



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Matrilineal Islam: State Islamic Law and everyday practices of marriage and divorce among people of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia
Al Farabi, A.

Citation

Al Farabi, A. (2023, December 13). *Matrilineal Islam: State Islamic Law and everyday practices of marriage and divorce among people of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3672200>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3672200>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Matrilineal Islam

State Islamic Law and Everyday Practices of
Marriage and Divorce among People
of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia

Matrilineal Islam

State Islamic Law and Everyday Practices of
Marriage and Divorce among People
of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 13 december 2023
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Al Farabi

geboren te Curup, Indonesië in 1987

Promotores : Prof. dr. A.W. Bedner
Prof. dr. L.P.H.M. Buskens
Promotiecommissie : Prof.dr. N.J.G. Kaptein
Dr. Nadia Sonneveld
Prof.dr. Euis Nurlaelawati (UIN Sunan
Kalijaga)
Dr. Stijn van Huis (Universitas Bina
Nusantara)

Lay-out: Imam Syahirul Alim
Cover photo: Courtesy of the author

© 2023 Al Farabi. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

*For my mother and in loving memory of my father,
M. Nazir bin Sata (1954 – 2018)*

This thesis was researched and written with financial support from *Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan* (LPDP, the Indonesian Endowment Fund for Education) of the Indonesian Ministry of Finance



Acknowledgements

This dissertation is a collective enterprise, and I am deeply indebted to a great many people and institutions for their help in seeing this project through to its completion. Detailed comments from my promoters, Prof. dr. Adriaan Bedner and Prof. dr. Léon Buskens, have refined the argument, theory, and structure of my dissertation. Professor Bedner showed genuine interest in the topic of my dissertation and put trust in me at all stages of the completion of this project. Through intensive supervision, almost weekly during a pandemic, he has taught me the importance of critical thinking and precise formulation for academic writing. Professor Buskens guided me during my early months as a PhD student and introduced me to many scholarly works that are relevant to my research. A number of prominent scholars from Indonesia, whom I met prior to starting my PhD, deserve a special mention: Pak Syamsul Anwar, Bu Euis, Pak Noorhaidi, Om Masdar, Pak Bunyan, Mas Yanwar, and Pak Dadi. Their passion for academia and support for young scholars made them my role models at the foundational stage of my academic journey.

This study draws on field research in the Mukomuko district in the province of Bengkulu, and I therefore want to express gratitude to my relatives and friends who facilitated my fieldwork there. I owe thanks to my late uncles, Darussalam, Ichsanuddin, and Tarmizi, who keenly shared their invaluable knowledge of Mukomuko. My gratitude also goes to Dang Guntur-Eva and Wo Tin-Putra, for facilitating my stay in Mukomuko. I would also like to thank Maadas and Kudimah, my host parents in Talang Buai, who helped me mingle and gain the trust of local people. I am also thankful to Tri, Erik, and all members of *orang adat*, who shared insiders' perspectives with me on the practices of

marriage and divorce within their community. I also owe words of thanks to Hendra Cipta, who keenly shared his knowledge on and enthusiasm for the *adat* of Mukomuko. Special thanks go to Dang Zikri, Ade, Guntur, Renal, Wahib, Arman, Farid, and Pepri, for their assistance in collecting data for this research. This dissertation has been made possible through financial support from LPDP. In particular, I am indebted to Ratna Prabandari, for her kind assistance in switching my scholarship from an MA to a PhD track.

In the Arga Makmur Islamic court, I am thankful to Om Fauzi, the judges and court employees, for providing me with almost full access to court hearings and files. I must also extend my gratitude to Judge Amran Suadi and Edi Riadi from the Supreme Court, and to Wo Nita, Cholil, Isna, and Dede. I have learned deeply from their collective and indispensable experiences serving as Islamic court judges. Colleagues at LIAS, especially Margreet, Maghiel, José, and Pia, have offered their help throughout my PhD-project. I am also grateful to my colleagues from the group discussion on family law at the VVI: Mies, Afriansyah, Hoko, Annelien, Fauzi, and Nanda. Mies deserves special mention, for giving me time amid her own project to read each chapter and give constructive feedback. Thanks also to Rebecca Blunden for proofreading my manuscript, to Maarten Manse for translating my summary into Dutch, and to Kora and Koen for helping me with the administrative matters involving the PhD-defence. Words of thanks also go to colleagues from UIN Raden Mas Said, especially Professors Mudofir, M. Usman, and Ismail Yahya. I am also very thankful to Mas Tio, Maaïke, Mbak Fit, Mega, Santy, Julia, Isma, Ayu, Maya, Raini, Dyah, Dian, Ade, Nazar, Ucok, Koko, Kurniawan, Cahyo, Asep, Syahril, Kus, Fahrizal, Yance, Taufik, Victor, and all *Leideners*, *Blitza*, *Aladhin*, *Kampung Damai*, and *Warkop* friends.

Finally, I want to address my deepest gratitude to my family. My parents, M. Nazir *bin* Sata and Nurjanah *binti* Abdullah Haskardjan, have always supported my choosing a career in academia. My mother's support and encouragement, in her

own way, mean the world to me. Sadly, my father passed away before I could complete this book, but his loving memory proved indispensable to the completion of this dissertation. I must also mention my brothers and sisters, Dang Zikri-Nur and Suci-Huda, who assisted me in collecting and organising data for this dissertation. My gratitude also goes to my parents-in-law, Su'aidi Asy'ari and Chodijah, for their invaluable support, and to my other in-laws, Haekal-Alda and Fairuz. Most of all, I am indebted to my wife, Fadhilatul Hikmah, and our son, Athaya Aydan Hakim. Being an academic herself, Dhila is always there to encourage and discuss my work. Aydan, born in October 2017, is too small to understand why we lived through times of separation during the pandemic. While I had to be in Yogyakarta completing the writing, our dear son stayed in Jambi, under the loving care of my parents in law. Thank you.

●

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	vii
Table of Contents	xi
List of Figures.....	xv
Note of Transliteration	xvii
Maps	xviii
1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 State, Islam, and Matrilineal Traditions	1
1.2 Mukomuko as a Research Site	6
1.3 Research Questions.....	9
1.4 Conceptual Framework.....	13
1.4.1 Multiple approaches to the development of Indonesian Muslim family law	13
1.4.2 Law in context: the unification of Muslim family law and Indonesian multicultural Muslim society	30
1.5 Research Methods.....	32
1.5.1 Empirical fieldwork.....	34
1.5.2 Archival data collection.....	38
1.6 Research Ethics.....	40
1.7 Structure of the Thesis.....	42
2 The Autonomy of the Islamic Court: Indonesian Marriage and Divorce Law for Muslims	48
2.1 Introduction	48
2.2 <i>Isbat Nikah</i> (a Retroactive Validation of Marriage).....	53
2.2.1 Registration and the Legality of (Islamic) Marriage.....	54
2.2.2 Dual Validity and a More Extended Form of	

<i>Isbat Nikah</i>	56
2.2.3 Refining the Law of <i>Isbat Nikah</i>	62
2.3 Broken Marriage Divorce	74
2.3.1 Judicial divorce and different grounds for divorce	74
2.3.2 The evolution of ‘continuous strife’ as a ground for divorce	78
2.3.3 The invention of ‘broken marriage’ as unilateral and no-fault.....	86
2.4 Concluding Remarks.....	96
3 Presenting Mukomuko and its Multicultural Society ...	99
3.1 Introduction	99
3.2 A Brief Historical Background for the Traditional Structure and Institution of Mukomuko	102
3.2.1 Mukomuko as <i>rantau</i> : the Minangkabau’s matrilineal structure and institution.....	103
3.2.2 The collapse of the Anak-Sungai sultanate and persisting traditional structure and institutions at village level.....	108
3.3 Contemporary Mukomuko: Society and Settlements..	118
3.3.1 The natives and their <i>hulu-hilir</i> villages.....	120
3.3.2 The migrants and their enclave villages	125
3.3.3 The emerging urban centres.....	135
3.4 Concluding Remarks	140
4 Semendo Tradition: Marriage and Divorce among Hulu- Hilir People in Contemporary Mukomuko.....	142
4.1 Introduction	142
4.2 <i>Semendo</i> Tradition and <i>Adat-Pegang-Pakai</i> in Traditional Villages	144
4.2.1 Ethnographic evidence: a view from Talang Buai village	149
4.2.2 The invention of <i>Badan Musyawarah Adat</i> (BMA).....	152

4.3	<i>Semendo</i> Marriage.....	155
4.3.1	An overview of marriage in traditional villages.....	157
4.3.2	<i>Antaran</i> and <i>mahar</i> ('bride price')	165
4.3.3	Abbas v. Dini: negotiating <i>mahar</i> and <i>antaran</i>	168
4.4	<i>Semendo</i> Divorce	174
4.4.1	An overview of divorce statistics in traditional villages	179
4.4.2	<i>Harta-sepencarian</i> (Joint-marital property)	183
4.4.3	<i>Syahril v. Yati</i> revisited: Contesting <i>harta-sepencarian</i>	186
4.5	Concluding Remarks.....	192
5	The State Islamic Court: Examining Conflicts between <i>Semendo Adat</i> and State Law	194
5.1	Introduction	194
5.2	The 'Late' Establishment of the Mukomuko Islamic Court.....	197
5.3	Access to the Islamic Court.....	203
5.4	Marriage-Related Cases: Bridging <i>Adat</i> and State Marriage	206
5.4.1	Nurdin v. the late Hamidah family: <i>isbat nikah</i> and debates on marital property	208
5.4.2	Forum and discourse shopping	214
5.5	Divorce-Related Cases: Types of Divorce and their Impacts	220
5.5.1	<i>Suhar v. Tini</i> : law-abiding citizens and a complete divorce procedure	225
5.5.2	Informal case-drafters and the construction of 'legal truth'	230
5.6	Whose Court is this and Who Do the Competent Courts Actually 'Serve'?	235
5.7	Concluding Remarks.....	239

6 Conclusion: The Interplay between State Islamic Law and Matrilineal <i>Adat</i>.....	242
6.1 Main Findings	244
6.1.1 Legal pluralism: <i>State law v. semendo adat</i>	244
6.1.2 The logic of the courts.....	251
6.1.3 The gradually centralised and homogenised Islamic judiciary	256
6.1.4 Islamic courts and state formation	260
6.2 Everyday Practices of Marriage and Divorce in the Contemporary Mukomuko.....	263
6.3 Matrilineal Muslims and the Unification of Muslim Family Law.....	267
6.4 The Prospect of <i>Adat</i> in the Gradually Centralised and Homogenised Muslim Family Law System: A Lesson from Mukomuko	270
References.....	275
Books, Article Journals, Magazines, and Web Pages	275
Other Sources: Archives, Reports, and Bulletins.....	300
Law, Regulations, Court Judgements	302
Glossary	309
Summary	321
<i>Sumenvatting</i> (Summary in Dutch)	332
Curriculum Vitae.....	345
Propositions	347

●

List of Figures

Figure 2.3.1.1: Muslims' divorce grounds, procedures, and outputs.....	78
Figure 3.2.2. 1: Native government after the 1789 patrilineal revolution	110
Figure 3.2.2.2: The native administration before and after the sultanate abolition	113
Figure 3.2.2.3: The trajectory of Mukomuko's history under different regimes	116
Figure 3.2.2.4: A bicara (deliberation) council to legitimise an elected candidate of kepala desa, according to the adat (right-hand image: Talang Buai village at noon).....	117
Figure 3.3.1: Typologies of the Mukomuko population (residents of 10-years old and over)	119
Figure 3.3.1. 1: Smaller scale of hulu-hilir relations in Mukomuko on the West Coast (lefthand) and the main hulu-hilir polities on the East Coast (righthand).....	122
Figure 3.3.1.2: Preparation for a wedding feast.....	124
Figure 3.3.1. 3: Nanam kelapo and a bride's khataman	125
Figure 3.3.2.1: Mukomuko in 1970 and transmigrant expansions 1905-1984	127
Figure 3.3.2.2: Lefthand image: Criticism of the large-scale plantation. Righthand image: The Lapindo transmigration unit.....	128
Figure 3.3.2.3: Land use in contemporary Mukomuko (2019)	129

Figure 3.3.3.1: Lefthand image: A Reog dance performance (originally from Ponorogo, East Java) in present day Mukomuko. Righthand image: The 2020 BMA (retrieved from Referensi Publik, 2020)	139
Figure 4.3.1.1: Different types of marriage and dissolution, on a continuum	163
Figure 4.4.1. 1: The number of divorcees, according to different sources.....	181
Figure 4.4.1. 2: The number of divorcees from Talang Buai.....	182
Figure 4.4.1. 3: Out-of-court and in-court divorces	183
Figure 5.3.1: Incoming cases from Mukomuko in the last six years (2016–May 2021)	205
Figure 5.4.1: Marriage dispensation in the Mukomuko Islamic court.....	207
Figure 5.5.1: Types of divorce lawsuit over the past six years.....	222
Figure 5.5 2: Court decisions on ‘cerai-talak’ in 2016 and 2019	224
Figure 5.6.1: Divorce lawsuits among state officials in 2016 and 2017	237

Note of Transliteration

Indonesian and Mukomuko words are written as they are used in these languages. The writing of Islamic terms follows “Brill’s simple Arabic transliteration system” as in the table below. This system has been departed from in cases where specific transcriptions have come into general use or have been absorbed into Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI). Words such as Qur’an and *Fikih*, for instance, are written as they are, instead of *Qur’ān* and *Fiqh*. Names of persons, organisations and foundations, as well as titles of books, journals and articles are rendered according to locally applied spellings and transliterations. All non-English words are written in italics, like *dusun* (Indonesian), *ulama* (Arabic), and *peroatin* (Mukomuko). The plural forms of these non-English words are indicated by adding an ‘s’ to the word in the singular, as in *dusuns*, *ulamas* and *peroatins*.

Arabic	sAts	Arabic	sAts	Arabic	sAts
ا	a, ā	ط	t	ى	ā
ب	b	ظ	z	ي	ī
ت	t	ع	‘	و	ū
ث	ṭ	غ	ġ	َ	a
ج	ġ	ف	f	ِ	i
ح	ḥ	ق	q	ُ	u
خ	ḫ	ك	k	يَا	ai
د	d	ل	l	وَا	au
ذ	ḏ	م	m	يَايَا	īy
ر	r	ن	n	وَاوَا	ūw
ز	z	ه	h	ة	a, ah, āh, at, āt
س	s	و	w, ū		
ش	š	ي	y, ī		
ص	ṣ	ء	’		
ض	ḏ				

