

Historiography and palaeography of Sasanian Middle Persian inscriptions

Ramble, O.K.C.

Citation

Ramble, O. K. C. (2024, June 11). *Historiography and palaeography of Sasanian Middle Persian inscriptions*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3762211

Version: Publisher's Version

Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral

License: thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University

of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3762211

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Historiography and Palaeography of Sasanian Middle Persian Inscriptions

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden, op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl, volgens besluit van het college voor promoties te verdedigen op dinsdag 11 juni 2024 klokke 15.00 uur

door

Olivia Kathleen Christiane Ramble

geboren te Levallois-Perret in 1990 Promotores: Prof. dr. Philip Huyse (Ecole pratique des hautes études/PSL)

Prof. dr. Albert de Jong

Copromotor: Dr. Samra Azarnouche (Ecole pratique des hautes études/PSL)

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. Gabrielle van den Berg

Prof. dr. Carlo Giovanni Cereti (La Sapienza/Univ. of California Irvine)

Prof. dr. Béatrice Fraenkel (Ecole des hautes études en sciences sociales)

Dr. Wouter Henkelman (Ecole pratique des hautes études)

Dr. Agnes Korn (Centre national de recherche scientifique/INALCO)

Olivia K. C. Ramble's doctoral research was conducted in the framework of a cotutelle agreement between the Ecole pratique des hautes études/Paris Sciences et Lettres and the University of Leiden.





THÈSE DE DOCTORAT

DE L'UNIVERSITÉ PSL

Préparée à l'École Pratique des Hautes Études Dans le cadre d'une cotutelle avec l'université de Leyde

Historiographie et paléographie des inscriptions moyenperses sassanides

Historiography and Palaeography of Sasanian Middle Persian inscriptions

Soutenue par

Olivia K. C. Ramble

Le mardi 11 juin 2024 à 15h

École doctorale n° 472

École doctorale de l'École Pratique des Hautes Études

Spécialité

Histoire, textes et documents







Composition du jury:

Gabrielle VAN DEN BERG

Prof., Leiden Présidente

Agnes KORN

CR HDR, CNRS Rapporteur

Carlo CERETI

Prof., La Sapienza, Rome/University of California, Irvine

Rapporteur

Béatrice FRAENKEL

DE, EHESS Rapporteur

Wouter HENKELMAN

MCF HDR, EPHE-PSL Examinateur

Philip HUYSE

DE, EPHE-PSL Directeur de thèse

Albert, DE JONG

Prof. dr., Université de Leyde Co-directeur de thèse

Samra Azarnouche

MCF, EPHE-PSL Co-encadrante

ISBN: 978-94-6506-070-5

Printing and Cover Design: Ridderprint, the Netherlands

Copyright: Olivia K. C. Ramble

Historiography and Palaeography of Sasanian Middle Persian Inscriptions

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Paris Sciences et Lettres for accepting my research project in 2017 and awarding me three years of funding to carry it out, thereby providing me with the best possible conditions to conduct and complete my doctoral research. I am equally grateful to the École pratique des hautes études, within the framework of which this doctoral thesis was prepared, for their professional help and financial support, thanks to which I was able to travel abroad to participate in conferences and present my ongoing research. I thank Leiden University for accepting me as a cotutelle student in 2019, for their encouragement and kind support, especially during the difficult time of the Covid pandemic.

I thank the Institut français de Recherche en Iran (IFRI) for awarding me a three-month travel grant (2018) with which I was able to travel to Iran for my fieldwork. I warmly thank the Pajouhešgāh-e 'Olum Ensāni va Motāle'āt-e Farhangi (IHCS) and in particular Professor Dr. Cyrus Nasrollāhzādeh who applied for a research visa on my behalf, allowing me to visit the archaeological sites of Fārs. I am very grateful to Dr. Hamid Fadaei, director of the Persepolis World Heritage Site, and Mohammad Jawad Owladhussein (Centre for Epigraphical Studies, Persepolis World Heritage Site), vice-president of Persepolis, for giving me permission to visit the sites of Persepolis and Naqš-e Rostam and to study its monuments and inscriptions in December 2018.

At the École pratique des hautes études, my supervisor Professor Philip Huyse (EPHE-PSL/CeRMI) and Dr. Samra Azarnouche (EPHE-PSL/CeRMI) have been following my progress and providing me with valuable feedback on my work since my Masters dissertation. I am indebted to them both for introducing me to ancient Iran and to the study of ancient Iranian languages, as well as for their encouragement in pursuing a doctoral project and their helpful remarks and advice as it took shape. At Leiden University, I would like to express my sincere thanks to my supervisor Albert de Jong, whose unwavering support and constructive comments saw me safely through the writing process and its rough patches. Our cheerful and engaging monthly meetings, in which we discussed my readings, written works and ideas, anchored my progress and reminded me that I should enjoy my research – they will remain a highlight of the past few years.

I would like to express my deep gratitude to my colleague Milad Abedi (Zurich University/CeRMI) for accompanying me on my fieldwork in Iran, for his patient help, support and friendship. I warmly thank my friends and colleagues at the École pratique des hautes études, Delphine, Alberto, Alessia and Aida, for their advice and kindness and for breaking up the solitude of doctoral research. I would like to thank my dearest and oldest friends Ayaka, Fern and Xanthippi, for their constancy and support – our regular conversations did much to brighten up my writing routine and keep me grounded. I extend my heartfelt thanks to Sylvie for our stimulating conversations and her patient guidance and kindness, and for reminding me to take pleasure in everything I do.

My greatest source of comfort and courage throughout these six years of research and writing has been my beloved family, whom I thank wholeheartedly for their support. I would like to thank my grandmother, Christiane de Sales, for her kindness and encouragement and for being my refuge when I needed it most; my parents Anne de Sales and Charles Ramble, for their unwavering enthusiasm and reassurance, as well as their valuable comments and advice, and for giving me the love of research and writing; my wonderful little sister Charlotte, for her constant care and thoughtfulness, and for our innumerable conversations and laughs which have been a most precious source of energy and comfort; and François Vandame, whose extraordinary patience and unshakable confidence in me was and is my greatest strength.

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Preparing for fieldwork in Iran	2
Taxt-e Suleymān and Hamadān	4
Pasargadae	5
Experimenting with RTI photography	6
Persepolis	7
The 'generations of writing' of Darius tačara	8
The site of Naqš-e Rostam	9
Exploring the Kūh-e Hussein mountain	10
Documenting the cursive inscriptions of Fars	12
Returning to France	15
Beginning work on the doctoral dissertation	16
Thesis outline	17
Chapter 1. Sasanian inscriptions and Persian scripts in Late Antique historiography Arabo-Persian chronicles	
I. Sasanian inscriptions and Persian scripts in Late Antique historiography	21
The "Persian" version of Gordian III's epitaph	21
Husraw II's inscribed ex-votos	23
Ardašīr I's boundary stones in Armenia	25
Agathias' "Persian writings"	27
Epiphanius of Salamis' "alphabet of the Persians"	29
Syriac or Middle Persian, Middle Persian or Syriac?	31
II. Persian scripts and Sasanian inscriptions in Arabo-Persian chronicles	33
The languages of Persia in the Kitāb al-Fihrist	33
The seven scripts of the Persians according to Ibn al-Muqaffa'	35
rawārašn spelling: an explanation of the Middle Persian heterographic writing syste	m 37
Assessing Ibn al-Muqaffa's account of the different scripts of the Persians	38
The phonetic alphabets of the Zoroastrians and Zoroastrian exegesis according to Mas'udi	39
Ishodad of Merv's account of the Middle Persian heterographic writing system	42
Sasanian inscribed objects in Arabo-Persian chronicles from the early Islamic period	1- 44

Sasanian poems and the Arabo-Persian inscriptions of the tačara	44
The "Pahlavi" writings of "A Thousand Columns"	46
Deciphering the "Pahlavi inscriptions" of "A Thousand Columns"	47
Sasanian inscribed monuments in Arabo-Persian chronicles from the early Islamic	40
period	
The Zartošt Nāmeh and the shift from the Middle Persian to the New Persian script-	
Chapter 2. Rediscovering Persepolis and its inscriptions: early European travelle Persia	
I. When Čehelmenār becomes "Persepolis"	
European diplomatic embassies, religious missions and travelling merchants in Pers	
Pyramidal characters and Chaldean mementos: the inscriptions of Persepolis	
Epic journeys to the East and their heroes: the rise of travel literature in Europe	
The "Antic Greek" inscriptions of Persepolis and Ardašīr as Alexander	
Invitations au voyage: calling on professional draftsmen to record Persepolis	
Drafting Persepolis and its inscriptions: when the learned societies become involved	
II. The first publication of Sasanian inscriptions in Europe	63
The "very good friend" of Mr. Flower	
Flower's epigraphic samples: cuneiform as the writing of the Gaures and Parthian/Middle Persian as ancient Hebrew/Syriac	64
Jean Chardin's first exhaustive publication of the ruins of Persepolis: contention over authorship of Flower's epigraphic samples	
The "Syriac" characters engraved at Naqš-e Rostam	67
The different alphabets of the Zoroastrians: comparing manuscripts and inscriptions	68
Magical inscriptions and royal treasures: large-scale tourism at Persepolis	70
The Greek inscriptions of Naqš-e Rostam: Alexander king of kings of all Asiatic nat	
Ambrosio Bembo or when Chardin's draftsman finds a new master	
Untangling the contention over the authorship of Flower's drafts	73
Copying the "Coptic" inscriptions of Tāq-e Bostān	74
Kaempfer and the iconic status of Flower's copies of Sasanian inscriptions	76
Drawing Persepolis	77
Carsten Niebuhr and the epigraphic corpus of Naqš-e Rostam – Persepolis	79
The two alphabets of the Parsi priests according to Carsten Niebuhr	81
Documenting Middle Persian glyntic and numismatics	81

III. Bringing back the first Middle Persian manuscripts to Europe	82
Anquetil Duperron and the Parsi manuscripts of Surat	82
Work on cursive Middle Persian begins	86
Chapter 3. The decipherment of inscriptional Middle Persian	88
I. The earliest studies of the Middle Persian language, script and textual tradition	88
Thomas Hyde's Historia Religionis Veterum Persarum	88
The alphabets of the Zoroastrians according to Hyde	90
Contention over the decipherment of Middle Persian: Hyde against Anquetil Duper	rron91
Hyde and the copies of inscriptions by Samuel Flower: cuneiform as decorative	
ornaments	
Alexander king of kings of the Asians	
Hyde's Palmyrene inscriptions	93
The first suggestion of a Sasanian date for the unknown inscriptions in Flower's co	
II. Early breakthroughs in the decipherment of inscriptional Middle Persian	
Silvestre de Sacy and his <i>Mémoires sur diverses antiquités de la Perse</i>	
Alexander becomes Ardašīr	
Tackling Middle Persian words through the lens of the Greek legends	
Deciphering inscriptional Middle Persian	
Looking at the second 'unknown' alphabet of the trilingual Sasanian inscriptions	
The Middle Persian legends of the Cabinet du Roi	
Grélots draughts of Tāq-e Bostān are brought to Silvestre de Sacy's attention	
III. Middle Persian studies within the broader research field of Iranian studies	107
Middle Persian as an emblem of an 'alliance' between Semitic and Aryan peoples	107
Work on Avestan and manuscript Middle Persian takes over	109
The decipherment of Old Persian cuneiform: how Middle Persian epigraphy contri	buted
Towards a biography of writing	
Chapter 4. Towards a biography of writing: Šābuhr's inscription at Hājjiābād	
I. Early studies of the Hājjiābād texts: contentions over the "nature" of Middle Persia	
The first copies of Šābuhr's bilingual inscription at Hājjiābād	
Scholars debate the relationship between manuscript Middle Persian and the langu- the Sasanian inscriptions	
Middle Persian: Semitic, "Aryan" or a "mixed" language?	

Identifying the language of "Inscription B" at Hājjiābād	125
Early translations of the Hājjiābād inscription, or how to be misled by aramaeogr King Šābuhr I as supreme lord of the Jews	
II. Working with the Parsi scholars of Mumbai	130
The Hājjiābād inscription intrigues the Parsi scholars of Mumbai	130
The importance of the Pahlavi-Pāzand Glossary for the understanding of the Mid Persian heterographic writing system	
The event described in the Hājjiābād inscription begins to emerge	138
Reflections on Middle Persian palaeography	140
Reception of Haug and West's translation of Hājjiābād: the aramaeograms MNW TB remain problematic	
III. Archaeological campaigns in Iran and their contribution to the study of the Hājjiinscription(s)	
New documents for the study of Sasanian inscriptions: photographs	144
Herzfeld and the end of the "French-monopoly" over archaeological work in Pers	sia - 145
Herzfeld's Paikuli (1924): further progress on Middle Persian aramaeograms and important corrections to the transcription and translation of Hājjiābād	
Samuel Nyberg and the bowshot of Šābuhr I	148
New Sasanian inscriptions are rediscovered and the Corpus Inscriptionum Iranica created	
Hājjiābād's twin inscription at Tang-e Boraq	153
When text editions take a life of their own	154
Chapter 5. The emergence of the Middle Persian heterographic writing system	157
I. The Aramaic roots of the Middle Persian writing system	157
Achaemenid Aramaic and the monolithic Achaemenid administrative tradition	157
The Elephantine papyri and the letters of Aršāma	162
Aramaic texts from Bactria: the Khalili archive	164
Aramaic at Persepolis	165
Adapting Aramaic to Iranian phonetics: transcribing Persian names, titles and loa	
The distinctly Old Persian flavour of some Aramaic documents	171
The Hellenistic period: traces of the survival of Aramaic	172
The Aramaic inscriptions of Aśoka: hints of heterography?	
The mysterious Aramaic inscription on the tomb of Darius at Naqš-e Rostam	180
II. The Aramaic-derived Parthian script	184

Parthian numismatics: from Aramaic to Greek to Parthian	184
The Parthian parchments of Avroman	192
The Parthian ostraca of Nisa	196
The curious case of Armazi	198
III. The Aramaic-derived scripts of the Arsacid period	199
A mosaic of different Aramaic-derived scripts in the Arsacid period	199
The Elymaean script(s)	201
The Characenean script	207
The Mandaic script	208
The Aramaic-derived scripts from the Arsacid period: preliminary conclusions	209
Coins from Persis	210
Chapter 6. Pre-Sasanian Middle Persian inscriptions: investigating the local stradition(s) of Persis	
I. Pre-Sasanian Persis: elements of its history and presentation of its corpus of coins	
Investigating the 'Dark Ages' of Persis	
Dating the coins series of Persis	
Elements for the political history of Hellenistic Persis	
Fratarakā of the Gods	
The title "krny" of the coins of the Persid kings Wahbarz	222
Achaemenid symbols, insignia and monuments on the coins of Persis	
The prestige of the kings of Persis	
Khodadad Rezakhani and the eastern origins of the Middle Persian inscriptional alphabet	
II. Towards a palaeography of the Persis coin legends	
The legends of the Persis coins and their script	
The first series: a neat, lapidary Imperial Aramaic script	
Enter the Parthians	
Indications of 'frozen' or heterographic spellings in the early first century BCE	
Indications of an emerging local scribal tradition	
New cursive forms: the first century CE	
The pre-Sasanian kings and the 'curly style'	
Further thoughts on the relationship between the Persis and Sasanian scripts	
III. Further examples of pre-Sasanian Middle Persian inscriptions	
Pre-Sasanian Middle Persian inscriptions on silver vessels	

Chapter 8. Early Middle Persian inscriptions: Documenting the lost manuscript to of Sasanian Iran and exploring the different symbolic aspects of Sasanian epigrap	
Preliminary conclusions: investigating the lost manuscript vestiges of Sasanian I	
The script of the Pahlavi Psalter: combining monumental forms with ligatures	
Dating the Pahlavi Psalter	
The translator of the Middle Persian Psalter: Syriac or Persian?	
The peculiar case of the so-called "Pahlavi Psalter"	
III. The Pahlavi Psalter	
The Middle Persian and Parthian graffiti of Dura	
Investigating the formation of later cursive 'corrupted' forms	
Prototypes of later 'corrupted' forms in the Dura dipinti	
Stylisations and ligatures in the Middle Persian dipinti	
Palaeography of the Middle Persian dipinti from the Dura synagogue	
Key words in the Middle Persian dipinti	
Of scribes and painters: the authors of the dipinti	
The dipinti of the Dura synagogue	
II. The Middle Persian dipinti and graffiti from Dura Europos	
The Parthian written vestiges of Dura	
Palaeographic features of the Middle Persian ostracon from Dura	
Palaeographic features of the Dura Middle Persian parchments: a multiplicity of styles	262
Palaeographic features of the Dura Middle Persian parchments: the rise of ligatures	
The bilingual nature of the Sasanian administration at Dura The Persian scribes of the Dura synagogue	
The Middle Persian manuscript vestiges of Dura Europos Dating the Sasanian occupation of Dura	
Inscriptional vs manuscript: the corpus of Sasanian written vestiges	
I. Early Sasanian manuscript material: the parchment fragments from Dura Europo	
Chapter 7. Early Sasanian manuscript vestiges: the rise of ligatures	
Preliminary conclusions concerning the local pre-Sasanian scribal tradition of Po	
A second pre-Sasanian Middle Persian inscription on a silver vessel	
Further indications of a local scribal tradition in Persis	
Comparing the coin legends with the silver vessel inscription	

I. The corpus of early Middle Persian Sasanian inscriptions within the Sasanian scrib tradition	
The lost manuscript tradition of Sasanian Iran and the political, symbolic, legal an religious aspects of Sasanian epigraphic texts	
Studying the Sasanian inscriptional corpus: problems of typology and chronology	290
II. Text and context (I): the relationship between Sasanian inscriptions and their natu built environment	
Sasanian label inscriptions: the symbolic choice of language and script	292
What's in a caption? The symbolic, political significance of Sasanian label inscrip	
Inscription and environment: Šābuhr's twin inscriptions at Hājjiābād and Tang-e E	Borāq
Traces of cursive models at Hājjiābād	300
Exploring the notion of an inscription's "deictic field" of reference	301
Inscriptions and arrows: the ritual demarcation of territory	304
Writing on ruins: Šābuhr I's inscription at Naqš-e Rostam	305
Dating Šābuhr I's ŠKZ	307
III. Text and context (II): the relationship between Sasanian inscriptions and the lost Sasanian manuscript tradition	308
Traces of a cursive manuscript model in ŠKZ	308
Legal aspects of ŠKZ: the first part of ŠKZ as an imperial land register	309
ŠKZ: Relationship between text and image	310
Scribal motifs and auto-referential passages in ŠKZ: the shadow of manuscript and materiality of text	
Legal aspects of ŠKZ: establishing royal soul foundations	312
IV. Text and context (III): cases of intertextuality within the corpus of Middle Persian monumental inscriptions	1
Reading Kerdīr's four inscriptions in light of Šābuhr's ŠKZ	315
The plasticity of palaeography, or how to play with the materiality of text	
Omissions and additions: exploring the textual discrepancies between Kerdīr's inscriptions	319
The intricate textual relationship between KKZ and ŠKZ	321
ŠKZ as the literary, political, legal and religious backdrop to KKZ	
Preliminary conclusions: the manuscript tradition behind Sasanian inscriptions and	
special status of the monumental epigraphic texts	

Figures	397
Bibliography	347
Conclusions	339
Sacred aspects of Sasanian inscriptions: epigraphic texts and ritual performance	335
For the sake of the soul: Mihr-Narseh's inscription at Fīrūzābād	333
Narseh's Paikuli: the importance of writing and written documents	331
Narseh's Paikuli: the significance of place	330
Narseh's Paikuli: exploring the different legal aspects of inscriptions	329
V. A choice of case studies: further evidence for the documentation of the lost Sasania manuscript tradition and the different symbolic aspects of Sasanian inscriptions	