



Universiteit
Leiden

The Netherlands

Intelligence for a complex environment: transforming traditional intelligence with insights from complexity science and field research on NATO

Spoor, B.E.P.

Citation

Spoor, B. E. P. (2025, January 15). *Intelligence for a complex environment: transforming traditional intelligence with insights from complexity science and field research on NATO*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4175700>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4175700>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Intelligence for a Complex Environment

**Transforming traditional intelligence with insights from
complexity science and field research on NATO.**

Bram Spoor

Printed by: Repro FBD

ISBN: 9789493124417

Intelligence for a Complex Environment

**Transforming traditional intelligence with insights from
complexity science and field research on NATO.**

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,

volgens besluit van het college voor promoties

te verdedigen op woensdag 15 januari 2025

klokke 16:00 uur

door

Bram Spoor

Promotor

Prof.dr.ir. S.J.H. Rietjens

Copromotor

Dr. M.G.D. Rothman, Nederlandse Defensie Academie

Promotiecommissie

Prof.dr. K. Caminada (decaan/voorzitter)

Prof.dr. F.P.B. Osinga

Prof.dr. P.A.L. Ducheine, Nederlandse Defensie Academie

Prof.dr. P.C. van Fenema, Nederlandse Defensie Academie

Dr. C. Hillebrand, Cardiff University

Dr. G.G. de Valk

This dissertation was financially supported by the Royal Netherlands Army and Ministry of Defence. The views and opinions, as well as any faults in this dissertation, are and remain solely the responsibility of the author.

Terzij de Horde

Content

1. Introduction: Outlining the Research	11
1.1 The changing intelligence environment	11
1.2 Research aim & knowledge gaps	14
1.3 Problem statement & research questions	18
1.4 Research structure	20
2. Intelligence Transformation	23
2.1 Introducing intelligence	24
2.2 The intelligence cycle	28
2.3 Theories of intelligence	34
2.4 A paradigm shift	47
2.5 Conclusion: What is the status of intelligence transformation?	57
3. The Intelligence Habitus	59
3.1 Structure of the chapter	59
3.1.1 What is the intelligence habitus?	59
3.1.2 Framework	61
3.1.3 Reflections on the framework	63
3.2 Great power politics	66
3.2.1 Cold War	66
3.2.2 Peace dividend	72
3.2.3 War on Terror	73
3.2.4 Return to great power politics	75
3.3 Technology	78
3.3.1 From machines to computers	78
3.3.2 The Information Revolution	81
3.4 Events	84
3.4.1 Formative Cold War events: Korea and Vietnam Wars, and the Cuban Missile Crisis	84
3.4.2 Transition to the 21 st Century: 9/11, Iraq WMD, and the Russian annexation of Crimea	87
3.5 Debate	93

3.5.1 Kent and Kendall	94
3.5.2 Intelligence as art or science	98
3.6 Institutionalisation	103
3.6.1 Landscape	104
3.6.2 Adaptation	111
3.7 Conclusion: How did the intelligence habitus evolve?	115
4. Intelligence & Complexity	118
4.1 Complexity in intelligence literature	118
4.1.1 Organising intelligence	119
4.1.2 Intelligence analysis	123
4.1.3 Resulting uncertainty	125
4.2 Introducing complexity science	129
4.2.1 Simple, complicated, complex, and chaos	129
4.2.2 What is complexity science?	137
4.2.3 Complexity in the study of war and warfare	144
4.3 Characteristics of complexity	148
4.3.1 Self-organisation	149
4.3.2 Emergence	151
4.3.3 Non-linearity	154
4.3.4 Adaptation	157
4.4 Organising for complexity	161
4.4.1 Requisite variety	161
4.4.2 Sensemaking	164
4.4.3 Organisational learning	166
4.5 Conclusion: How does complexity science relate to intelligence?	168
5. Approach to case study research	169
5.1 Research strategy: A qualitative orientation	169
5.2 Research design: single-case study	170
5.2.1 Research question, case selection, and secrecy	171
5.2.2 Data collection	176
5.2.3 Data analysis	181

5.2.4 Research quality	183
6. Case study, part I; case introduction & environment.....	186
6.1 Case study introduction	186
6.1.1 Setting	186
6.1.2 MNC NE and its intelligence organisation	188
6.2 Environment of MNC NE intelligence organisation - respondent view.....	191
6.2.1 Peacetime, hybrid, or Article 5?	192
6.2.2 Exercise mode versus real life	193
6.2.3 National versus NATO interests	195
6.3 Environment of MNC NE intelligence organisation - analysis	196
6.3.1 Self-organisation	196
6.3.2 Emergence.....	199
6.3.3 Non-linearity.....	201
6.3.4 Adaptation.....	202
6.4 Subconclusion.....	204
7. Case study, part II; The organisation of intelligence – respondent view.....	206
7.1 The intelligence cycle	206
7.1.1 Direction	206
7.1.2 Collection.....	209
7.1.3 Processing.....	212
7.1.4 Dissemination.....	216
7.2 Respondent reflections on practice	217
7.2.1 Products and frameworks	218
7.2.2 Prediction	219
7.2.3 Objectivity, bias, and cultural perspectives.....	220
7.3 Issues of alignment.....	222
7.3.1 Internal alignment.....	223
7.3.2 External alignment	225
7.4 Subconclusion.....	226
8. Case Study, part III: The Organisation of Intelligence – analysis	228
8.1 The intelligence cycle as missing procedure	228

8.2 Nuanced positivism	230
8.3 Co-existing and conflicting paradigms	232
8.4 Design properties	237
8.4.1 Requisite variety.....	237
8.4.2 Sensemaking.....	238
8.4.3 Organisational learning	240
8.5 Conclusion: How do military intelligence organisations deal with their complex operational environment?	241
9. Conclusion, Reflection, Recommendations	243
9.1 Conclusion: How can complexity science advance intelligence transformation?	243
9.2 Reflection	252
9.3 Recommendations	256
9.3.1 Recommendations for practice	257
9.3.2 Recommendations for further research.....	261
Bibliography.....	264
Annex A: Case study protocol	303
A1. From theory to questions	303
A2. List with interview questions	304
A3. Data management	307
Annex B: Operationalisation of questions.....	309
Annex C: Data analysis	310
Summary	312
Samenvatting.....	315
Acknowledgement.....	319
Curriculum Vitae.....	320

List of figures

<i>Figure 1: Research model</i>	22
<i>Figure 2: Generic intelligence cycle</i>	28
<i>Figure 3: Cynefin framework</i>	134
<i>Figure 4: Normal distribution (bell curve) and power law distribution (long tail)</i>	150
<i>Figure 5: Adaptation of a complex system using schemata</i>	158
<i>Figure 6: Boyd's OODA loop</i>	161
<i>Figure 7: MNC NE area of responsibility and location of headquarters</i>	189
<i>Figure 8: Peacetime organisation of MNC NE</i>	190

List of tables

<i>Table 1: Difference between traditional and new intelligence paradigms</i>	51
<i>Table 2: From the Cold War to an Age of Terror</i>	53
<i>Table 3: The five driving forces</i>	62
<i>Table 4: The evolution of the study of intelligence</i>	111
<i>Table 5: Overview of driving forces of the intelligence habitus</i>	117
<i>Table 6: Puzzles, mysteries, and complexities</i>	120
<i>Table 7: Jominian versus Clausewitzian Intelligence</i>	126
<i>Table 8: The 'Rumsfeld matrix'</i>	127
<i>Table 9: Complicated or complex? Key differences</i>	132
<i>Table 10: Traditional versus Emerging Worldview</i>	141
<i>Table 11: The four regimes of the scientific way of warfare</i>	144
<i>Table 12: Interview data characteristics</i>	178
<i>Table 13: Number of respondents per nationality</i>	179
<i>Table 14: Number of respondents per rank</i>	179
<i>Table 15: Data per Cynefin domain</i>	235
<i>Table 16: Traditional versus complexity intelligence paradigms</i>	250
<i>Table 17: Operationalisation of interview questions</i>	310
<i>Table 18: Data analysis: terms, themes, and dimensions</i>	311