



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Becoming and Belonging? Lived experiences of naturalization and the implementation of citizenship law in Germany and Canada

Bliersbach, H.

Citation

Bliersbach, H. (2025, May 13). *Becoming and Belonging?: Lived experiences of naturalization and the implementation of citizenship law in Germany and Canada*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4246246>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4246246>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Becoming and Belonging?

Becoming and Belonging?
Lived Experiences of Naturalization and the
Implementation of Citizenship Law in Germany
and Canada

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 13 mei 2025
klokke 16.00 uur

door

Hannah Bliersbach

geboren te Aken, Duitsland

in 1995

Promotoren: prof.dr. O.P. van Vliet
 prof. mr. dr. M.A.H. van der Woude

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. J.P. van der Leun
 dr. M. Jesse LLM
 prof. dr. P.W.A. Scholten
 prof. dr. T. Triadafilopoulos (University of Toronto)

Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest
Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio – Delft
Drukwerk: Ipskamp Printing – Amsterdam

© 2025 H. Bliersbach

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprerecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprerecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

The difference between a naturalized citizen and a stateless resident was not great enough to justify taking any trouble, the former being frequently deprived of important civil rights and threatened any moment with the fate of the latter.

Hannah Arendt (2017: 373)

Acknowledgements

A series of most-fortunate events has led to this dissertation being written and finished. Thanking everyone is sadly outside the scope of this acknowledgement section, but if our paths crossed during these past years, know that you played a part.

First and foremost, I owe the greatest debt to my interviewees. You gave me your time and trusted me with parts of your life and identity. Thank you, this research would not have been possible without you. I hope to have done your stories and struggles justice.

None of my work would have seen the light of day without the – as we say in German – parents of this dissertation: Olaf van Vliet and Maartje van der Woude. Thank you for letting me make this project my own and for your support and trust. Your pragmatism and clear-eyed view of when to stop tinkering with a piece of writing was exactly what my ever-critical mind needed.

Starting my PhD as the COVID-19 pandemic unfolded was not ideal, but my dear colleagues at the Institute of Public Administration and the Van Vollenhoven Institute made it as easy as it could have been. You cared about me and my work from day one and I cannot thank you enough. A special thank you to the VVI PhD Writing Club for creating a space to talk about the pain and joy of putting words on a page, to Chase, Lisa, Judith, Mies and Straton.

Doing a PhD can be a lonely endeavor and nothing eases the sting of academic rejection like friends going through the same thing: Julia, my favorite New Yorker, writer of perfect e-mails and fellow Swiftie; Nada, master of the deadpan joke and quiet generosity; Hannah, data management mogul and greatest person to be silly with; Dorien, my favorite second soprano and the only reason I applied for this position. I owe my sanity to you.

I want to thank Audrey Macklin for generously hosting me at the Centre for Criminology & Sociolegal Studies at the University of Toronto and for providing me with the necessary wheels (two) to get around the city. Thank you to Ayelet Shachar for inviting me into the Harney Graduate Fellowship as a visiting scholar. To Adina, thank you for sharing your office and time with me; to Huibin, Laura AZ, Laura L, Sabeen, Sara, Sophie, Diego, Jamie, Jeffrey, Jona, Daniel and everyone at CrimSL, I could not have imagined a warmer welcome to Toronto.

To my wonderful friends in Bonn: Britta, Jana, Marie, Markus, Sabrina and Victoria, I am so glad we all decided to study political science in a two-room department without WIFI or a bathroom. Without knowing you, I would not know myself as I do now.

Once upon a time, Leiden had a research master in political science and public administration and I had the absolute pleasure of meeting the kindest group of *strebers* I know: Joep, Maria, and Rozemarijn, I hope to bask in your curiosity and enthusiasm for research as long as my neurons are firing. Svenne, Leiden and the Netherlands would not feel like home without you (and my Dutch would not be half as good).

I would be remiss if I did not thank my family. To my brothers Sebastian and Thomas, to Anne and Angela: Getting glimpses into your adult lives way before I had to make any adult decisions was such a privilege. How could I grow up around you and not be endlessly curious about the world? To Mama and Paps, for letting me go out into the world at 15, for proofreading my early essays, and for reminding me to not overcomplicate things. To Ashley, Krista, Graeme and the Heys branch of our family tree, your love and support has meant the world.

Em and Janna, I feel like you could claim at least joint custody of this dissertation. Thank you for having confidence in me when I did not. Growing alongside you as researchers and people has been an absolute joy and I cannot wait for whatever comes next.

Finally, to Lisa and Paulin: Any words printed here will not do justice to how much your friendship means to me. I am the luckiest person to share this life with you. To answer Lucy Dacus, if I were to rewrite my life, you'd still play a part, every time. Thank you.

Table of Contents

1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Naturalization in the Law and in the Literature	2
1.2	Research Question and Contribution	4
1.3	Case Selection, Methodology & Positionality	7
1.3.1	Naturalization in Germany & Canada	7
1.3.2	Methodology	8
1.3.3	Positionality	10
1.4	Outline of the Thesis	12
2	FUTURE CITIZENS BETWEEN INTEREST AND ABILITY <i>A Systematic Literature Review of the Naturalization and Crimmigration Scholarship</i>	15
2.1	Introduction	15
2.2	Methodology	17
2.3	Analysis	18
2.3.1	Bibliometric Connections	18
2.3.2	Substantive Analysis	21
2.3.2.1	The State of the Art on Naturalization & Crimmigration	21
2.3.2.2	The Case for Connection: The Restrictive Power of Residence Requirements	25
2.3.2.3	Objectives of Immigration Policies	29
2.4	Conclusion	31
3	'I'M NOT GERMAN. I'M A NATURALIZED GERMAN.' <i>Lived Experiences of Citizenship Acquisition in Germany</i>	33
3.1	Introduction	33
3.2	Methodology	35
3.3	Naturalization in Germany: Prior Work on Motivations and Quotas	36
3.4	Analysis	38
3.4.1	Paperwork and Practicalities	38
3.4.2	Status and Security	41
3.4.3	Indignities and Implicitness	43
3.5	Conclusion	46

4	THE GETTING AND GRANTING OF CITIZENSHIP <i>Examining the Inequalities of Naturalization Policy Implementation involving Discretion</i>	49
4.1	Introduction	49
4.2	Naturalization in Germany	51
4.3	Discretion as a Legal Term and an Administrative Reality	53
4.4	Methodology	51
4.5	Analysis	57
4.5.1	The Trouble with Indefinite Legal Concepts	57
4.5.2	To Process, Or Not To Process	60
4.5.3	The Client-Caseworker Relationship	64
4.6	Conclusion	66
5	'AM I REALLY A FULL CANADIAN? I'M NOT' <i>Immigration Experiences of New Citizens in Canada</i>	69
5.1	Introduction	69
5.2	The Dimensions and Developments of Citizenship	71
5.2.1	General Trends	71
5.2.2	Naturalization in Canada	72
5.3	Methodology	74
5.4	Analysis	75
5.4.1	Deportability and Belonging	75
5.4.2	Human-Capital Citizenship	77
5.5	Conclusion	80
6	COMPARING THE LEGAL CONSCIOUSNESS OF NEW CITIZENS <i>Perceptions of Naturalization in Canada and Germany</i>	83
6.1	Introduction	83
6.2	Comparing Canadian and German Citizenship Law	85
6.3	Studying Legal Consciousness in a Migration Context	87
6.4	Methodology	89
6.5	Analysis: Black Box vs. Decentralized Discretion	90
6.5.1	Understandings and Impact of the Letter of the Law	90
6.5.2	Understanding the Relationships Built through Implementation	93
6.6	Conclusion	97
7	CONCLUSION	99
7.1	Revisiting the Research Question	99
7.2	Theoretical, Empirical, and Methodological Contributions	101
7.2.1	Extending the Theory of Citizenship Allocation	101
7.2.2	Extending the Literature on Citizenship 'From Below'	102
7.2.3	Extending Interviewing Methodologies	115
7.2.4	Limitations and Future Research	105

Table of Contents

xi

8	POST-SCRIPT: GERMANY'S 2024 CITIZENSHIP LAW REFORM	109
	SUMMARY	111
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	119
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	127
	APPENDIX	141
	CURRICULUM VITAE	151

