Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Beyond friends and foes: immigration policymaking in contemporary China

Speelman, J.T.

Citation
Speelman, J. T. (2023, September 19). *Beyond friends and foes: immigration policymaking in contemporary China*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3641093

Version:	Publisher's Version
License:	Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3641093

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Beyond Friends and Foes: Immigration Policymaking in Contemporary China

Tabitha Speelman

Leiden University

© 2023 / Tabitha Speelman

Cover images: Krish Raghav
Design: Ria von Hout | RiArrange
Printing: Ipskamp Printing

Notes:

1) This thesis was part of the 'Immigration and the Transformation of Chinese Society' research project, a China-Europe Collaborative Research Initiative. It was funded by the NWO (Nederlandse organisatie voor wetenschappelijk onderzoek), and received additional funding from the Confucius New Sinology Programme (2018-2020), and the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange (2022-2023).
2) With the exception of the introduction, the conclusion, and Chapter 3, the chapters in this thesis have been previously published as separate articles. See the footnotes at the start of the respective chapters for further details.

Beyond Friends and Foes: Immigration Policymaking in Contemporary China

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 19 september 2023
klokke 10.00 uur

door
Jeannette Tabitha Speelman
geboren te Urk

Promotor
Prof. Dr. Frank N. Pieke

Copromotor
Dr. Katharina Natter

Promotiecommissie
Dr. Florian Schneider
Prof. dr. Erin Chung (Johns Hopkins University)
Prof. dr. Donglin Han (Renmin University)
Prof. dr. Biao Xiang (Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology)

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements 8

Chapter 1 – Introduction 11

1. Questions 11
2. Context 14
3. Contributions 18
   a. Integrating reform era migration policy in the study of China's migration patterns 19
   b. Mobilizing immigration politics as a lens on the Chinese state's conflicted approach to internationalization 22
   c. Illuminating Xi-era policymaking through China's immigration politics 24
   d. Positioning China in global migration politics 26
4. Methodology 29
   a. Data collection 29
   b. Fieldwork conditions 32
   c. Terminology 34
5. Synopsis 35

Chapter 2 - Establishing the National Immigration Administration: Change and Continuity in China's Immigration Reforms 39

1. Introduction 39
2. The Chinese state and immigration 40
3. Methodology 43
4. Building the NIA: New discourse, familiar politics 44
   a. Establishment 44
   b. Structure 46
   c. Discourse 48
   d. Policy agenda 50
5. Evaluating the NIA: "Overdue" and "controversial" 52
6. Conclusion: The significance of the NIA for China's immigration reform 54

Chapter 3 - Skilled migrants wanted? Policy tensions in the implementation of Shanghai's 'new talent regime' 57

1. Introduction 57
2. Literature review: Attracting and retaining skilled migrants 59
3. Background: Trialing China's foreign talent attraction and immigrant employment in Shanghai 61
4. Methodology 64

5. Case: Managing political risk in the implementation of skilled migration reforms 65
   a. Growing the high-skilled foreign talent base 65
   b. Experimenting with young and part-time talent 67
   c. Defining immigrant integration 69
6. Discussion 71
   a. Centralizing Chinese policy innovation 72
   b. An emerging (re-)politicization of immigration policy in China 73
7. Conclusion 75

Chapter 4 - Guest workers and development–security conflict: Managing labor migration at the Sino-Vietnamese border 77
1. Introduction 77
2. Development and security in state responses to labor migration 79
3. Border mobility and foreign employment in China's south-west 81
4. Methodology 83
5. Developing a temporary labor migration program at the Guangxi border (2015–17) 84
   a. A laissez-faire approach to Vietnamese migrants in the border area labor market 85
   b. Guangxi's developmentalist framing of Vietnamese labor regularization 86
6. Implementing cross-border labor regularization (2017–2019) 88
   a. Post-trial mixed effects on cross-border labor migrant flows 88
   b. Securitizing the cross-border labor trial 90
7. Discussion 92

Chapter 5 - Immigration attitudes, national identity and development in mainland China 95
1. Introduction 95
2. Contextualizing China in the broader debate on immigrant reception 96
3. Methodology 98
4. Analysis: From immigrants helping China "catch up" to China helping immigrants prosper 100
   a. The historical roots of Chinese attitudes towards immigrants 101
   b. The normalization of immigrant perceptions 102
   c. Diverging views on the effects of immigration 105
   d. Widely shared views on the need for immigrant control and selection 107
   e. The growing salience of eradicating foreign privilege 109
   f. Immigration as part of Chinese national identity 111
5. Discussion: A developmental lens on immigration attitudes and policy preferences 112

Chapter 6 - How China's nationalist online sphere constrains policymaking – The case of foreigners' permanent residency reform 116
1. Introduction 116
2. Literature review: Public opinion and popular nationalism in Chinese policymaking 119
3. Methods 121

4. The 2020 permanent residency debate 123
a. Permanent residency reform in mainland China: A compromise policy 123
b. The P.R. debate: Selling out the country to (fake) foreigners 125
c. The aftermath of the P.R. debate: 'Immigration is now sensitive' 129
5. Discussion 131
6. Conclusion 135

Chapter 7 - Conclusion 138
1. Core argument 138
2. Key findings: The political dynamics of China's immigration policymaking 140
3. Research implications 144
a. Contributions to the study of China's migration patterns 144
b. Contributions to the study of China's internationalization 146
c. Contributions to the study of Chinese policymaking 148
d. Contributions to the study of global migration politics 150
4. Wider implications for public and policy debate 153
a. Does China have immigrants? 154
b. Immigration and the Covid-19 pandemic 157
c. Immigration reform and China's global rise 160

Annexes 164
Annex 1. Timeline: Key events in Chinese immigration management (1978-2022) 164
Annex 2. Immigration statistics: Selected data sources and their limitations 167
Annex 3: Interview and survey details 171
Annex 4: Selected survey data 173

References 178

Summary 198

Samenvatting 201

Curriculum Vitae 204

Acknowledgements

A dissertation takes a good amount of solitude, all the more when its completion is accompanied by global border closures, public health emergencies and chronic illness. But in the past six years, I learnt how vital it was to both this research project and myself to balance writing and reflection with social contact and community. I am deeply grateful for the support I received from many individuals and communities, and for the broader sociopolitical environment that enabled me to do this work.

First, I want to thank my two thesis supervisors, Frank Pieke and Katharina Natter. This project was not smooth sailing, but it made such a difference to have two encouraging mentors who brought instant clarity to any research issue, and never any stress. Frank, since taking your classes in Leiden's MA program twelve years ago, your anthropological lens on Chinese society and political system has very much shaped my own. The way you pursue answers to questions rooted in real-world change, regardless of disciplinary or academic-policy boundaries, is very inspiring. Thanks for all the motivation, and for bringing me on board. Katharina, I feel so lucky that after I came across your work in 2019, you not only made me see a way forward for this thesis, but also agreed to co-supervise me until its completion. Thank you for your always amazingly helpful feedback, and for your generosity in sharing your time and experience.

Many others contributed to this thesis. My deep thanks, of course, goes to those who were willing to be part of this research, through sharing your thoughts in an interview or survey, helping me with contacts, or by otherwise supporting a foreign PhD candidate's research. It's so deeply appreciated. Thanks to Bingqin Shan, Zhongwei Chen, and Xueqian Zhang for your help in conducting the interviews with members of the public, and for making that part of the research so fun. I am very grateful for the collaboration on the online survey with Yuqin Huang and her team at East China Science and Technology University, and to the supervision by Yuan Ren at Fudan University during my 1.5-year stay there. Thanks to Maghiel van Crevel, for the best editing and mentoring at key moments, and to Heidi Haugen, Ivan Franceschini and Tianlong You for the opportunity to share research results in (co-)writing. To my committee members, thank you for your inspiring work, and for the kind and constructive feedback in the final phase of this project. Thanks to my paranymphs, Qing Wang and Kai Shmushko, for being by my side, and to Krish Raghav, for drawing cover art that transports me to the scene.

Thanks also to the academic communities, large and small, virtual and in-person, that provided much-needed sociality and structure to PhD life. These include: the 'Immigrant China' research consortium, the Fudan 'New Sinology' PhD cohort, the 移民研究小组 WeChat group, the LIAS PhD program, the 'Migrant China' Twitter account group (while it lasted), online feedback sessions with Jana Kapitz, the monthly discussion group with Ning Wei and Tianmu Hong.

Unexpected was the empowering community of patient groups, who shared experiences and knowledge of a new medical condition like long Covid, as well as post-viral illness more broadly. Thanks especially to the Long Covid Sessions podcast, and to the work of Gez Medinger, whose expert interviews and patient surveys provided me with the tools to pursue treatment and to complete this PhD. These are deeply inspiring examples of what the public dissemination of research can look like. For all involuntary migrants to the land of the ill, I hope your stay turns out temporary.

My social life reflects my own migrations. In these past years, I often wished for you to be all in one place, but also felt how these are ties that bind and support across borders and large distances. Reb, Qing, Kai, Lana, Cora, Elke – I don't know what I would do without you. To Inma, Xinrong, Junya, Yujing, Jeroen, Daan, Loz, Ruben, Jip, Yara, Seb, Kevin, Xiao, Melody, Emily, Fiona, Annelous, Joost, and the Stroom community, thank you for your friendship and for making life better in Amsterdam, Shanghai, Hong Kong, and beyond. Thanks also to my six dear siblings and their families. I always feel connected to you, but it's great when we are not so far apart.

Thanks to my parents, for their love and the joy they bring through their lives. And to Tom, for being in it with me. Your love of learning inspired me to pursue this project, and your selfless support (and hypermobility in these years) made it possible. I look forward to more of everything – and a bit more stability – ahead.

Like most of my adult life, this thesis, including the writing of these acknowledgements, was completed between China and the Netherlands. As geopolitical tensions have increased, I've been reminded of how special it was for an 18-year-old to start building a life that way. That period of deepening exchanges has of course shaped my interests and biases, and brought me to this point. I hope that those opportunities remain open.