



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

**Legal aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR):
regulation of ADR under international space law and
the way forward for legal development**

Tian, Z.

Citation

Tian, Z. (2024, September 5). *Legal aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR): regulation of ADR under international space law and the way forward for legal development*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4082461>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4082461>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Legal Aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR)

Regulation of ADR under International Space Law
and the Way Forward for Legal Development

Legal Aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR)

Regulation of ADR under International Space
Law and the Way Forward for Legal Development

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 5 september 2024
klokke 10.00 uur

door

Zhuang Tian

geboren te Guangzhou, China

in 1991

Promotoren: prof. dr. S.J. Truxal
 prof. dr. D.A. Dam-de Jong
Copromotor: dr. T.L. Masson-Zwaan

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. N.M. Blokker
 prof. dr. C. Stahn
 dr. H.J. Woker
 prof. dr. M. Hofmann (University of Luxembourg, Luxembourg)
 prof. dr. Y. Radi (Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium)

ISBN: 978-94-6473-541-3

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2024 Zhuang Tian

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Table of Contents

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IX
LIST OF PRINCIPAL ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	XI
1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Research Context	1
1.2 The Concept of International Space Law	6
1.3 Research Questions	11
1.4 Structure	11
1.5 Methodology	13
2 GENERAL OVERVIEW OF SPACE DEBRIS AND ADR	21
2.1 Overview of the Space Debris Problem	21
2.2 Risks Posed by Space Debris	25
2.2.1 Risks to Satellites	26
2.2.2 Risks to Crewed Spacecraft	27
2.2.3 Risks to the Ground	28
2.2.4 Risks to Space Sustainability	30
2.3 Overview of the Status of ADR and Issues relating to its Governance	32
2.3.1 Current Status of ADR Missions	34
2.3.2 Issues relating to the Governance of ADR	38
2.4 Chapter Conclusion	42
3 APPLICATION OF THE HARD LAW PILLAR TO SPACE DEBRIS AND ADR	45
3.1 <i>Issue 1: Obligation of Debris Mitigation and Remediation</i>	46
3.1.1 The Freedom of Exploration and Use of Outer Space and the Province of All Mankind Principle	46
3.1.2 The Principle of Non-Appropriation of Outer Space	48
3.1.3 Environmental Protection of Outer Space under the Outer Space Treaty	50
3.1.3.1 International Cooperation and Due Regard	51
3.1.3.2 Avoidance of Harmful Contamination	54
3.1.3.3 Appropriate International Consultation	59
3.1.4 Application of International Environmental Law to Space Debris	62
3.1.5 State Responsibility for National Space Activities	65
3.2 <i>Issue 2: International Liability for Damage Caused by Space Objects</i>	69
3.2.1 Relation Between “Space Object” and “Space Debris”	71

3.2.2	Absolute Liability for Damage Caused on the Ground	74
3.2.3	Fault-Based Liability for Damage Caused in Outer Space	75
3.2.4	Liability for Damage Caused by Knock-on Collisions	77
3.2.5	Implications of the Liability Regime for ADR Activities	79
3.3	<i>Issue 3: Prior Consent as a Prerequisite for the Removal of Debris under Foreign Jurisdiction</i>	80
3.3.1	Jurisdiction, Control, and Ownership Regarding Space Objects	80
3.3.2	Registration of Space Objects	84
3.3.3	Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness and Non-Consensual ADR	87
3.3.3.1	Distress	88
3.3.3.2	Necessity	90
3.3.4	Security Risks of Non-Consensual ADR	92
3.4	<i>Issue 4: Legal Restrictions on the Use of ADR Technologies</i>	95
3.4.1	Prohibition to Place Weapons of Mass Destruction in Outer Space	96
3.4.2	The Prohibition on the Threat or Use of Force and the Right of Self-Defence	98
3.4.3	Lack of Specific Rules to Address Dual-Use Concerns	102
3.5	Chapter Conclusion	103
4	RELEVANCE OF THE SOFT LAW PILLAR TO SPACE DEBRIS AND ADR	107
4.1	<i>Issue 1: International Guidelines and Standards Relevant to the Control of Space Debris</i>	110
4.1.1	International Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines and Standards	111
4.1.1.1	IADC Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines	111
4.1.1.2	COPUOS Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines	115
4.1.1.3	Other International Guidelines and Standards regarding Debris Mitigation	117
4.1.1.4	Application of the Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines to ADR Activities	122
4.1.1.5	Implementation of the Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines and Standards at the National Level	125
4.1.2	The LTS Guidelines	128
4.1.2.1	Development of the LTS Guidelines	129
4.1.2.2	Relevance of the LTS Guidelines to ADR	132
4.1.2.3	Implementation of the LTS Guidelines at the National Level	136
4.1.3	Section Conclusion	139
4.2	<i>Issue 2: The Role of Soft Law for the Clarification of “Fault” and the Industry-Led Initiatives in Developing ADR Guidelines</i>	140
4.2.1	The Role of Soft Law for Clarifying the Notion of “Fault”	141
4.2.2	CONFERS Guiding Principles and Recommended Practices	146

4.2.3	ISO Standard 24330: From Industry-Led Initiative to International Standard	150
4.2.4	Space Safety Coalition Best Practices for Space Sustainability	152
4.2.5	Space Sustainability Rating	154
4.2.6	Section Conclusion	156
4.3	<i>Issue 3: Recommendations Regarding Registration and the Need for Legal Development to Facilitate Consensual ADR</i>	158
4.4	<i>Issue 4: Relevance of Transparency and Confidence-Building Measures for Addressing Dual-Use Concerns over ADR</i>	159
4.4.1	Information Exchange on Space Policies	162
4.4.2	Information Exchange on Space Objects and Activities	163
4.4.3	Risk Reduction Notifications	164
4.4.4	Communication Channels and Consultative Mechanisms	164
4.4.5	Familiarisation Visits	165
4.4.6	Section Conclusion	166
4.5	Chapter Conclusion	167
5	FURTHER DEVELOPMENT OF INTERNATIONAL SPACE LAW FOR ADR ACTIVITIES	173
5.1	<i>Issue 1: Commitments to Tackle the Space Debris Problem</i>	174
5.1.1	Unilateral Commitment to Debris Mitigation and Remediation	175
5.1.1.1	Moratorium on Destructive Direct-Ascent Anti-Satellite Missile Testing	176
5.1.1.2	Shortening the Post-Mission Disposal Rule to 5 Years	178
5.1.1.3	Substance of Unilateral Commitments	179
5.1.2	Multilateral Commitment to Debris Mitigation and Remediation	182
5.1.3	Global Commitment to Debris Mitigation and Remediation	185
5.1.4	Involvement of All Stakeholders: The Net Zero Space Initiative	189
5.2	<i>Issue 2: Establishment of Safety Guidelines and Standards for ADR</i>	191
5.2.1	Draft ADR Guideline Proposed in the Development of the LTS Guidelines	193
5.2.2	Legal Developments in the US Relating to the Governance of ADR	197
5.2.3	The Japanese Guidelines and Standards Relevant to ADR	200
5.2.4	The Way Forward for the Development of Safety Norms for ADR Activities	203
5.3	<i>Issue 3: Recommendations to Promote Consensual ADR Operations</i>	207
5.3.1	Consultation and International Cooperation for ADR	207
5.3.1.1	Apportionment of Liability for Damage Caused	209
5.3.1.2	Legal Arrangements for Export Control	211
5.3.2	Provision of Information on the Removability of Space Debris	213

5.3.3	Removal of Space Objects of Unknown Origin	215
5.3.4	Adoption of a UNGA Resolution to Promote International Cooperation on ADR	219
5.4	<i>Issue 4</i> : Norms of Responsible Behaviours to Address Dual-Use Concerns over ADR	220
5.4.1	The Way Forward for Normative Development to Reduce Space Threats	221
5.4.2	Development of Norms of Responsible Behaviours for ADR	223
5.5	Chapter Conclusion	227
6	CONCLUDING REMARKS	231
	SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	237
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	253
	CURRICULUM VITAE	259

Aknowledgements

My appreciation goes first to my supervisors, who have very kindly and patiently instructed, guided and supported me to accomplish my PhD thesis. Thank you, Professor Steven Truxal, for arranging the regular meetings with me, leading me to head towards the finish line, and telling me that your door is always open if I have any needs in doing my research. Thank you, Professor Daniëlla Dam-de Jong, for mentoring me closely to navigate through the complex system of public international law, especially international environmental law. And thank you, Assistant Professor Tanja Masson-Zwaan, for introducing me to the fantastic world of space law, enlightening me with your wisdom and expertise in this fascinating field, and reviewing deeply my draft manuscript and providing me with your thoughtful feedback. Many thanks go also to Professor Pablo Mendes De Leon for your support and insight in my master's studies and in the early stages of my PhD research.

I would also like to express my great appreciation to my nice colleagues at the International Institute of Air and Space Law (IIASL) of Leiden Law School at Leiden University. The Institute has not only granted me enormous support, but the team activities, such as the cheese-making on a farm and the visit to a brewery, have enriched my experiences in the Netherlands. Specifically, thank you Hilkje for helping me to extend my enrolment and scheduling the supervision meetings for me. Thank you Natascha for your kind help in my PhD application process and for aiding me with my onboarding. Thank you Dimitra, it is my great pleasure to co-coach the IIASL space law moot court with you, and I have learned a lot from you in this process. And thank you, Benjamyn, Jin, Tuvana, Yuran and Wanlu, it is very pleasant to be your colleague and to work and talk with you.

I am grateful to the Stichting Space Professionals Foundation for your generous financial support that enables me to participate in the Space Studies Program (SSP) at the International Space University (ISU). This once-in-a-lifetime experience has enabled me to deepen my understanding of space in general, inspired me in the research and practice of space law, and provided me with the opportunity to build connections with many close friends. Many thanks to all the staff and participants in the SSP 21, including in particular Aiden, Alberto, Alexandra, Antonio, Charlotte, Claudiu, Federico, Gary, Gautier, Grant, Joao, Ori, Stefan, Victor, and Xiaochen. Space is beyond doubt gorgeous, but what is even more stunning for me is our friendship built through our common enthusiasm for space.

To my dad Ziguang and my mom Qinzhen, and my grandparents, Muyan and Lanxiang, thank you for raising me up and providing me with endless love and support that have enabled me to reach this point. I would also like to thank my dear friends Annemarie, Feiye, Mike, Moyu, Octavie, Tian, Weidong, Wenlan, Wensen, Yilin, and Xuezi, and many other friends who have played badminton, board games and video games with me. The time with you has created many enjoyable memories during my stay in Leiden. My thanks go also to the China Scholarship Council for the PhD scholarship sponsoring my research at Leiden University.

A special thanks goes to our fluffy friend Mimimo. He is a talkative cat as he often shouts “lai shua ma” (an attempted translation from feline language into Sichuan dialect meaning “come play with me”) in days and nights and does not stop shouting until we play fetch using garlic, blueberries or grapes. He is also a consoling cat as he gives me a hug most of the time when I need, which has great healing effects after a long day of PhD research.

Thank you, my beloved life teammate Shaoyu. It always gives me power and strength when I recall our fantastic journeys to embrace the gentle summer breeze with the cicadas singing along the Mediterranean coast, to listen to classical music and moist our eyes with tears at the Musikverein, and to enjoy the view of Leiden high from the sky through the Starflyer. I am looking forward to opening more boxes of chocolates with you in the future. While pursuing a PhD may be described as a lonely journey as it focuses on independent research, it is not anymore with you accompanying me along the way. Together as a team, I am confident that we can achieve the goals we set, become the persons we want, and most importantly, live a happy life.

List of Principal Acronyms and Abbreviations

ADR	Active Debris Removal
CAM	Collision Avoidance Manoeuvre
CONFERS	Consortium for Execution of Rendezvous and Servicing Operations
COPUOS	Committee on the Peaceful Uses of Outer Space (UN)
COSPAR	Committee on Space Research
ESA	European Space Agency
FCC	Federal Communications Commission (US)
GEO	Geostationary Orbit
GGE	Group of Governmental Experts
IAA	International Academy of Astronautics
IADC	Inter-Agency Debris Coordination Committee
ICJ	International Court of Justice
IGA	Intergovernmental Agreement (ISS)
IISL	International Institute of Space Law
ILC	International Law Commission
ISO	International Organization for Standardization
ISS	International Space Station
ITAR	International Traffic in Arms Regulations (US)
ITU	International Telecommunication Union
JAXA	Japan Aerospace Exploration Agency
LEO	Low Earth Orbit
LSC	Legal Subcommittee (COPUOS)
LTS	Long-Term Sustainability
NASA	National Aeronautics and Space Administration (US)
NDCs	Nationally Determined Contributions
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OEWG	Open-Ended Working Group
OOS	On-Orbit Servicing
OST	Outer Space Treaty
RPO	Rendezvous and Proximity Operations
SSA	Space Situational Awareness
SSC	Space Safety Coalition
SSN	Space Surveillance Network
SSR	Space Sustainability Rating
STSC	Scientific and Technical Subcommittee (COPUOS)
SWF	Secure World Foundation
TCBMs	Transparency and Confidence-Building Measures
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations

UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNOOSA	United Nations Office for Outer Space Affairs
UNSG	United Nations Secretary-General
US	United States
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties