



Universiteit
Leiden

The Netherlands

Social Subjecthood? The inclusion of (post)colonial migrants in Dutch, French, and British welfare states, 1945-1970

Wolff, E.A.

Citation

Wolff, E. A. (2024, June 18). *Social Subjecthood?: The inclusion of (post)colonial migrants in Dutch, French, and British welfare states, 1945-1970*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3763857>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3763857>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

SOCIAL SUBJECTHOOD?

The Inclusion of
(Post)Colonial Migrants
in Dutch, French, and
British Welfare States,
1945 - 1970



EMILY ANNE WOLFF



Social subjecthood?

The inclusion of (post)colonial migrants in
Dutch, French, and British welfare states, 1945-1970

By Emily Anne Wolff

Colofon

Provided by thesis specialist Ridderprint, ridderprint.nl

ISBN 978-94-6506-117-7

Printing Ridderprint

Layout and design Indah Hijmans, persoonlijkproefschrift.nl

Cover design Andrea Parra Salazar

Social subjecthood?
The inclusion of (post)colonial migrants in
Dutch, French, and British welfare states, 1945-1970

Proefschrift
ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 18 juni 2024
klokke 13.45 uur

door

Emily Anne Wolff
geboren te 's Gravenhage
in 1994

Promotor: Prof. dr. Olaf van Vliet

Co-promotor: Dr. Alexandre Afonso

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. Caelesta Braun
Prof. dr. Cybelle Fox (University of California, Berkeley)
Dr. Ali Meghji (University of Cambridge)
Prof. mr. dr. Erwin Muller
Prof. dr. Marlou Schrover
Dr. Natascha van der Zwan

This dissertation was written within the research project “Borders of Equality,” funded by the Dutch Research Council (NWO) (VIDI Grant 185.159.6289, awarded to Dr. Alexandre Afonso).

To those who moved from colony to metropole in search of a better life, and to their families. Without asking you first, I borrowed your stories – or the silences in the archives where your stories should be – to tell this one. Thank you.

Acknowledgments

For the realisation of this dissertation, and for the professional, intellectual, and personal transformations to which it has given rise, I am indebted to more people than will fit on these pages. What an enviable position to be in.

My PhD was made possible both by the Dutch Research Council and by the support of my supervisors, which came in many forms. Olaf, thank you for your encouragement during moments of uncertainty, for trusting my instincts and helping me to do the same. I have benefited tremendously from your guidance. Alex, you involved Samir and me in your world from day one and I am grateful for the opportunities for growth that this afforded us. Thank you for your feedback, reliability and (seemingly infinite) patience with my (no doubt seemingly infinite) questions about everything under the sun. If I am finding my footing as an academic, it is because of your professional guidance and investment in my well-being.

Special thanks to the staff at the national and local archives of the collections I consulted, whose expertise and familiarity with the collections they preserve were indispensable to my research. I happily combined trips to French and British archives with two research visits. Thank you to Allison Rovny and Olivier Godechot for having me at the Max Planck-Sciences Po Center in Paris, and to Bruno Palier and Yann Scioldo-Zürcher-Levi for the fruitful exchanges. Many thanks to Odette Rogers and Ali Meghji for coordinating my stay at the Department of Sociology at the University of Cambridge. Ali, it was a privilege to benefit from your mentorship, without which my theory section would be unrecognisable. Thank you for reviewing my work so thoughtfully.

My profound gratitude is due every other member of my doctoral committee as well. Natascha, thank you for all the inspiration, reading suggestions and advice I was fortunate enough to receive throughout the course of my PhD. When you taught me the word “defamiliarise,” you introduced me to my own research aims. Cybelle, thank you for having drawn up a blueprint for studying racial in- and exclusions without compromising their complexity, and for graciously entertaining the questions of a first-year PhD across the ocean five years ago. I feel very fortunate to have benefited from your insights at the end of the process as well. Marlou, thank you for holding me to such high standards and engaging so meticulously with my Dutch empirics. Caelesta, thank you for your comments and for your persistent commitment to making academia a better place.

Countless others took the time to read and discuss my work. My warmest appreciation to anonymous reviewers of the article based on my Dutch chapter as well as Pavithra Suryanarayan, Inés Valdez, Julia Moses, Carina Schmitt, Cecilia Bruzelius, Marcus Kreuzer, Crystal Ennis, Briitta van Staalduinen and so many others.

Because of generous colleagues, the Institute of Public Administration in Leiden was a gratifying place to research solidarity. Samir, I can't imagine this process without you. Thank you for asking such poignant questions, for always having my back, and for the steadfast companionship, on good days and bad. Erin, my hyphen-happy co-author, neighbour, and partner-in-caffeine-and-capslock-crimes: where would I be without you? Hannah, thank you for the gender question that I never answered, for holding me accountable and for your patience

with my “emergency theory” calls. Shivant, you taught me what conceptual searchlights are, to talk about racisms in the plural, and what Foucault means when he says - well, anything. Thank you. To name just a few of the many other colleagues whose advice, feedback, friendship, inspiration, and support I have benefited from over the years: Elena, Daniëlle, Densua, Moritz, Toon, Johan, Fabio, Sebastian, Stephanie, Chantal, Sophia, Benjamin, Thijs, Jeroen, Linda, Eduard, Bernard, Fia, Andrei, Sandra, Bram, Rik, Tanachia, Charlotte, Nadine, Sander, Sem.

To Natalie, Nuria, Anna, Robert, Ier, Ezra, Djuna, and the rest of my Rotterdam family: thank you for rooting for me and for trusting my commitment to you when I had to cancel our plans. To my friends a little further afield but no further from me, in London, Paris, Berlin, Nairobi, Austin, Denver, Toronto: thank you for being in my corner. Nothing I do would mean anything if you weren't. Andrea, words will embarrass my attempt at describing the gratitude you are owed. Invoking the image of you waiting alone with our dog in a broken, borrowed car during a sandstorm on a wedding day in an abandoned parking lot in Italy on the week of my submission deadline is the closest I can come to capturing its intensity. Thank you for loving me for the person I was yesterday and into the person I can become.

To my parents, and to Daniel and Denise: thank you for believing that I can do things that feel hard, and for your lifelong love, encouragement, and support. They are the single reason I can.

I want to close with one final acknowledgment. So many of us set out to speak truth to power. As Foucault reminds us (in words and unfortunately in deeds), the production of knowledge is always associated with the production of new forms of power. As a white person with European citizenship in a white-collar job, my blind spots with regards to migration, racism and subjection to state power have, without a doubt, left their residue on the pages that follow. Responsibility for any resultant shortcomings, misrepresentations and harm is mine alone.

E.A. Wolff
Rotterdam, March 2024

1. Introduction

1.1 The Golden Age of welfare exclusion?	18
1.1.1 The first and most important distributive question	18
1.1.2 Empire shrinks as welfare state expands	21
1.2 My project	25
1.2.1 Research design	25
1.2.2 Findings	26
1.3 Race and immigration in welfare state scholarship	28
1.3.1 Racial inequality in the US welfare state	28
1.3.2 Immigrant rights	30
1.3.3 Welfare chauvinism	34
1.4 Post-war Europe as empire	37
1.4.1 Linking colony, metropole and welfare	37
1.4.2 The rights of postcolonial migrants	40
1.5 Plan	48

2. Drawing redistributive boundaries

2.1 Introduction	50
2.2 Boundaries and integrity	51
2.3 The nation's dirty work	54
2.3.1 Defining the welfare state	54
2.3.2 Social and statist views	56
2.3.3 An agent of integration	58
2.4 Understanding inclusion	62
2.4.1 Two dimensions of inclusion	62
2.4.2 Amount of welfare – the Marshall dimension	63
2.4.3 Character of welfare - the Somers dimension	65
2.4.4 Ideal-types of inclusion	67
2.5 Explaining inclusion	69
2.5.1 Building blocks	69
2.5.2 Rewarding the deserving, disciplining the deviant	77
2.5.3 Identity in welfare state scholarship	79

3. Methodology and inference

3.1 Logic of inquiry	82
3.1.1 Qualitative case studies	82
3.1.2 Historical interpretivism	83
3.2 Case selection	86
3.2.1 Guiding principles	86
3.2.2 Country-level contrasts	88
3.2.3 Programme-level contrasts	91
3.2.4 Group-level contrasts	94
3.3 Strategies of inference	96
3.3.1 Three pillars	96
3.3.2 'Curious activities' and abduction	97
3.3.3 Contextualised self-interpretation	98
3.3.4 Entangled comparison	101
3.4 Data collection	101
3.4.1 Archival sources	101
3.4.2 Other sources: statistics, legislation and parliamentary debates	104
3.5 Nomenclature	105
3.5.1 Key considerations	105
3.5.2 Chosen nomenclature	106
3.6 Limitations	107
3.6.1 Missing voices	107
3.6.2 Controlled comparison	108
3.6.3 Generalisability	108

4. Post-war welfare states in the Netherlands, France and the United Kingdom

4.1 Introduction	110
4.2 The Dutch welfare state: a laggard?	110
4.2.1 Overview	110
4.2.2 Poor boards and religious influence	111
4.2.3 Stagnation	113
4.2.4 Van Rhijn and social security	115
4.2.5 Ongoing municipal involvement and a new Ministry	118
4.3 The French welfare state: work, family, fatherland	120
4.3.1 Overview	120

4.3.2	Providence, mutualism and sanitation	121
4.3.3	Moving toward social insurance	123
4.3.4	Increasing expenditure in a divided nation	124
4.3.5	The Laroque Plan	126
4.3.6	La Sécurité sociale	128
4.4	The British welfare state: from poor law to Beveridge	130
4.4.1	Overview	130
4.4.2	Medieval history	131
4.4.3	Moving toward social insurance	133
4.4.4	The Beveridge Report	135
4.4.5	National Insurance, National Assistance	137
5.	Migration and boundary-making in colonial empires	
<hr/>		
5.1	Introduction	140
5.2	Totoks, Indische Nederlanders, Moluccans	140
5.2.1	Overview	140
5.2.2	Dutch empire	141
5.2.3	A nation without citizens	142
5.2.4	Decolonisation	144
5.2.5	Citizenship after Indonesian independence	146
5.2.6	Repatriates and regrettants	147
5.2.7	Stateless soldiers	150
5.3	Algerians, pieds-noirs, harkis	152
5.3.1	Overview	152
5.3.2	French empire	152
5.3.3	(Algerian) French	153
5.3.4	The French Union: an instrument of stability?	155
5.3.5	A domestic workforce in high demand	157
5.3.6	Algerian independence	160
5.3.7	Pieds-noirs and harkis	162
5.4	Caribbean citizens and the Windrush generation	166
5.4.1	Overview	166
5.4.2	British empire	166
5.4.3	Citizenship in empire	168
5.4.4	Black in the Union Jack	170

5.4.5 Will the last one out turn off the lights?	172
5.4.6 Racial exclusions	174
6. The struggle over Westernness: (post)colonial migrants in the Dutch welfare state	
6.1 Introduction	177
6.2 Targeted, in-kind social assistance	177
6.2.1 Formal entitlements	177
6.2.2 Evacués	178
6.2.3 A “Repatriation Council” and cultural conversion	181
6.2.5 “No worse than refugees”	183
6.2.6 National group schemes	186
6.3 Constructing and discouraging ‘Eastern’ citizens	190
6.3.1 The Werner report	190
6.3.2 The distinction takes hold	191
6.4 Securing old-age pensions for all	193
6.4.1 Formal entitlements	193
6.4.2 Transitional rules in the Kingdom	194
6.4.3 Relaxing requirements through Royal Decree	195
6.4.4 Moluccans and regretants	198
6.5 Analysis	201
7. Securing the republic: (post)colonial migrants in the French welfare state	
7.1 Introduction	204
7.2 Social security in Algeria	204
7.2.1 The Algerian Assembly and its social security provisions	204
7.3 Algerian labour migrants	207
7.3.1 The Algerian services network	207
7.3.2 Social security without family allowances	210
7.3.3 A Fund for “Muslim Workers”	212
7.3.4 Cleaning courses and child-rearing advice	215
7.4 Benefits of Returning (for Pieds-Noirs)	216
7.4.1 Resettling displaced citizens	216
7.4.2 Defining the repatriate	217
7.4.3 The 26 December Law	220
7.4.4 Expedited access to social security	223
7.4.5 Professional resettlement	224

7.5 Harkis	226
7.5.1 Refugees and reception benefits	226
7.5.2 “Adapted to Muslims”	229
7.5.3 Parodi Committee	232
7.5.4 Into the woods?	235
7.6 Analysis	238

8. Deservingness debates: (post)colonial migrants in the British welfare state

8.1 Introduction	241
8.2 The National Assistance Board	242
8.2.1 Formal entitlements	242
8.2.2 “Neither discrimination, nor special treatment”?	243
8.2.3 Two committees, one conclusion	245
8.2.4 Welfare chauvinism	249
8.3 National Insurance	252
8.3.1 Formal entitlements	252
8.3.2 Imperial social insurance	252
8.3.3 Social security and surveillance	255
8.4 Analysis	259

9. Conclusion

9.1 Social security as cultural security	262
9.2 Boundaries of post-war welfare	265
9.2.1 Instruments of external boundaries	265
9.2.2 Worlds of (post)colonial welfare	268
9.3 Serving the patria	276
9.3.1 Summary of explanation	276
9.3.2 Agent of stratification	277
9.3.3 Hearts and minds	278
9.3.4 Cultural change	280
9.4 Revisiting the heterogeneity-redistribution trade-off	282
9.4.1 Summary of contributions	282
9.4.2 Racecraft and racism, not diversity	282
9.4.3 Homogenising the heterogeneous	284
9.4.4 The malleability of attitudes	285
9.4.5 Society	286

Archives consulted	290
Bibliography	292
Appendix	
Appendix A. Historical-interpretivism examples	317
A.1 Du Bois' contextualised self-interpretation	317
A.2 Fox' and Cooper's entangled comparisons	318
Appendix B. Nomenclature	319
B.1 Common-sense categories	319
B.2 Analytical categories	320
B.3 Self-determined categories	321
Dutch summary	323
About the author	328

Abbreviations

ABW	General Assistance Act (<i>Algemene Bijstandswet</i>)
ADC	Assistance for Dependent Children
AEF	French Equatorial Africa (<i>Afrique equatorial française</i>)
AGIRC	General Association of Retirement Schemes for Cadres (<i>Association générale des institutions de retraites des cadres</i>)
AKW	General Child Benefit Act (<i>Algemene Kinderbijslagwet</i>)
AMANA	Moral Assistance and Aid to North Africans (<i>Assistance morale et aide aux nord-africains</i>)
AOW	Old Age Assistance Act (<i>Algemene Ouderdomswet</i>)
ARBVO	Directorate-General of Employment Services (<i>Directoraat-Generaal Arbeidsvoorziening</i>)
ARP	Anti-Revolutionary Party (<i>Anti-Revolutionaire Partij</i>)
AWW	General Widow and orphans Act (<i>Algemene weduwen- en wezenwet</i>)
BIS	Social Intervention Offices (<i>Bureaux d'interventions sociales</i>)
BSP	Basic State Pension
CARIN	Control, Attitude, Reciprocity, Identity, and Need
CAVI	Commission for Indonesian Affairs (<i>Commissie voor Aangelegenheden van Indonesië</i>)
CAZ	Commission of Ambonese Assistance (<i>Commissariaat Ambonezenzorg</i>)
CBVO	Central Bureau for the Care of War Victims (<i>Centraal Bureau Verzorging Oorlogsslachtoffers</i>)
CCG	Commission for the Coordination of Repatriates (<i>Commissie-Coördinatie Grepatrieerden</i>)
CCKP	Central Committee of Religious and Private Initiative for Repatriates (<i>Centraal Comité van Kerkelijk en Particulier Initiatief</i>)
CFLN	French Committee of National Liberation (<i>Comité Français de la Libération National</i>)
CFTC	French Confederation of Christian Workers (<i>Confédération française des travailleurs chrétiens</i>)
CGT	General Confederation of Labour (<i>Confédération générale du travail</i>)
CHA	Comparative-historical analysis
CICC	Citizenship of Independent Commonwealth Countries
CNAF	National Family Allowance Fund (<i>Caisse nationale d'allocations familiales</i>)
CNPF	National Council of French Employers (<i>Conseil national du patronat français</i>)
CNSS	National Fund for Social Security (<i>Caisse nationale de sécurité sociale</i>)
CRM	Ministry of Culture, Recreation and Social Work (<i>Ministerie van Cultuur, Recreatie en Maatschappelijk Werk</i>)

CTAM	Technical Consultant for Muslim Affairs (<i>Conseillers techniques pour les affaires musulmanes</i>)
CUKC	Citizenship of the UK and the Colonies
DHSS	Department of Health and Social Security
DMZ	Service of Social Care (<i>Dienst Maatschappelijke Zorg</i>)
DP	Displaced person
ESS	European Social Survey
FAS	Social Assistance Fund for Muslim Workers and Their Families (<i>Fonds d'action sociale pour les musulmans travailleurs et leurs familles</i>); later, Social Assistance Fund for Foreign Workers (<i>Fonds d'action sociale pour les travailleurs immigrés</i>)
FLN	National Liberation Front (<i>Front de Libération Nationale</i>)
FMA	Muslim French of Algeria (<i>Français musulman d'Algérie</i>)
FR-AixAN	Archives Nationales d'Outre Mer, Aix-en-Provence, France
FR-MaAD	Departmental Archives of Bouches-du-Rhône, Marseille, France
FR-PaAN	Archives Nationales, Pierrefitte-sur-Seine, Paris, France
FR-PaSP	Archives of Julien Charles-André, Sciences Po Centre d'Histoire, Paris
FSNA	French of North African origin (<i>Français de souche nord-africaine</i>)
GPRF	Provisional Government of the French Republic (<i>Gouvernement provisoire de la République française</i>)
IEV	Indo-European Association (<i>Indo-Europeesch Verbond</i>)
IGAME	General Administrative Inspectors on Special Assignment (<i>Inspecteurs généraux de l'administration en mission extraordinaire</i>)
KLM	Royal Dutch Airlines (<i>Koninklijke Luchtvaart Maatschappij</i>)
KNAF	Catholic Civil Servants and Private Employees from former Netherlands Indies (<i>Katholieke Ambtenaren en Particuliere Werknemers uit het Voormalige Nederlands-Indië</i>)
KNIL	Royal Dutch army in the Netherlands Indies (<i>Koninklijk Nederlands Indische Leger</i>)
KVP	Catholic Peoples' Party (<i>Katholieke Volkspartij</i>)
LIS	Luxembourg Income Study
MINUOR	Ministry of Union Affairs and Overseas Kingdom (<i>Ministerie van Uniezaken en Overzeeserijksdelen</i>)
MP	Member of Parliament
MPNI	Ministry of Pensions and National Insurance
NASSI	Committee of National Action Supporting Regrettants From Indonesia (<i>Comité Nationale Actie Steunt Spijtoptanten Indonesië</i>)
NHS	National Health Service
NI	National Insurance

NIBEG	Dutch-Indisch Alliance for Ex-Prisoners of War and Internees (<i>Nederlands-Indische Bond van Ex-Krijgsgevangenen en Geïnterneerden</i>)
NL-HaHG	Haags Gemeentearchief, The Hague, The Netherlands
NL-HaNA	Het Nationaal Archief, The Hague, The Netherlands
NL-StRo	Rotterdam Stadsarchief, The Netherlands
NL-UtA	Het Utrechts Archief, Utrecht, The Netherlands
OAI	Old-Age Insurance
OAS	Secret Army Organisation (<i>Organisation armée secrète</i>)
ONI	National Office of Immigration (<i>Office national d'immigration</i>)
RAF	Royal Air Force
RAPWI	Recovery of Allied Prisoners of War and Internees
RAVI	Council for Indonesian Matters (<i>Raad voor Aangelegenheden met Indonesië</i>)
RTC	Round Table Conference
SAS	Specialised Administrative Sections (<i>Sections administrative spécialisées</i>)
SFIM	Reception and Reclassification Service for French people from Indochina and Muslim French (<i>Service d'accueil et de reclassement des Français d'Indochine et musulmans</i>)
SGI	General Society of Agricultural and Industrial Immigration (<i>Société générale d'immigration agricole et industriel</i>)
SSFNA	North African Family Social Service (<i>Service social familial nord africain</i>)
SVB	Social Insurance Bank (<i>Sociale Verzekeringsbank</i>)
UK-LoNA	The National Archives, Richmond, London, The UK
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNHCR	UN High Commissioner for Refugees
VOC	Dutch East Indian Company (<i>Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie</i>)
WIC	Dutch West Indian Company (<i>West-Indische Compagnie</i>)

