



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Protection of aviation security through the establishment of prohibited airspace

Zhang, W.

Citation

Zhang, W. (2023, June 8). *Protection of aviation security through the establishment of prohibited airspace*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3620100>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3620100>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Protection of aviation security through the establishment of prohibited airspace

Protection of aviation security through
the establishment of prohibited airspace

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 8 juni 2023,
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Wanlu Zhang

geboren te Funan, China

in 1992

Promotoren: prof. dr. S.J. Truxal
 dr. R.W. Heinsch

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. E.C.P.D.C. De Brabandere
 dr. C.E. Rose
 prof. dr. h.c. S. Hobe (University Cologne, Germany)
 prof. dr. J. Chuah (City, University of London, UK)

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio – Delft
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest
Drukwerk: Ipskamp Printing – Enschede

ISBN 978 94 6473 103 3

© 2023 W. Zhang

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

To my supervisors, Pablo Mendes de Leon, Steven Truxal, and Robert Heinsch, thank you for giving me the opportunity to undertake this project and for your guidance and support along the way. I very much appreciated your support and guidance along the way as I struggled through many phases to complete this project.

Thank you to others who took the time to share their knowledge, read my work and discuss and challenge my ideas. I will forever be grateful for the invaluable assistance, in particular Jiefang Huang, for allowing me to undertake the research at ICAO. Thank you also Tanja Masson-Zwaan, Mia Wouters, Roderick van Dam, Julian Rotter, Peter Haanappel, and Daqun Liu, for your aid and insight in the early days.

I am lucky to have met colleagues and friends Dejian Kong, Lain Kovudhikulrungsri, Xiaoxi Sun, Hui Liu, Ed Batista, Annemarie Schuite, Dimitra Stefoudi, Leah Powell, and Zhuang Tian for making my study at Leiden such an enjoyable memory. Thank you very much, Hilkje Wijnmaalen and Natascha Meewisse, for your assistance in navigating through the procedural process. Thank you also to Paula, who I believe is looking at me smiling from up there.

Many others who helped along the way: friends and family back at China University of Political Science and Law, at ICAO, at the United Nations, and throughout the world. Thank you for reading the draft of my thesis and offering guidance from various perspectives. I want to give a big shout-out to Ms. Christina Kiewiet de Jonge who included me into her family celebrations of Koningsdag and Sinterklaas and encouraged me to carry on with the research.

Michael Huang, my beloved husband, thank you for the love, patience, and support in every way and for keeping me on track. I cannot wait to embark on the next adventure with you! My mum Li Wang and dad Jian'en Zhang, thank you for raising me to be courageous and inspiring me to rise to challenges. But, most of all, thank you all for the endless love and 24/7 family support.

Finally, I am so grateful for having spared me on the afternoon of 24 July 2014 when I was flying to a summer school over the same area as MH17; and for the calling which keeps motivating me to demand a change.

Table of contents

TABLE OF FIGURES	xiii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xv
INTRODUCTION	1
1 Background	1
2 Research Questions	2
3 Roadmap of the Study	3
4 Summary of Methodology	4
1 METHODOLOGY, TERMINOLOGIES AND PRELIMINARY QUESTIONS	5
1 Methodology of this study	5
1.1 Outline of methodology	5
1.2 Normative legal study	5
1.2.1 Customary treaty interpretation rules	6
1.2.2 Interpretation methods in the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	9
1.2.2.1 Ordinary meaning	9
1.2.2.2 Context	9
1.2.2.3 Object and purpose	10
1.2.2.4 Preparatory work	10
1.2.2.5 Subsequent practices	11
1.3 Case studies	12
1.4 Interim conclusions	13
2 Terminologies	13
2.1 Introduction of terminologies	13
2.2 Contracting States, States Parties, and Member States	14
2.2.1 Contracting Parties and States Parties	14
2.2.2 ICAO Member States	15
2.2.3 Interim conclusions	17
2.3 Territory, sovereignty, and jurisdiction	17
2.3.1 Sovereignty	17
2.3.1.1 Airspace sovereignty	17
2.3.1.2 Airspace sovereignty in relation to jurisdiction	19
2.3.2 Territory	20
2.3.3 Jurisdiction	22
2.3.4 Competence	23
2.3.4.1 Competence and capacity	23

2.3.4.2	The usage of competence in the context of EU law	24
2.3.5	Interim conclusions	26
2.4	Responsibility and obligation	26
2.4.1	Responsibility	26
2.4.2	Obligation	27
2.4.3	Interim conclusions	29
2.6	Aviation safety, security, and risk	29
2.6.1	Aviation safety and security	29
2.6.2	Defining risk	30
2.6.3	Interim conclusions	31
3	The legal force of ICAO regulations	31
3.1	Introduction of ICAO regulations	31
3.2	Standards and Recommended Practices (SARPs)	31
3.2.1	Introduction	31
3.2.2	Legal force of ICAO Standards	33
3.2.2.1	General statements	33
3.2.2.2	Filing of differences from ICAO Standards	34
3.2.2.3	The impact of enforcement of ICAO Standards	36
3.2.2.4	Interim conclusions	38
3.2.3	Legal force of Recommended Practices	38
3.2.3.1	General statements	38
3.2.3.2	Filing differences from Recommended Practices	39
3.2.3.3	ICAO audit of compliance with Recommended Practices	42
3.2.3.4	Interim conclusions	43
3.3	Procedures for Air Navigation Services (PANS)	44
3.3.1	Introduction	44
3.3.2	Legal force of PANS	44
3.4	ICAO guidance documents	45
3.4.1	Introduction	45
3.4.2	Legal force of guidance documents	46
3.5	Interim conclusions	48
4	Chapter summary and conclusions	48
2	THE INTERPRETATION OF PROVISIONS CONCERNING PROHIBITED AIRSPACE IN THE CHICAGO CONVENTION	51
1	Preliminary remarks	51
2	Analysis of the terms of Article 9 of the Chicago Convention	51
2.1	The text of Article 9 of the Chicago Convention	51
2.2	The right to prohibit flights over sovereign territory	53
2.2.1	Territorial sovereignty in relation to jurisdiction	53
2.2.2	The use of the term “may”	54
2.2.3	The definitions of prohibited and restricted area	56
2.2.4	Summary on a Contracting State’s right to establish prohibited airspace	58
2.3	The meaning of “its territory”	58
2.3.1	Territorial sea	58
2.3.2	International straits	59

2.3.3 Internal waters	61
2.3.4 Archipelagic waters	62
2.3.5 Summary on the meaning of “territory”	64
2.4 Conditions to establish prohibited airspace under Article 659 of the Chicago Convention	65
2.4.1 Military necessity	65
2.4.1.1 General remarks	65
2.4.1.2 The context of the Chicago Convention	66
2.4.1.3 Contextual interpretation of military necessity in Article 9	69
2.4.2 Public safety	70
2.4.3 Exceptional circumstances	72
2.4.4 Emergency	74
2.4.5 Summary on the justifications to establish prohibited airspace	77
2.5 The application of the non-distinction requirement	77
2.5.1 The objects and purposes of the Chicago Convention	77
2.5.2 National treatment and most-favoured-nation treatment	80
2.5.3 Nationality of aircraft	83
2.5.4 Summary on the ‘non-distinction’ requirement	86
2.6 The requirement of reasonable extent and location	86
2.6.1 The geographic scope of prohibited airspace	86
2.6.2 Prohibited area in the Bay of Gibraltar (1967)	87
2.6.3 The criteria for reasonable extent and location	88
2.6.4 Summary on reasonable extent and location	89
2.7 The requirement to notify the international community	89
2.8 Interim conclusions	90
3 Practices in the application of Article 9 of the Chicago Convention	91
3.1 Pasir Gudang restricted area (2019)	91
3.2 India-Pakistan dispute (1950s and 2010s)	94
3.2.1 Dispute in the 1950s	94
3.2.2 Dispute in the 2010s	95
3.2.2.1 Summary of the facts	95
3.2.2.2 The legality of Pakistan’s restrictions	97
3.2.2.2.1 Pakistan’s right to regulate its territorial airspace	97
3.2.2.2.2 Pakistan’s restriction in Airway P518	98
3.2.3 Interim conclusions	103
3.3 Qatar ‘blockade’ case (2017-2021)	103
3.3.1 The proceedings	104
3.3.2 The legality of the blockade in air law	105
3.3.3 The closure of delegated airspace	108
3.3.4 Interim conclusions	110
4 Chapter summary and conclusions	110
 3 TECHNICAL AND OPERATIONAL ASPECTS OF PROHIBITED AIRSPACE	 113
1 Preliminary remarks	113
2 Relevance of ANS to prohibited airspace	113
2.1 Introductory remarks	113
2.2 Appropriate ATS authority	116

2.3	Case study of airspace closure due to the unavailability of ATS	120
2.4	Interim conclusions	124
3	International rules with respect to the provision of Air Traffic Services	124
3.1	Introductory remarks	124
3.2	Responsibility to provide ATS in national airspace	125
3.2.1	The national competence to provide ATS	125
3.2.2	The obligation to provide ATS	126
3.2.3	The interpretation of “so far as it may find practicable”	128
3.3	Jurisdiction to provide ATS	133
3.3.1	Three situations with respect to ATS provision	133
3.3.2	ATS jurisdiction in FIRs	135
3.4	The delegation of the responsibility to provide ATS	137
3.5	Interim conclusions	140
4	Responsibility of the appropriate ATS authorities relating to prohibited airspace	141
4.1	Introductory remarks	141
4.2	Responsibility to assess risks of air routes	141
4.2.1	The competence to assess risks of air routes	141
4.2.2	The obligation to assess risks of air routes	141
4.3	Responsibility to take contingency measures	144
4.3.1	Contingency response to establish prohibited airspace	144
4.3.2	The obligation to take contingency measures	145
4.4	Customary international law status of ICAO regulations on contingency responses	147
4.5	Interim conclusions	150
5	Prohibited airspace in bilaterally delegated airspace	151
5.1	Introductory remarks	151
5.2	The ‘(non)-use’ of sovereign airspace	151
5.3	Case study of the Qatar blockade in 2017-2021	152
5.4	Interim conclusions	157
6	Chapter summary and conclusions	157
4	AIRSPACE RESTRICTIONS OUTSIDE TERRITORIAL LIMITS	159
1	Preliminary remarks	159
2	Responsibility to provide ATS over the high seas	159
2.1	The Relationship between UNCLOS and the Chicago Convention	159
2.2	The supremacy of ICAO Rules of the Air over the high seas	163
2.3	The meaning of ‘high seas’ in ICAO regulations	165
2.3.1	The significance of regional agreements under the auspice of ICAO	168
2.3.2	Case study of the re-delegation of ATS provision over the high seas	171
2.4	Interim conclusions	173
3	Airspace restrictions over the high seas and in airspace of undetermined sovereignty	173
3.1	Introductory remarks	173
3.2	Category I: The regulations of prohibited airspace above the high seas	175

3.2.1	Freedom of overflight above the high seas	175
3.2.2	Danger areas over the high seas	176
3.2.2.1	Preliminary remarks	176
3.2.2.2	Conditions to establish a danger area over the high seas	177
3.2.2.3	The supervision of contingency responses over the high seas	180
3.2.3	Summary: Danger areas over the high seas	180
3.3	Category II: The regulations of prohibited airspace over areas of undetermined sovereignty	181
3.3.1	Airspace of undetermined sovereignty	181
3.3.2	Prohibited airspace over territories of undetermined sovereignty	183
3.3.2.1	The right to establish prohibited airspace over territories of undetermined sovereignty	183
3.3.3.2	Regional contingency plan over disputed territories	187
3.3.3	Summary: Prohibited airspace over territories of undetermined sovereignty	188
4	Chapter summary and conclusions	188
5	AIRSPACE RESTRICTIONS IN TIMES OF WAR	191
1	Preliminary remarks	191
2	The competence to establish prohibited areas in war	191
2.1	Introductory remarks	191
2.2	The competence to establish prohibited areas in wartime	191
2.2.1	The 'war' clause in the Chicago Convention	191
2.2.2	The relationship between Article 89 and Article 9 of the Chicago Convention	194
2.3	The determination of 'war'	195
2.3.1	Preliminary remarks	195
2.3.2	The interpretation of war by ICAO and the ICJ	196
2.3.3	Preparatory work of the Chicago Convention	198
2.3.4	Subsequent agreement between the parties regarding the meaning of 'war'	198
2.3.4.1	Evolutionary interpretation of 'war'	198
2.3.4.2	The meaning of war in IHL	200
2.4	Triggers of the application of Article 89	202
2.4.1	The temporal dimension of war	202
2.4.2	National emergency and non-international armed conflict (NIAC)	203
2.4.3	The geographic dimension of combat zone and conflict zone	206
2.5	Interim conclusions	208
3	The obligation to establish prohibited airspace over conflict zones	211
3.1	Preliminary remarks	211
3.2	General international law – the <i>Corfu Channel</i> case	212
3.3	Humanitarian rules	214
3.3.1	Customary rule on precautionary measures	214
3.3.2	Customary obligation of removing civil objects from combat zones	216

3.3.3 The expansion of customary obligations to 'conflict zones' defined by ICAO	218
3.3.3.1 The tragedy of PS752	218
3.3.3.2 Obligatory prohibited airspace over heightened alert areas	222
3.4 Caveat to the obligation: technical considerations	224
3.5 Interim conclusions	227
4 Chapter summary and conclusions	228
6 A SYNTHESIS AND THE PROSPECT FOR A COHERENT SECURITY REGIME FOR PROHIBITED AIRSPACE	231
1 Preliminary remarks	231
2 A coherent legal regime for prohibited airspace	231
2.1 Normative analysis of the Chicago Convention and ICAO regulations	231
2.1.1 Conditions to establish prohibited airspace in the Chicago Convention – <i>how?</i>	231
2.1.2 Justifications for prohibited airspace under Article 9 – <i>when?</i>	232
2.1.3 Jurisdiction to establish prohibited airspace – <i>who?</i>	233
2.2 Sovereignty and ATS jurisdiction exercised by the same State	234
2.2.1 From 'may' to 'should'	234
2.2.2 When should States establish prohibited airspace?	235
2.3 Sovereignty and ATS jurisdiction exercised by different States	236
2.3.1 Prohibited airspace in bilaterally delegated airspace	236
2.3.2 Danger areas over the high seas	237
2.3.3 Prohibited airspace in areas of undetermined sovereignty	237
2.4 ATS jurisdiction not exercised by any State	238
3 Stocktaking and prospect for <i>lex ferenda</i>	239
SUMMARY	243
SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	247
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	251
CURRICULUM VITAE	269

List of tables of figures

Figure 1:	Hierarchy of air laws and regulations	48
Figure 2:	UNCLOS Maritime and Airspace Zones	61
Figure 3:	Archipelagic sea lane passage	62
Figure 4:	The Pasir Gudang Port	91
Figure 5:	Proposed restricted airspace over Pasir Gudang	92
Figure 6:	Airspace closure over Pakistan	96
Figure 7:	Air routes between India and Pakistan in April 2019	99
Figure 8:	Air Routes over Pakistan in April 2019	102
Figure 9:	The new route in and out of Qatar	109
Figure 10:	Air Navigation Services	114
Figure 11:	Singapore FIR	138
Figure 12:	High seas	168
Figure 13:	ATS in the northeast of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia's airspace	171
Figure 14:	Relationship territory, sovereignty and FIRs	173
Figure 15:	The airspace over Cyprus	184
Figure 16:	Civil aviation over Ukraine on 24 February 2022	223
Figure 17:	The relationship among conflict zones, prohibited airspace, and combat zones	229
Table 1:	Air service links in the Middle East in 1988	122/123
Table 2:	Prohibited airspace in times of IAC, NIAC and military tensions	210
Table 3:	Attacks against Civilian Aircraft over 'Conflict Zones' as defined by ICAO (1978-2020)	221
Table 4:	Matrix for a coherent security regime for prohibited airspace	239

List of abbreviations

ACI	Airports Council International
AIC	Aeronautical Information Circular
AIP	Aeronautical Information Publication
ANB	Air Navigation Bureau (of ICAO)
ANC	Air Navigation Commission (of ICAO)
ANP	Air Navigation Plan
ANS	Air Navigation Services
ASA	Air Services Agreement
ATM	Air Traffic Management
ATS	Air Traffic Services
CAA	Civil Aviation Authority
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CZIB	Conflict Zone Information Bulletin
CZIR	Conflict Zone Information Repository
DSB	Dutch Safety Board
EASA	European Union Aviation Safety Agency
EUROCONTROL	European Organisation for the Safety of Air Navigation
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EC	European Commission
ECAC	European Civil Aviation Conference
EU	European Union
FAA	United States Federal Aviation Administration
FABs	Functional Airspace Blocks
FIR	Flight Information Region
GADSS	Global Aeronautical Distress and Safety System (of ICAO)
GANP	Global Air Navigation Plan (of ICAO)
GASP	Global Aviation Safety Plan (of ICAO)
GIS	Geographic Information System
HLSC	High-level Safety Conference
IAC	International Armed Conflict
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
ILC	International Law Commission
MANPADS	Man-portable air-defence systems
NIAC	Non-international Armed Conflict
NOTAM	Notice to airmen

PANS	ICAO Procedures for Air Navigation Services
PIRG	Planning and implementation regional group
<i>Proceedings</i>	<i>Proceedings of the International Civil Aviation Conference.</i> Chicago, Ill., November 1–December 7, 1944. (Publ. No. 2820) 2 vols. United States, Department of State, Washington D.C., 1948
RCZ	Risks to civil aviation arising from Conflict Zones
SARPs	Standard and Recommended Practices
SAMs	Surface-to-air missiles
SES	European Union's Single European Sky Initiative
SMS	Safety management system
TF RCZ	Task force on Risks to Civil Aviation arising from Conflict Zones (of ICAO)
USAP	Universal Security Audit Programme (of ICAO)
USOAP	Universal Safety Oversight Audit Programme (of ICAO)
UN	United Nations
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention for the Law of the Sea
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WHO	World Health Organization