



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The unruly image: memory and transmission in Argentina.

Saab, A.P.

Citation

Saab, A. P. (2024, October 15). *The unruly image: memory and transmission in Argentina*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4094509>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4094509>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

THE UNRULY IMAGE
Memory and Transmission in Argentina

Ana Paula Saab



foto: Fígona Colectivo Fotográfico

The Unruly image
Memory and Transmission in Argentina

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden op
gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
ter verdediging op dinsdag 15 oktober 2024
klokke 11.30 uur
door Ana Paula Saab
geboren te Buenos Aires, Argentina
in 1971

Promotores

Prof. dr. E.J. van Alphen

Prof. dr. M. Boletsi

Copromotor

Dr. C. Wanschelbaum (Luján University, Buenos Aires, Argentina)

Promotiecommissie

Prof. dr. Brigitte Adriaensen (Radboud University Nijmegen)

Prof. dr. Patricio Silva

Dr. Reindert Dhont (Utrecht University)

Dr. Nanne Timmer

Dr. Nidesh Lawtoo

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	8
INTRODUCTION	9
ADELINA'S GAZE	9
OBJECTIVES AND RESEARCH QUESTION	11
THEORETICAL AND METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS	12
SUMMARY OF THE CHAPTERS	24
PART 1: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND HISTORICAL CONTEXT	27
INTRODUCTION TO PART 1	27
LAUNDERED PHOTOS	28
CHAPTER 1: THEORETICAL APPROACHES TO THE CONCEPT OF MEMORY	30
MEMORY AND NARRATION	30
INDIVIDUAL MEMORY AND COLLECTIVE MEMORY	33
HERETICAL, CLANDESTINE, OR PROHIBITED MEMORIES	38
MEMORY AND POLITICS	39
MEMORY AND TEMPORALITY	42
MEMORY AND FORGETTING	45
MEMORY AND ARCHIVE	52
CHAPTER 2: THE LAST MILITARY DICTATORSHIP IN ARGENTINA	58
INTRODUCTION	58
THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT	59
THE STATE'S NARRATIVE: "WHO'S THE ENEMY?"	61
THE DISAPPEARANCE AS A TECHNOLOGY OF POWER	63
THE BATTLES OF THE MOTHERS	68
CHAPTER 3: THE TRANSMISSION OF THE RECENT PAST	78
INTRODUCTION	78
TRANSMISSION AND ITS CONDITIONS	80
<i>Transmission and subjectivity</i>	80
<i>Transmission and temporality</i>	84
<i>Transmission and politics</i>	86
<i>Transmission as a visual and emotional plot</i>	90
<i>Memory practices and pedagogy</i>	93
CHAPTER 4: IMAGE-SPACE	97
FROM STORAGE ARCHIVE TO IMAGE-SPACE	97
POWER IS ALWAYS OPTIMISTIC	97
THE LESSON OF WALTER BENJAMIN	99
A DIALECTICAL RELATIONSHIP WITH THE PAST	100
MEMORY PRACTICES AS IMAGE-SPACE	102
THE CITY AND ITS SYMPTOMS	106
THE BLASPHEMOUS TWIST	107
THE CHILD'S GAZE	109
THE RECONTEXTUALISED IMAGE	110
1ST YEAR, 6TH DIVISION, CLASS PHOTO 1967	111
CONCLUSIONS	111
PART 2: TOWARDS THREE CONFIGURATIONS OF MEMORY	116
INTRODUCTION TO PART 2	116
EDUCATION AND BARBARISM	117
THREE CONFIGURATIONS OF MEMORY	121
CHAPTER 5: THE PHOTOGRAPH AS A DOCUMENT	124
INTRODUCTION	124
THE SILHOUETTES	124

The Unruly Image: Memory and Transmission in Argentina

PHOTOGRAPHY AND MEMORY PRACTICES	132
THE PHOTOGRAPH AND THE ARCHIVE.....	140
CONCLUSIONS.....	153
CHAPTER 6: OVERFLOWS BETWEEN ART AND POLITICS	156
INTRODUCTION	156
THINGS TOLD AND CINEMA.....	157
La historia oficial (The Official Story).....	157
<i>Things Told and the Children's Films</i>	158
<i>The Current Cinema of Memory: Rojo (Red)</i>	163
THINGS TOLD: MONTAGE AND DISMOUNTING	165
<i>Family Photomontages</i>	165
<i>Esquina militarizada (Militarised corner)</i>	172
THE INSTABILITY OF THE PAST	175
TO SEE OR NOT TO SEE: THAT IS THE QUESTION	176
IMAGES FROM HELL	178
<i>Stolen Photographs</i>	181
RES, <i>DUNAMIS: ENTRE EL DESASTRE Y LA ESPERANZA (DUNAMIS: BETWEEN DISASTER AND HOPE)</i> AND <i>TOSCA MEMORIA (COARSE MEMORY)</i>	186
THE FINE LINE OF MEMORY: THE PASSAGES IN THE WORK OF SEBASTIÁN DÍAZ MORALES.....	190
CONCLUSIONS.....	196
CHAPTER 7: IMAGES UNDER SCHOOL REGIME	199
INTRODUCTION	200
THE UNEXPECTED ALLIANCE.....	201
<i>A Momentum That Is Slowing Down</i>	203
"EDUCATION AND MEMORY" PROGRAMME	207
<i>The Integration of Memory into Schooling</i>	209
<i>School History Education and the Concept of Citizenship</i>	212
<i>Citizenship and Memory</i>	214
THE VOLUME <i>PENSAR LA DICTADURA: TERRORISMO DE ESTADO EN ARGENTINA (REFLECTIONS ON THE DICTATORSHIP: STATE TERRORISM IN ARGENTINA)</i>	218
<i>Corpus Selection Criteria</i>	218
<i>Volume Description: Pensar la dictadura: terrorismo de Estado en Argentina (Reflections on the Dictatorship: State Terrorism in Argentina)</i>	221
THE PLACE OF THE IMAGE IN SCHOOL PROGRAMMES	223
<i>Image Sequences: Two Series of images</i>	224
<i>Reference Table of Images</i>	232
<i>Considerations on the Content of the Images</i>	234
SECOND SERIES: MEMORY PASSAGES	236
<i>Passage I: Memory Boards</i>	236
<i>Passage II: The Fragmented Image</i>	245
<i>Passage III: New Obscurities</i>	256
CONCLUSIONS.....	260
<i>The Initial Images and the Abrupt Contrasts</i>	260
<i>To Look Closer</i>	260
<i>Cover and Back Cover Images</i>	261
<i>Images in the Body of The Text</i>	263
<i>Considerations on the Images in the Book</i>	269
FINAL CONCLUSIONS	275
THE EVENT AND ITS CONSEQUENCES.....	275
MEMORY AND POLITICS	276
THE MEDIA IMAGE AND THE DIALECTICAL IMAGE.....	279
THE RIGHT-WING LIFE	282
BIBLIOGRAPHY	289
SUMMARY	319

The Unruly Image: Memory and Transmission in Argentina

SAMENVATTING	321
CURRICULUM VITAE	324
PROPOSITIONS	325

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I especially want to thank Professor E.J. van Alphen not only for accepting me as a student but for the decisive contribution he made to my research, always getting me out of theoretical difficulties with clarity and elegance. I also want to thank him for his kindness and willingness to help me at all times. I also thank Professor María Boletsi for her great kindness and understanding, the effectiveness of her suggestions, comments and corrections and the general guidance she provided me during all these years. This book would not have been possible without the constant support of both of them. I am also grateful Professor Cinthia Wanschelbaum for her supportive and understanding attitude and her specific theoretical contributions that protected me from several inaccuracies.

I appreciate the Department of Science and Technology of the National University of Luján, which granted me the Research Scholarship that allowed the financing of this doctoral project. In a very special way I want to thank Gabriel Inzaurre for the role he played in this thesis. His classes on art and politics and his help as a simultaneous translator and proofreader have been crucial to solving the different problems of this work. The contributions of the historian Paula Spregelburd have been of fundamental importance in the area of History of Education. There are those who accompanied me at work and in friendship: the Educational Theories Team II and the Department of Education of the National University of Luján, Claudia Soro, Emiliano Cuevas, Adrián Vicente, Rosana Ponce, Paula Morayta and Yamila Pochet. A notable mention goes to Marisela Trevin and Federico Gascón, managers of the translation tasks and the English classes.

A thesis demands a lot from the family environment. I want to mention here my brothers Eduardo and Andrés and, with enormous gratitude, my daughters Nadia and Lucía for the patience they have had with me and the help they have given me throughout these very complicated years. Finally, I want to thank my mother, Professor Ada Morandi, and my father, the historian Jorge Saab whose advice has been invaluable. This work is dedicated to them.