

Matrilineal Islam: State Islamic Law and everyday practices of marriage and divorce among people of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia Al Farabi, A.

Citation

Al Farabi, A. (2023, December 13). Matrilineal Islam: State Islamic Law and everyday practices of marriage and divorce among people of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3672200

Version: Publisher's Version

Licence agreement concerning inclusion of

License: <u>doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository</u>

of the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3672200

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Matrilineal Islam

State Islamic Law and Everyday Practices of Marriage and Divorce among People of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia

Matrilineal Islam

State Islamic Law and Everyday Practices of Marriage and Divorce among People of Mukomuko-Bengkulu, Sumatra, Indonesia

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden, op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl, volgens besluit van het college voor promoties te verdedigen op woensdag 13 december 2023 klokke 11.15 uur

> door Al Farabi geboren te Curup, Indonesië in 1987

Promotores : Prof. dr. A.W. Bedner

Prof. dr. L.P.H.M. Buskens

Promotiecommissie : Prof.dr. N.J.G. Kaptein

Dr. Nadia Sonneveld

Prof.dr. Euis Nurlaelawati (UIN Sunan

Kalijaga)

Dr. Stijn van Huis (Universitas Bina

Nusantara)

Lay-out: Imam Syahirul Alim

Cover photo: Courtesy of the author

© 2023 Al Farabi. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.



Acknowledgements

This dissertation is a collective enterprise, and I am deeply indebted to a great many people and institutions for their help in seeing this project through to its completion. Detailed comments from my promotors, Prof. dr. Adriaan Bedner and Prof. dr. Léon Buskens, have refined the argument, theory, and structure of my dissertation. Professor Bedner showed genuine interest in the topic of my dissertation and put trust in me at all stages of the completion of this project. Through intensive supervision, almost weekly during a pandemic, he has taught me the importance of critical thinking and precise formulation for academic writing. Professor Buskens guided me during my early months as a PhD student and introduced me to many scholarly works that are relevant to my research. A number of prominent scholars from Indonesia, whom I met prior to starting my PhD, deserve a special mention: Pak Syamsul Anwar, Bu Euis, Pak Noorhaidi, Om Masdar, Pak Bunyan, Mas Yanwar, and Pak Dadi. Their passion for academia and support for young scholars made them my role models at the foundational stage of my academic journey.

This study draws on field research in the Mukomuko district in the province of Bengkulu, and I therefore want to express gratitude to my relatives and friends who facilitated my fieldwork there. I owe thanks to my late uncles, Darussalam, Ichsanuddin, and Tarmizi, who keenly shared their invaluable knowledge of Mukomuko. My gratitude also goes to Dang Guntur-Eva and Wo Tin-Putra, for facilitating my stay in Mukomuko. I would also like to thank Maadas and Kudimah, my host parents in Talang Buai, who helped me mingle and gain the trust of local people. I am also thankful to Tri, Erik, and all members of *orang adat*, who shared insiders' perspectives with me on the practices of

marriage and divorce within their community. I also owe words of thanks to Hendra Cipta, who keenly shared his knowledge on and enthusiasm for the *adat* of Mukomuko. Special thanks go to Dang Zikri, Ade, Guntur, Renal, Wahib, Arman, Farid, and Pepri, for their assistance in collecting data for this research. This dissertation has been made possible through financial support from LPDP. In particular, I am indebted to Ratna Prabandari, for her kind assistance in switching my scholarship from an MA to a PhD track.

In the Arga Makmur Islamic court, I am thankful to Om Fauzi, the judges and court employees, for providing me with almost full access to court hearings and files. I must also extend my gratitude to Judge Amran Suadi and Edi Riadi from the Supreme Court, and to Wo Nita, Cholil, Isna, and Dede. I have learned deeply from their collective and indispensable experiences serving as Islamic court judges. Colleagues at LIAS, especially Margreet, Maghiel. José, and Pia, have offered their help throughout my PhD-project. I am also grateful to my colleagues from the group discussion on family law at the VVI: Mies, Afriansyah, Hoko, Annelien, Fauzi, and Nanda. Mies deserves special mention, for giving me time amid her own project to read each chapter and give constructive feedback. Thanks also to Rebecca Blunden for proofreading my manuscript, to Maarten Manse for translating my summary into Dutch, and to Kora and Koen for helping me with the administrative matters involving the PhD-defence. Words of thanks also go to colleagues from UIN Raden Mas Said, especially Professors Mudofir, M. Usman, and Ismail Yahya. I am also very thankful to Mas Tio, Maaike, Mbak Fit, Mega, Santy, Julia, Isma, Ayu, Maya, Raini, Dyah, Dian, Ade, Nazar, Ucok, Koko, Kurniawan, Cahyo, Asep, Syahril, Kus, Fahrizal, Yance, Taufik, Victor, and all Leideners, Blitza, Aladhin, Kampung Damai, and Warkop friends.

Finally, I want to address my deepest gratitude to my family. My parents, M. Nazir *bin* Sata and Nurjanah *binti* Abdullah Haskardjan, have always supported my choosing a career in academia. My mother's support and encouragement, in her

own way, mean the world to me. Sadly, my father passed away before I could complete this book, but his loving memory proved indispensable to the completion of this dissertation. I must also mention my brothers and sisters, Dang Zikri-Nur and Suci-Huda, who assisted me in collecting and organising data for this dissertation. My gratitude also goes to my parents-in-law, Su'aidi Asy'ari and Chodijah, for their invaluable support, and to my other in-laws, Haekal-Alda and Fairuz. Most of all, I am indebted to my wife, Fadhilatul Hikmah, and our son, Athaya Aydan Hakim. Being an academic herself, Dhila is always there to encourage and discuss my work. Aydan, born in October 2017, is too small to understand why we lived through times of separation during the pandemic. While I had to be in Yogyakarta completing the writing, our dear son stayed in Jambi, under the loving care of my parents in law. Thank you.



Table of Contents

Ac	kno	wledg	ements	vii
Ta	ble	of Con	tents	xi
Lis	st of	Figur	es	xv
No	te o	f Tran	ısliteration	xvii
Ma	ıps.			xviii
1	Int	roduc	tion	1
	1.2	State,	Islam, and Matrilineal Traditions	1
	1.2	Muko	muko as a Research Site	6
	1.3	Resea	arch Questions	9
	1.4	Conce	eptual Framework	13
		1.4.1	Multiple approaches to the development of	
			Indonesian Muslim family law	13
		1.4.2	Law in context: the unification of Muslim	
			family law and Indonesian multicultural	
			Muslim society	
	1.5	Resea	rch Methods	32
		1.5.1	Empirical fieldwork	34
		1.5.2	Archival data collection	38
	1.6	Resea	arch Ethics	40
	1.7	Struc	ture of the Thesis	42
2	The	e Auto	nomy of the Islamic Court:	
	Ind	lonesi	an Marriage and Divorce Law for Muslims	48
	2.1	Intro	duction	48
	2.2	Isbat	Nikah (a Retroactive Validation of Marriage)	53
		2.2.1	Registration and the Legality of (Islamic)	
			Marriage	54
		2.2.2	Dual Validity and a More Extended Form of	

	Isbat Nikah	<i></i> 56
2.2.3	Refining the Law of Isbat Nikah	62
2.3 Brol	ken Marriage Divorce	74
2.3.1	Judicial divorce and different grounds for	
	divorce	74
2.3.2	The evolution of 'continuous strife' as a	
	ground for divorce	78
2.3.3	8	
	unilateral and no-fault	86
2.4 Con	cluding Remarks	96
Present	ing Mukomuko and its Multicultural Socie	tv 99
3.2 A Br	ief Historical Background for the Traditional	
		102
3.2.1	Mukomuko as <i>rantau</i> : the Minangkabau's	
	9	103
3.2.2	2 The collapse of the Anak-Sungai sultanate	
	and persisting traditional structure and	
	institutions at village level	108
3.3 Conf	temporary Mukomuko: Society and Settlemer	ts118
3.3.1	The natives and their hulu-hilir villages	120
3.3.2	The migrants and their enclave villages	125
3.3.3	The emerging urban centres	135
3.4 Con	cluding Remarks	140
Somond	o Tradition: Marriage and Divorce among	Hulu-
	_	
		144
	_	
1.2.		149
4.2.2		
	(BMA)	152
	2.3 Broke 2.3.1 2.3.2 2.3.3 2.4 Condo Present 3.1 Intro 3.2 A Broke 3.2.1 3.2.2 3.3 Conto 3.3.1 3.3.2 3.4 Condo Semend Hilir Ped 4.1 Intro 4.2 Semend 4.2.1	unilateral and no-fault

	4.3	Seme	ndo Marriage	155
		4.3.1	An overview of marriage in traditional villa	iges157
		4.3.2	Antaran and mahar ('bride price')	165
		4.3.3	Abbas v. Dini: negotiating mahar and antar	an168
	4.4	Seme	ndo Divorce	174
		4.4.1	An overview of divorce statistics in tradition	nal
			villages	179
		4.4.2	Harta-sepencarian (Joint-marital property)	183
		4.4.3	Syahril v. Yati revisited: Contesting harta-	
			sepencarian	186
	4.5	Concl	uding Remarks	192
5	The	e State	e Islamic Court: Examining Conflicts betw	een
_			Adat and State Law	
	5.1	Intro	duction	194
	5.2	The 'I	Late' Establishment of the Mukomuko Islami	ic
		Court		197
	5.3	Acces	s to the Islamic Court	203
	5.4	Marri	age-Related Cases: Bridging Adat and State	
		Marri	age	206
		5.4.1	Nurdin v. the late Hamidah family: isbat nik	каh
			and debates on marital property	208
		5.4.2	Forum and discourse shopping	214
	5.5	Divor	ce-Related Cases: Types of Divorce and thei	r
		Impa	cts	220
		5.5.1	Suhar v. Tini: law-abiding citizens and a	
			complete divorce procedure	225
		5.5.2	Informal case-drafters and the construction	
			'legal truth'	230
	5.6		e Court is this and Who Do the Competent	
			s Actually 'Serve'?	
	5.7	Concl	uding Remarks	239

6	Cor	nclusion: The Interplay between State Islamic Law	
	and	d Matrilineal <i>Adat</i> 2	42
	6.1	Main Findings2	44
		6.1.1 Legal pluralism: State law v. semendo adat2	44
		6.1.2 The logic of the courts2	51
		6.1.3 The gradually centralised and homogenised	
		Islamic judiciary2	56
		6.1.4 Islamic courts and state formation2	60
	6.2	Everyday Practices of Marriage and Divorce in the	
		Contemporary Mukomuko2	63
	6.3	Matrilineal Muslims and the Unification of Muslim	
		Family Law2	67
	6.4	The Prospect of Adat in the Gradually Centralised and	
		Homogenised Muslim Family Law System: A Lesson	
		from Mukomuko2	70
Ref	fere	ences2	75
		Books, Article Journals, Magazines, and Web Pages 2	
		Other Sources: Archives, Reports, and Bulletins3	00
		Law, Regulations, Court Judgements	02
Glo	ssa	ıry3	09
Sur	nm	ary3	21
Sur	nen	watting (Summary in Dutch)3	32
Cui	ric	ulum Vitae3	45
Pro	ono:	sitions3	47

List of Figures

Figure 2.3.1.1: Muslims' divorce grounds, procedures, and
outputs78
Figure 3.2.2. 1: Native government after the 1789
patrilineal revolution110
Figure 3.2.2.2: The native administration before and after
the sultanate abolition113
Figure 3.2.2.3: The trajectory of Mukomuko's history
under different regimes116
Figure 3.2.2.4: A bicara (deliberation) council to
legitimise an elected candidate of kepala desa,
according to the adat (right-hand image: Talang Buai
village at noon)117
Figure 3.3.1: Typologies of the Mukomuko population
(residents of 10-years old and over)119
Figure 3.3.1. 1: Smaller scale of hulu-hilir relations in
Mukomuko on the West Coast (lefthand) and the
main hulu-hilir polities on the East Coast
(righthand)122
Figure 3.3.1.2: Preparation for a wedding feast124
Figure 3.3.1. 3: Nanam kelapo and a bride's khataman125
Figure 3.3.2.1: Mukomuko in 1970 and transmigrant
expansions 1905-1984127
Figure 3.3.2.2: Lefthand image: Criticism of the large-
scale plantation. Righthand image: The Lapindo
transmigration unit128
Figure 3.3.2.3: Land use in contemporary Mukomuko
(2019)129

Figure 3.3.3.1: Lefthand image: A Reog dance	
performance (originally from Ponorogo, East Java) in	n
present day Mukomuko. Righthand image: The 2020)
BMA (retrieved from Referensi Publik, 2020)	.139
Figure 4.3.1.1: Different types of marriage and	
dissolution, on a continuum	.163
Figure 4.4.1. 1: The number of divorcees, according to	
different sources	.181
Figure 4.4.1. 2: The number of divorcees from Talang	
Buai	.182
Figure 4.4.1. 3: Out-of-court and in-court divorces	.183
Figure 5.3.1: Incoming cases from Mukomuko in the last	
six years (2016-May 2021)	.205
Figure 5.4.1: Marriage dispensation in the Mukomuko	
Islamic court	.207
Figure 5.5.1: Types of divorce lawsuit over the past six	
years	.222
Figure 5.5 2: Court decisions on 'cerai-talak' in 2016 and	l
2019	.224
Figure 5.6.1: Divorce lawsuits among state officials in	
2016 and 2017	.237



Indonesian and Mukomuko words are written as they are used in these languages. The writing of Islamic terms follows "Brill's simple Arabic transliteration system" as in the table below. This system has been departed from in cases where specific transcriptions have come into general use or have been absorbed into Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI). Words such as Qur'an and Fikih, for instance, are written as they are, instead of Qur'ān and Fiqh. Names of persons, organisations and foundations, as well as titles of books, journals and articles are rendered according to locally applied spellings and transliterations. All non-English words are written in italics, like dusun (Indonesian), ulama (Arabic), and peroatin (Mukomuko). The plural forms of these non-English words are indicated by adding an 's' to the word in the singular, as in dusuns, ulamas and peroatins.

Arabic	sAts	Arabic	sAts	Arabic	sAts
١	a, ā	ط	ţ	ی	ā
ب	b	ظ	ż	ي	ī
ت	t	ع	•	و	ũ
ث	ţ	ع غ ف	ģ	0	a
ج	ğ	ف	f	9	i
ح د خ	ķ	ق	q	0	u
خ	ĥ	ك	k	ئي	ai
د	d	J	1	· 5	au
ذ	d	٢	m	بِيّ	īy
ر	r	ن	n	ئى ئۆ	ūw
ز	z	ھ	h	ö	a, ah, āh, at, āt
س	s	و	w, ū		
ش	š	ي	y, ī		
ص	ş		>		
ض	ģ				





Sumatera (Source: CartoGIS ANU)



Mukomuko (Source: Peta Bahasa)