



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

**Legal aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR):
regulation of ADR under international space law and
the way forward for legal development**

Tian, Z.

Citation

Tian, Z. (2024, September 5). *Legal aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR): regulation of ADR under international space law and the way forward for legal development*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4082461>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/4082461>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Legal Aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR)

Regulation of ADR under International Space Law
and the Way Forward for Legal Development

Legal Aspects of Active Debris Removal (ADR)

Regulation of ADR under International Space
Law and the Way Forward for Legal Development

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 5 september 2024
klokke 10.00 uur

door

Zhuang Tian

geboren te Guangzhou, China

in 1991

Promotoren: prof. dr. S.J. Truxal
 prof. dr. D.A. Dam-de Jong
Copromotor: dr. T.L. Masson-Zwaan

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. N.M. Blokker
 prof. dr. C. Stahn
 dr. H.J. Woker
 prof. dr. M. Hofmann (University of Luxembourg, Luxembourg)
 prof. dr. Y. Radi (Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium)

ISBN: 978-94-6473-541-3

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2024 Zhuang Tian

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Table of Contents

| | |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| AKNOWLEDGEMENTS | IX |
| LIST OF PRINCIPAL ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS | XI |
| 1 GENERAL INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 Research Context | 1 |
| 1.2 The Concept of International Space Law | 6 |
| 1.3 Research Questions | 11 |
| 1.4 Structure | 11 |
| 1.5 Methodology | 13 |
| 2 GENERAL OVERVIEW OF SPACE DEBRIS AND ADR | 21 |
| 2.1 Overview of the Space Debris Problem | 21 |
| 2.2 Risks Posed by Space Debris | 25 |
| 2.2.1 Risks to Satellites | 26 |
| 2.2.2 Risks to Crewed Spacecraft | 27 |
| 2.2.3 Risks to the Ground | 28 |
| 2.2.4 Risks to Space Sustainability | 30 |
| 2.3 Overview of the Status of ADR and Issues relating to its Governance | 32 |
| 2.3.1 Current Status of ADR Missions | 34 |
| 2.3.2 Issues relating to the Governance of ADR | 38 |
| 2.4 Chapter Conclusion | 42 |
| 3 APPLICATION OF THE HARD LAW PILLAR TO SPACE DEBRIS AND ADR | 45 |
| 3.1 <i>Issue 1: Obligation of Debris Mitigation and Remediation</i> | 46 |
| 3.1.1 The Freedom of Exploration and Use of Outer Space and the Province of All Mankind Principle | 46 |
| 3.1.2 The Principle of Non-Appropriation of Outer Space | 48 |
| 3.1.3 Environmental Protection of Outer Space under the Outer Space Treaty | 50 |
| 3.1.3.1 International Cooperation and Due Regard | 51 |
| 3.1.3.2 Avoidance of Harmful Contamination | 54 |
| 3.1.3.3 Appropriate International Consultation | 59 |
| 3.1.4 Application of International Environmental Law to Space Debris | 62 |
| 3.1.5 State Responsibility for National Space Activities | 65 |
| 3.2 <i>Issue 2: International Liability for Damage Caused by Space Objects</i> | 69 |
| 3.2.1 Relation Between “Space Object” and “Space Debris” | 71 |

| | | |
|---------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 3.2.2 | Absolute Liability for Damage Caused on the Ground | 74 |
| 3.2.3 | Fault-Based Liability for Damage Caused in Outer Space | 75 |
| 3.2.4 | Liability for Damage Caused by Knock-on Collisions | 77 |
| 3.2.5 | Implications of the Liability Regime for ADR Activities | 79 |
| 3.3 | <i>Issue 3: Prior Consent as a Prerequisite for the Removal of Debris under Foreign Jurisdiction</i> | 80 |
| 3.3.1 | Jurisdiction, Control, and Ownership Regarding Space Objects | 80 |
| 3.3.2 | Registration of Space Objects | 84 |
| 3.3.3 | Circumstances Precluding Wrongfulness and Non-Consensual ADR | 87 |
| 3.3.3.1 | Distress | 88 |
| 3.3.3.2 | Necessity | 90 |
| 3.3.4 | Security Risks of Non-Consensual ADR | 92 |
| 3.4 | <i>Issue 4: Legal Restrictions on the Use of ADR Technologies</i> | 95 |
| 3.4.1 | Prohibition to Place Weapons of Mass Destruction in Outer Space | 96 |
| 3.4.2 | The Prohibition on the Threat or Use of Force and the Right of Self-Defence | 98 |
| 3.4.3 | Lack of Specific Rules to Address Dual-Use Concerns | 102 |
| 3.5 | Chapter Conclusion | 103 |
| 4 | RELEVANCE OF THE SOFT LAW PILLAR TO SPACE DEBRIS AND ADR | 107 |
| 4.1 | <i>Issue 1: International Guidelines and Standards Relevant to the Control of Space Debris</i> | 110 |
| 4.1.1 | International Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines and Standards | 111 |
| 4.1.1.1 | IADC Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines | 111 |
| 4.1.1.2 | COPUOS Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines | 115 |
| 4.1.1.3 | Other International Guidelines and Standards regarding Debris Mitigation | 117 |
| 4.1.1.4 | Application of the Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines to ADR Activities | 122 |
| 4.1.1.5 | Implementation of the Space Debris Mitigation Guidelines and Standards at the National Level | 125 |
| 4.1.2 | The LTS Guidelines | 128 |
| 4.1.2.1 | Development of the LTS Guidelines | 129 |
| 4.1.2.2 | Relevance of the LTS Guidelines to ADR | 132 |
| 4.1.2.3 | Implementation of the LTS Guidelines at the National Level | 136 |
| 4.1.3 | Section Conclusion | 139 |
| 4.2 | <i>Issue 2: The Role of Soft Law for the Clarification of “Fault” and the Industry-Led Initiatives in Developing ADR Guidelines</i> | 140 |
| 4.2.1 | The Role of Soft Law for Clarifying the Notion of “Fault” | 141 |
| 4.2.2 | CONFERS Guiding Principles and Recommended Practices | 146 |

| | | |
|---------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4.2.3 | ISO Standard 24330: From Industry-Led Initiative to International Standard | 150 |
| 4.2.4 | Space Safety Coalition Best Practices for Space Sustainability | 152 |
| 4.2.5 | Space Sustainability Rating | 154 |
| 4.2.6 | Section Conclusion | 156 |
| 4.3 | <i>Issue 3: Recommendations Regarding Registration and the Need for Legal Development to Facilitate Consensual ADR</i> | 158 |
| 4.4 | <i>Issue 4: Relevance of Transparency and Confidence-Building Measures for Addressing Dual-Use Concerns over ADR</i> | 159 |
| 4.4.1 | Information Exchange on Space Policies | 162 |
| 4.4.2 | Information Exchange on Space Objects and Activities | 163 |
| 4.4.3 | Risk Reduction Notifications | 164 |
| 4.4.4 | Communication Channels and Consultative Mechanisms | 164 |
| 4.4.5 | Familiarisation Visits | 165 |
| 4.4.6 | Section Conclusion | 166 |
| 4.5 | Chapter Conclusion | 167 |
| 5 | FURTHER DEVELOPMENT OF INTERNATIONAL SPACE LAW FOR ADR ACTIVITIES | 173 |
| 5.1 | <i>Issue 1: Commitments to Tackle the Space Debris Problem</i> | 174 |
| 5.1.1 | Unilateral Commitment to Debris Mitigation and Remediation | 175 |
| 5.1.1.1 | Moratorium on Destructive Direct-Ascent Anti-Satellite Missile Testing | 176 |
| 5.1.1.2 | Shortening the Post-Mission Disposal Rule to 5 Years | 178 |
| 5.1.1.3 | Substance of Unilateral Commitments | 179 |
| 5.1.2 | Multilateral Commitment to Debris Mitigation and Remediation | 182 |
| 5.1.3 | Global Commitment to Debris Mitigation and Remediation | 185 |
| 5.1.4 | Involvement of All Stakeholders: The Net Zero Space Initiative | 189 |
| 5.2 | <i>Issue 2: Establishment of Safety Guidelines and Standards for ADR</i> | 191 |
| 5.2.1 | Draft ADR Guideline Proposed in the Development of the LTS Guidelines | 193 |
| 5.2.2 | Legal Developments in the US Relating to the Governance of ADR | 197 |
| 5.2.3 | The Japanese Guidelines and Standards Relevant to ADR | 200 |
| 5.2.4 | The Way Forward for the Development of Safety Norms for ADR Activities | 203 |
| 5.3 | <i>Issue 3: Recommendations to Promote Consensual ADR Operations</i> | 207 |
| 5.3.1 | Consultation and International Cooperation for ADR | 207 |
| 5.3.1.1 | Apportionment of Liability for Damage Caused | 209 |
| 5.3.1.2 | Legal Arrangements for Export Control | 211 |
| 5.3.2 | Provision of Information on the Removability of Space Debris | 213 |

| | | |
|-------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5.3.3 | Removal of Space Objects of Unknown Origin | 215 |
| 5.3.4 | Adoption of a UNGA Resolution to Promote International Cooperation on ADR | 219 |
| 5.4 | <i>Issue 4</i> : Norms of Responsible Behaviours to Address Dual-Use Concerns over ADR | 220 |
| 5.4.1 | The Way Forward for Normative Development to Reduce Space Threats | 221 |
| 5.4.2 | Development of Norms of Responsible Behaviours for ADR | 223 |
| 5.5 | Chapter Conclusion | 227 |
| 6 | CONCLUDING REMARKS | 231 |
| | SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY | 237 |
| | SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY) | 253 |
| | CURRICULUM VITAE | 259 |

Aknowledgements

My appreciation goes first to my supervisors, who have very kindly and patiently instructed, guided and supported me to accomplish my PhD thesis. Thank you, Professor Steven Truxal, for arranging the regular meetings with me, leading me to head towards the finish line, and telling me that your door is always open if I have any needs in doing my research. Thank you, Professor Daniëlla Dam-de Jong, for mentoring me closely to navigate through the complex system of public international law, especially international environmental law. And thank you, Assistant Professor Tanja Masson-Zwaan, for introducing me to the fantastic world of space law, enlightening me with your wisdom and expertise in this fascinating field, and reviewing deeply my draft manuscript and providing me with your thoughtful feedback. Many thanks go also to Professor Pablo Mendes De Leon for your support and insight in my master's studies and in the early stages of my PhD research.

I would also like to express my great appreciation to my nice colleagues at the International Institute of Air and Space Law (IIASL) of Leiden Law School at Leiden University. The Institute has not only granted me enormous support, but the team activities, such as the cheese-making on a farm and the visit to a brewery, have enriched my experiences in the Netherlands. Specifically, thank you Hilkje for helping me to extend my enrolment and scheduling the supervision meetings for me. Thank you Natascha for your kind help in my PhD application process and for aiding me with my onboarding. Thank you Dimitra, it is my great pleasure to co-coach the IIASL space law moot court with you, and I have learned a lot from you in this process. And thank you, Benjamyn, Jin, Tuvana, Yuran and Wanlu, it is very pleasant to be your colleague and to work and talk with you.

I am grateful to the Stichting Space Professionals Foundation for your generous financial support that enables me to participate in the Space Studies Program (SSP) at the International Space University (ISU). This once-in-a-lifetime experience has enabled me to deepen my understanding of space in general, inspired me in the research and practice of space law, and provided me with the opportunity to build connections with many close friends. Many thanks to all the staff and participants in the SSP 21, including in particular Aiden, Alberto, Alexandra, Antonio, Charlotte, Claudiu, Federico, Gary, Gautier, Grant, Joao, Ori, Stefan, Victor, and Xiaochen. Space is beyond doubt gorgeous, but what is even more stunning for me is our friendship built through our common enthusiasm for space.

To my dad Ziguang and my mom Qinzhen, and my grandparents, Muyan and Lanxiang, thank you for raising me up and providing me with endless love and support that have enabled me to reach this point. I would also like to thank my dear friends Annemarie, Feiye, Mike, Moyu, Octavie, Tian, Weidong, Wenlan, Wensen, Yilin, and Xuezi, and many other friends who have played badminton, board games and video games with me. The time with you has created many enjoyable memories during my stay in Leiden. My thanks go also to the China Scholarship Council for the PhD scholarship sponsoring my research at Leiden University.

A special thanks goes to our fluffy friend Mimimo. He is a talkative cat as he often shouts “lai shua ma” (an attempted translation from feline language into Sichuan dialect meaning “come play with me”) in days and nights and does not stop shouting until we play fetch using garlic, blueberries or grapes. He is also a consoling cat as he gives me a hug most of the time when I need, which has great healing effects after a long day of PhD research.

Thank you, my beloved life teammate Shaoyu. It always gives me power and strength when I recall our fantastic journeys to embrace the gentle summer breeze with the cicadas singing along the Mediterranean coast, to listen to classical music and moist our eyes with tears at the Musikverein, and to enjoy the view of Leiden high from the sky through the Starflyer. I am looking forward to opening more boxes of chocolates with you in the future. While pursuing a PhD may be described as a lonely journey as it focuses on independent research, it is not anymore with you accompanying me along the way. Together as a team, I am confident that we can achieve the goals we set, become the persons we want, and most importantly, live a happy life.

List of Principal Acronyms and Abbreviations

| | |
|---------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|
| ADR | Active Debris Removal |
| CAM | Collision Avoidance Manoeuvre |
| CONFERS | Consortium for Execution of Rendezvous and Servicing Operations |
| COPUOS | Committee on the Peaceful Uses of Outer Space (UN) |
| COSPAR | Committee on Space Research |
| ESA | European Space Agency |
| FCC | Federal Communications Commission (US) |
| GEO | Geostationary Orbit |
| GGE | Group of Governmental Experts |
| IAA | International Academy of Astronautics |
| IADC | Inter-Agency Debris Coordination Committee |
| ICJ | International Court of Justice |
| IGA | Intergovernmental Agreement (ISS) |
| IISL | International Institute of Space Law |
| ILC | International Law Commission |
| ISO | International Organization for Standardization |
| ISS | International Space Station |
| ITAR | International Traffic in Arms Regulations (US) |
| ITU | International Telecommunication Union |
| JAXA | Japan Aerospace Exploration Agency |
| LEO | Low Earth Orbit |
| LSC | Legal Subcommittee (COPUOS) |
| LTS | Long-Term Sustainability |
| NASA | National Aeronautics and Space Administration (US) |
| NDCs | Nationally Determined Contributions |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| OEWG | Open-Ended Working Group |
| OOS | On-Orbit Servicing |
| OST | Outer Space Treaty |
| RPO | Rendezvous and Proximity Operations |
| SSA | Space Situational Awareness |
| SSC | Space Safety Coalition |
| SSN | Space Surveillance Network |
| SSR | Space Sustainability Rating |
| STSC | Scientific and Technical Subcommittee (COPUOS) |
| SWF | Secure World Foundation |
| TCBMs | Transparency and Confidence-Building Measures |
| UK | United Kingdom |
| UN | United Nations |

| | |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------|
| UNCLOS | United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea |
| UNGA | United Nations General Assembly |
| UNOOSA | United Nations Office for Outer Space Affairs |
| UNSG | United Nations Secretary-General |
| US | United States |
| VCLT | Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties |