



Universiteit
Leiden

The Netherlands

Women issuing fatwas: female Islamic scholars and community-based authority in Java, Indonesia

Ismah, N.

Citation

Ismah, N. (2023, January 12). *Women issuing fatwas: female Islamic scholars and community-based authority in Java, Indonesia*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3505634>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3505634>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

WOMEN ISSUING FATWAS



**Female Islamic Scholars
and Community-Based Authority
in Java, Indonesia**

Nor Ismah

Lay out: Imam Syahirul Alim
Cover design: Muhdhor Kokore
The image was reproduced from a figurative painting
on gallerist.in and for non-profit purposes.

=====

@2023 Nor Ismah. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronics, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the permission in writing from the proprietor.

**Women Issuing Fatwas:
Female Islamic Scholars and Community-Based
Authority in Java, Indonesia**

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 12 januari 2023
klokke 10.00 uur

door

Nor Ismah
geboren te Pekalongan, Indonesië
in 1978

Promotor:

Prof. dr. N.J.G. Kaptein

Copromotor:

Dr. D. Kloos (Koninklijk Instituut voor Taal-, Land- en
Volkenkunde)

Promotiecommissie:

Prof. dr. L.P.H.M. Buskens

Prof. dr. B.A. Barendregt

Prof. dr. P.A. van Doorn-Harder (Wake Forest University, North
Carolina)

Dr. R. Saptari Soetikno Slamet

*To Ayah Rochmad,
Kak Abiq, Kak Atha, and Dik Ara,
we made it!*

This thesis was researched and written with financial support from the Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education of Ministry of Finance of Republic Indonesia (LPDP RI)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENT >>> viii
**A NOTE ON TRANSLITERATION, SPELLING,
AND OTHER CONVENTIONS** >>> xi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT >>> xii

CHAPTER ONE

Introduction

Women Issuing Fatwas >>> 1
Muslim Women and Religious Authority in the Indonesian
Context >>> 7
Female Religious Authority >>> 16
Studying Fatwas by Women from Anthropological and
Gender Perspectives >>> 23
Fieldwork >>> 32
Structure of the Dissertation >>> 40

Interlude

Mbak Khotim: A Woman in the NU Circle >>> 43

CHAPTER TWO

Contesting Religious Authority, Women and Fatwa-giving in the Traditionalist Fatwa Councils

Introduction >>> 47
Nahdhatul Ulama as a Traditionalist Muslim Mass
Organization >>> 50
Intellectual and Social Activism within
Nahdlatul Ulama >>> 59
NU Women and Gender Activism >>> 65
Women's Struggle for a Place in NU's Bahtsul Masail >>> 70
Rahima and the PUP Programme >>> 78

Interlude

*Bu Hanik: Breaking the Patern, Devoting Life
to the Community* >>> 86

CHAPTER THREE

Building Community-based Authority: Everyday Practices of Female Ulama in Issuing Fatwas at the Grassroots

Introduction >>> 91

Encountering the Term of *Ulama Perempuan* and the Ulama-ness of Women >>> 94

Male Resistance to the Concept of *Ulama Perempuan* >>> 99

The Inclusion of a Gender Perspective in Religious Debates and Interpretations >>> 106

Performing the Roles of Ulama: What Women Can Do and What They Cannot Do >>> 111

Female Ulama and their Everyday Practices of Issuing Fatwas >>> 115

Conclusion >>> 131

Interlude

Bu Afwah: Defending Women's Rights through the Pesantren >>> 135

CHAPTER FOUR

The Indonesian Congress of Women Ulama (Kongres Ulama Perempuan Indonesia, KUPI 2017): Fatwa-making, Community Network, and the Building of a Social Movement

Introduction >>> 139

Islamic Feminism: Local and International Circulations >>> 142

The Formation of KUPI and the First Conference >>> 148

The Leading Figures: Knowledge Circulation and Network >>> 158

Redefining the Term *Ulama Perempuan* and the Methodology of KUPI's Fatwas >>> 164

Building Solidarity and the Challenge from Established Authority >>> 171

Affirming Juristic Authority: The Fatwa-making of KUPI >>> 179

KUPI: A Transformation from Intellectual to Social Movement >>> 189

Conclusion >>> 166

Interlude

Nyi Ruq: Writing for Question-and-Answer Section >>> 198

CHAPTER FIVE

Amplifying Authority: Female Ulama and Mass-mediated Fatwas in the Public Sphere of Indonesia

Introduction >>> 201

Muslim Women in the Public Sphere of Indonesia >>> 205

Question-and-Answer Format of Fatwas
in Magazines >>> 208

Women Islamic Magazines in Indonesia:
The Historical Context >>> 212

Content Analysis: Fatwas through the Question and
Answer (Q&A) Format >>> 215

NGO-Based Publication: Swara Rahima >>> 215

Semi Commercial Magazine: AuleeA >>> 219

Commercial Magazine: NooR >>> 222

Questions: Reflecting the Dilemmas and Worries of the
Audiences >>> 226

The Answers: Challenges and Strategies in Constructing
and Amplifying the Progressive Message of Islam >>> 236

Conclusion >>> 258

CHAPTER SIX

Conclusion >>> 261

REFERENCES >>> 271

GLOSSARY >>> 293

SUMMARY >>> 305

SAMENVATTING >>> 312

CURRICULUM VITAE >>> 321

A NOTE ON TRANSLATION, SPELLING, AND OTHER CONVENTIONS



This book relies on primary resources that are written in the Indonesian language, besides many other sources. I have translated quotes and interviews originally written and spoken in the Indonesian language. I frequently refer to Indonesian words and terms, which I have written according to standard Indonesian orthography (see *Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia*; <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/>), including a significant number of words and terms that are derived from the Arabic language. These words, terms, and phrases are thus given in the commonly used Indonesian spelling or as I came across them in the sources I used, for instance *taharah*, *muamalah*, *majelis taklim*, *jamaah*, *niat*, *sunat*, *bidah*, *adat*, *mubalig*, *ustazah*, *dai*, *daiyah*, *mudarat*, *bahtsul masail*, *nafkah*, *salat*, *sedekah* etc. In rare cases, I have decided to privilege a more commonly used transliteration of the Arabic over the standard Indonesian (e.g. *hadith* instead of *hadis* and *fiqh* instead of *fikih*). For this, I have referred to the Oxford English Dictionary: (<https://www.oed.com/>).

I have not used diacritics and other symbols, with the exception of the Arabic letters ‘*ayn* (as in *shari‘a*) and—when occurring in word-medial position—*hamzah* (as in *Qur’an*). All non-English terms are italicized, with the exception of some terms that occur relatively frequently in the English language, for example *fatwa*, *ulama*, *mufti*, and *shari‘a*. For these non-English terms I have also used the Oxford English Dictionary. The plural forms of Arabic terms are mostly retained. The only exception is the term *ulama* (religious scholars). The term *ulama* in Arabic is the plural for ‘*alim*. However, in Indonesian usage, the term *ulama* refers to both the singular and the collective. Thus, *ulama* in this book refers to both the singular and plural forms. Similarly, the

word *jamaah*, which means a group of religious followers, can be translated as an individual follower. The plural form of other Islamic terms will be indicated with an “s”; thus fatwas is the plural form of fatwa and *pesantrens* is the plural for *pesantren*.

For Qur’anic translations, I refer to <https://quran.com/> and for dates I use the Common Era (CE) format.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT



My supervisors often reminded me that my PhD thesis is my own work. This is true. But it is also a result of constant discussions and constructive critiques between me and them. I am indebted to Nico Kaptein, or Pak Nico as I am used to calling him. He intensively supervised me in the crucial period of my first year preparing my research on women ulama, a period in which I was pregnant, helping me to find my focus on the everyday practices of women's fatwa-making in Java, Indonesia. I am also indebted to David Kloos, who gave me a lot of his time and thoughts, especially after I returned to Indonesia in 2020. During the pandemic, he painstakingly reviewed my writing with rigorous discussions every week through Zoom meetings. Our intensive discussions have spurred my enthusiasm to complete my dissertation. I am grateful for having them as my supervisors. With them I felt that I was in good hands.

I wish to thank LPDP RI for providing generous funds during my PhD study. I would also like to thank to Margreet van Till, the coordinator of exchange programmes in the faculty of Humanities, Leiden University, for her assistance. I would also like to express my gratitude to Leon Buskens, Bart Barendregt, Nelly van Doorn-Harder, Ratna Saptari, Claudia Derichs, and Eka Srimulyani for their willingness to sit on my examination committee. I benefited from discussion with Barbara Andaya, Martin van Bruinessen, Lies Marcoes, Mirjam Kunkler, Eva Fahrún Nisa, Ahmad Nuril Huda, Elizarni, Neeraj Dangol, Faqihuddin Abdul Kodir, Nurrofiah, and Kurniawan Saefullah for

the progress of my research. I am thankful to my colleagues at LIAS, KITLV, PCINU Belanda and other Indonesian students in the Netherlands, Ade Jaya Suryani, Fitria Sari Yuniarti, Muhammad Latif Fauzi, Al Farabi, Syahril Sidik, Aminudin Siregar, Yanwar Pribadi, Nurenzia Yannuar, Julia Se, Kay, Darid, Xu Guanmian, Taufiq Hanafi, Grace Leksana, Arfiansyah, Fachrizal Affandi, Yance Arizona, Sudarmoko, Andi Yani, Ayu Swaningrum, Ajeng Arainikasih, Mubarika Nugraheni, Hari Nugroho, M. Zamzam Fauzanafi, Mega Atria, Dian Akram, Hengky Wijaya, Nazaruddin, Kuswanto, Nurmaya Prahatmaja, Widya Fitria Ningsih, Wijayanto, Tjahjono Prasodjo, Arum Perwitasari, Adrian Prakasa, Yunus Sulistiyono, and Nur Ahmad for sharing thoughts, foods, and laughs. My student life in Boerhaavelan became colorful with the friendship of Indonesche Vrouw in Leiden, our late beloved Teh Meira Setiawati, Desty Eka Putri Sari, Latifah, Mufidah Hasanah, Rully Wiliandri, Maya Febriyanti, Raini Diah Susanti, Tika Prahatmaja, Ka Bati, Rahma Zain, Umi Illiyina, Herra Pahlasari, Ratna Hapsari, Nur R. Isnaningsih, Dian Armanda, Suci Herdian, Wulida Fitri Maulina, and many more.

My dissertation could not have been completed without the countless help of people during the fieldwork. A number of good people deserve my sincere gratitude, mainly Nyai Afwah Mumtazah, Nyai Umi Hanik, Nyai Khotimatul Husna, Nyi Ruqayah, Nyai Hindun Anisah, Nyai Bashirotul Hidayah, Nyai Masriyah Amva, Kiai Husein Muhammad, Kiai Helmi Ali, Nyai Siti Musyfiqah, Nyai Badriyah Fayumi and the entire KUPI network, Mbak AD Eridani and all the PUP alumni of Rahima, Yu Aliyatul Wathoni and Lu'lu'ul Maknun, my research assistants, Annise Sri Maftuchin, Nazhifatun Muthahharoh, Halimah, Masyithah Mardhatillah, and Noorhidayah, and everyone else I cannot mention individually here. In addition, I would like to thank Clare Wilkinson for proofreading my manuscript. I also wish to thank my colleagues at the Institute of Southeast Asian Islam (ISAIS) of Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University, including Wiwin Siti Aminah Rahmawati, Anfasul Marom, Ahmad Usman,

Mamat Abdul Khodir, and Handini. I am grateful to Mbak Inayah Rahmaniyah, Nihayatul Wafiroh, Mbak Kiki, and Mbak Iing for sharing support and loves, and M. Rizal Abdi from CRCS UGM and Imam Syahirul Alim for their willingness to help me out with the book cover design and layout.

I cannot thank enough my family, my late parents, H. Kumbari and Hj. Zubaidah, Abah Uzeir, my brothers and sisters, and all my in-laws who are always supporting and proud of me no matter what. I would also like to extend my gratitude to Ibu Kartini who has given me a warm place to stay anytime I visit the Netherlands. Lastly, to my spouse, Rochmad Hidayat. We know our journey since 2016 has not been an easy one, but thankfully we get through it. I am grateful for our love and care, and for our three amazing daughters, Shinfia Labieq, Kafkay Natha, and Iolana Narashansha. Once I complained, ohh this is so difficult, and our little girl answered, it is obvious, Mom, because you are doing a PhD! This is certainly our memorable journey.