



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Dimensions of student participation: participatory action research in a teacher education context**

Smit, B.H.J.

### **Citation**

Smit, B. H. J. (2023, September 6). *Dimensions of student participation: participatory action research in a teacher education context*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3638573>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3638573>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

# Dimensions of student participation

participatory action research  
in a teacher education context

***Ben Smit***



Universiteit  
Leiden  
ICLON

ICLON, Leiden University Graduate School of Teaching

Title: Dimensions of student participation: Participatory action research in a teacher education context

Titel: Dimensies van leerlingenparticipatie: Participerend actieonderzoek in de context van een lerarenopleiding

ICLON PhD Dissertation Series

Print: Mostert & Van Onderen, Leiden

Cover design: Ben Smit / Frank Turenhout

Cover graphics: Atlas.ti 23, Force-Directed Graph of PST PAR principles

Layout: Ben Smit

ISBN/EAN: 978-94-90383-44-2

© 2023, Ben H.J. Smit

All rights reserved. No part of this thesis may be reproduced, stored in retrieval systems, or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior written permission of the author.

# Dimensions of student participation

participatory action research in a teacher education context

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,  
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties  
te verdedigen op woensdag 6 september 2023  
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Bernardus Hermannus Johannes Smit

*Promotores*

Prof.dr. W.F. Admiraal

Prof.dr. A.K. Berry, Monash University

*Copromotor*

Dr. E.H. Tigelaar

*Promotiecommissie*

Prof.dr. P.F. Wouters (decaan/voorzitter)

Prof.dr.ir. F.J.J.M. Janssen

Prof.dr.mr. T. Liefwaard

Dr. H.W. Oolbakkink-Marchand, HAN

Dr. R.C. Zwart, NRO

your children  
are not your children  
[...]  
for they have their own thoughts  
they have their own thoughts

Astrid Seriese, song 'On Children'  
album 'On Children: de kinderen van de Hondsbeg'  
1998, Brigadoon, Hilversum, the Netherlands



# Contents

---

<b>Chapter 1 – General introduction</b>	<b>3</b>
Teacher research	3
Teacher education and Participatory Action Research	4
Student participation: education, schools, and scope for decision-making	4
Context and outline of the dissertation	9
<b>Chapter 2 – Young People as Co-researchers: Enabling Student Participation in Educational Practice</b>	<b>17</b>
Introduction	17
Student participation	18
A student participation project in the Netherlands	26
Discussion and implications	34
Acknowledgments	36
<b>Chapter 3 – Source, respondent, or partner? Involvement of secondary school students in Participatory Action Research</b>	<b>39</b>
Introduction	39
Theoretical framework	40
Method	42
Findings	46
Conclusions and discussion	50
Limitations and further research	53
Significance and implications	54
<b>Chapter 4 – Principles for school student participation in pre-service teacher action research: A practice architecture's perspective</b>	<b>59</b>
Introduction	59
Theoretical framework	60
The current study	62
Method	62
Findings	72
Conclusions	76
<b>Chapter 5 – Teacher educators' views on educating pre-service teachers for participatory action research in secondary schools</b>	<b>81</b>
Introduction	81
The current study	83
Method	83
Findings	88
Discussion and conclusions	100
Implications for TEd practice and further research	102



<b>Chapter 6 – General discussion</b>	<b>107</b>
Introduction	107
Findings per chapter	107
Reflections	110
Limitations and suggestions for future research	116
Implications for practice and research	118
<b>References</b>	<b>125</b>
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>137</b>
Appendix 1 – List of readings as part of the TED program	137
Appendix 2 – Matrix SPinSTAR (Student participation in student teacher’s action research)	138
Appendix 3 – Level of student involvement – definition and decision rules	139
Appendix 4 – Action research stage – definition and decision rules	140
Appendix 5 – Types of student participation in PST action research projects; in keywords	141
Appendix 6 – PST interview guide	145
Appendix 7 – Level of student involvement	146
Appendix 8 – Case summary and perceived conditions	148
Appendix 9 – Table of enablers and constraints, per case	149
<b>Nederlandse samenvatting</b>	<b>153</b>
Inleiding	153
Hoofdstuk 2 - De verkennende studie	155
Hoofdstuk 3 - Omvang en aard van leerlingenparticipatie	156
Hoofdstuk 4 - Principes voor deelname van leerlingen aan onderzoek van dio’s	157
Hoofdstuk 5 - Manifestaties van principes voor participatief actieonderzoek in een lerarenopleiding	158
Hoofdstuk 6 - Algemene discussie	159
<b>English summary</b>	<b>167</b>
Introduction	167
Chapter 2 – The exploratory study	169
Chapter 3 – Occurrence and nature of student participation	170
Chapter 4 – Principles for school student participation in pre-service teacher research	170
Chapter 5 – Manifestations of PST PAR principles in a teacher education program	171
Chapter 6 – General discussion	172
<b>Curriculum Vitae</b>	<b>181</b>
<b>Selected publications and presentations</b>	<b>185</b>
Scientific publications	185
Presentations	185
Other output	187
<b>Dankwoord / Acknowledgment</b>	<b>191</b>
<b>ICLON PhD Dissertation Series</b>	<b>195</b>

## Table of Figures

Figure 1. Enabling student participation in PST PAR projects	8
Figure 2. Constituting aspects of the research focus on PST PAR projects	9
Figure 3. The Interconnected Model of Teacher Professional Growth (Clarke & Hollingsworth, 2002)	25
Figure 4. Multiple case study design with 8 cases	63
Figure 5. Perceived supporting conditions for PST PAR projects	70
Figure 6. Perceived supporting conditions for PST PAR projects (continued)	71
Figure 7. Principles for student participation in PST PAR	74

## Table of Tables

Table 1. Overview of the studies	13
Table 2. Level of student involvement	44
Table 3. Action research stages	45
Table 4. Occurrence of student participation in PST action research projects	47
Table 5. Site A (TE/Program) - Generic arrangements (apply to all PSTs)	64
Table 6. Case descriptors	65
Table 7. Types of arrangements and applicable aspects, concepts, and terms	66
Table 8. Types of conditions	67
Table 9. Descriptions of PST PAR principles	75
Table 10. Types of arrangements and applicable aspects, concepts, and terms	83
Table 11. Generic characteristics of the TEed program; along with three kinds of arrangements	84
Table 12. Descriptions of PST PAR principles (Smit et al., 2022)	86
Table 13. Co-occurrences of principles across three dimensions; number of fragments	87
Table 14. Characteristic manifestations of PST PAR principles <sup>a</sup> , across three dimensions	96
Table 15. Types of arrangements and applicable aspects, concepts, and terms	109
Table 16. Matrix SPinSTAR (Student participation in student teacher's action research)	119
Table 17. Level of student involvement	146
Table 18. Overall level of student participation in PST PAR projects	146
Tabel 19. Typen arrangementen en toepasselijke aspecten, concepten en terminologie	157
Table 20. Matrix SPinSTAR (Student participation in student teacher's action research)	164
Table 21. Types of arrangements and applicable aspects, concepts, and terms	171
Table 22. Matrix SPinSTAR (Student participation in student teacher's action research)	177

## Abbreviations

PAR	participatory action research
PST	pre-service teacher
TEd	teacher education

## Acknowledgments

The author wishes to thank the school students, pre-service teachers, teacher educators, and school mentors for voluntarily participating in the studies for this dissertation, and the reviewers and members of the PEP research program for giving constructive feedback. Furthermore, the project has greatly been inspired by the work of Susan Groundwater-Smith and the Coalition of Knowledge Building Schools in Sydney, Australia. See website (CBKS, 2012) and book (Groundwater-Smith et al., 2013).

