

## Navigating corporate responsibility in global supply chains using codes of conduct

Vandenbroucke, S.E.M.

#### Citation

Vandenbroucke, S. E. M. (2025, February 25). Navigating corporate responsibility in global supply chains using codes of conduct. Meijersreeks. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4196396

Version: Publisher's Version

Licence agreement concerning inclusion of

License: doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of

the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4196396

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

# Navigating Corporate Responsibility in Global Supply Chains using Codes of Conduct

# Navigating Corporate Responsibility in Global Supply Chains using Codes of Conduct

#### **PROEFSCHRIFT**

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden, op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl, volgens besluit van het college voor promoties te verdedigen op dinsdag 25 Februari 2025 klokke 16.00 uur

door

### Sarah Vandenbroucke

geboren te Croix, France

in 1995

Promotores: Dr. H. Pluut

Dr. M.Y.H.G. Erkens Prof.dr. W.H. van Boom

Promotiecommissie: Prof.dr. G.J.J. Heerma van Voss

Prof.dr. P.F. van der Heijden Prof.dr. A.G. Castermans Prof.dr. J.M. Ubink

Dr. D. Palombo (Tilburg University)

Prof.dr. M. Siems (European University Institute,

Firenze, Italy)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

#### © 2025 S. Vandenbroucke

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

"My friends, the simple fact of the matter is this: If we cannot make globalization work for all, in the end it will work for none."

 ${\rm Kofi\ Annan}$  29 January 2001 Secretary General of the United Nations 1997 - 2006

# Table of Contents

Ac	CKNO	WLEDO	GMENTS	XV
Li	ST OI	ABBRI	EVIATIONS	VII
1	Int	RODUC	TION	1
	1.1	Settin	g The Stage: The governance of human rights in a globalized	
		world		1
		1.1.1	The global supply chain: Landscape of modern production	2
			The global governance gap of transnational production The paradigm shift towards binding corporate social	4
		_	responsibility	6
	1.2	Explo	oring Gaps in Understanding Supplier Codes of Conduct	7
	1.3		arch question: An interdisciplinary socio-legal approach	9
	1.4		retical building blocks and contributions	10
			Foundations of corporate responsibility	10
		1.4.2	Institutional and organizational theories on policy	
			adoption and implementation	13
		1.4.3	Intended contributions to theory and literature	14
	1.5		ded contribution to practice	15
			odology: a PHD in socio-legal studies	16
			ter structure and overview	18
2	LEG	AL FRA	AMEWORK OF SUPPLIER CODES OF CONDUCT	23
	2.1	Introd	duction	23
		2.1.1	Defining supplier codes of conduct as soft law	23
		2.1.2	The choice of soft law in transnational governance	24
		2.1.3	Objective of the chapter and research question	25
	2.1	Adop	oting codes of conduct: An evolving legal framework	26
			Questioning the voluntariness of SCCs	26
		2.1.2	The shift towards mandated codes in the EU with the	
			due diligence framework	28
	2.2	Enfor	cing codes of conduct: The legal implications of sccs	29
		2.2.1	Supplier Codes of Conduct enforceability with contract law	30
		2.2.2	Supplier codes of conduct enforceability with	
			consumer protection laws	34
		2.2.3	Supplier codes of conduct enforceability with the CSDDD	37
	23	Concl	lusion	39

3	Liti	ERATUI	RE REVIEW ON THE EFFECTIVENESS OF SUPPLIER CODES OF	
	CON	DUCT		43
	Abs	tract		43
	3.1	Introd	duction	44
		3.1.1	Theoretical framework	45
	3.2	Meth	od of the systematic literature review	46
		3.2.1	The selection process	46
		3.2.2	Overview of the selected papers	47
	3.3	Resea	rch designs to measure compliance and effectiveness	53
		3.3.1	The difference between compliance and effectiveness	53
		3.3.2	Designs used to measure effectiveness	54
	3.4	Unev	en impact of codes on labor conditions	56
	3.5	Facto	rs affecting compliance and effectiveness	57
		3.5.1	External contextual factors	58
		3.5.2	Buyer level factors	59
		3.5.3	Buyer-supplier level: the relational factor	61
		3.5.4	Supplier level factors	62
	3.6	Discu	ussion	63
		3.6.1	Limitations of the review	67
		3.6.2	Suggestions for future research & practice	67
4	DEC	CODING	G CODES: THE CONTENT OF CODES OF CONDUCT	69
		tract		69
	4.1	Intro	duction	70
	4.2	Datab	pase of codes of conduct: the sample studied	72
	4.3	What	is the content of supplier codes of conduct?	74
		4.3.1	Literature review	74
			Research design	76
		4.3.3	Results	79
			4.3.3.1 Similarity levels of SCC provisions	79
			4.3.3.2 Prevalence and reference to labor-related	
			provisions and international standards	80
	4.4	How	do supplier codes of conduct differ across sectors and	
		region	ns?	82
		4.4.1	Literature review and hypotheses	82
			Research design	84
		4.4.3	Results	86
			4.4.3.1 Variation of SCC content across sectors	86
			4.4.3.2 Variation of SCC content across geographical	
			locations	88
	4.5	Discu	ssion	90
			Contributions	90
		4.5.2	Methodological contributions	92
		4.5.3	Limits of this paper and opportunities for future research	92

5	Dο	COMPANIES WALK THE TALK? COMMITMENTS AND ACTIONS IN	
)		BAL SUPPLY CHAIN LABOR STANDARDS	95
		stract	95
		Introduction	96
		5.1.1 Conceptual framework: multinational responsibility	, ,
		to implement labor standards	97
		5.1.1.1 Theorizing shared responsibility beyond the	
		liability model	98
		5.1.1.2 Embracing the paradigm of corporate	
		responsibility	99
		5.1.2 Risks of decoupling: from policy to outcome	100
		5.1.3 Conceptualizing implementation provisions and	
		implementation programs	101
	5.2	Study 1. Written commitments in implementation provisions	102
		5.2.1 Methods for Study 1	102
		5.2.2 Results of Study 1	106
	5.3	Study 2. From commitment to actions in implementation	
		mechanisms	110
		5.3.1 Methods for study 2	111
		5.3.1.1 KnowtheChain sample of companies	111
		5.3.1.2 KnowtheChain scoring	111
		5.3.1.3 Comparing KnowtheChain results with our	
		Database	112
		5.3.2 Results of Study 2	113
	5.4	Discussion	120
		5.4.1 Implementation provisions in SCC: How companies 'talk'	120
		5.4.2 A shared responsibility and collaborative approach	
		with suppliers: Necessary to 'walk the talk'	121
		5.4.3 Limitations and opportunities for future research	122
		5.4.4 Practical implications	123
6	Cor	RPORATE INSIGHTS ON SUPPLIER CODES OF CONDUCT AND HUMAN	
0		HTS DUE DILIGENCE LEGISLATION	125
		stract	125
		Introduction	126
	0.1	6.1.1 Legal and regulatory framework	127
		6.1.2 State of the art of the research on supplier codes of	12,
		conduct	129
		6.1.3 Objectives and research questions	130
	6.2	Methodology: A qualitative study	131
		6.2.1 Sample and procedure	131
		6.2.2 Qualitative analysis process	133
	6.3	Results	134
		6.3.1 Context: The place of codes within corporations	135
		6.3.1.1 Adoption of a SCC	135
		6.3.1.2 Supplier codes and contracts with suppliers	136

		6.3.2	Evolution of human rights concerns within corporations	137
		6.3.3	Challenges in implementing supplier codes	138
			6.3.3.1 Buyer level challenges	139
			6.3.3.2 Buyer-supplier relationship challenges	141
			6.3.3.3 External challenges	142
		6.3.4	Potential impact of the developing legal framework	143
			6.3.4.1 Opportunities	143
			6.3.4.2 Threats and concerns	144
		6.3.5	Where do companies stand on due diligence?	146
	6.4	Discu	assion	147
		6.4.1	Implications for corporate governance	148
		6.4.2	Implications for policy makers	149
		6.4.3	Limitations and suggestions for future research	151
7		CUSSIC		155
	7.1		mary and integration of the key findings	155
		7.1.1	Adopting codes: A step towards addressing supply	
			chain labor risks?	156
		7.1.2	Implementing codes: a multi-level challenge	158
			7.1.2.1 Integration of human rights concerns within	
			corporate policies: The buyer level	159
			7.1.2.2 Relational factors of SCC implementation:	
			The buyer-supplier level	160
			7.1.2.3 External factors influencing SCC implementation	162
	7.2		retical contributions: The Path to successful implementation	163
			Presenting the path to success	164
			Derailing from the path: Decoupling	169
			Avoiding derailing from the path: Recoupling	171
	7.3	7.3.1	ical implications: Recommendations on the path to success  Preventing derailing from the path:	172
			Recommendations for corporate practice	173
		7.3.2		
			Recommendations for policy makers	176
			7.3.2.1 Re-coupling with the CSDDD	176
			7.3.2.2 Re-coupling beyond the CSDDD	178
	7.4	Limit	ations and direction for future research	182
		7.4.1	Empirical limitations and lessons learnt	182
		7.4.2	Avenues for future research	184
	7.5	Conc	luding remarks	186
8	List	Γ OF RE	FERENCES	189
9	An	NEX		205
	9.1	Chap	ter 4	205
			endix 1: Justification for 25 topic model	205
			endix 2. Classifier for the dictionary-based method	207

Summary	XI

	Appendix 3: Scattered plot	208
	Appendix 4: Sector clustering	210
	Appendix 5: Variation of labor-related provisions across	
	sector groups according to the manual coding	210
	Appendix 6: Variation of labor-related provisions across	
	geographical locations according to the	
	manual coding	211
	Appendix 7: Labelling of the topics identified by the STM	
	approach	212
9.2	Chapter 5	214
	Annex 1	214
	Annex 2	216
9.3	Chapter 6	218
	Annex 1: Topic list and example questions	218
	Annex 2: Table describing the Atlas.TI code book	219
Summa	ARY	221
Samen	VATTING	225
Résum	É	229
Curri	CULUM VITAE	233

## Figures, Tables & Conceptual models

Chapter 1	
Conceptual model: Lay out of the structure of this dissertation	21
Chapter 3	
Table 1: Key words for paper selection	47
Figure 1: Flow diagram of the systematic literature review on supplier	4-
codes of conduct impact	47
Table 2: Overview of the paper selected	52
Table 3: Overview of respondents in studies using perception data	55
Table 4: Overview of SCC impact findings per labor right	57
Table 5: Overview of factors impacting SCC compliance and SCC	EC
effectiveness	58
Conceptual model: Process of supplier code decoupling	64
Chapter 4	
Figure 1: Companies included in the sample per index	73
Table 1: Research design overview	78
Figure 2: Similarity levels	79
Figure 3: Length variation of SCC	79
Figure 4: Percentage of most prevalent topics identified in the text of all	
codes of the sample	80
Figure 5: Percentage of SCCs referring to labor standards	81
Figure 6: Representation of sectors	85
Figure 7: Variation of the prevalence of labor-related provisions across	
sector groups in percentage of SCCs' text	86
Figure 8: Variation of labor-related provisions across sector groups	87
Figure 9: Variation of the prevalence of labor-related provisions across	
location groups	88
Figure 10: Variation of labor-related provisions across geographical	
locations according to the dictionary method	89
Charter 5	
Chapter 5  Figure 1. Concentral model: Intentions of studies 1 and 2 to assess SCC	
Figure 1. Conceptual model: Intentions of studies 1 and 2 to assess SCC	101
1 01	101 104
Table 2: Number of management system categories included in supplier	104
	106
	$100 \\ 107$
Table 3: Quality assessment of implementation provisions in supplier	/
	108

Table 5: Quality of implementation provisions across sector  Table 6: Means, standard deviations and correlations between expert
assessment and frequency of management system keywords  110
Table 7: Correlation matrix between expert assessment and Knowthe Chain scores 114
Table 8: Correlation matrix of the frequency of management systems and
KnowtheChain scores 115
Figure 3. KnowtheChain global scoring when there is and when there is
no reference to management systems.
Figure 4. Mean of KnowtheChain scoring in the presence or absence of
keywords on Reporting 117
Figure 5. Mean of KnowtheChain scoring in the presence or absence of
keywords on Training 118
Figure 6. Mean of KnowtheChain scoring in the presence or absence of
keywords on Corrective Action Plan
keywords on Corrective Action Flan
Chapter 6
Table 1: Descriptive list of participants
Table 2: Overview of the results classified by themes and sub-themes
Table 3. Overview of factors challenging SCC implementation 138
8 8 1
Chapter 7
Table 1. Factors influencing SCC implementation 163
Model 1: The path to success from SCC adoption to decent labor standards 166
Model 2. Derailing for the path: the decoupling phases 170
Model 3: Multinationals' capacity to address the goal-system decoupling 174
Model 4: Multinationals' capacity to address the system-practice decoupling 175
Model 5: Public actors' capacity to address the decoupling stages  183

### Acknowledgments

Amidst the highs and lows of this PhD journey, one essential factor made it all possible: an extraordinary support system, shaped by both my professional and personal environments. The people and institutions mentioned in these acknowledgements were the fuel and the inspiration of this thesis.

First and foremost, I am deeply grateful to my 'team' of supervisors, Helen, Yvonne, and Willem. In 2020, you placed your trust in me to undertake this research, even when I struggled to trust it myself. Your guidance—sometimes close, sometimes distant— was invaluable in helping me navigate the challenges of focusing my efforts on the right priorities. The journey together was not always smooth sailing, but I knew I could always count on your support when I sought it.

Beyond my supervisors, I was privileged to be guided by some of my academic role models, whose wisdom and insight are the shoulders on which I stand. Jaroslaw Kantorowicz, this thesis would hardly be relevant without your help on quantitative text analysis. I am so thankful for your brilliant mind, kindness, and patience. Rick Lawson, what an honor it has been to teach human rights by your side. Matthieu Caron, your leadership, your warm friendship, and your unwavering trust have played an important role in my growth as an academic. I am excited to continue thinking and doing business ethics together. Dalia Palombo and Mathias Siems, your insightful feedback, our discussions on business and human rights, and your support and encouragements have been invaluable. Thank you for accepting to be part of my external evaluation committee.

This PhD began in March 2020, at the dawn of the COVID-19 pandemic, making relocating to the Netherlands more difficult than I had imagined. Eschwin, you carried me through it and believed in me. Without you, I would not have dreamt of starting a PhD in the first place, and I am eternally grateful for the impact you had on my life. In this isolating context, I quickly found solace in a community of fellow PhDs, who since became an essential part of my life. Among them, special thanks to Kimia, my partner-in-crime from day one: our endless overthinking sessions, long hours of working side by side, and your sarcastic humor made the journey not just bearable, but an exciting TV show. To my (para)nymphs, Hannah and Sabrina, I do not have enough words to express my love and gratitude. You were there through it all—the good, the bad, the ugly—picking me up from rock bottom and reminding me to dance through the chaos. You, along with Chouchou, are my Leiden family.

Leiden University, with its vibrant community of young researchers, has been an exceptional home for this research. I am especially grateful to the Empirical Legal Studies lab and its members for their invaluable support

XVI Acknowledgments

and guidance on the empirical aspects of this dissertation. My intellectual growth was also nurtured by other inspiring communities I found within the Netherlands Network for Human Rights Research, L'Observatoire de l'Ethique Publique, and the European University Institute. In these organizations, I met likeminded academics and incredible humans, with whom I openly exchanged ideas and drew strength from their collective wisdom. In tough moments of frustrations thinking about social injustices, I think about the dedication of these academics, which gives me hope for the future of human rights.

The strong foundation I rely on and the ultimate support system in my life is, without a doubt, my wonderful family. Merci, papa et maman, for setting an example of living in generosity and grace for those around you. You are the reason I am a human rights passionate, everything I do is to make you proud. To my siblings and cousins—Perrine, Théophile, Emma, Étienne, Blandine, Manue, Marianne, and Pauline—you are the pillars I know will always be there, thank you for embracing my choices even when they differ from your own. Lorina and Mojen, your unconditional love is a constant source of strength—thank you for sharing this life journey with me and for being the funniest, most graceful, and loyal partners.

Looking back, I find myself deeply grateful for this PhD journey. The relentless questioning it demanded brought me closer to understanding not only my research but also myself. It taught me my limits, my strengths, and the incredible network of people I can rely on. Above all, this process led me to you, Antoine. With you, every doubt fades as everything finds meaning. I cannot wait for all that lies ahead, knowing you are by my side.

## List of Abbreviations

BHR Business and Human Rights

CSDDD Corporate Sustainability Due Diligence Directive

CSR Corporate Social Responsibility ILO International Labor Organization

MNE Multinational Enterprise SCC Supplier code of conduct

UNGP United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human

Rights