Alyan, et al. 'The impacts of social media use and online racial discrimination on Asian American mental health: cross-sectional survey in the United States during COVID-19.' JMIR formative research 6.9 (2022): e38589 available at <<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC9488547/>> accessed 28 May 2024.
- Lunden, Ingrid (2020) Facebook adds hosting, shopping features and pricing tiers to WhatsApp Business, available at <<https://rb.gy/2sj7p>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Lutkevich, Ben and Madelyn Bacon (2021) Definition end-to-end encryption (E2EE) available at <<https://www.techtarget.com/searchsecurity/definition/end-to-end-encryption-E2EE>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Medianama, Sarvesh Methi (2022) "How end-to-end encryption impact human rights? The Good and the Bad" available at <<https://www.medianama.com/2022/04/223-end-to-end-encryption-human-rights-impact/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- O'Flaherty, Kate (Wired, 2018) YouTube Keep deleting evidence of Syrian chemical weapon attacks, available at <<https://www.wired.co.uk/article/chemical-weapons-in-syria-youtube-algorithm-delete-video>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- OT, Anina (2021) What Apps Use End-to-End Encryption to Improve Online Privacy, available at <<https://www.makeuseof.com/apps-use-end-to-end-encryption/>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Prakken d'Oliveira (2018) European Court: Decisions Placing the PKK on the List of Terrorist Organizations Annulled, Prakken d'Oliveira (Nov. 15, 2018) available at <<https://www.prakkendoliveira.nl/en/news/2018/european-court-decisions-placing-the-pkk-on-the-list-of-terrorist-organizations-annulled>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Purnell, Newley and Jeff Horwitz, 'Facebook Services Are Used to Spread Religious Hatred in India, Internal Documents.
- Rachwani, Motafa and Christopher Knaus (The Guardian, 2023) Videos urged counter-protesters to attack LGBTQ+ activists outside Sydney church, available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2023/mar/22/videos-urged-counter-protesters-to-attack-lgbtq-activists-outside-sydney-church>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Ray, Siladitya (2023) Encrypted Messaging, 2-Hour Videos: Here Are the Moves Twitter Has Made in Its Bid To Become an 'Everything' App, available at <<https://www.forbes.com/sites/siladityaray/2023/05/26/encrypted-messaging-2-hour->

- videos-here-are-the-moves-twitter-has-made-in-its-bid-to-become-an-everything-app/> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Robertson, Adi (the Verge, 2021) 'Apple's controversial new child protection features, explained', available at <<https://www.theverge.com/2021/8/10/22613225/apple-csam-scanning-messages-child-safety-features-privacy-controversy-explained>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Safi, Michael (The Guardian, 2018) Sri Lanka accuses Facebook over hate speech after deadly riots, available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/mar/14/facebook-accused-by-sri-lanka-of-failing-to-control-hate-speech>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Safi, Michael, Sri Lanka Accuses Facebook Over Hate Speech After Deadly Riots, (Guardian, 2018), available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/mar/14/facebook-accused-by-sri-lanka-of-failing-to-control-hate-speech>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Show' (The Wall Street Journal, 2021) available at <https://www.wsj.com/articles/facebook-services-are-used-to-spread-religious-hatred-in-india-internal-documents-show-11635016354?mod=article_inline> accessed 28 Aug 2023.
- Smith, Ashel (Bits of Freedom, 2022) European Commission wants to eliminate online confidentiality, available at <<https://www.bitsoffreedom.nl/2022/05/11/european-commission-wants-to-eliminate-online-confidentiality/>> accessed 7 Sep 2023;
- Spadafora, Anthony (2023) The best encrypted messaging apps in 2023 available at <<https://www.tomsguide.com/reference/best-encrypted-messaging-apps>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Speech But Not Black Children, (PROPUBLICA, 2017), available at <<https://www.propublica.org/article/facebook-hate-speech-censorship-internal-documents-algorithms>> accessed 21 Feb 2024.
- Stevenson, Alexandra (New York Times, 2018), 'Facebook Admits It Was Used to Incite Violence in Myanmar', available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/2018/11/06/technology/myanmar-facebook.html>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- Sumner, A. et al. (Jama Network Open, 2021) Association of Online Risk Factors with Subsequent Youth Suicide-Related Behaviors in the US, available at <<https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamanetworkopen/fullarticle/2784337Steven>> accessed 29 August 2024.
- The New York Times (2018) Facebooks admits it was used to incite violence in Myanmar, available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/2018/11/06/technology/myanmar-facebook.html>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- The New York Times (2019) Minutes before El Paso killing, hate filled manifesto appears online, available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/2019/08/03/us/patrick-crusius-el-paso-shooter-manifesto.html?action=click&module=Spotlight&pgtype=Homepage>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- The New York Times (2022), Using the Word 'Queer' Instead of 'Gay', available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/2022/11/13/opinion/letters/lgbt-gay-queer.html>> accessed 22 November 2024.
- The New York Times, What Does Facebook Consider Hate Speech? Take Our Quiz (2017) available at <<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2017/10/13/technology/facebook-hate-speech-quiz.html>> accessed 29 August 2024.

- The Wall Street Journal (2020) 'Facebook Executives Shut Down Efforts to Make the Site Less Divisive', available at <[wsj.com/articles/facebook-knows-it-encourages-division-top-executives-nixed-solutions-11590507499](https://www.wsj.com/articles/facebook-knows-it-encourages-division-top-executives-nixed-solutions-11590507499)> accessed 28 May 2024.
- The Wall Street Journal (2021) The Facebook Papers, available at <<https://facebookpapers.com/outlet/wall-street-journal/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- UCD Centre for Digital Policy, available at <<https://digitalpolicy.ie/explainer-irelandsonline-safety-and-media-regulation-bill/>> accessed 18 November 2021.
- Vincent, James (The Verge, 2022), New EU rules would require chat apps to scan private message for child abuse, available at <<https://www.theverge.com/2022/5/11/23066683/eu-child-abuse-grooming-scanning-messaging-apps-break-encryption-fears?scrolla=5eb6d68b7fedc32c19ef33b4>> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Weprin, Alex (The Hollywood Reporter, February 2022) 'YouTube Ad Revenue Tops \$8.6B, Beating Netflix in the Quarter', available at <<https://www.hollywoodreporter.com/business/digital/youtube-ad-revenue-tops-8-6b-beating-netflix-in-the-quarter-1235085391/>> accessed 6 April 2023.
- Whitney, Lance (2023) "Twitter rolls out encryption for direct messages but with key limitations" available at <<https://www.zdnet.com/article/twitter-rolls-out-encryption-for-direct-messages-but-with-key-limitations/>> accessed 10 April 2024.
- Wikipedia, FBI requested backdoors to Apple's iPhone software, available at <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/End-to-end_encryption#Backdoors> accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Williams, Adrienne, Milagros Miceli and Timnit Gebru 'The Exploited Labor Behind Artificial Intelligence' (2022) available at <<https://www.noemamag.com/the-exploited-labor-behind-artificial-intelligence/>> accessed 28 May 2024.
- Zenger, Rejo (Bits of Freedom, 2022) This might sound attention-seeking, but we really believe to be not far off the mark. It really looks like the European Commission wants to cancel encryption, available at <<https://www.bitsoffreedom.nl/2022/05/11/european-commission-wants-to-eliminate-online-confidentiality/>> accessed 28 August 2024.

Other Web Resources

- Content Policy, Reddit, available at <<https://www.redditinc.com/policies/content-policy#:~:Text=Abide%20by%20community%20rules.,With%20or%20Disrupt%20Reddit%20communities.&Text=Respect%20the%20privacy%20of%20others>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Daniel Ruby, '55+ Facebook Statistics For 2023 (Users, Revenue & Trends)' (Demand Sage, 10 February 2023) available at <<https://www.demandsage.com/facebook-statistics/>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Emily R (2022) Top 7 Most Secure Video Calling Apps, available at <<https://getstream.io/blog/safest-video-calling-apps/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Facebook Community Standards Hate Speech (2023) available at <<https://transparency.fb.com/Pt-Pt/Policies/Community-Standards/Hate-Speech/>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Facebook Help Center, What End-To-End Encryption On Messenger Means And How It Works, available at <https://www.facebook.com/help/messenger-app/786613221989782?Cms_Id=786613221989782> Accessed 21 February 2024.

- Facebook Help Centre, available at <https://www.facebook.com/help/messenger-app/786613221989782?cms_id=786613221989782> Accessed 28 Aug 2023.
- Google, 'Featured Policies: Hate Speech' (2023) available at <<https://transparencyreport.google.com/youtube-policy/featured-policies/hate-speech?hl=en>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- How Meta Enforces Its Policies (2022) available at <<https://transparency.fb.com/en-gb/enforcement/>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- How Meta Prioritises Content For Review (2022) available at <<https://transparency.fb.com/policies/improving/prioritizing-content-review/>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Idowu Omisola (2023) WhatsApp Community Vs. WhatsApp Group: What's The Difference? available at <<https://www.makeuseof.com/whatsapp-community-vs-whatsapp-group-difference/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Instagram Help Centre (2023) How Do I Start An End-To-End Encrypted Chat On Instagram, available at <https://help.instagram.com/1165835007222763/?helpref=related_articles> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Janice Asare, 'Are Marginalized Communities Being Censored Online' (2020) Forbes, available at <<https://www.forbes.com/sites/janicegassam/2020/05/24/are-marginalized-communities-being-censored-online/>> Accessed 28 May 2024.
- Jim Waterson & Dan Milmo, Facebook Whistleblower Frances Haugen Calls For Urgent External Regulation, Guardian, available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2021/oct/25/facebook-whistleblower-frances-haugen-calls-for-urgent-external-regulation>> accessed 28 November 2024.
- Jim Waterson And Dan Milmo, Facebook Whistleblower Frances Haugen Calls For Urgent External Regulation (Oct. 25, 2021) available at <<https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2021/oct/25/facebook-whistleblower-frances-haugen-calls-for-urgent-external-regulation>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- LinkedIn, Help "'Hateful And Derogatory Content'" available at <<https://www.linkedin.com/help/linkedin/answer/a1339812>> Accessed 11 August 2024.
- Mansoor Iqbal (2023) Facebook Revenue And Usage Statistics, available at <<https://www.businessofapps.com/data/facebook-statistics/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Mansoor Iqbal (2023) Telegram Revenue And Usage Statistics, available at <<https://www.businessofapps.com/data/telegram-statistics/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Mansoor Iqbal (2023) WhatsApp Revenue And Usage Statistics, available at <<https://www.businessofapps.com/data/whatsapp-statistics/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Mansoor Iqbal, 'Twitter Revenue And Usage Statistics (2023)' (Business Of Apps, 21 January 2023) available at <<https://www.businessofapps.com/data/twitter-statistics/>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Meta (2019) Detecting Non-Consensual Intimate Images And Supporting Victims, available at <<https://about.fb.com/news/2019/03/detecting-non-consensual-intimate-images/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Meta (2023) Messenger End-To-End Encryption Overview, available at <https://engineering.fb.com/wp-content/uploads/2023/12/messengerend-to-end-encryption-overview_12-6-2023.pdf> Accessed 10 April 2024.

- Meta, Transparency Center “Hate Speech” available at <<https://Transparency.Meta.Com/En-Gb/Policies/Community-Standards/Hate-Speech/>> Accessed 11 August 2024.
- Musically, ‘Youtube, Meta, Twitter And Spotify (Sort Of) Reveal Their EU User Figures’ (2023) available at <<https://Musically.Com/2023/02/20/Youtube-Meta-Twitter-And-Spotify-Sort-Of-Reveal-Their-Eu-User-Figures/>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Number Of Internet And Social Media Users Worldwide As Of January 2023 (2023) available at <<https://Www.Statista.Com/Statistics/617136/Digital-Population-Worldwide/>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Policies And Reporting Legal Removal Request, What Types Of Things Aren’t Allowed On Facebook? (2023) available at <<https://Www.Facebook.Com/Help/212826392083694>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Professional Community Policies, LinkedIn, available at <<https://Www.Linkedin.Com/Legal/Professional-Community-Policies>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- Signal Support, available at <<https://Support.Signal.Org/Hc/En-Us/Articles/360007320391-Is-It-Private-Can-I-Trust-It>> Accessed 10 April 2024.
- Signal Support, Group Chats, available at <<https://Support.Signal.Org/Hc/En-Us/Articles/360007319331-Group-Chats#:~:Text=Admin%20controls%20of%20who%20can%20send%20messages%20and%20start%20calls,Size%20limit%20of%201000>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Similarweb, Top Websites Ranking (2023) available at <<https://Www.Similarweb.Com/Top-Websites/>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Snow, D. Della Porta, D., Klandermans, B. And Mcadam, D. (Eds.) Encyclopedia Of Social And Political Movements, Agents Provocateurs As A Type Of Faux Activist, available at <<https://Web.Mit.Edu/Gtmarx/Www/Agentsprovocateursfaux.Html>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- Statista, ‘Facebook Monthly Active Users (MAU) In Europe As Of 4th Quarter 2022’ (2023) available at <<https://Www.Statista.Com/Statistics/745400/Facebook-Europe-Mau-By-Quarter/>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Statista, ‘Most Popular Social Networks Worldwide As Of January 2023, Ranked By Number Of Monthly Active Users’ (2023) available at <<https://Www.Statista.Com/Statistics/272014/Global-Social-Networks-Ranked-By-Number-Of-Users/>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Statistica (2024), Worldwide Digital Population, available at <<https://Www.Statista.Com/Statistics/617136/Digital-Population-Worldwide/#:~:Text=Worldwide%20digital%20population%202024&Text=As%20of%20January%202024%2C%20there,Population%2C%20were%20social%20media%20users>> Accessed 10 April 2024.
- Statistica, Social Media – Statistics And Facts, available at <<https://Www.Statista.Com/Topics/1164/Social-Networks/#Topicoverview>> Accessed 21 Feb 2024.
- Telegram FAQ, available at <<https://Telegram.Org/Faq#Secret-Chats>> Accessed 10 April 2024.
- Telegram Group Chats On Telegram, available at <<https://Telegram.Org/Faq#:~:Text=With%20Telegram%2C%20you%20can%20send,For%20broadcasting%20to%20unlimited%20audiences>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.

- Timothy Buck (2022) Update To End-To-End Encrypted Chats On Messenger, available at <<https://about.fb.com/news/2022/01/updates-to-end-to-end-encrypted-chats-messenger/>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- TRT World, 'Activists Accuse YouTube Of Destroying Digital Evidence Of Syria War' (2021) available at <<https://www.trtworld.com/life/activists-accuse-youtube-of-destroying-digital-evidence-of-syria-war-44809>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Twitter Help Center, 'Hateful Conduct' (2023) available at <<https://help.twitter.com/en/rules-and-policies/hateful-conduct-policy>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- Twitter Help Center, 'Our Range Of Enforcement Options' (2023) available at <<https://help.twitter.com/en/rules-and-policies/enforcement-options>> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- WhatsApp Help Center – How WhatsApp Helps Fight Child Exploitation. available at <<https://faq.whatsapp.com/general/how-whatsapp-helps-fight-child-exploitation/?lang=en>> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- WhatsApp Help Center, About End-To-End Encryption, available at <https://faq.whatsapp.com/820124435853543?locale=en_US&cms_id=820124435853543&draft=false> Accessed 10 April 2024.
- WhatsApp Help Center, How To Add And Remove Group Participants, available at <https://faq.whatsapp.com/841426356990637?locale=en_US&cms_platform=web&cms_id=841426356990637&draft=false> Accessed 7 Sep 2023.
- WhatsApp Terms Of Service, WhatsApp, available at <<https://www.whatsapp.com/legal/terms-of-service/?lang=en>> Accessed 29 August 2024.
- X, Help Center "Hateful Conduct" available at <<https://help.x.com/en/rules-and-policies/hateful-conduct-policy>> Accessed 11 August 2024.
- YouTube Help, 'Reporting And Enforcement' (2023) available at <https://support.google.com/youtube/topic/2803138?hl=en&ref_topic=6151248> Accessed 6 April 2023.
- YouTube, 'Hate Speech Policy' (2023) available at <<https://support.google.com/youtube/answer/2801939?hl=en>> Accessed 6 April 2023;
- YouTube, 'How Does YouTube Protect The Community From Hate And Harassment?' (2023) available at <https://www.youtube.com/intl/ALL_Ca/howyoutube-works/our-commitments/standing-up-to-hate/> Accessed 6 April 2023.

Audio Resources

- Podcast series by Katie Pentney "Decoding Hate," Episode 2 "The Hate You Tweet" with Tarlach McGonagle, 10 February 2021, funded by OSCE Representative on Freedom of the Media, #SAIFE project, available at <<https://www.decodinghatepod.com/episodes/episode-05-the-anywhere-workout-lhgdz-D0JBu>> accessed 10 April 2024.

List of publications and talks

PH.D. PUBLICATIONS

- 1 Nave E. (2023), Hate speech, historical oppressions, and European human rights, *Buffalo Human Rights Law Review* 29 (2022/2023): 83-145, <https://digitalcommons.law.buffalo.edu/bhrlr/vol29/iss1/3/>.
- 2 Nave E. and Lane L. (2023), Countering online hate speech: how does human rights due diligence impact terms of service?, *Computer Law and Security Review* 51: 105884, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clsr.2023.105884>.
-- Nave E. and Lane L. (2024) Governing hate speech detection on online platforms: A human rights approach. *International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence 2024 Workshop on AI Governance: Alignment, Morality, and Law*.
- 3 Nave E., Raaijmakers S., and Veugen T (2024) Disrupting violence while preserving encryption: A human rights approach, *Technology and Regulation 2024* (2024): 115-131, <https://doi.org/10.26116/techreg.2024.012>.
- 4 Nave E. (under review, 2024) Criminal hate speech attributable to online platforms – a call for a thorough corporate remedial responsibilities framework in Europe.

OTHER SELECTED PUBLICATIONS

- Tan, Y., Nave, E., Vandebosch, H., Pabian, S., Poels, K. (2023) Methods for reporting online sexual harassment (NETHATE report), <https://doi.org/10.31235/osf.io/p92t4>.
- Nave, E. (2019) The Importance of the Arms Trade Treaty for the Implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals. *Journal of Conflict and Security Law*, 24(2), 297-324 (Oxford Press): <https://doi.org/10.1093/jcsl/krz010>.
- Brown, M., Burkard, C., Jeangeorge, A., Nave, E. (2017) Computer Modelling in Collateral Damage Estimates and Choice of Weapons in Iraq. ICRC International Humanitarian Law in Action: respect for the law on the battlefield, supervised by Heinsch, R.W., Pouloupoulou, S., and Tremblay, C; 6 other co-authored case-studies of Colombia, Eritrea/Ethiopia, Iraq and Peru: <https://ihl-in-action.icrc.org/>.
- Nave, E. (2016) Can drones comply with the IHL targeting framework? Critique about drones and compliance with the principle of distinction, Research

paper, *Privatissimum* in Contemporary Issues in International Humanitarian Law.

Nave, E. (2016) What would I do if I was Abbas, Netanyahu or myself to improve the peace process between the Israeli and the Palestinians? Youth Peace Initiative International Essay Competition (awarded 2nd prize).

Nave, E. (2010) European Citizenship, a sovereignties' monologue?, Research paper for the European Union Law course, available at the NOVA Law School online repository (best class paper).

SELECTED TALKS RESULTING FROM THE PH.D. RESEARCH

Invited speaker at the International Network for Hate Studies, 2024 Biennial Conference, NETHATE panel "Understanding Online Hate" (25-27/11/2024).

Guest lecture titled "Hate speech, human rights and content moderation", 2 hours guest lecture for the Pre-University College course on Law and Technology, eLaw – Center for Law and Digital Technologies, Leiden University (Leiden, The Netherlands, 26/02/2024 and 15/02/2023).

Invited talk titled "Countering online hate speech: How does human rights due diligence impact terms of service?", European seminar series on Legal Issues Arising from Networks, <https://www.lians-seminar.com/speakers>, joint work with Dr. Lottie Lane (online, 18/10/2023).

Speaker in the panel titled "Content moderation at the infrastructure level and its impact on business and human rights", organized by ARTICLE 19 at the RightsCon 2023 Edition (online, 07/06/2023).

Guest lecture "Hate speech, human rights and content moderation", 2 hours, Fundamental Rights course, Bachelor's Programme Social Sciences for Globalization, UNIMI, Italy (online, 09/05/2023).

Invited talk titled "Hate speech, historical oppressions, and European human rights", "International Seminar Hate Speech: How to Counteract?", University of Azores, Portugal (online, 04/05/2023).

Invited talk titled "Countering online hate speech: How does human rights due diligence impact terms of service?", Laboratori itineranti di Diritto internazionale, UNIMI (Milan, Italy, 13/04/2023).

Invited talk titled "Countering online hate speech in Europe through enhanced human rights due diligence responsibilities in the drafting of terms of service", "Digital Legal Talks 2022 Conference", joint work with Dr. Lottie Lane (Utrecht, The Netherlands, 24/11/2022).

Speaker/ participant in the International Workshop "Hate Speech – an Interdisciplinary Approach", organized by the Minerva Center for the Rule of Law under Extreme Conditions at the University of Haifa in collaboration with Freie Universität Berlin and Technische Universität Berlin (online, 17-19/01/2022).

- Speaker/ participant in the Workshop: “Method, methodology and critique in international law” (online, 15-18 December 2021).
- Invited speaker in the Podcast series “Integrated Projects” created by students at the Leiden University’s Security Studies Bachelor’s degree, episode on “Hate speech, cyberbullying and doxing” (online, 2021).
- Invited talk titled “Countering online hate speech – how to effectively protect fundamental rights?”, Annual Conference of the research programme “Effective Protection of Fundamental Rights in a pluralist world”, edition titled “Legal regimes and social divides – radicalization, discrimination and exclusion” (online, 2021).
- Invited speaker in the Fourth Annual Netherlands Network for Human Rights Research (NNHRR) Conferences “Human Rights and Vulnerability”, participation in the panel on “Vulnerability and Human Rights in the Digital Age” convened by the Human Rights in the Digital Age Working Group (online, 2021).

Curriculum vitae

Eva Nave was born in Guarda, Portugal, in 1991. Eva holds a LL.B. in Law at the Nova University of Lisbon, with one semester completed at LMU Munich, a Postgraduation in Human Rights at the Coimbra University, and a LL.M. in Public International Law at the Leiden University. During her LL.M., she was part of the International Humanitarian Law Clinic where she integrated as junior researcher an international team working for the International Committee of the Red Cross.

Since 2021, Eva is a PhD candidate at eLaw – Center for Law and Digital Technologies, Leiden University and Marie Curie Fellow with the Marie Skłodowska-Curie Actions Innovative Training Network project titled Network of Excellence for Training on Hate (NETHATE). Her research focuses on countering hate speech through enhanced corporate human rights due diligence for online platforms and, in 2024, Eva was awarded the Leiden University prize of best 2022-2023 Ph.D. paper on human rights. During her Ph.D., Eva was a visiting researcher at the University of Queensland (05-06/24), under the mentorship of Professor Katharine Gelber, and at the University of Milan UNIMI (03-04/23), and a seconded Researcher at TNO Netherlands Organization for Applied Scientific Research (10/22-01/23). From June 2024 to April 2025, Eva was also an Advisor to the Portuguese Secretary of State for Science, on legal and policy matters related to human rights, public administration for science, and law and technology.

Before joining eLaw, Eva worked for four years with the United Nations Mine Action Service, where she contributed with legal research, policy and project advice on weapons control and conflict prevention in Mali, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Uganda and Colombia. Prior to that, she worked for two years in the human rights field both with non-governmental organizations (Amnesty International, the Portuguese Refugee Council and the Portuguese Association for Victims Support) and with governmental bodies (the Boston Mayor's Office for Immigrants Advancement). Eva was also a trainee at the Secretariat for the Committee on Constitutional Affairs at the European Parliament.

In the range of books published by the Meijers Research Institute and Graduate School of Leiden Law School, Leiden University, the following titles were published in 2024-2025:

- MI-414 E. Hutten, *Belastingprofessionals onder maatschappelijke druk. Een Nederlandse casestudie naar reacties op BEPS*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-415 R. Stolk, *Procederende belangenorganisatie in de polder. Een interdisciplinair perspectief op de toegang tot de rechter*, (diss. Leiden), Zutphen: Uitgeverij Paris 2024
- MI-416 A. Sarris, *International law and governance of the Arctic in an era of climate change*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024, ISBN 978 94 6473 382 2
- MI-417 F. Heitmüller, *Combatting tax avoidance, the OECD way? The impact of the BEPS Project on developing and emerging countries' approach to international tax avoidance*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-418 F.I. Kartikasari, *Mining and environmental protection in Indonesia: Regulatory pitfalls*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024, ISBN 978 94 6473 462 1
- MI-419 S.H. Starrenburg, *Striking a balance between local and global interests. Communities and cultural heritage protection in public international law*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-420 D. Stefoudi, *Legal and policy aspects of space big data. Legal implications of the use of large amounts of space data – Regulatory solutions and policy recommendations* (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024, ISBN 978 94 6473 479 9
- MI-421 S. Pouloupoulou, *Towards the establishment of a new International Humanitarian Law compliance mechanism. Lessons learned from monitoring systems within the International Humanitarian and Human Rights Law frameworks*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-422 M. Aalbers, *De werking van algemene belangenafwegingen in het Europese staatssteunrecht. Tussen verbod en verenigbaarheid?*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-423 J.M. Elbers, *Reward Systems in Prison*, (diss. Leiden), Alblasterdam: Ridderprint 2024
- MI-424 Z. Tian, *Legal Aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR): Regulation of ADR under International Space Law and the Way Forward for Legal Development*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-425 J.P. Cnossen, *Wisselwerking tussen gemeen en bijzonder materieel strafrecht. Een analyse en waardering in het licht van de beginselen van codificatie, schuld en legaliteit*, (diss. Leiden), Den Haag: Boom juridisch 2024, ISBN 978 94 6212 967 2, ISBN 978 94 0011 466 1 (e-book)
- MI-426 L.B. Louis, *Towards Better Policing. Achieving Norm Internalization and Compliance with Persuasively Designed Technology*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024, ISBN 978 94 6473 559 8
- MI-427 J.P. Loof & R.A. Lawson (red.), *Diverse mensen en gelijke rechten anno 2024. Essays ter gelegenheid van het emeritaat van prof. Titia Loenen als hoogleraar Mensenrechten en diversiteit*, Leiden: Stichting NJCM-Boekerij 2024, ISBN 978 90 6750 070 8
- MI-428 Y. Shi, *Labour Regulation of International Aviation. A Crawl-Walk-Run Approach in International Law*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024, ISBN 978 94 6473 588 8
- MI-429 I.S. Ouweland, *Toetsing van deskundigenadviezen door de bestuursrechter*, (diss. Leiden), Zutphen: Uitgeverij Paris 2024, ISBN 978 94 6251 362 4
- MI-430 P.L. Koopmans, *Essays on the Economics of Household Finance and Social Insurance*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-431 N.U. van Capelleveen, *Radicalisering bij minderjarigen en overheidsingrijpen. Over de interactie van rechtsgebieden en een kinder- en mensenrechtenconforme inzet van juridische instrumenten*, (diss. Leiden), Den Haag: Boom 2024, ISBN 978 94 6212 009 9, ISBN 978 94 0011 504 0 (e-book)
- MI-432 A.B. Muñoz Mosquera, *The North Atlantic Treaty Organization. An International Institutional Law Perspective*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2024
- MI-433 S. Vandenbroucke, *Navigating Corporate Responsibility in Global Supply Chains using Codes of Conduct*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025

- MI-434 B.N. van Ganzen, *Dynamism and Democracy. Essays on the Fiscal Social Contract in a Globalised World*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-435 M. Michels, *Meerouderschap en het erfrecht. Een onderzoek naar de erfrechtelijke positie van het kind en zijn ouders in een intentioneel meeroudergezin*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-436 D.K. Jongkind, *Netwerksubsidies. Een onderzoek naar de wijze waarop samenwerking in subsidierelaties binnen het bestuursrecht kan worden vormgegeven*, (diss. Leiden), Deventer: Kluwer 2025, ISBN 978 90 1318 051 0
- MI-437 G. Boffi, *Socio-Economic Integration and Social Citizenship of Migrants: Empirical Analyses*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-438 A. Kaviani Johnson, *From concept to application: A critical reflection on child safeguarding from a children's rights perspective*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025 ISBN 978 94 6473 734 9
- MI-439 J. Choi, *Criminal Liability of Pilots in Aviation Accident Cases*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-440 K. Sharma, *The Assembly of States Parties to the International Criminal Court – A Good Governance Approach*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-441 B. Budinská, *The European Central Bank's centralised application of national law under the Single Supervisory Mechanism. A rule of law analysis*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-442 H. Bliersbach, *Becoming and Belonging? Lived Experiences of Naturalization and Implementation of Citizenship Law in Germany and Canada*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-443 D.P.L. van Thiel, *Fundamental Labour Standards and the Shift from International to Transnational Labour Law. Countervailing Power in the Globalised World of Work*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025, ISBN 978 94 6473 757 8
- MI-444 L.M.J. van Doorn, *From Risks to Public Opinion. How Structural Economic Changes Shape Political Attitudes and Policy Preferences*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-445 S.D. Koning, *De ventiefunctie van de artikel 12 Sv-procedure. Klachten tegen niet-vervolgung in maatschappelijk gevoelige kwesties*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025, ISBN 978 94 6473 796 7
- MI-446 A.S. Florescu, *Migration, Abduction and Children's Rights. The relevance of children's rights and the European supranational system to child abduction cases with immigration components*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-447 C. Smit, *Minderheidskabinetten in Nederland en Denemarken*, (diss. Leiden), Den Haag: Boom juridisch 2025, ISBN 978 94 6212 216 1 (978-94-0011-571-2 ebook)
- MI-448 S.J. Lopik, *Klimaatstrafrecht. De rol van het strafrecht binnen het juridische antwoord op klimaatverandering*, (diss. Leiden), Deventer: Kluwer 2025, ISBN 978 90 1318 157 9
- MI-449 E. Grosfeld, *Increasing Public Perceived Legitimacy of the European Union Through the Integration of Psychological Insights into Law*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025
- MI-450 E. Nave, *Countering online hate speech. How to adequately protect fundamental rights?*, (diss. Leiden), Amsterdam: Ipskamp Printing 2025 ISBN 978 94 6473 832 2