



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## Achieving decent work in China: a case study of decent working time

Zhang, W.

### Citation

Zhang, W. (2023, March 23). *Achieving decent work in China: a case study of decent working time*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3576738>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3576738>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Achieving decent work in China  
*A case study of decent working time*



# Achieving decent work in China

*A case study of decent working time*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,  
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 23 maart 2023  
klokke 10.00 uur

*door*

Weidong Zhang

geboren te Henan, China

in 1992

Promotoren: prof. dr. G.J.J. Heerma van Voss  
prof. dr. B.P. ter Haar (Rijksuniversiteit Groningen/  
University of Warsaw, Poland)

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. B. Barentsen  
prof. dr. A.W. Bedner  
dr. W. Huang (Renmin University of China, China)  
prof. dr. U. Liukkunen (University of Helsinki, Finland)

This research project is funded by the China Scholarship Council (CSC).

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven  
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2023 Weidong Zhang

*Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.*

*No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.*

# Acknowledgements

This book would not have been completed without the support of many people. First, I would like to thank my supervisors prof. Beryl ter Haar and prof. Guus Heerma van Voss. They are the most patient and talented people I have ever met in my life, from whom I have benefited a lot. They always timely responded to my questions and requests. Whenever I got stuck in my research, they always guided me with broad knowledge and rich experience. We had many constructive discussions on my research, and they provided lots of valuable comments and recommendations. They also encouraged me to attend international conferences and workshops, which not only enabled me to present my research to a wider audience but also opened my eyes to the field of labour law from a global and comparative perspective. In addition, I thank Beryl as a friend for life. I could not have wished for a better supervisor-friend than Beryl, whose passions on labour law and a better society still inspire me a lot.

I thank my officemate at Leiden Law School and also a friend for life, Anke van der Hoeven, who accompanied me from the beginning to the end of my PhD journey in the Netherlands. She supported me in many ways, professionally as a colleague and emotionally as a friend. We had many wonderful discussions on academic topics as well as issues of every day life. We celebrated many festivals, both Chinese and Dutch.

I would also like to express my sincere gratitude to the following persons: prof. Barend Barentsen from the Labour Law Department at Leiden Law School, for his support during my stay in Leiden; prof. Wei Huang from Renmin University of China, who invited me to collaborate on two research projects sponsored by the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security; prof. Monika Schlachter from Trier University, who generously welcomed and guided me in Trier, where we had lively discussions about my PhD research and other topics; and prof. Ying Jiang from China University of Labour Relations, who offered me with opportunities to gain practical experience on labour dispute resolution at the Beijing Labour Dispute Arbitration Committee.

Many thanks also go to our Labour Law Department and my colleagues, Albert van Marwijk Kooy, Yvonne Erkens, Licette Claproth-Usmany, Marian Hoerber, Hanneke Bennaars, Suzanne Kali, Emma van der Vos, and Marije Schneider, for creating a nice working environment. I am also very grateful to my friends for their support of various kinds in the Netherlands: Xiang Li, Yi Lu, Qiuyin Hu, Xuechan Ma, Shuai Guo, Anran Zhang, Yifan Yuan, Haiqing Hao, Shaomei Chen, Qing Cao, Meng Meng, Cheng Chang, Ding Ding, Dejian Kong, Wanlu Zhang, Zhuang Tian, Lalin Kovudhikulrungsri, Linlin Sun, Yudan Tan, Fengang Jiang, Jing Zhang, Moyu Zhang, Siyou Zhou,

Yu Zhao, Yang Xie, Dapeng Li, Lei Li, Chalermwut Sriporm, and Jin Choi. I would further like to thank my Neighbour in Boerhaavelaan, the Siregar Family, from Indonesia. They made the living there enjoyable. Special thanks go to Wenqian Pan, from whom I benefited a lot of encouragement and inspiration.

Last but not least, I thank my parents, who are always confident in me and support me. I am truly indebted to them, and this thesis could never have been accomplished without their love.

# Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XV
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 A quest for decent work	1
1.2 Aims, research questions and the scope	3
1.3 Methodology	4
1.3.1 Case Study	4
1.3.2 Historical analysis – periodisation	5
1.3.3 Content analysis	6
1.3.4 Structured critical analysis	8
1.3.5 Comparative law	9
1.4 Outline	9
2 HISTORICAL ORIGINS AND DEVELOPMENTS OF DECENT WORK	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.2 Early attempts before 1919	14
2.3 Advancing social justice (1919-1944)	16
2.4 Highlighting human rights (1944-1980s)	21
2.5 Raising social concerns (1980s-1999)	25
2.6 Promoting decent work (1999-2019)	29
2.7 Conclusion	33
3 FROM DECENT WORK TO DECENT WORKING TIME	35
3.1 Introduction	35
3.2 Concept of decent work	36
3.2.1 Decent work as a multi-faceted concept	37
3.2.2 Decent work as a development goal	40
3.2.3 Measurement of decent work	44
3.2.4 Meaning of decent work as a research subject	48
3.3 Concept of decent working time	50
3.3.1 Working time as an essential element of decent work	50
3.3.2 Decent working time and its five dimensions	55
3.3.3 Meaning of decent working time as a research subject	59
3.4 Conclusion: A working definition of decent working time from a legal perspective	60
3.4.1 A development goal with five dimensions	60
3.4.2 Substantive and procedural aspects	61



4	SUBSTANTIVE ASPECTS OF DECENT WORKING TIME: THE BENCHMARKS FROM THE ILO	63
4.1	Introduction	63
4.2	Decent working time: substantive aspects	64
4.3	Mapping the ILO legal instruments concerning working time	65
4.3.1	Types of ILO legal instruments dealing with labour standards and their implications on working time	66
4.3.1.1	The Constitution	66
4.3.1.2	Declarations	67
4.3.1.3	Conventions	67
4.3.1.4	Protocols	68
4.3.1.5	Recommendations	69
4.3.1.6	Resolutions and Conclusions	70
4.3.1.7	Codes of Practice and Technical Guidelines	71
4.3.1.8	Interpretation and case law	72
4.3.1.9	Relations between the ILO legal instruments and their implications for working time	74
4.3.2	Selected ILO legal instruments to create the benchmarks	75
4.3.2.1	Working time Conventions and Recommendations with 'up-to-date' and 'interim' status	75
4.3.2.2	ILO General Surveys on working time	77
4.4	Benchmarks of substantive aspects of decent working time from the ILO	78
4.4.1	Scheme for formulating the benchmarks	78
4.4.2	The concrete benchmarks	80
4.4.3	Scheme for applying the benchmarks	91
4.4.4	Some further methodological issues	92
4.4.4.1	Individual countries vs. international comparisons	92
4.4.4.2	Longitudinal data vs. cross-sectional data	93
4.4.4.3	Law in books vs. law in practice	93
4.5	Conclusion	94
5	SUBSTANTIVE ASPECTS OF DECENT WORKING TIME: THE DEVELOPMENT OF CHINA	95
5.1	Introduction	95
5.2	The period before the transition (1949-1978)	96
5.2.1	Identification of China's legal instruments dealing with working time (1949-1978)	96
5.2.1.1	The Constitution	97
5.2.1.2	Administrative Regulations	98
5.2.1.3	Department Rules	99
5.2.1.4	Normative Documents	99

5.2.2	Assessment of China's substantive working time standards against the ILO benchmarks	101
5.2.2.1	Working time duration	102
5.2.2.2	Working time organisation	104
5.2.2.3	Care-related leave	105
5.2.2.4	Other legal indicators	106
5.2.3	Analysis of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects (1949-1978)	106
5.3	The transition period (1978-2007)	107
5.3.1	Identification of China's legal instruments dealing with working time (1978-2007)	107
5.3.1.1	The Constitution	110
5.3.1.2	Laws	111
5.3.1.3	Administrative Regulations	113
5.3.1.4	Department Rules	115
5.3.1.5	Normative Documents	116
5.3.2	Assessment of China's substantive working time standards against the ILO benchmarks	118
5.3.2.1	Working time duration	119
5.3.2.2	Working time organisation	121
5.3.2.3	Care-related leave	123
5.3.2.4	Other legal indicators	124
5.3.3	Analysis of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects (1978-2007)	124
5.4	The period after the transition (2008-2020)	125
5.4.1	Identification of China's legal instruments dealing with working time (2008-2020)	125
5.4.1.1	Laws	126
5.4.1.2	Administrative Regulations	127
5.4.1.3	Departmental Rules	127
5.4.1.4	Normative Documents	128
5.4.2	Assessment of China's substantive working time standards against the ILO benchmarks	128
5.4.2.1	Working time duration	129
5.4.2.2	Working time organisation	129
5.4.2.3	Care-related leave	130
5.4.2.4	Other legal indicators	130
5.4.3	Analysis of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects (2008-2020)	131
5.5	Conclusion: an overall evaluation of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects	132
6	PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF DECENT WORKING TIME: AN ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK	133
6.1	Introduction	133
6.2	Decent working time: procedural aspects	134

6.3	The formulation and enforcement of working time standards	135
6.3.1	Working time regimes	135
6.3.2	Working time configurations	138
6.3.3	Procedural aspects: regulatory levels and enforcement mechanisms	141
6.4	Framework for analysing procedural aspects of decent working time	146
6.4.1	Mandated working time configuration	148
6.4.2	Centralised negotiated working time configuration	149
6.4.3	Decentralised negotiated working time configuration	149
6.4.4	Unilateral working time configuration	150
6.4.5	Application of the analytical framework with four ideal-type working time configurations	151
6.4.6	Some further methodological issues	151
6.4.6.1	Ideal combinations vs. other combinations	152
6.4.6.2	Individual countries vs. international comparisons	152
6.4.6.3	Longitudinal data vs. cross-sectional data	152
6.5	Conclusion	153
7	PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF DECENT WORKING TIME: THE DEVELOPMENT OF CHINA	155
7.1	Introduction	155
7.2	The period before the transition (1949 – 1978)	156
7.2.1	Early stage (1949-1956)	156
7.2.1.1	Public enterprises	157
7.2.1.2	Private enterprises	164
7.2.2	Later stage (1957-1978)	167
7.2.2.1	Public enterprises	167
7.2.3	Identification and analysis of China's working time procedural configurations (1949-1978)	168
7.3	The transition period (1978-2007)	172
7.3.1	Early stage (1978-1994)	172
7.3.1.1	Public enterprises	173
7.3.1.2	Private enterprises	176
7.3.2	Later stage (1995-2007)	178
7.3.2.1	Various types of enterprises	179
7.3.3	Identification and analysis of China's working time procedural configurations (1978-2007)	185
7.4	The period after the transition (2008-2020)	188
7.4.1	Various types of enterprises	189
7.4.1.1	Regulatory levels	189
7.4.1.2	Enforcement mechanisms	191
7.4.2	Identification and analysis of China's working time procedural configurations (2008-2020)	195

7.5	Conclusion: an overall evaluation of achieving decent working time in China: procedural aspects	196
8	THE OVERALL ANALYSIS OF ACHIEVING DECENT WORKING TIME IN CHINA	199
8.1	Introduction	199
8.2	Healthy working time	201
8.2.1	Identification of the legal indicators for healthy working time	201
8.2.2	Healthy working time regulations in China	201
8.2.3	Analysis and evaluation of achieving healthy working time in China	203
8.3	Family-friendly working time	205
8.3.1	Identification of the legal indicators for family-friendly working time	205
8.3.2	Family-friendly working time regulations in China	206
8.3.3	Analysis and evaluation of achieving family-friendly working time in China	207
8.4	Gender equality through working time	209
8.4.1	Identification of the legal indicators for gender equality through working time	209
8.4.2	Gender equality through working time regulations in China	209
8.4.3	Analysis and evaluation of achieving gender equality through working time in China	211
8.5	Choice and influence regarding working time	212
8.5.1	Ideal-type working time configurations	212
8.5.5	Working time configurations in China	214
8.5.3	Analysis and evaluation of achieving workers' greater choice and influence regarding working time in China	216
8.6	Productive working time	219
8.6.1	The roof of the decent working time house	219
8.6.2	Analysis and evaluation of achieving productive working time in China	220
8.7	Achieving decent working time in China	221
9	FROM DECENT WORKING TIME TO DECENT WORK	223
9.1	Aim of the thesis and research questions	223
9.2	Recapitulation findings research questions	224
9.2.1	How did the concept of decent work take shape in the ILO?	224
9.2.2	What is the definition of decent work?	225
9.2.3	What is the definition of decent working time?	226
9.2.4	What analytical frameworks are needed to analyse the achievement of decent working time?	226

9.2.5	To what extent is China achieving decent working time?	229
9.3	Achieving decent work in China	233
9.3.1	Rights at work	234
9.3.2	Employment	234
9.3.3	Social protection	235
9.3.4	Social dialogue	235
9.3.5	Decent work in China	236
9.4	Recommendations	236
9.4.1	Recommendations for China	236
9.4.2	Recommendations for further research	238
APPENDIX I	PROFILE OF CHINA	239
APPENDIX II	INDEX OF THE ILO LEGAL INSTRUMENTS CONCERNING WORKING TIME (1919-2020)	243
APPENDIX III	INDEX OF CHINESE LEGAL INSTRUMENTS CONCERNING THE SUBSTANTIVE ASPECTS OF WORKING TIME (1949-2020)	245
APPENDIX IV	INDEX OF CHINESE LEGAL INSTRUMENTS CONCERNING THE PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF WORKING TIME (1949-2020)	251
APPENDIX V	COMPARISON BETWEEN THE ILO BENCHMARKS AND CHINESE WORKING TIME STANDARDS (ILO-DWT-CHINA DATABASE)	257
BIBLIOGRAPHY		299
SUMMARY		307
SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)		313
CURRICULUM VITAE		317

## List of Abbreviations

ACFTU	All-China Federation of Trade Unions
CASS	Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CC-CCP	Central Committee of Chinese Communist Party
CEACR	Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations
CFA	Committee on Freedom of Association
CNKI	China National Knowledge Infrastructure
CPPCC	Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference
DWCPs	Decent Work Country Programmes
DWCPprofiles	Decent Work Country Profiles
DWI	Decent Work Indicators
DWPPs	Decent Work Pilot Programmes
EU	European Union
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNI	Gross National Income
HRI	Human Development Index
IALL	International Association for Labour Legislation
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ILC	International Labour Conference
ILO	International Labour Organisation/International Labour Office
IMF	International Monetary Fund
ISWT	International Symposium on Working Time
IWA	International Workingmen's Association
KMT	Kuomintang/Chinese Nationalist Party
LDACs	Labour Dispute Arbitration Committees
LDMCs	Labour Dispute Mediation Committees
LIB	Labour Inspection Bureau
LRD-NPC	Laws and Regulations Database-National People's Congress
LRD-PKU	Laws and Regulations Database-Peking University
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals
MHRSS	Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security
MoLSS	Ministry of Labour and Social Security
NPC	National People's Congress
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PRC	People's Republic of China
SOEs	State-owned enterprises

---

SAA	State Archives Administration
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SRM	Standards Review Mechanism
SRM-TWG	Tripartite Working Group of the Standards Review Mechanism
TVEs	Town and Village Enterprises
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
WB	World Bank
WTO	World Trade Organisation

## List of Tables

Table 1.1	Methods and their relevant chapters in this thesis	4
Table 2.1	The 1944 Declaration of Philadelphia vs. The 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights	22
Table 2.2	A timeline of historical origins and developments of decent work: key terms and expressions	34
Table 3.1	Overview of measurements of decent work: some selected studies and the ILO's indicators	44
Table 4.1	Classification of ILO legal instruments	66
Table 4.2	Selection of ILO Conventions, Protocols, and Recommendations for creating the benchmarks	77
Table 4.3	Identification of ILO General Surveys on working time	78
Table 4.4	Structural dimensions of the benchmarks: Legal indicators and legal sources	79
Table 4.5	The concrete benchmarks of the substantive aspects of decent working time	81
Table 4.6	Coding schemes of a legal indicator by four aspects	92
Table 5.1	The legal instruments dealing with working time in China (1949-1978)	96
Table 5.2	Results of the assessment of China's substantive working time standards against the ILO benchmarks (1949-1978)	102
Table 5.3	The legal instruments dealing with working time in China (1978-2007)	108
Table 5.4	Results of the assessment of China's substantive working time standards against the ILO benchmarks (1978-2007)	118
Table 5.5	The legal instruments dealing with working time in China (2008-2020)	126
Table 5.6	Results of the assessment of China's substantive working time standards against the ILO benchmarks (2008-2020)	129
Table 6.1	Overview of approaches to examine the formulation and enforcement of working time standards	141
Table 6.2	Framework to analyse the procedural aspects of decent working time: Ideal-type configurations	148
Table 6.3	Questions to be addressed in the individual countries by applying the framework	151
Table 7.1	Labour dispute cases handled in thirty cities (1950-1952)	164
Table 7.2	Identification of China's working time procedural configurations (1949-1978)	169



Table 7.3	The number of labour inspection cases (2002-2019)	182
Table 7.4	The number of labour dispute cases handled by the LDACs (1992-2007)	185
Table 7.5	The number of labour disputes cases handled by the courts (2006-2007)	185
Table 7.6	Identification of China's working time procedural configurations (1978-2007)	186
Table 7.7	The number of labour inspection cases (2008-2019)	192
Table 7.8	The number of labour dispute cases handled by the LDACs (2008-2019)	194
Table 7.9	The number of labour disputes cases handled by the courts (2006-2008, 2014-2019)	194
Table 7.10	Identification of China's working time procedural configurations (2008-2020)	195
Table 7.11	Developments of China towards decent working time: Procedural aspects (three periods, 1949-2020)	197
Table 8.1	Identification of legal indicators for the first three dimensions of decent working time	201
Table 8.2	Evaluation of whether the three legal indicators adhere to the gender equality principle in China	211
Table 8.3	Framework to analyse the procedural aspects of decent working time: Ideal-type configurations	213
Table 8.4	Developments of working time configurations in China by types of enterprises and periods	216
Table 9.1	Framework to analyse the procedural aspects of decent working time: Ideal-type configurations	229
Table 9.2	Developments of China towards decent working time: Procedural aspects (three periods, 1949-2020)	231

## List of Figures

Figure 3.1	The number of ILO Conventions and Recommendations by subjects	54
Figure 3.2	The relationship among each of the five dimensions of decent working time	58
Figure 3.3	House of decent working time by the five dimensions	61
Figure 3.4	Framework for the overall analysis of the achievement of decent working time	62
Figure 4.1	The rationale underlying the ILO benchmarks	65
Figure 4.2	The number of ILO Conventions and Recommendations on working time (incl. maternity protection and workers with family responsibilities) by status	76
Figure 5.1	Evaluation of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects (1949-1978)	106
Figure 5.2	Evaluation of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects (1978-2007)	124
Figure 5.3	Evaluation of achieving decent working time in China: Substantive aspects (2008-2020)	131
Figure 5.4	Developments of China towards decent working time: Substantive aspects (three periods, 1949-2020)	132
Figure 8.1	House of decent working time by the five dimensions	199
Figure 8.2	The trend in the regulation of healthy working time by nine legal indicators in China	203
Figure 8.3	The trend in the regulation of healthy working time at the overall level in China	203
Figure 8.4	The trend in the regulation of family-friendly working time by three legal indicators in China	207
Figure 8.5	The trend in the regulation of family-friendly working time at the overall level in China	207
Figure 8.6	The trend in the three legal indicators for gender equality through working time in China	211
Figure 8.7	The overall trend in the substantive aspects of decent working time by all twelve legal indicators	216
Figure 8.8	House of decent working time by the five dimensions in China	221
Figure 9.1	House of decent working time by the five dimensions	227
Figure 9.2	The rationale underlying the ILO benchmarks	228
Figure 9.3	Developments of China towards decent working time: Substantive aspects (three periods, 1949-2020)	230
Figure 9.4	House of decent working time by the five dimensions in China	232

