



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Beyond friends and foes: immigration policymaking in contemporary China**

Speelman, J.T.

### **Citation**

Speelman, J. T. (2023, September 19). *Beyond friends and foes: immigration policymaking in contemporary China*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3641093>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3641093>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

# Beyond Friends and Foes: Immigration Policymaking in Contemporary China

Tabitha Speelman

Leiden University

© 2023 / Tabitha Speelman

Cover images: Krish Raghav

Design: Ria von Hout | RiArrange

Printing: Ipskamp Printing

Notes:

- 1) This thesis was part of the ‘Immigration and the Transformation of Chinese Society’ research project, a China-Europe Collaborative Research Initiative. It was funded by the NWO (Nederlandse organisatie voor wetenschappelijk onderzoek), and received additional funding from the Confucius New Sinology Programme (2018-2020), and the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange (2022-2023).
- 2) With the exception of the introduction, the conclusion, and Chapter 3, the chapters in this thesis have been previously published as separate articles. See the footnotes at the start of the respective chapters for further details.

# Beyond Friends and Foes: Immigration Policymaking in Contemporary China

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,  
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 19 september 2023  
klokke 10.00 uur

door  
Jeannette Tabitha Speelman  
geboren te Urk

**Promotor**

Prof. Dr. Frank N. Pieke

**Copromotor**

Dr. Katharina Natter

**Promotiecommissie**

Dr. Florian Schneider

Prof. dr. Erin Chung (Johns Hopkins University)

Prof. dr. Donglin Han (Renmin University)

Prof. dr. Biao Xiang (Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology)

# Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	8
Chapter 1 – Introduction	11
1. Questions	11
2. Context	14
3. Contributions	18
a. Integrating reform era migration policy in the study of China’s migration patterns	19
b. Mobilizing immigration politics as a lens on the Chinese state’s conflicted approach to internationalization	22
c. Illuminating Xi-era policymaking through China’s immigration politics	24
d. Positioning China in global migration politics	26
4. Methodology	29
a. Data collection	29
b. Fieldwork conditions	32
c. Terminology	34
5. Synopsis	35
Chapter 2 - Establishing the National Immigration Administration: Change and Continuity in China’s Immigration Reforms	39
1. Introduction	39
2. The Chinese state and immigration	40
3. Methodology	43
4. Building the NIA: New discourse, familiar politics	44
a. Establishment	44
b. Structure	46
c. Discourse	48
d. Policy agenda	50
5. Evaluating the NIA: “Overdue” and “controversial”	52
6. Conclusion: The significance of the NIA for China’s immigration reform	54
Chapter 3 - Skilled migrants wanted? Policy tensions in the implementation of Shanghai’s ‘new talent regime’	57
1. Introduction	57
2. Literature review: Attracting and retaining skilled migrants	59
3. Background: Trialing China’s foreign talent attraction and immigrant employment in Shanghai	61
4. Methodology	64

5. Case: Managing political risk in the implementation of skilled migration reforms	65
a. Growing the high-skilled foreign talent base	65
b. Experimenting with young and part-time talent	67
c. Defining immigrant integration	69
6. Discussion	71
a. Centralizing Chinese policy innovation	72
b. An emerging (re-)politicization of immigration policy in China	73
7. Conclusion	75
Chapter 4 - Guest workers and development–security conflict: Managing labor migration at the Sino-Vietnamese border	77
1. Introduction	77
2. Development and security in state responses to labor migration	79
3. Border mobility and foreign employment in China’s south-west	81
4. Methodology	83
5. Developing a temporary labor migration program at the Guangxi border (2015–17)	84
a. A laissez-faire approach to Vietnamese migrants in the border area labor market	85
b. Guangxi’s developmentalist framing of Vietnamese labor regularization	86
6. Implementing cross-border labor regularization (2017–2019)	88
a. Post-trial mixed effects on cross-border labor migrant flows	88
b. Securitizing the cross-border labor trial	90
7. Discussion	92
Chapter 5 - Immigration attitudes, national identity and development in mainland China	95
1. Introduction	95
2. Contextualizing China in the broader debate on immigrant reception	96
3. Methodology	98
4. Analysis: From immigrants helping China “catch up” to China helping immigrants prosper	100
a. The historical roots of Chinese attitudes towards immigrants	101
b. The normalization of immigrant perceptions	102
c. Diverging views on the effects of immigration	105
d. Widely shared views on the need for immigrant control and selection	107
e. The growing salience of eradicating foreign privilege	109
f. Immigration as part of Chinese national identity	111
5. Discussion: A developmental lens on immigration attitudes and policy preferences	112
Chapter 6 - How China’s nationalist online sphere constrains policymaking – The case of foreigners’ permanent residency reform	116
1. Introduction	116
2. Literature review: Public opinion and popular nationalism in Chinese policymaking	119
3. Methods	121

4. The 2020 permanent residency debate	123
a. Permanent residency reform in mainland China: A compromise policy	123
b. The P.R. debate: Selling out the country to (fake) foreigners	125
c. The aftermath of the P.R. debate: ‘Immigration is now sensitive’	129
5. Discussion	131
6. Conclusion	135
Chapter 7 - Conclusion	138
1. Core argument	138
2. Key findings: The political dynamics of China’s immigration policymaking	140
3. Research implications	144
a. Contributions to the study of China’s migration patterns	144
b. Contributions to the study of China’s internationalization	146
c. Contributions to the study of Chinese policymaking	148
d. Contributions to the study of global migration politics	150
4. Wider implications for public and policy debate	153
a. Does China have immigrants?	154
b. Immigration and the Covid-19 pandemic	157
c. Immigration reform and China’s global rise	160
Annexes	164
<i>Annex 1. Timeline: Key events in Chinese immigration management (1978-2022)</i>	164
<i>Annex 2. Immigration statistics: Selected data sources and their limitations</i>	167
<i>Annex 3: Interview and survey details</i>	171
<i>Annex 4: Selected survey data</i>	173
References	178
Summary	198
Samenvatting	201
Curriculum Vitae	204



## Acknowledgements

A dissertation takes a good amount of solitude, all the more when its completion is accompanied by global border closures, public health emergencies and chronic illness. But in the past six years, I learnt how vital it was to both this research project and myself to balance writing and reflection with social contact and community. I am deeply grateful for the support I received from many individuals and communities, and for the broader sociopolitical environment that enabled me to do this work.

First, I want to thank my two thesis supervisors, Frank Pieke and Katharina Natter. This project was not smooth sailing, but it made such a difference to have two encouraging mentors who brought instant clarity to any research issue, and never any stress. Frank, since taking your classes in Leiden's MA program twelve years ago, your anthropological lens on Chinese society and political system has very much shaped my own. The way you pursue answers to questions rooted in real-world change, regardless of disciplinary or academic-policy boundaries, is very inspiring. Thanks for all the motivation, and for bringing me on board. Katharina, I feel so lucky that after I came across your work in 2019, you not only made me see a way forward for this thesis, but also agreed to co-supervise me until its completion. Thank you for your always amazingly helpful feedback, and for your generosity in sharing your time and experience.

Many others contributed to this thesis. My deep thanks, of course, goes to those who were willing to be part of this research, through sharing your thoughts in an interview or survey, helping me with contacts, or by otherwise supporting a foreign PhD candidate's research. It's so deeply appreciated. Thanks to Bingqin Shan, Zhongwei Chen, and Xueqian Zhang for your help in conducting the interviews with members of the public, and for making that part of the research so fun. I am very grateful for the collaboration on the online survey with Yuqin Huang and her team at East China Science and Technology University, and to the supervision by Yuan Ren at Fudan University during my 1.5-year stay there. Thanks to Maghiel van Crevel, for the best editing and mentoring at key moments, and to Heidi Haugen, Ivan Franceschini and Tianlong You for the opportunity to share research results in (co-)writing. To my committee members, thank you for your inspiring work, and for the kind and constructive feedback in the final phase of this project. Thanks to my paranymphs, Qing Wang and Kai Shmushko, for being by my side, and to Krish Raghav, for drawing cover art that transports me to the scene.

Thanks also to the academic communities, large and small, virtual and in-person, that provided much-needed sociality and structure to PhD life. These include: the 'Immigrant China' research consortium, the Fudan 'New Sinology' PhD cohort, the 移民研究小组 WeChat group, the LIAS PhD program, the 'Migrant China' Twitter account group (while it lasted), online feedback sessions with Jana Kapitz, the monthly discussion group with Ning Wei and Tianmu Hong.

Unexpected was the empowering community of patient groups, who shared experiences and knowledge of a new medical condition like long Covid, as well as post-viral illness more broadly. Thanks especially to the Long Covid Sessions podcast, and to the work of Gez Medinger, whose expert interviews and patient surveys provided me with the tools to pursue treatment and to complete this PhD. These are deeply inspiring examples of what the public dissemination of research can look like. For all involuntary migrants to the land of the ill, I hope your stay turns out temporary.

My social life reflects my own migrations. In these past years, I often wished for you to be all in one place, but also felt how these are ties that bind and support across borders and large distances. Reb, Qing, Kai, Lana, Cora, Elke – I don't know what I would do without you. To Inma, Xinrong, Junya, Yujing, Jeroen, Daan, Loz, Ruben, Jip, Yara, Seb, Kevin, Xiao, Melody, Emily, Fiona, Annelous, Joost, and the Stroom community, thank you for your friendship and for making life better in Amsterdam, Shanghai, Hong Kong, and beyond. Thanks also to my six dear siblings and their families. I always feel connected to you, but it's great when we are not so far apart.

Thanks to my parents, for their love and the joy they bring through their lives. And to Tom, for being in it with me. Your love of learning inspired me to pursue this project, and your selfless support (and hypermobility in these years) made it possible. I look forward to more of everything – and a bit more stability – ahead.

Like most of my adult life, this thesis, including the writing of these acknowledgements, was completed between China and the Netherlands. As geopolitical tensions have increased, I've been reminded of how special it was for an 18-year-old to start building a life that way. That period of deepening exchanges has of course shaped my interests and biases, and brought me to this point. I hope that those opportunities remain open.

