



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The European precariat: the protection of precarious workers in the European Union

Carter, D.W.

Citation

Carter, D. W. (2023, April 19). *The European precariat: the protection of precarious workers in the European Union*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3594459>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3594459>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

**The European Precariat:
The Protection of Precarious Workers in the European Union**

The European Precariat: The Protection of Precarious Workers in the European Union

PROEFSCHRIFT
ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 19 april 2023
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Daniel William Carter
Geboren in Southampton, England
In 1985

Promotor: prof. dr. R.C. Tobler
Co-promotor: dr. M. Jesse

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. M. Dougan (University of Liverpool, UK)
prof. dr. N. Nic Shuibhne (University of Edinburgh, UK)
prof. dr. S. Van Den Bogaert
dr. V. Kosta

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my supervisors, Prof. Christa Tobler and Dr. Moritz Jesse, for their encouragement, motivation, and support during my time at Leiden. In particular, to Christa for giving me the opportunity to both write a PhD and act as Academic Coordinator for the Advanced LLM in European and International Business Law, which has undoubtedly been one of the most enriching and rewarding experiences of my life. Thank you also to Moritz for his support and mentorship as a teacher, moot court coach, co-coach, and co-author.

I would next like to express my appreciation to the members of the PhD Committee: Prof. Michael Dougan, Prof. Niamh Nic Shuibhe, Prof. Stefaan Van den Bogaert and Dr. Vasiliki Kosta for agreeing to assess my manuscript. I am honoured that they have invested the time and effort, and I am very grateful for the keen and helpful insights that they have provided.

A special mention to my paronyms, Kristel van Kruisbergen and Valentine Vandendaele, for the laborious work of preparing for a PhD defence as well as their enduring support and friendship over the years and into the future.

Next, thank you to the many, many people at Leiden Law School and the Europa Institute that made my time in Leiden such a special and memorable experience. To my dear friend and marathon partner Merinda Stewart, thank you for keeping me sane during the highs and lows of the 'other marathon'. Thank you to my moot court coach, colleague, and dear friend Ilektra Antonaki for all her support and encouragement. Thank you to Maria Cabrera for persuading me to participate in the European Law Moot Court Competition and to my wonderful teammates, Aurelie Villanueva and Ruth Foulis, for our challenging, exhilarating, and generally life-altering experiences in Leiden, Prague, and Luxembourg. Thank you to Darinka Piqani for supervising my LLM thesis and her guidance throughout my studies. And to everyone else at Leiden that made it such a wonderful place to work: Maarten, Nathan, Barbora, Daniel, Kristof, Veronika, Richard, Anran, Tuvana, David, Carina, Jorrit, Armin, Vestert, Melanie, Alison, Ben, Jorrit, Armin, Rick, Petra, Jet, Jasmina, Narin, Agis, Sheena, and all the others who made my time at Leiden such a rich and fulfilling experience.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents for their emotional and financial support throughout my studies. To my mother, Loraine Harding, for her resolute support throughout my academic studies (and for proofreading large sections of this manuscript!), and to my father, Keith Carter, for giving me an opportunity to see that the most rewarding experiences can come from unexpected places.

Table of Contents

CONTENTS

<i>Chapter 1: Introduction</i>	1
1 The Development of Labour Markets & The Rise of Precarious Employment	1
2 The European Regulation of Precarious Employment	3
3 Protecting the European Precariat	6
4 Research Question & Sub-questions	7
5 Methodology & Limitations of the Thesis.....	8
6 Academic Relevance	10
7 Societal Relevance.....	13
8 Structure of the Thesis.....	14
<i>Part I: The Development of Labour Markets and the Rise of Precariousness</i>	18
<i>Chapter 2: The De-standardisation & Precariatization of Employment</i>	19
1 Introduction.....	19
2 The Development of Labour Markets Pre-European Union	19
3 Bretton Woods and the Post-war Consensus of Embedded Liberalism.....	22
3.1 Standardised Employment.....	24
3.2 The Welfare State	25
4 The De-standardisation of Employment.....	26
4.1 Shifting Consensus: From 'Embedded' to 'Neo' Liberalism.....	27
4.2 Flexible (i.e., de-standardised) Employment	28
4.3 Activating Labour Market Policies.....	30
5 Labour Markets following the Global Financial Crisis	31
6 The Traits of Precariousness	33
7 Conclusion.....	37
<i>Chapter 3: The European Response to the Development of Labour Markets</i>	39
1 Introduction.....	39
2 The Treaty of Rome.....	39
2.1 Rome: Social Protection through Market Integration	40
2.2 The EEC: European Embedded Liberalism?	43
3. Maastricht: The Start of Social Integration.....	46
3.1 Maastricht: Making the Market more Social	46
3.2 Amsterdam: Formalised Social Competences	48
3.3 Open Coordination & The European Employment Strategy.....	49
3.4 Maastricht: European Neoliberalism?	51

4	The Treaty of Lisbon	53
4.1	The Balance Between Market and Social Rights.....	54
4.2	Increased Fundamental Rights Protection	55
4.3	The European Pillar of Social Rights.....	56
5	Conclusion: The Limits and Influences on the Protection of Workers under EU law	58
	<i>Part II: The General Protection of EU Migrant Workers</i>	<i>61</i>
	<i>Chapter 4: The Definition and Status of the Worker under EU Law</i>	<i>62</i>
1	Introduction.....	62
2	The Definition of Worker under EU Law	62
2.1	The Lawrie-Blum Criteria.....	63
2.2	Genuine Economic Activity	64
2.3	Subordination.....	70
2.4	Remuneration.....	72
3	The Reach of Lawrie Blum beyond the Freedom of Movement for Workers	74
3.1	EU Definition: The Direct Application of Lawrie-Blum.....	74
3.2	Member State Definition: The Indirect Application of Lawrie-Blum.....	76
3.3	A Uniform Definition of Worker Across EU Law?	81
4	Lawrie-Blum as the Gateway to Market Citizenship	82
4.1	Protection through Lawrie-Blum.....	82
4.2	Market Citizenship with a Federalised Character.....	85
5	Conclusion.....	87
	<i>Chapter 5: Non-economic Free Movement & Union Citizenship.....</i>	<i>89</i>
1	Introduction.....	89
2	The Development of Non-Economic Rights: Pre-Citizenship	90
2.1	'Non-economic' Market Rights.....	90
2.2	The Residency Directives.....	92
3	Citizenship of the European Union	94
3.1	Citizenship of the European Union.....	95
3.2	The (expansive) early Citizenship case-law on.....	97
4	One Directive to Rule Them All: Directive 2004/38.....	103
4.1	The Right to Reside under Directive 2004/38.....	104
4.2	Limitations on the Right to Reside	106
4.3	Equal Treatment Rights & Limitations	108
5	The Case-law on Union Citizenship following the Adoption of Directive 2004/38	109
5.1	Early Case-law	109
5.2	The Saga of the Special Non-contributory Cash Benefits.....	114
6	Evaluating Social Protection under Directive 2004/38.....	121

6.1	Criticisms of the Court	121
6.2	Unwarranted Nostalgia?	123
6.3	The Greater Legal Value of Directive 2004/38?.....	125
6.4	Literal & Teleological Interpretations of the Directive 2004/38	127
7	Implications for Non-standard and Precarious Workers	129
7.1	No safety net of Social Citizenship.....	129
7.2	'Earned' Union Citizenship with (continued) Market Dominance.....	131
7.3	An Autonomous and Precarious System	134
7.4	Systemic in Place of Individual Assessments	139
7.5	Less Entitlement to Social Benefits	142
8	Conclusion	144
	Part III: Case Studies	146
	Chapter 6: Part-time & On-Demand Workers	147
1	Introduction.....	147
2	Precarious forms of Limited Employment.....	148
2.1	Marginal Part-time Work	149
2.2	On-demand Work, Zero-hour, and Platform Work.....	150
3	Marginal Work & Genuine Economic Activity	152
3.1	CJEU Approach: Quantity over Quality?	153
3.2	A Shift towards Qualitative Considerations?	154
3.3	National Application: A problem of enforcement?.....	155
4	Precarious Part-time Workers under Directive 2004/38	159
4.1	The Binary Distinction between Economic Activity and Inactivity.....	159
4.2	Marginal Workers as Jobseekers.....	161
4.3	Sufficient Resources as Residual Residence for Marginal Workers?	164
4.4	The Treatment of Marginal Workers under National Law	166
5	The Free Movement Rights of Precarious Part-time Workers.....	168
5.1	Employment-based Rights	168
5.2	Social Security	170
5.3	Social Assistance and Social Advantages	173
5.4	Derived Family Rights	174
6	The Social Rights of Precarious Part-time Workers.....	176
6.1	The Part-time Work Directive	177
6.2	The Working Time Directive.....	182
6.3	Equal treatment between Men and Women	187
6.4	The Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	190
6.5	The Directive on Transparent & Predictable Working Conditions: (Finally) Protecting Marginal Workers?	196

7	The Wider Consequences of excluding Precarious Part-time Workers.....	198
7.1	Breaking the bonds of Market Solidarity.....	199
7.2	The European Lumpenproletariat.....	201
7.3	Labour Commodification & Downward Pressures on Social Standards.....	203
8	Solution: A Rebuttable Presumption of Genuine Activity?.....	205
9	Conclusion.....	208
	<i>Chapter 7: Intermittent Workers</i>	<i>211</i>
1	Introduction.....	211
2	Precarious forms of Intermittent Employment	211
2.1	Fixed-term Work.....	212
2.2	Employment Agency Work.....	212
2.3	Other forms of Intermittent Employment	213
3	Protection of Intermittent Workers under Directive 2004/38	214
3.1	Retaining Workers Status: The Court’s Case-law	214
3.2	No Social Assistance for Jobseekers? Intermittent Workers and the ‘Alimanovic Trap’	219
3.3	Retaining Worker Status: A Proportionate System?	220
3.4	Intermittent Workers & Permanent Residence.....	221
3.5	Application at National Level.....	222
4	Intermittent & Fixed-term Workers and EU Social Law	224
4.1	The Fixed-term Work Directive	224
4.2	The Employment Agency Directive.....	228
4.3	The Charter of Fundamental Rights.....	229
4.4	Transparent and Predictable Working Conditions	229
5	The Wider Consequences for Intermittent Workers.....	230
5.1	Intermittent Workers: Neoliberal Market Citizens?	230
5.2	Dualisations in the Labour Market	231
5.3	Social Exclusion.....	232
6	Solution: Elevated Employment Security for Intermittent Workers?.....	232
7	Conclusion.....	233
	<i>Chapter 8: False & Precarious Self-Employed Persons.....</i>	<i>235</i>
1	Introduction.....	235
2	Precarious Forms of Self-Employment.....	235
2.1	‘False’ or ‘Bogus’ Self-employment.....	236
2.2	Dependent Contractors & Platform Workers	237
3	The Distinction between genuine and false self-employment.....	238
3.1	The Court of Justice	238
3.2	National Courts.....	240

3.3	Comparing the National and European Approaches	243
4	The Protection of the Self-Employed under Free Movement Law	245
4.1	Protection under the Freedom of Establishment provisions	245
4.2	Social Protection of Self-employed under Directive 2004/38	246
5	Social Protection of Self-Employed: Social Rights	248
5.1	(No Right to) Employment & Social Law	249
5.2	The Right to Assembly and Collectively Agreed Rates	250
5.3	EU Competition Law	251
5.4	The Freedom of Establishment and Service Provision	254
6	Suggestions: A Presumption of Paid Employment & Social Rights for Precarious Self-Employed Workers?.....	256
7	Conclusion	258
<i>Chapter 9: Final Conclusions</i>		<i>260</i>
1	Europe Sways with the Winds of Change	260
2	Protecting Precarious Workers: Please Mind the (Legal) Gap	263
3	Part-time and On-demand Workers: Europe’s Lumpenproletariat?	265
4	Intermittent Workers: Falling between the Gaps	267
5	Precarious Self-Employment: New Employment, Old Distinctions.....	269
6	Final Comments: Time to protect Europe’s Most Vulnerable Workers?	271
<i>Het Europese Precariaat</i>		<i>273</i>
<i>Samenvatting (Dutch Summary)</i>		<i>273</i>
<i>Summary</i>		<i>275</i>
<i>Bibliography.....</i>		<i>276</i>
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i>		<i>302</i>