



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

International law and governance of the arctic in an era of climate change

Sarris, A.

Citation

Sarris, A. (2024, February 15). *International law and governance of the arctic in an era of climate change*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3717514>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3717514>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

International law and governance of the Arctic in an era of climate change

International law and governance of
the Arctic in an era of climate change

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 15 februari 2024
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Alexandros Sarris

geboren Athene – Griekenland

in 1982

Promotoren: prof. dr. N.J. Schrijver
prof. dr. F. Baetens

promotiecommissie: prof. dr. N.M. Blokker
prof. dr. E. Doussis (University of Athens, Greece)
prof. dr. M.G. Kohen (Graduate Institute, Geneva,
Switzerland)
prof. dr. J.H. de Wilde (Universiteit Groningen)
dr. T.L. Masson-Zwaan

Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest
Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio – Delft
Drukwerk: Ipskamp Printing – Amsterdam

ISBN 978 94 6473 382 2

© 2024 A. Sarris

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische vervoelvoudingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.



To Veatriki and Ismini ...

Table of contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XIII
INTRODUCTORY CHAPTER	1
PART I – THE ARCTIC AND THE LAW OF THE SEA	21
1 ARCTIC TERRITORIAL CLAIMS: DELIMITATION AND DELINEATION OF THE OUTER LIMITS OF THE CONTINENTAL SHELVES OVER THE ARCTIC OCEAN	23
1.1 Introduction	23
1.2 The international legal regime of the continental shelf	25
1.2.1 Article 76 of UNCLOS: Background and implementation	25
1.2.2 The origins of Article 76 of UNCLOS	26
1.2.3 The substance of Article 76	30
1.2.4 The United States and Article 76	32
1.2.5 Preliminary concluding remarks	35
1.3 High Seas Freedoms, the 200NM rule and extensions beyond and the common heritage of mankind	36
1.3.1 Introduction	36
1.3.2 The definition of the Area	38
1.3.3 The scope of application of Part XI of UNCLOS	41
1.4 State claims over natural resources within national jurisdiction	46
1.4.1 Arctic states' practice with respect to rights over natural resources in the Arctic Ocean	47
1.4.1.1 Russia	47
1.4.1.2 United States	54
1.4.1.3 Denmark	56
1.4.2 The importance of ridges in the Arctic Ocean	57
1.5 Boundary delimitations and continental margins	61
1.5.1 Donut holes	62
1.5.2 Overlap	63
1.5.3 Submission rights and possibilities	64
1.5.4 Collaborative Arctic research on continental shelves	68
1.6 Conclusions	71

2	NAVIGATIONAL MANAGEMENT OF THE ARCTIC OCEAN	75
2.1	Introduction	75
2.2	The existing legal framework of the international straits	77
2.2.1	The Arctic Ocean and shipping	80
2.2.2	The Arctic straits and trans-Arctic shipping	83
2.2.2.1	The Bering Strait	83
2.2.2.2	The Nares Strait	87
2.2.2.3	The Davis Strait	88
2.2.2.4	Fram Strait	89
2.2.2.5	The Denmark Strait	89
2.3	Multiple levels of Arctic shipping governance	90
2.3.1	Global level	90
2.3.1.1	The analysis of the new IMO Polar Code	93
2.3.2	Regional level	97
2.3.3	National Level	100
2.4	Applying international rules and standards to Arctic shipping	105
2.4.1	Maritime safety	105
2.4.2	Marine environmental protection	107
2.5	Preliminary conclusions	110
3	ARCTIC FISHERIES	113
3.1	Introduction	113
3.2	Current Arctic Fisheries	116
3.3	Arctic Fisheries and climate change	117
3.4	Law of the Sea in the Arctic marine area	119
3.4.1	The 2018 Agreement to Prevent Unregulated High Seas Fisheries in the Central Arctic Ocean	121
3.4.1.1	The negotiations	122
3.4.1.2	Scope of the CAOFA	123
3.4.1.3	Moratorium on unregulated commercial fishing	124
3.4.1.4	Questions of participation and concluding remarks	126
3.5	International legal and policy framework for Arctic fisheries management	127
3.5.1	Introduction	127
3.5.2	Interests, rights, obligations and jurisdiction	127
3.5.3	Substantive standards	128
3.5.4	Intergovernmental organisations and other relevant international bodies	129
3.5.5	International instruments	132
3.5.5.1	Introduction	132
3.5.5.2	UNCLOS	133
3.5.5.3	Fish Stocks Agreement	133
3.5.5.4	Constitutive instruments of RFMOs and arrangements and their conservation and management measures	136
3.5.5.5	Arctic Council instruments	137

3.6 National regulation	138
3.7 Gaps in the international legal and policy framework and national regulation and options for addressing them	139
3.7.1 Gaps	139
3.7.2 Options	140
3.7.2.1 General	140
3.7.2.2 Declaration on new and existing fisheries in the Arctic Ocean	141
3.7.2.3 Adjusting the spatial scope of the NEAFC Convention	142
3.7.2.4 Integrated, cross-sectoral ecosystem-based ocean management	145
3.8 Preliminary conclusions	149
PART II – ARCTIC GOVERNANCE, ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AND SECURITY	151
4 ARCTIC GOVERNANCE	153
4.1 Introduction	153
4.2 Arctic Council Working Groups	155
4.2.1 Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Program (AMAP)	155
4.2.2 Arctic Contaminants Action Program (ACAP)	159
4.2.3 Conservation of Arctic Flora and Fauna (CAFF)	160
4.2.4 Protection of the Arctic Marine Environment (PAME)	162
4.2.5 Sustainable Development Working Group (SDWG)	165
4.2.6 Arctic Council ministerial meetings	167
4.3 Sea of challenges	169
4.3.1 Obtaining full ratification of international agreements	169
4.3.2 Following through with AMSA recommendations	170
4.3.3 Putting the ecosystem approach into practice	172
4.3.4 Completing the Arctic Council’s restructuring	173
4.4 Addressing future ocean governance of areas beyond national jurisdiction in the Arctic	179
4.5 Strengthening the ‘Arctic Voice’ in international fora	184
4.6 Dynamic means of multi-level governance	186
4.7 Conclusion	188
5 THE ARCTIC LEGAL REGIME FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AND SUSTAINABILITY	191
5.1 Introduction	191
5.2 Arctic-Antarctica: Relevance of and differences between their environmental perspectives	191
5.3 The current regional Arctic environmental legal regime	193
5.3.1 The Arctic environment	193
5.3.2 Environmental challenges in the Arctic region	195
5.4 The absence of an environmental legal regime and initiatives for cooperation	196
5.4.1 Legal overview	196
5.4.2 Growth in Arctic cooperation initiatives	197

5.5 Arctic Environmental Protection Strategy (AEPS)	199
5.5.1 Evaluation of the effectiveness of AEPS	202
5.6 The Arctic Council	202
5.7 Global environmental treaties applicable in the Arctic	203
5.7.1 Implementation of the global treaties in the Arctic	204
5.7.2 Agreements for the protection of marine environment	205
5.7.3 Agreements for the protection of the atmosphere	208
5.7.3.1 The 1979 Geneva Convention on Long-range Transboundary Air Pollution	208
5.7.3.2 Ozone treaties	210
5.7.4 International agreements on climate change	211
5.7.5 Biodiversity: Protection of species and ecosystems	213
5.7.5.1 Consumptive use of wild species	214
5.7.5.2 Wildlife trade	214
5.7.5.3 Whales and marine mammals	215
5.7.5.4 Polar bears	216
5.7.5.5 Treaties on wildlife and world heritage	217
5.7.5.6 International arrangements on resource extraction and waste disposal	218
5.7.6 Natural resources and mining	219
5.7.7 Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA)	221
5.7.8 Concluding remarks on the implementation of the existing global treaties related to environmental protection	222
5.8 Need for a regional environmental Arctic agreement	222
5.8.1 Effectiveness of the current regional environmental legal regime	223
5.8.2 Regional Arctic environmental protection agreement	225
5.8.3 Advantages of an Arctic environmental treaty	226
5.8.4 Disadvantages of an Arctic environmental protection treaty	227
5.9 Preliminary conclusion	228
6 ADDRESSING THE IMPACT OF CLIMATE CHANGE IN THE ARCTIC AND INDIGENOUS INTERESTS	231
6.1 Introduction	231
6.2 Defining indigenous peoples	235
6.2.1 Right to culture under Article 27	237
6.2.2 Subsistence rights under Article 1(2)	240
6.3 Land claims in Canada: An overview	241
6.4 Reconciling certainty and flexibility in times of climate change	244
6.5 Promoting meaningful participation of indigenous communities in climate change governance	249
6.6 Globalisation in the Arctic accelerated by climate change	254
6.6.1 Societal change	257
6.6.2 Economic disparities	258
6.6.3 Development of infrastructure	259
6.6.4 Livelihood and cultural changes	259
6.7 Preliminary conclusion	260

7	ARCTIC SECURITY	261
7.1	Introduction	261
7.1.1	Climate change and security policy	261
7.1.2	Rising temperatures equate to rising tensions	265
7.2	The conflict potential in the Arctic	268
7.2.1	Conflicts between interest groups and sectors	268
7.2.2	Conflicts over access to petroleum resources	270
7.2.3	Conflicts over access to marine resources	273
7.2.4	Conflicts over access to shipping lanes	276
7.3	Traditional military conflicts	279
7.3.1	Arctic security governance	283
7.3.1.1	An Arctic Security Forum (?)	283
7.3.1.2	Using the existing forum	285
7.3.2	The option of multilateral organisations	286
7.3.2.1	The EU	287
7.3.2.2	NATO	287
7.3.2.3	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE)	288
7.3.3	An alternative Arctic security forum?	289
7.4	Meeting the new security challenges	290
7.4.1	Mitigation and adaptation strategies	290
7.4.2	Implications for military planners	293
7.5	Preliminary conclusions	296
	CONCLUSIONS	299
	SUMMARY	319
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	327
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	336
	TABLE OF CASES	363
	MAPS	265
	CURRICULUM VITAE	371

Abbreviations

ABNJ	Area beyond national jurisdiction
ACAP	Arctic contaminants action program
ACIA	Arctic Climate Impact Assessment
AEPS	Arctic Environmental Protection Strategy
AIRS	Arctic Ice Regime System
ALDE	Alliance for Liberals and Democrats for Europe
AMAP	Arctic Monitoring and Assessment Programme
AMSA	Arctic Marine Shipping Assessment Report
APMS	Associated Protective Measures
AR4	Fourth Assessment Report
ARTA	Alpha Ridge Test of Appurtenance
AWPPA	Arctic Waters Pollution Prevention Act 1970 Canada
BEAR	Barents Euro-Arctic Region
BLG	Bulk Liquids and Gases
CAFF	Conservation of Arctic Flora and Fauna
CAO	Central Arctic Ocean
CASD	Commission on Arctic Sustainable Development
CBD	Convention on Biological Diversity
CBMP	Circumpolar Biodiversity Monitoring Program
CAMLR	Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources
CFCS	Chlorofluorocarbons
CITES	Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora
CLCS	Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf
CLRTAP	Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution
COFI	Committee on Fisheries
COMSAR	Sub-Committee on Search and Rescue
CPAN	Circumpolar Protected Areas Network
DE	Ship Design and Equipment
DOALOS	Division of Oceans Affairs and the Law of the Sea
EAF	Ecosystem Approach to Fisheries
EBM	Ecosystem-Based Management
EBSAS	Ecologically and Biologically Significant Areas
EEA	European Environment Agency
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EJIL	European Journal of International Law
EPPR	Emergency Prevention, Preparedness and Response
EU	European Union

FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FMPS	Fishery Management Plans
GCI	Gwich'in Council International
GRIS	The Greenland Ice Sheet in a Changing Climate
IAATO	International Association of Antarctic Tour Operators
IASC	International Arctic Science Committee
IBCAO	International Bathymetric Chart of the Arctic Ocean
ICC	Intergovernmental Consultative Committee
ICC	Inuit Circumpolar Conference
ICCAT	International Commission on the Conservation of Atlantic Tunas
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICES	International Council for the Exploration of the Sea
ICJ	International Court of Justice
IEA	International Energy Agency
IGO	Intergovernmental Organisation
IHO	International Hydrographic Organization
IISD	International Institute for Sustainable Development
ILC	International Law Commission
IMO	International Maritime Organisation
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IPCC	United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IPHC	International Pacific Halibut Commission
IPOAS	International Plans of Action
ISOPE	International Offshore and Polar Engineering Conference
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature
IUU	Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated Fishing
IYB	International Year on Biodiversity
JPOI	Plan of Implementation of the World Summit on Sustainable Development, Johannesburg
IPY	International Polar Year
LOMROG	Lomonosov Ridge Off Greenland
LORITA	Lomonosov Ridge Test of Appurtenance
LMES	Large Marine Ecosystems
LRTAP	Long Range Transboundary Air Pollution
MARPOL	International Convention on the Prevention of Pollution From Ships
MAST	Mapping of Arctic Sediment Thickness
MEPC	Marine Environment Protection Committee
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MPA	Marine Protected Area
MSC	Maritime Safety Committee
NAFO	Northwest Atlantic Fisheries Organization
NAMMCO	North Atlantic Marine Mammals Commission
NASCO	North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organization
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NAVAREAS	Regional Navigation Areas
NEAFC	North East Atlantic Fisheries Commission

NIMBY	“Not in My Back Yard”
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NOAA	National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (USA)
NORDREG	Arctic Canada Traffic System
NPAFC	North Pacific Anadromous Fish Commission
NPFMC	North Pacific Fishery Management Council
OAS	Organization of American States
OPRC	Convention on Oil Pollution Preparedness and Response
OSPAR	Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East Atlantic
PAME	Protection of the Marine Environment
PCB	Polychlorinated Biphenyls
PICES	North Pacific Marine Science Organization
POAC	Port and Ocean Engineering Under Arctic Conditions
POPS	Persistent Organic Pollutants
PSC	Pacific Salmon Commission
PSGS	Project Steering Groups
PSSA	Particularly Sensitive Sea Area
RAIPON	Association of Indigenous Minorities in the Far North, Siberia, the Far East of Russia
RFMO	Regional Fisheries Management Organisation
ROMO	Regional Oceans Management Organization
SAO	Senior Arctic Officials
SCAR	Scientific Committee for Antarctic Research
SCPAR	Standing Committee of Parliamentarians of the Arctic Region
SDWG	Sustainable Development Working Group (Arctic Council)
SEA	Strategic Impact Assessment
SLCF	Short-Lived Climate Forcers
SOAER	State of the Arctic Environment Report
SOLAS	International Convention on Safety of Life At Sea
SWIPA	Snow, Water, Ice and Permafrost in the Arctic
TAC	Total Allowable Catch
TENORM	Technologically Enhanced Naturally Occurring Radioactive Materials
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNFCCC	Un Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WCPFC	Western and Central Pacific Ocean Fisheries Commission
WMO	World Meteorological Organization

