



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Intra-group financing and enterprise group insolvency: problems, principles and solutions

Kokorin, I.

Citation

Kokorin, I. (2023, November 14). *Intra-group financing and enterprise group insolvency: problems, principles and solutions*. Meijers-reeks.

Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3663098>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3663098>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Intra-group financing and enterprise group insolvency:
Problems, principles and solutions

Intra-group financing and enterprise group insolvency

Problems, principles and solutions

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 14 november 2023
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Ilya Kokorin

geboren te Krasnoyarsk-26, Unie van Socialistische Sovjetrepublieken

in 1987

Promotoren: prof. dr. M. Haentjens
 prof. dr. R.D. Vriesendorp

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. H. Koster
 prof. dr. W.A.K. Rank
 prof. dr. I. Mevorach (The University of Warwick, UK)
 prof. dr. G.R. Warner (St. John's University, USA)
 prof. dr. P.M. Veder (Radboud Universiteit)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2023 I. Kokorin

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Acknowledgements

This book is the result of a long and exciting journey – a journey of constant learning and development. I am grateful to the many people who have supported and guided me in my academic and professional pursuits. Without them, this book would not have been possible.

I began my legal career in a small law firm in the Siberian city of Tomsk, three thousand kilometres east of Moscow, at the end of 2008. This was right at the time when the global financial crisis reached Russia, causing many firms to go out of business. It marked my initial encounter with the rapidly evolving field of insolvency law. In 2012, after obtaining an LLM degree from Central European University (Hungary), I relocated to Saint Petersburg. There, I joined the dispute resolution and insolvency groups of international law firms. Being a member of a team solving complex legal and practical problems was truly fulfilling. I am thankful to all practicing lawyers who shared their knowledge with me. The hands-on experience in the field ignited a deeper, more theoretical interest in insolvency law. This interest was further fuelled during my studies at Leiden University (2014-2015), where I met some of the greatest teachers and researchers. It was also at this prestigious, the Netherlands' oldest, university that I set foot on my academic path in 2017.

My first words of gratitude go to my supervisors, Matthias Haentjens and Reinout Vriesendorp. These two individuals played an important role in the success of the entire PhD endeavour. They provided me with unwavering support and the flexibility to explore new ideas and engage in various projects. I would like to express my appreciation to Stichting Hazelhoff Van Huet and the Meijers Research Institute, who generously co-funded my 4-year PhD position. Many thanks also extend to the doctoral committee members, who took their time to read my (rather lengthy) PhD thesis and share their insightful comments and questions. Thank you, Professors Harold Koster, Pim Rank, Irit Mevorach, Ray Warner, Michael Veder, Branda Katan and Bob Wessels.

I was once told that doing a PhD is a lonely journey. However, I consider myself fortunate to have crossed paths with remarkable people who made my PhD life much more enjoyable. I was lucky to have met Prof. Bob Wessels, who, over the past few years, has become a good friend and ally. Bob is simply amazing. With him, I have co-authored two books, numerous

articles, and blogs. I have also collaborated with other outstanding scholars, including Irit Mevorach, Stephan Madaus, Tycho de Graaf, Matthias Haentjens, Gert-Jan Boon, Jeroen van der Weide, Bilal Kurbanov, Jaap Baaij, Vasile Rotaru and Morshed Mannan. I am indebted to Prof. Ray Warner, who warmly welcomed me to St. John's University during my research stay in April 2022. I will always cherish the countless hours spent with him discussing the complexities of US bankruptcy law. I greatly benefitted from a research visit to the Commercial Law Centre at Harris Manchester College, University of Oxford, in the fall of 2021. My sincere thanks go to Prof. Kristin van Zwieten for facilitating this research visit, even during the challenging times of the coronavirus pandemic.

I wish to express my thanks to Iris Wuisman and Reinout Vriesendorp, who first invited me to work in Leiden in 2017. My appreciation also goes to Pim Rank and Matthias Haentjens for welcoming me into the family of the Hazelhoff Centre for Financial Law in 2019. I am grateful to both my current and former colleagues at Leiden University for fostering a safe, fun, and intellectually stimulating work environment. I would like to extend special thanks to Jacqueline Wessel for always being there for me.

My PhD life has been enriched through the participation in scientific conferences and various activities organised by INSOL Europe, INSOL International, European Banking Institute, Oxford Digital Assets Project, International Insolvency Institute, Conference on European Restructuring and Insolvency Law, and several other initiatives. Being a part of the insolvency, company and financial law communities has allowed me to share my research, receive valuable feedback and get to know many brilliant scholars all over the world. A big thanks also goes to my friends, including my paranymphs, Daniël Stein and Gert-Jan Boon, whose encouragement, help, and critical views are always appreciated.

Last but certainly not least, I owe a tremendous debt of gratitude to my family, without whom this journey would not have even begun. My parents, Vladimir and Natalia, have always believed in me and invested in my growth, from my early English language classes in Siberia, to my education in Tomsk and multiple ventures abroad. It is because of their unconditional love and support that I achieve this milestone. *Спасибо вам за все, люблю и ценю вас!* (*Thank you for everything; I love and deeply value you!*).

Ilya Kokorin
Leiden, September 2023

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XIII
PART I INTRODUCTION	1
1 WHAT THIS BOOK IS ABOUT	3
1.1 Setting the Scene	3
1.1.1 Lehman Brothers	3
1.1.2 Nortel Networks	8
1.1.3 Oi Brazil	12
1.1.4 Common features of group insolvencies	16
1.2 Main Question	17
1.3 Scope and Aims of This Book	21
1.4 Organisation of This Book	27
PART II ENTERPRISE GROUPS: THEIR LIFE AND DEATH	31
2 PHENOMENON AND RISE OF MULTINATIONAL ENTERPRISE GROUPS	33
2.1 Introduction	33
2.2 History and Legal Foundations of Enterprise Groups	34
2.3 Defining an Enterprise Group	41
2.4 Characteristics and Types of Enterprise Groups	45
2.5 Enterprise Groups and the Curious Case of Limited Liability	48
2.6 Conclusion	54
3 ENTERPRISE GROUPS AND INSOLVENCY LAW	57
3.1 Introduction	57
3.2 Three Generations of Insolvency Law	59
3.3 Three Restructuring Procedures	64
3.3.1 The UK: schemes of arrangement	64
3.3.2 The USA: Chapter 11 of the US Bankruptcy Code	66
3.3.3 The Netherlands: WHOA schemes	70
3.4 From a Single Entity to a Single Enterprise?	72
3.4.1 Why recognition of enterprise groups in insolvency law took so long	72

3.4.2	The Global Financial Crisis as an accelerator of change	75
3.4.3	The rise of the rescue culture	77
3.5	Limits of a Single Enterprise Approach	80
3.5.1	Limits of group resolvability	80
3.5.2	Limits of a group-centric vision in corporate insolvency law	82
3.6	Conclusion	84
PART III	PRINCIPLES OF INSOLVENCY LAW AND HOW TO BALANCE THEM	87
4	PRINCIPLES OF INSOLVENCY LAW AND PRINCIPLE-BASED APPROACH	89
4.1	Introduction	89
4.2	Defining a Legal Principle	91
4.3	Core Legal Principles at Play in Insolvency	94
4.3.1	Classification of legal principles	94
4.3.2	Principles of insolvency law v. principles of restructuring law	95
4.3.3	Value preservation and maximisation	97
4.3.4	Protection of legitimate expectations, freedom of contract and party autonomy	102
4.3.5	Equal treatment of creditors	107
4.4	Application of Legal Principles in Group Insolvencies	111
4.4.1	Value preservation and maximisation within enterprise groups	111
4.4.2	Legitimate expectations and group reality	113
4.4.3	Explicit and hidden priorities in group insolvencies	114
4.5	Conclusion	116
5	COLLISION OF LEGAL PRINCIPLES AND HOW TO RESOLVE IT	117
5.1	Introduction	117
5.2	The Notion of Fairness in Insolvency Law	118
5.3	Weight of Legal Principles	122
5.4	Meta-Principles	124
5.4.1	Optimisation: Pareto and Kaldor-Hicks efficiency	124
5.4.2	Consistency: alike and unlike cases	125
5.4.3	Proportionality: key tool in a balancing exercise	126
5.5	Conclusion	128
PART IV	INTRA-GROUP FINANCING AND INSOLVENCY: TRANSACTIONS AND PROBLEMS	131
6	CROSS-GUARANTEES, RECOURSE CLAIMS AND "ORPHAN RESTRUCTURINGS"	133
6.1	Introduction	133

6.2	Cross-guarantees and Co-debtorship Arrangements	134
6.3	How Do Cross-guarantees Work?	135
6.4	Functions of Cross-guarantees	138
6.4.1	“Protective” function of cross-guarantees	138
6.4.2	“Opportunistic” function of cross-guarantees	141
6.5	Insolvency and Triangle of Rights and Liabilities: Principal Debtor, Creditor and Guarantor	143
6.5.1	Cross-guarantees and insolvency: important questions	143
6.5.2	Insolvency of the principal debtor and claim against a guarantor	145
6.5.3	Performance by a guarantor and its rights against the principal debtor	160
6.6	Insolvency and Ex-post Effects of Cross-guarantees	172
6.7	Conclusion	175
7	INTRA-GROUP LOANS AND STATUTORY SUBORDINATION	177
7.1	Introduction	177
7.2	Intra-group Loans and Centralised Cash Management	179
7.3	Internal v. External Creditor Divide	181
7.3.1	Information asymmetry	181
7.3.2	Power and control	182
7.3.3	Risk appetite and misalignment of incentives	183
7.3.4	Minimum capital requirements and capital maintenance	184
7.4	Subordination of Shareholder Loans: National Perspectives	185
7.4.1	Contractual v. statutory subordination	185
7.4.2	The UK: subordination for claims of shareholders <i>qua</i> shareholders	187
7.4.3	The USA: Equitable subordination and debt recharacterization	190
7.4.4	The Netherlands: conflicting authorities	198
7.5	Shareholder Loans: to Subordinate or not to Subordinate?	201
7.5.1	Facilitation of early insolvency filings	201
7.5.2	Responsibility for consequences of financial decisions	203
7.5.3	Risk re-allocation and risk shifting	204
7.5.4	Value-enhancing and value-destroying rescue attempts	207
7.6	Conclusion	211
8	FACING UNCERTAINTY: INTRA-GROUP FINANCING AND TRANSACTION AVOIDANCE	213
8.1	Introduction	213
8.2	“Group Considerations” in Insolvency Transaction Avoidance	215
8.2.1	Transaction avoidance and group specificity	215

8.2.2	The UK: measuring the value for the creditor and guarantor	218
8.2.3	The USA: in search for future and indirect benefits	223
8.2.4	The Netherlands: <i>Faillissementspauliana</i>	229
8.3	Difficulties of Ex Post Substantive Review	235
8.4	Conclusion	239
9	WHEN INSOLVENCY MEETS FREEDOM OF CONTRACT: IP SO FACTO AND CROSS-DEFAULT CLAUSES	241
9.1	Introduction	241
9.2	Ipso Facto and Cross-Default Clauses: Definition and Rationale	242
9.2.1	Ipso facto clauses	242
9.2.2	Cross-default clauses	245
9.3	Enforceability of Ipso Facto Clauses	247
9.3.1	The UK: contracts for supply of goods or services	247
9.3.2	The USA: executory contracts and safe harbours	250
9.3.3	The Netherlands: WHOA schemes and obligations towards debtors	256
9.3.4	International developments	260
9.4	Enforceability of Cross-Default Clauses in Insolvency	262
9.4.1	The UK: suspension of termination rights during “insolvency period”	262
9.4.2	The USA: contract assumption and de-acceleration	265
9.4.3	The Netherlands: suspension of termination rights during “cooling-off period”	270
9.5	Insolvency and Ex-post Effects of Ipso Facto and Cross-Default Clauses in a Group Context	273
9.6	Conclusion	274
PART V	GROUP-SENSITIVE INSOLVENCY LAW: TOOLS AND SOLUTIONS	277
10	GROUP DEBT DELEVERAGING AND DEBT ADJUSTMENT: THIRD-PARTY RELEASES	279
10.1	Introduction	279
10.2	Third-Party Releases	280
10.2.1	Rationale of third-party releases	280
10.2.2	The UK: third-party releases in schemes of arrangement	283
10.2.3	The USA: third-party releases in Chapter 11	289
10.2.4	The Netherlands: third-party releases in WHOA schemes	293
10.3	Conclusions and Suggestions	306
10.3.1	Overview of main findings	306
10.3.2	Suggestions on third-party releases in a group context	308

11	INSOLVENCY STAY ON CREDITOR ACTION AND ITS EXTENSION TO GROUP ENTITIES	313
11.1	Introduction	313
11.2	Enforcement Stays in National Law	315
11.2.1	The UK: patchwork of different rules and procedures	315
11.2.2	The USA: broad automatic and worldwide stay	319
11.2.3	The Netherlands: moratoriums and cooling-off periods	323
11.2.4	Summary of national law approaches	327
11.3	Extension of an Enforcement Stay to Group Entities	329
11.3.1	A stay and group insolvency	329
11.3.2	The USA: limited possibility of a stay extension	331
11.3.3	The Netherlands: extension of a stay to group entities	334
11.4	Conclusions and Suggestions	335
11.4.1	Overview of main findings	335
11.4.2	Suggestions on the extension of a stay to group entities	337
12	INTRA-GROUP RESCUE FINANCING: SAFE HARBOURS AND PRE-EMPTIVE STRATEGIES	341
12.1	Introduction	341
12.2	Ex Ante Approval Mechanisms and Safe Harbours	343
12.2.1	Three types of safe harbours	343
12.2.2	The Netherlands: safe harbour under the WHOA	345
12.2.3	The USA: DIP financing as a group effort	348
12.3	Pre-emptive Financial Arrangements in Banking Groups	353
12.3.1	Bank resolution: from reaction to pre-emption	353
12.3.2	Group financial support agreements under the BRRD	355
12.3.3	Prepositioning of loss absorbing capacity within banking groups	359
12.3.4	Structural and contractual arrangements related to intra-group support	361
12.4	Conclusions and Suggestions	364
12.4.1	Overview of main findings	364
12.4.2	Suggestions on dealing with intra-group rescue financing	366
13	LIMITS OF FREEDOM OF CONTRACT: IPSO FACTO AND CROSS-DEFAULT CLAUSES IN A GROUP CONTEXT	371
13.1	Introduction	371
13.2	IpsO Facto Clauses in a Group Insolvency Context	372
13.2.1	Determining the scope of inquiry: three scenarios	372
13.2.2	The UK and the Netherlands: application to direct counterparties	374
13.2.3	The USA: expansive interpretation of law	376
13.2.4	The BRRD and unenforceability of cross-entity ipso facto clauses	381

13.3	Cross-defaults in a Group Insolvency Context	384
13.3.1	Suspension of default-related rights	384
13.3.2	Neutralisation of intercompany cross-defaults in a restructuring plan	386
13.3.3	Assumption, deacceleration and substantially unrelated contracts	388
13.4	Conclusions and Suggestions	391
13.4.1	Overview of main findings	391
13.4.2	Suggestions on intercompany ipso facto clauses	393
13.4.3	Suggestions on intercompany cross-default clauses	395
PART VI CONCLUSION		397
14	KEY FINDINGS AND OBSERVATIONS	399
14.1	Forces of Change and Group Insolvencies	399
14.2	Revealing the Trunk and Branches behind the Leaves	400
14.3	Intra-group Financing and Group Insolvency: Challenges and Solutions	402
14.3.1	Group economic and legal realities	402
14.3.2	“Extension effect” in insolvency law	404
14.4	Key Observations: Guiding Factors	408
14.4.1	In search for guiding factors	408
14.4.2	Group integration and interdependence	408
14.4.3	Financial situation of non-debtor group entities	409
14.4.4	Purpose and nature of the procedure	410
14.4.5	Prevalence of public interest	412
ANNEX SUMMARY OF PROBLEMS AND SOLUTIONS		415
BIBLIOGRAPHY		417
SUMMARY		445
SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)		453
CURRICULUM VITAE		461

List of Abbreviations

ABI	American Bankruptcy Institute
AktG	<i>Aktiengesetz</i> (German), German Stock Corporation Act
ALI	American Law Institute
APR	Absolute priority rule
Art.	Article
AT&T	American Telephone and Telegraph Company
BCBS	Basel Committee on Banking Supervision
BGH	<i>Bundesgerichtshof</i> (German), German Federal Court of Justice
B.R.	Bankruptcy Reporter
BRRD	Bank Recovery and Resolution Directive, Directive 2014/59/ EU of 15 May 2014 establishing a framework for the recovery and resolution of credit institutions and investment firms
BW	<i>Burgerlijk Wetboek</i> (Dutch), Dutch Civil Code
CCAA	Companies' Creditors Arrangement Act (Canada)
CEO	Chief executive officer
CERIL	Conference on European Restructuring and Insolvency Law
CIGA	Corporate Insolvency and Governance Act 2020 (UK)
Cir.	Circuit
CIWUD	Directive 2001/24/EC of 4 April 2001 on the reorganisation and winding up of credit institutions
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CNA	Citicorp North America
COMI	Centre of main interests
Coop	Oi Brasil Holdings Coöperatief U.A.
CPR	Civil Procedure Rules (UK)
CUP	Cambridge University Press
CVA	Company voluntary arrangement
DAO	Decentralised autonomous organisation
DCC	Dutch Civil Code
DCFR	Draft Common Frame of Reference
DIP	Debtor in possession
EBA	European Banking Authority
EBOR	European Business Organization Law Review
EBRD	European Bank for Reconstruction and Development
EC	European Commission
ECB	European Central Bank
ECFR	European Company and Financial Law Review
ECGI	European Corporate Governance Institute
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights

ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EFTA	European Free Trade Association
e.g.	<i>exempli gratia</i> (for example)
EIC	English East India Company
EIR 2000	Council Regulation (EC) No 1346/2000 of 29 May 2000 on insolvency proceedings
EIR Recast	Regulation (EU) 2015/848 of 20 May 2015 on insolvency proceedings (recast)
EKEG	<i>Bundesgesetz, mit dem ein Bundesgesetz über Eigenkapital ersetzende Gesellschafterleistungen (Eigenkapitalersatz-Gesetz – EKEG)</i> (German), Austrian Equity Substitution Act (Austria)
EU	European Union
EUR	Euro
EWCA	England and Wales Court of Appeal (UK)
FDIA	Federal Deposit Insurance Act (USA)
FDIC	Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation
FSB	Financial Stability Board
Fw	<i>Faillissementswet</i> (Dutch), Dutch Bankruptcy Act
GFC	Global Financial Crisis
GFSA	Group financial support agreement
GMRA	Global Master Repurchase Agreement
G-SIB	Global systemically important bank
HR	<i>Hoge Raad</i> (Dutch), Dutch Supreme Court
HUP	Harvard University Press
IAIS	International Association of Insurance Supervisors
ibid.	<i>ibidem</i> (in the same place)
i.e.	<i>id est</i> (in other words)
IHC	Intermediate holding company
III	International Insolvency Institute
InsO	<i>Insolvenzordnung</i> (German), German Insolvency Code
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
IP	Insolvency practitioner
IRDA	Insolvency, Restructuring and Dissolution Act (Singapore)
ISDA	International Swaps and Derivatives Association
IT	Information technology
IVA	Individual voluntary arrangement
JOR	<i>Jurisprudentie Onderneming & Recht</i> (Dutch), Jurisprudence Business & Law
KA	Key Attribute
LBHI	Lehman Brothers Holdings, Inc.
LBT	Lehman Brothers Treasury Co B.V.
LMA	Loan Market Association
MEG	Multinational enterprise group
MLCBI	UNCITRAL Model Law on Cross-Border Insolvency
MLEGI	UNCITRAL Model Law on Enterprise Group Insolvency
MPOE	Multiple point of entry

MREL	Minimum requirement for own funds and eligible liabilities
MSME	Micro, small and medium-sized enterprise
NACIIL	<i>Nederlandse Vereniging voor Rechtsvergelijkend en Internationaal Insolventierecht</i> (Dutch), Netherlands Association for Comparative and International Insolvency Law
NCWO	No-creditor-worse-off
NJ	<i>Nederlandse Jurisprudentie</i> (Dutch), reports of court decisions (Netherlands)
NPV	Net present value
OUP	Oxford University Press
PECL	Principles of European Contract Law
PTIF	Portugal Telecom International Finance B.V.
R&D	Research and development
ReO	<i>Restrukturierungsordnung</i> (German), Restructuring Regulation (Austria)
Rb.	<i>Rechtbank</i> (Dutch), first instance court (Netherlands)
RPT	Related party transaction
SME	Small and medium-sized enterprise
SNFE	Significant non-financial enterprise
SPOE	Single point of entry
SPE	Special purpose entity
SPV	Special purpose vehicle
SRB	Single Resolution Board
SRMR	Single Resolution Mechanism Regulation, Regulation (EU) No 806/2014 of 15 July 2014 establishing uniform rules and a uniform procedure for the resolution of credit institutions and certain investment firms in the framework of a Single Resolution Mechanism and a Single Resolution Fund
SSA	Secured support agreement
StaRUG	<i>Gesetz über den Stabilisierungs- und Restrukturierungsrahmen für Unternehmen</i> (<i>Unternehmensstabilisierungs- und -restrukturierungsgesetz – StaRUG</i>) (German), Enterprise Stabilization and Restructuring Act (Germany)
TLAC	Total loss-absorbing capacity
UCC	Uniform Commercial Code
UK	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
UKSC	United Kingdom Supreme Court
UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
USA/US	United States of America
USD	US dollar
VOC	<i>Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie</i> (Dutch), Dutch East India Company
Vol.	Volume
WHOA	<i>Wet Homologatie Onderhands Akkoord</i> (Dutch), Act on Court Confirmation of Extrajudicial Restructuring Plans (Netherlands)

