



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Gas wars: a two-level analysis of Ukraine's bargaining position in the 2006 and 2009 energy conflicts with Russian Federation

Barboutev, I.K.

Citation

Barboutev, I. K. (2024, November 20). *Gas wars: a two-level analysis of Ukraine's bargaining position in the 2006 and 2009 energy conflicts with Russian Federation*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4139174>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4139174>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Gas Wars

A Two-Level Analysis of Ukraine's Bargaining Position in the
2006 and 2009 Energy Conflicts with the Russian Federation

Gas Wars

A Two-Level Analysis of Ukraine's Bargaining Position in the 2006 and 2009 Energy Conflicts with the Russian Federation

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 20 november 2024
klokke 11:30 uur

door

Ilia K. Barboutev
geboren te Plovdiv, Bulgarije
in 1989

Promotor:

Prof. dr. André Gerrits

Copromotor:

Dr. Morena Skalamera

Promotiecommissie:

Dr. Coby van der Linde (The Centre for International Energy Policy)

Prof. dr. Margarita Balmaceda (Seton Hall University)

Dr. Matthew Frear

Prof. dr. Sarah Wolff

Prof. dr. Taras Kuzio (University of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy)

I dedicate this work to Professor Joris Jacob Clemens Voorhoeve for his tireless devotion to serving his country, helping his students, promoting international cooperation, and aiding the people of Ukraine in this dark hour.

Acknowledgements

I would like to take the opportunity to thank everyone who assisted me in the writing of this dissertation.

First and foremost, I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisors André Gerrits, Max Bader, and Morena Skalamera. Professor Gerrits has been with me from the very beginning of this journey and has continuously been providing me with incisive commentary. Doctor Bader has given me with a lot of organizational advice and has been instrumental in shaping the overall structure of the text. Professor Skalamera became my second supervisor after Doctor Bader's departure from academia during a very important event in her life. Despite that, she found the time to give me valuable guidance which has significantly improved the final text.

I express my sincerest appreciation to the reading committee members. Professors Margarita Balmaceda, Taras Kuzio, Coby van der Linde, Matthew Frear, and Sarah Wolff provided me with indispensable feedback that has considerably enriched the overall quality of this research.

I extend my gratitude to Professor Doctor Joris Jacob Clemens Voorhoeve to whom I dedicate this work. If I had to list each single thing for which I am grateful to Joris, I would have to write another doctoral dissertation. His dedication to serving the public and to helping those in need, without asking for a reward or recognition, is something that I will never cease to admire and which I can only aspire to emulate.

I want to thank my long-time, loyal friend Vasileios Karakasis who has always assisted me, even in times of difficulty. This project was initially supposed to focus on the gas relations between the European Union and the Russian Federation. Vasileios suggested that addressing Ukraine's role as a key transit state in the gas trade between the EU and Russia would be a truly original research project. His advice effectively gave birth to the research question and to the adopted framework.

I am grateful to my good friend Samuel Jong. His love for Eastern Europe and for its people, languages, politics, and scenery never ceases to inspire me.

I would like to thank my friends who have accompanied me throughout my journey. My sincerest gratitude to Neelesh B, Salman T, Joshua H, Billy K, Erica B, Yuval Y, Nimrod E, Taras K, Andriy K, Uliana P, Oleh S, Ihor B, Tarık E, Kürşat G, Furkan K, Mirkan B, Cem B, İrfan D, Mesut K, Tuna Y, Esra Ö, Arslanali S, Shamil S, Umar A, Jean-Pierre A, Anton B, Nikita A, Nikita C, Alexander R, Nina M, Aida I, Artem V, Javid I, Lala M, Nikola K, Nikola S, Alexander M, David W, Paul VdB, Sham A, Mohammed M. S, Mohammed G, Mohammed S, Dionis K, Ilyasse B, Yassine B, Sidi E-B, Zouina S-A, Fons W, Hugo C, Pablo M, Mahrouz R, Vusal I, Sahib R, Ethan B, Omar K, Zachary N, Nico R, Giacomo F, Lukas V, George P, Nikos A, Yılmaz G, Mete E, Shimon V, Martin S, and Martin B.

I am grateful to my family for their support and encouragement, especially my mom. She has travelled across the former Soviet Space with me, crisscrossing the Black and Caspian Seas. I hope she can forgive and forget the rather dangerous bus ride on a dirt road in the Caucasus to visit an 18th century palace. The bus almost fell into a ravine and the palace was closed for renovation. On the plus side, her lifelong dream of her son speaking more than broken Russian has come true and on top of that I have managed to learn Ukrainian. As the wise King Solomon said, "There is a time for everything. / Всему свое время. / Для всього свій час."

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	6
Summary.....	11
1 Introduction.....	12
1.1 Preliminary Remarks.....	12
1.2 Scope of the Research Project.....	13
1.3 Structure.....	15
1.4 Methodology.....	22
1.5 Sources.....	23
1.6 Transliteration.....	24
1.7 Theoretical and Empirical Contributions.....	25
Part 1 Literature Review and Theoretical Background.....	26
2 Literature Review.....	26
2.1 Introductory Remarks.....	26
2.2 Approaches and Commentary on the 2006 Gas Dispute.....	27
2.3 Approaches and Commentary on the 2009 Gas Dispute.....	31
2.4 Commentary on Existing Literature.....	35
2.5 Towards Integrating the International and the Domestic Levels.....	39
3 Research Question and Theoretical Framework.....	40
3.1 Primary Goal of the Study, Research Question, and Hypothesis.....	40
3.2 Theoretical Models and Relevance to the Research.....	40
3.3 Classical Realism.....	41
3.4 Structural (Neo) Realism.....	42
3.4.1 Types of Neorealism: Defensive and Offensive.....	42
3.5 Neoclassical Realism: Bridging the Level Gap.....	44
3.6 Constructivism: Ideas Matter.....	46
3.7 Putnam's Two-Level Game Theory.....	47
3.8 Multi-Level Case Studies.....	52
3.9 Application to the Study of Ukraine's Bargaining Position vis-à-vis Russia.....	53
Part 2 Key Gas-related Issues Prior to the Conflicts.....	56
4 The Role of Gas in Ukrainian-Russian Relations in the 1990s.....	56
4.1 Introductory Remarks.....	56
4.2 Political Economy of Energy Dependence.....	57
4.3 Bilateral Issues in the 1990s.....	59
4.4 Gas Relations and Bilateral Disputes.....	61
4.5 Key Events and Issues in 1992.....	63
4.6 Key Events and Issues in 1993.....	64
4.7 Key Events and Issues in 1994.....	67
4.8 Key events and Issues in 1995 and Lazarenko's Gas Market Reforms.....	68
4.9 Key Events and Issues in 1996.....	72
4.10 Key Events and Issues in 1997.....	74
4.11 Key Events and Issues in 1998.....	75
4.12 Key Events and Issues in 1999.....	76
4.13 Conclusion, Analysis, and Commentary.....	77
5 The Gas Traders.....	79
5.1 Introductory Remarks.....	79
5.2 Barter and Ihor Bakai's Respublika.....	80
5.3 Igor Makarov and Itera.....	84
5.3.1 Beginnings.....	84
5.3.2 Dispute with Ashgabat.....	89
5.3.3 Corporate Scandals and Demise.....	91

5.4 Dmytro Firtash and Eural Trans Gas	99
6 The Role of Gas in Ukraine's Political Economy	106
6.1 Introductory Remarks	106
6.2 Domestic Politics, Oligarchic Groupings, and the Rise of the Dnipro Clan	107
6.3 Lazarenko's Reign and the Role of United Energy Systems of Ukraine (UESU).....	109
6.4 Rent Seeking in the Energy Sector	114
6.5 Yulia Tymoshenko's Reforms	118
Part 3 The 2006 Gas Conflict: A Two-Level Analysis.....	125
7 Introduction and pre-Crisis Events	125
7.1 Introductory Remarks	125
7.2 Early 2000 Gas Dispute	126
7.3 The Polish Bypass Proposal	127
7.4 The Multilateral GTS Consortium and Domestic Disturbances.....	132
7.5 The Three-sided Chess Game of Turkmen Gas	140
7.6 The Missing 7.8 Bcm Episode	149
7.7 Relevant Pre-Conflict Agreements	152
7.7.1 Agreement on Additional Measures to Ensure Gas Transit Through Ukraine.....	152
7.7.2 Summer 2004 Accords.....	154
7.7.3 Amendment 4	155
7.7.4 Analysis of Agreements	156
8 First Level Analysis.....	157
8.1 Changing Gas Market Realities and Gazprom's New Priorities.....	157
8.2 March 28 Meeting and Consequences.....	159
8.3 Russian Gas Price Offensive and a War of Documents	162
8.4 Conflict Escalation and January 1 Gas Cutoff	164
9 Second Level Analysis	170
9.1 Introductory Remarks	170
9.2 Political Developments in Russia	170
9.3 Orange Revolution in Ukraine	172
9.4 Orange Victory and Orange Split.....	173
9.5 RosUkrEnergo (RUE).....	176
10 Agreements and Conclusion	181
10.1 January 4 Agreement.....	181
10.2 Revelation of Additional Agreements.....	184
10.3 Concluding Remarks	188
Part 4 The 2009 Gas Conflict: A Two-Level Analysis.....	189
11 Introduction and pre-Crisis Events	189
11.1 Introductory Remarks.....	189
11.2 Impact and Consequences of 2006 Gas Agreements	189
11.3 Changes in Turkmen Gas Supplies	194
11.4 Russian-Ukrainian Gas Relations in late 2007/early 2008	198
11.5 Russia's Perception of Ukraine's NATO Ambitions	208
12 First Level Analysis.....	211
12.1 Introductory Remarks.....	211
12.2 The Putin-Tymoshenko Memorandum	212
12.3 The Dubyna-Miller Agreement.....	215
12.4 Ukraine's Debt and Intensification of Conflict	216
12.5 Negotiations Failure and Oleh Dubyna's Alleged Recall	221
12.6 Gas Cutoff and Principal Developments	225
12.7 The Initial Bargaining Stance of the Ukrainian Government	235
12.8 Technical/Linepack Gas	237

12.8 Implications of the June 21, 2002, Transit Contract and Other Legal Instruments	238
12.9 Reverse Flow of GTS and Inability to Resume Supplies between 13-17 January	243
12.10 Status of Putin-Tymoshenko Memorandum	247
12.11 The Final Gas Price for 2009	248
13 Second Level Analysis	251
13.1 Introductory Remarks	251
13.2 Ukrainian Political Instability	251
13.2.1 Elections and 2006 Political Crisis	252
13.2.2 2007 Political Crisis and New Elections	256
13.2.3 Tymoshenko Government and Disputes with Yushchenko	261
13.2.4 War in Georgia and Ukraine's Position	265
13.2.5 2008 Political Crisis, Coalition Dissolution, and Reconstitution	266
13.3 Role of RosUkrEnergo and Dmytro Firtash	271
13.3.1 RUE's Impact on Ukrainian Domestic Politics	273
13.3.2 RUE's Business Model and Raison d'être	276
13.3.3 RUE and UGE's Role on the Ukrainian Gas Market	279
13.3.4 Privat-UGE Row	280
13.3.5 Tymoshenko's Alleged Attempt to Replace RUE with Itera	286
13.3.6 Privat's Attempt to Buy RUE	286
13.4 The Gas Transit Network Consortium Issue	288
13.5 Tymoshenko's January Showdown with Boyko/Lyovochkin/Firtash/Yushchenko	292
14 Agreements, Subsequent Events, Conclusion, and 2014 Stockholm Litigation.	299
14.1 2009 Gas Supply and Transit Contracts	300
14.2 Commentary and Analysis of the Agreement	303
14.2.1 Impact of the Pricing Formula on Ukraine and on Relations with Moscow	305
14.2.2 Stockholm Arbitration Institute Case over the 11 bcm	308
14.2.3 Tymoshenko Trial and Sentencing	311
14.3 Conclusion and Further Repercussions	317
14.3.1 Concluding Remarks	317
14.3.2 Consequences and Key Events after the 2009 Conflict	319
14.4 Litigation at the Arbitration Institute of the Stockholm Chamber of Commerce	323
15 Conclusion	328
15.1 General Remarks	328
15.2 Key Findings	329
15.3 Findings and Reflections on the 2006 Crisis	330
15.4 Findings and Reflections on the 2009 Crisis	332
15.5 Tracking Changes Across Four Dimensions	335
15.6 2022 Invasion of Ukraine and Repercussions for the European Gas Trade	338
Bibliography	343
Primary English Language Sources:	343
Secondary English Language Sources:	343
Primary Russian Language Sources:	356
Secondary Russian Language Sources:	360
Primary Ukrainian Language Sources:	396
Secondary Ukrainian Language Sources	399
Samenvatting	404
Curriculum vitae	405