



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Power and dignity: the ends of online behavioral advertising in the European Union**

Zardiashvili, A.

### **Citation**

Zardiashvili, A. (2024, May 7). *Power and dignity: the ends of online behavioral advertising in the European Union*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3753619>

Version: Publisher's Version  
License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)  
Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3753619>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

# POWER & DIGNITY

*The Ends of Online Behavioral Advertising  
in the European Union*



# POWER & DIGNITY

*The Ends of Online Behavioral Advertising in the European Union*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 7 mei 2024  
klokke 16.15 uur

door

ALEKSANDRE ZARDIASHVILI

geboren te Tbilisi (Georgië)

in 1992

*Promotoren:* Prof.mr.dr.ir. B. H.M. Custers  
Prof.dr.mr. S. van der Hof

*Co-promotor:* Dr. F. Dechesne

*Promotiecommissie:* Prof.mr.dr. B.W. Schermer  
Prof.dr.mr. V. Mak  
Dr. G. Malgieri  
Prof.dr. S. Zuboff (Harvard University, Boston, USA)  
Prof.mr. F.J. Zuiderveen Borgesius (Radboud Universiteit)

Copyright © by Aleksandre Zardiashvili, 2024  
All rights reserved  
ISBN 978-94-6473-432-4, Lex Zard.  
Printed by *IPSKAMP printing*, Enschede, the Netherlands



**Universiteit  
Leiden**  
The Netherlands

*for joy*



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b> .....	<b>XI</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b> .....	<b>XII</b>
<b>ACRONYMS</b> .....	<b>XIII</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION: POWER &amp; DIGNITY</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1. Setting the Stage</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2. Research Questions</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>1.3. Methodology</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>1.4. Scope</b> .....	<b>12</b>
<b>1.5. Structure</b> .....	<b>13</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2. ONLINE BEHAVIORAL ADVERTISING</b> .....	<b>16</b>
<b>2.1. The OBA Paradigm</b> .....	<b>17</b>
2.1.1. Targeting .....	17
2.1.2. Behaviorism .....	18
2.1.3. The Internet.....	19
<b>2.2. The OBA Configuration</b> .....	<b>21</b>
2.2.1. Online Targeted Advertising.....	21
2.2.2. Profiling: Behavioral Personalization .....	23
<b>2.3. The OBA Markets</b> .....	<b>25</b>
2.3.1. Publishers and Advertisers.....	26
2.3.2. Walled Gardens and AdTech .....	27
2.3.3. Markets and Power.....	30
<b>2.4. The OBA Infrastructures</b> .....	<b>32</b>
2.4.1. Real-Time Bidding (RTB) .....	33
2.4.2. Cookies and Mobile IDs.....	35
2.4.3. Cookieless OBA.....	38
<b>2.5. Conclusion: Online Behavioural Advertising</b> .....	<b>41</b>
<b>CHAPTER 3. MANIPULATION</b> .....	<b>43</b>
<b>3.1. Influencing Human Behavior</b> .....	<b>44</b>



3.1.1. Influence.....	44
3.1.2. Persuasion, Coercion, and Manipulation.....	45
3.1.3. Manipulation: Hidden, Successful, Intentional Influence.....	50
<b>3.2. Methods: Exploitation of Vulnerability .....</b>	<b>52</b>
3.2.1. Cognitive Biases .....	53
3.2.2. Beliefs, Desires, Emotions, and Nudges .....	55
<b>3.3. Measuring Manipulativeness .....</b>	<b>58</b>
3.3.1. Vulnerability .....	59
3.3.2. Levels of Vulnerability .....	61
3.3.3. The Spectrum of Influences .....	65
<b>3.4. Conclusion: Manipulation .....</b>	<b>67</b>
<b>CHAPTER 4. CONSUMER MANIPULATION VIA OBA .....</b>	<b>69</b>
<b>4.1. Manipulation in Contexts .....</b>	<b>70</b>
4.1.1. Consumer Manipulation.....	70
4.1.2. Consumer Manipulation Online.....	75
4.1.3. Consumer Manipulation via OBA .....	79
<b>4.2. Manipulative Extraction of Attention, Time, and Data.....</b>	<b>80</b>
4.2.1. “Free” Internet.....	81
4.2.2. Maximizing Time.....	84
4.2.3. “Accept All” Data Extraction.....	87
<b>4.3. Manipulative Advertisement Personalization.....</b>	<b>93</b>
4.3.1. Covert Personalization .....	93
4.3.2. Targeting Vulnerability.....	98
<b>4.4. Conclusion: Consumer Manipulation via OBA.....</b>	<b>102</b>
<b>CHAPTER 5. CONSUMER MANIPULATION HARMS OF OBA.....</b>	<b>105</b>
<b>5.1. Theories of Harm .....</b>	<b>106</b>
5.1.1. Consumer Manipulation Harms .....	106
5.1.2. Welfare: Free Market Approach .....	109
5.1.3. Dignity: Human Rights Approach .....	113
5.1.4. Unifying Strands: Capability Approach.....	119
<b>5.2. Typology of Consumer Manipulation Harms.....</b>	<b>122</b>

5.2.1. Economic Harms.....	123
5.2.1.1 Economic Loss: Personal Detriment .....	123
5.2.1.2 Market Harms: Structural Detriment.....	124
5.2.2. Environment Harms .....	130
5.2.3. Affinity Harms .....	132
5.2.4. Privacy Harms.....	133
5.2.5. Authenticity Harms .....	134
5.2.6. Integrity Harms .....	136
5.2.7. Dignity Harms.....	137
5.2.7.1 Threat to Children.....	139
5.2.7.2 Threat to Democracy .....	140
5.2.7.3 Threat to Vulnerability .....	141
<b>5.3. Conclusion: Consumer Manipulation Harms of OBA.....</b>	<b>143</b>
<b>CHAPTER 6. BOUNDARIES OF CONSUMER MANIPULATION VIA OBA.....</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>6.1. The EU Legal Framework for OBA .....</b>	<b>146</b>
6.1.1. EU Consumer Protection Law .....	146
6.1.2. EU Personal Data Protection Law.....	152
6.1.3. EU Competition Law .....	156
6.1.4. EU Digital Single Market.....	161
6.1.4.1 Before the DSA and the DMA .....	161
6.1.4.2 The DSA and the DMA.....	163
6.1.4.3 Artificial Intelligence Act (AIA) .....	167
<b>6.2. Prohibited OBA Practices .....</b>	<b>169</b>
6.2.1. The Prohibition of OBA Using Special Categories of Data.....	170
6.2.2. The Prohibition of OBA for Minors.....	175
6.2.3. The Prohibition of Profiling with Significant Effects .....	177
6.2.4. The Prohibition of Unfair Practices and OBA .....	179
6.2.5. The Proposed Prohibitions of Manipulation via AI .....	185
<b>6.3. Legal Grounds for OBA .....</b>	<b>188</b>
6.3.1. Consent.....	188
6.3.1.1 Conditions.....	189

6.3.1.2 Consent in AdTech.....	193
6.3.1.3 OBA Contracts .....	196
6.3.2. Contractual Necessity.....	198
6.3.3. Legitimate Interest .....	200
<b>6.4. OBA Transparency &amp; Fairness .....</b>	<b>203</b>
6.4.1. Information Disclosure.....	203
6.4.2. OBA Scrutiny: Archives, Access, Audit.....	206
6.4.3. Managing OBA Risks .....	209
<b>6.5. Conclusion: Boundaries of Consumer Manipulation via OBA.....</b>	<b>213</b>
<b>CHAPTER 7. CONCLUSIONS: THE ENDS OF OBA.....</b>	<b>216</b>
<b>7.1. Conclusion.....</b>	<b>216</b>
<b>7.2. Recommendations .....</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>7.3. Going Forward .....</b>	<b>225</b>
<b>EPILOGUE .....</b>	<b>228</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....</b>	<b>229</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY.....</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>GLOSSARY .....</b>	<b>267</b>
<b>SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY).....</b>	<b>270</b>
<b>CURRICULUM VITAE.....</b>	<b>274</b>
<b>INDEX .....</b>	<b>276</b>

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2:1. <i>Real Time Bidding (RTB)</i> (by Veale & Zuiderveen Borgesius).....	33
Figure 3:1. <i>Quadrant of influence with examples</i> (by author) .....	46
Figure 3:2. <i>Levels of vulnerability</i> (by author).....	65
Figure 3:3. <i>Spectrum of influences with situations</i> (by author).....	66
Figure 4:2. <i>Levels of online consumer vulnerability</i> (by author) .....	78

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 4-1. <i>Manipulative practices for attracting consumers</i> (by author) .....	84
Table 4-2. <i>Manipulative practices for maximizing engagement</i> (by author)....	87
Table 4-3. <i>Exploitative patterns in cookie banners</i> (by author).....	90
Table 4-4. <i>Manipulative practices for data extraction</i> (by author) .....	92
Table 4-5. <i>Covert advertising personalization</i> (by author) .....	97
Table 4-6. <i>Hardship targeting</i> (from Google Ad Policy).....	99
Table 4-7. <i>Targeting identity</i> (from Google Ad Policy, examples added) .....	100
Table 4-8. <i>Advertising practices that exploit vulnerabilities</i> (by author).....	102
Table 4-9. <i>Manipulative practices of OBA</i> (by author).....	103
Table 5-1. <i>Consumer manipulation harms of OBA</i> .....	143
Table 6-1. <i>Article 5(1)(a)-(b) EC.AIA, EP.AIA and C.AIA</i> (by author) .....	185
Table 6-2. <i>The EU Legal framework for consumer manipulation via OBA</i> ...	213
Table 7-1. <i>Safeguarding consumer manipulation harms of OBA</i> (by author)	220

## ACRONYMS

<b>AI</b>	Artificial Intelligence
<b>AIA</b>	Artificial Intelligence Act
<b>AVMSD</b>	Audiovisual Media Services Directive
<b>CA</b>	Competition Authority
<b>CFREU</b>	Charter for the Fundamental Rights of the EU
<b>CJEU</b>	The Court of Justice of the European Union
<b>CMP</b>	Consent Management Platform
<b>CRD</b>	Consumer Rights Directive
<b>CPA</b>	Consumer Protection Authority
<b>C.AIA</b>	Council Mandate of AIA
<b>DMA</b>	Digital Markets Act
<b>DPA</b>	Data Protection Authority
<b>DSA</b>	Digital Services Act
<b>DSC</b>	Digital Service Coordinator
<b>DSP</b>	Demand Side Platform
<b>DPIA</b>	Data Protection Impact Assessment
<b>EAIB</b>	European Artificial Intelligence Board
<b>EBDS</b>	European Board for Digital Services
<b>EC</b>	European Commission
<b>ECHR</b>	European Convention of Human Rights
<b>EC.AIA</b>	European Commission Proposal for AIA
<b>ECtHR</b>	The European Court of Human Rights
<b>EDPB</b>	European Data Protection Board
<b>EDPS</b>	European Data Protection Supervisor
<b>EP.AIA</b>	European Parliament Mandate for AIA
<b>EU</b>	European Union
<b>GDN</b>	Google Display Network (GDN)
<b>GDPR</b>	General Data Protection Regulation
<b>OBA</b>	Online Behavioral Advertising
<b>PKM</b>	Persuasion Knowledge Model
<b>RTB</b>	Real-Time Bidding
<b>SSP</b>	Supply Side Platform
<b>TEU</b>	Treaty of the European Union
<b>TFEU</b>	Treaty of the Functioning of the European Union
<b>UCPD</b>	Unfair Commercial Practices Directive
<b>UCTD</b>	Unfair Contract Terms Directive
<b>UK</b>	United Kingdom
<b>US</b>	United States of America
<b>VLOP</b>	Very Large Online Platform
<b>VLOSE</b>	Very Large Online Search Engine

