



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Towards an understanding of Kurdistani Memory Culture: apostrophic and phantomic approaches to a violent past

Majid, B.

Citation

Majid, B. (2022, May 17). *Towards an understanding of Kurdistani Memory Culture: apostrophic and phantomic approaches to a violent past*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3443725>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3443725>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Towards an Understanding of Kurdistan Memory Culture

Towards an Understanding of Kurdistani Memory Culture

Apostrophic and Phantomic Approaches to a Violent Past

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.dr.ir. H.Bijl,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 17 mei 2022
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Bareez Majid
geboren te Sulaymaniyah
in 1987

Promotores

Prof. dr. A. Visser

Prof. dr. S.P.M. Bussels

Copromotor

Dr. S.A. Polak

Promotiecommissie

Prof. dr. S. Lammes

Prof. dr. P.J. ter Keurs

Prof. dr. A.A. Seyed-Ghorab

Dr. A. Fischer-Tahir

© Bareez Majid, 2022.

Printed by Ipskamp Printing, Enschede

Typesetting by TAT Zetwerk

Cover design by Dana Majid

Cover illustration by helene veilleux

Contents

Acknowledgements IX

Introduction 1

- 1 The KRI's Memory Struggle 1
 - 2 Memory Studies 5
 - 3 Trauma Studies 7
 - 4 Kurdish Studies 11
 - 5 Methodology and Positionality 13
 - 5.1 Methodology 13
 - 5.2 Fieldwork and Interviews 16
 - 5.3 Positionality 22
 - 6 Levels of Witnessing 25
-
- 1 **Kurdistani Memory Culture and Educational Textbooks 27**
 - 1 Education and Ideology 27
 - 2 Struggles for Identity in the Iraqi Education System 30
 - 2.1 Education Policies before and during the Ba'ath Regime 30
 - 2.2 Education and the Hegemony of 'the' Arab Identity 32
 - 2.3 The Kurdistan Region Education System between 1991 and 2003 36
 - 3 Education after 2003 37
 - 3.1 Education Reform and Foreign Donors 37
 - 3.2 The Textbook Quality Improvement Programme 39
 - 4 Kirmanj's Analysis 40
 - 4.1 The Second Generation of Textbooks 40
 - 4.2 'Self' and 'Other' 41
 - 4.3 International Forces 43
 - 4.4 Exclusion 44
 - 5 Humiliated Silence 45
 - 5.1 Halabja and Anfal 45
 - 5.2 Forgetfulness 48
 - 6 Interlude: The Problematic Position of Jash 50
 - 7 Forgetfulness and Reconciliation 56
 - 7.1 Disarming the Mind 56
 - 7.2 Family and Collectivity 59
 - 7.3 Forgiveness and Human Rights 63
 - 7.4 Democracy and Future Hope 65
 - 7.5 Postmemory 66
 - 8 Two Narratives 67

- 2 **Amna Suraka: In Order Not to Forget** 69
 - 1 No Friends but the Mountains: The Referendum and an Apostrophizing of Kurdistan 69
 - 2 The Material 76
 - 2.1 Nora's Three Aspects 76
 - 2.2 A Brief History of the Building 76
 - 2.3 The Building Itself 78
 - 2.4 The Prison Cells 84
 - 3 The Functional 91
 - 3.1 In Order Not to Forget 91
 - 3.2 Interlude: Historical Context 98
 - 3.3 Detailing the Anfal Campaign 100
 - 3.4 Detailing Rakrdn 104
 - 3.5 Mourning and Sharing 108
 - 3.6 Recognizing the Present 122
 - 4 The Symbolic 126
 - 4.1 Kurdistan Culture and Folklore 126
 - 4.2 Kurdistan Heroes 132
 - 5 An Entwinement of History and Memory 142
 - 5.1 "Our True History" 142
 - 5.2 Manipulation and Appropriation 145
 - 6 Material, Functional and Symbolic 149

- 3 **Kurdistani Literature in its Socio-Political Context: An Analysis of Two Texts by Bachtyar Ali** 151
 - 1 A Utopian Place 151
 - 2 Literature and Identity 153
 - 2.1 Literature, Oppression and Nationalism 153
 - 2.2 Allegorical Approaches to Kurdistan Literature 154
 - 2.3 A Novel Telling Us Who the Kurds Are 157
 - 2.4 "A Hasty Flight to (Allegorical) Meaning" 159
 - 3 My Uncle Jamshid Khan 160
 - 3.1 A Summary of the Story 160
 - 3.2 An Allegorical Reading of JM 161
 - 3.3 An Affective Reading of JM 162
 - 3.4 Putting Experiences into Words 164
 - 3.5 A Plethora of Meanings 166
 - 3.6 Art and Escape 167
 - 4 The City of White Musicians 169
 - 4.1 Mourning and Disappearance 169
 - 4.2 Magical Realism 172

4.3	Messianic, Biblical and Cyclic Temporalities	174
4.4	Third-Time and the Unravelling of the Self	176
4.5	Us vs Them	178
4.6	Ghosts	180
5	Different Forms of Escapism	181
4	The Halabja Monument and Peace Museum	185
1	The Phantomic	185
2	Museums and Prosthetic Memories	188
2.1	Holocaustal Events	188
2.2	History, Memorial and Memory Museums	190
2.3	Prosthetic Memory	192
2.4	Milieux and Lieux de Mémoire	195
3	The Material	196
4	The Functional	199
4.1	In Order Not to Repeat	199
4.2	In Order to Mourn	201
4.3	In Order to Document and Convince	205
4.4	Photographs and Dioramas as Prosthetic Memory	216
4.5	Prosthetic Memories in a Phantomic Museum	228
4.6	A Political Function	233
4.7	Politicizing Prosthetic Memories	235
4.8	The Prosthetic Replacing the Phantomic	238
5	The Symbolic	239
5.1	Symbols of Peace and Unity	239
5.2	Kurdistani Culture as a Symbol of Strength and Vulnerability	243
5.3	The Journalist as a Symbol of Justice and Heroism	246
5.4	The Garden: A Continuation of Symbolism	250
5.5	Replacing the Functional with the Symbolic	254
6	A Struggle for Meaning Haunted by Ghosts from the Past	256
	Conclusion: Memory as an Agent of Change	259
1	Synthesizing Overview	259
2	Parki Azadi	262
3	Bottom-up and Top-down Approaches	265
4	A Scholarly Contribution	268
	Works Cited	271
	Summary in Dutch	283
	Summary in Kurdish	289
	Curriculum Vitae	297

Acknowledgements

It takes a village to write a dissertation. I consider myself extremely lucky to be surrounded by caring and loving people without whom this book would and could not have been written.

First, I am in debt to all my respondents in Sulaymaniyah and in Halabja. These beautiful souls who, despite their many difficulties in life, opened their doors and their hearts to me. I thank you, truly, for confiding in me, for sharing your stories with me. I can only hope that I did them justice.

The list of those at Leiden University, and in particular at LUCAS, who encouraged me and made me feel at home is extensive. I would like to take the opportunity to thank some of you here:

Thony, I remember the day I came to your office to tell you that I wanted to apply for an NWO research grant. In response, you told me that it was going to be difficult, but not impossible. And here we are Thony: we did it! Your drive and critical attitude encouraged me to give my best.

Stijn, thank you for treating me, right from the beginning, as a peer. I enjoyed our talks about the precariousness of existence within academia, and you taught me how to put all my insecurities into perspective.

Sara, you encompass all that I aspire to become. The many hours we spent talking offline and online kept me going. I am grateful to your family for allowing me to speak with you about my research even when you were out camping with them. You uniquely combine kindness with academic curiosity.

Frans-Willem: avanti! Many thanks for your support and the discussions we had about my research. You are truly generous with your time and your intellect. I would also like to thank Yra. It is not a coincidence that almost everyone with whom I followed your course “Shoah-icons in Art and Literature” is now either a doctor or becoming one. Thank you for being an inspiration, and for encouraging me to pursue an academic career. Kitty, Isabel, Sabina, Astrid, Yasco, Nicole, Nynke, Lieke, Anna, Looi, Eliza, Laura, Janna and Viola: thanks for making the university a welcoming place. Judith, Alessia, Sary, Marcela and others from our writing group, thanks for organizing my mock defense. Jenneka, thank you for editing my dissertation. To the late Kaiven, one of our students—a fellow Kurdistani at Leiden University—I want to say: you will not be forgotten.

My paranympths, Charlotte and Eline, I am grateful to have you by my side. Thank you for the many walks, drinks, dinners, cries and laughs we shared throughout the years. You are my most critical and yet my most empathetic mirrors. I hold you dear.

And there are my friends Bestoon, Anke, Didi, Mischa, Dodo, Renas, Thijs, Eva and Nele: thank you for lending me your sympathetic ears whenever I felt the need to complain about life and the loneliness of doing research.

My dear family, without you I would not have been where I am today. Sabawi gul, thank you for being so strong. Thanks for being an empowering role model. Babe gyan, the greatest

feminist I have known. Until this day, I draw strength from your unconditional love. I wish you were here today to see the result of your encouragement and your confidence in me. I miss you immensely!

Dade Bakcha, my sister in crime. Without your humor, sparkle and intelligence my life would be colorless. Power woman, you are one of a kind! I am grateful for your beautifully translated Kurdish summary of this research. But also: no more Tony Chocolonys, I hope.

Kak Sardar, thank you for making your network available to me.

Yaad, Mimi, Kak Kosar, Laas, Wiëna, Dade Shapol, Joop, Narine, Nashmile, Dade Shara, Alan, Helane, Kake Twana, Boeke, Lani, and little Daran, I love you. Thank you for being with me every step of the way.

Dana lief, I am thankful for having you as my little brother. Thank you for buying me my first laptop from your first salary. Thanks for your kindness and everlasting support. Your creative mind shines through this beautifully designed cover. You make me proud, as always.

Hanneke, Adri, Daniel, Nadia, Yara, Isis, Judith, Christiaan, Isaak, Nathan, Rachel, Machteld, and Marije, thank you for making me part of your family. The gezellige moments we share are very dear to me.

Monster the cat: thanks! Just because you always make me laugh.

Finally, Mathijs. There are no words to describe how much joy you bring to my life. I love our numerous travels to Berlin, working together in German libraries and cafes. Thank you deeply for the many hours talking and thinking about my research. Thanks for your witty remarks. Mattie, you ground me. Please stay as generous and beautiful as you are.