



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Overcoming ruptures: Zande identity, governance, and tradition during cycles of war and displacement in South Sudan and Uganda (2014-2019)

Braak, B.J.

Citation

Braak, B. J. (2022, June 1). *Overcoming ruptures: Zande identity, governance, and tradition during cycles of war and displacement in South Sudan and Uganda (2014-2019)*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3304674>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3304674>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Overcoming Ruptures

Overcoming Ruptures

Zande identity, governance, and tradition during
cycles of war and displacement in South Sudan
and Uganda (2014-2019)

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 1 juni 2022
klokke 15.00 uur

door

Bruno Jim Braak

geboren te Utrecht
in 1987

Promotores: prof. dr. J.M. Otto
dr. ir. C.I.M. Jacobs and dr. C. Leonardi (University of Durham, UK)

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. L. Hammond (SOAS University of London, UK)
prof. dr. P. Shipton (Boston University, USA)
prof. dr. J.M. Ubink
dr. P.H. Justin
dr. L.A. de Vries (Wageningen University)

Parts of the research for this PhD thesis were funded by: 1) the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs through the Knowledge Platform Security & Rule of Law; 2) the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs through the Rift Valley Institute; and 3) the Rockefeller Foundation through the London School of Economics' Firoz Lalji Centre for Africa.

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest
Drukwerk: Ipskamp Printing – Enschede

© 2022 B.J. Braak

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden veeleenvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische veeleenvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

I owe a debt of gratitude to many people.

First, to the countless people in South Sudan who shared their time, knowledge, and ideas with me. Peter Minaida welcomed me in Yambio with warm hospitality, valuable insights, and a great sense of humour. Bishop Eduardo Hiiboro and the priests at the Catholic Diocese Tombura-Yambio opened their guesthouse, dining table, and conversations to me. I will never forget the joint learning, frustrated contingency planning, and joyful banter of my research team with Angelica, Donato, Evelyn, Faida, Felix, Gasport, Matondo, Rejoice, Veronica, and Amos. Our respondents were too many to thank, but I am especially grateful to paramount chief – now King! – Wilson Hasan Rikito Peni and judge William Kaya, and to Patrick Augustine, Charles Babiro, Mary Dawudi Biimo, Kuzee John Elia, Eduard Arminio Mombasa, Mathew Nvuru, and Tartisio Wandu. This part of my research would not have been possible without the partnership with Cordaid, funding by the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and administration by NWO-WOTRO in collaboration with the Knowledge Platform on Security and Rule of Law.

Second, to the South Sudanese people in Uganda, who welcomed me even as they were recovering from the shocks of war and displacement. Much beyond the scope of my academic pursuit, I learned from them about fate and faith, about the limits of understanding, and about the many ways of being human in an absurd world. I have tried to capture some of it in this book, but apologise to them that (my) ink on paper inevitably does no justice to the lives they have lived. My debt is greatest to Lina Abangite, Charles Bangbe, Justin Banzim, Aluel Jok, Daniel Mbikoyezu, Albert Moudie, Simon Ngbidigi, Elizabeth Night, Mary Victor, James Waraga, Moses Zaza, and the Sisters of the Blessed Virgin Mary.

Third, to colleagues and friends in Uganda. In Uganda I had the privilege of working with John Kenyi, a seasoned field researcher with an exceptional gift of connecting with respondents. We were assisted by Aluel Jok, Bidal James, Mary Victor, and Paul Night. Our work was part of the 'South Sudan's Customary Authorities'-project by the Rift Valley Institute, funded by the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs. I am profoundly grateful to John Ryle and Anna Rowett for their enthusiasm, trust, and guidance. Later I met a most inspiring young man in Kiryandongo refugee settlement: Isaac Waanzi Hillary (see Portraits). We published a paper together, *When the World Turns Upside*

Down, Live Like a Bat! Idioms of Suffering, Coping, and Resilience among Elderly Female Zande Refugees in Kiryandongo Refugee Settlement, Uganda (2019-20) in Civil Wars. This research was part of the project 'Deconstructing Notions of Resilience: Diverse Post-Conflict Settings in Uganda' by Ryan O'Byrne and Julian Hopwood of London School of Economics' Firoz Lalji Centre for Africa. This work was funded by the Rockefeller Foundation.

Fourth, to the academics. First, my unrivaled team of supervisors: Jan Michiel Otto, Carolien Jacobs, and Cherry Leonardi. With wisdom and care they generously offered detailed edits, big ideas, and ample encouragement. They always remained humble and kind towards one another and to myself. I hope to one day teach like they taught. Second, to the bastion of academic curiosity and warmth that is the VVI: Janine and Adriaan, Kari and Kora, Annelien, Arshad, Bernardo, Elizabeth, Hoko, Neske, Santy, Suliman, Willem, and everyone else who made our rice lunches and research meetings so stimulating. Third, to the scattered scholars who helped me to organise my research, think about my material, find treasure troves of literature, and improve my writing: Severine Autesserre, Pritha Belle, Matthew Benson, Hazel Cameron, Wendy James, Douglas Johnson, Francis Gotto, Tarnjeet Kang, Nicki Kindersley, Louisa Lombard, Christian Lund, Sarah Marriott, Naomi Pendle, Mara Revkin, Anouk Rigterink, John Ryle, Mareike Schomerus, Parker Shipton, Liz Storer, Virginie Tallio, Lotje de Vries, and Catherina Wilson.

Last but essentially: my family and friends. I have not always been a good husband, son, brother, in-law, and friend. During birthdays, weddings, and hard times I was away. Your forgiveness and patience have meant the world. Mieke, Carel and Boris, I am blessed to be your son and brother. Josi, I am beyond grateful to be with you. The anticipation of Noa motivated the finalisation of this book, and deepened my solidarity with mothers, fathers, and children in hard places.

I write these acknowledgements to testify to my gratitude, and not to deflect responsibility. I wrote this book and take responsibility for any shortcomings and inaccuracies.

Table of contents

ABBREVIATIONS	xi
ILLUSTRATIONS	xiii
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Another beginning	1
1.2 A multi-sited ethnography: Foci, sites, and methods	2
1.2.1 'The Zande', reading Evans-Pritchard, and change overlooked	7
1.2.2 Conflict, salvage anthropology, and constructivist/essentialist quagmires	9
1.2.3 Constructed essences: Reaching across time	11
1.3 Conceptual keys and contributions	12
1.3.1 What kind of war?	12
1.3.2 'Oto vura': Cyclical displacement along the voluntary-forced continuum	14
1.3.3 Identifying 'ethnicity'	17
1.3.4 Governing authorities	20
1.3.4.1 An empirical view of the state and beyond	20
1.3.4.2 Traditional authority: Rooted, invented, reconstructed	21
1.4 Portraits: Introducing key respondents	24
1.5 Outline and point of the book	27
2 RUPTURES: TRADITIONAL AUTHORITIES, VIOLENCE, AND THE STATE IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (1500s-2014)	31
2.1 Some notes on historiography and the works of Evans-Pritchard	34
2.2 The origin of the Avungara and the formation of 'the Zande' (1500s-1856)	37
2.3 A tale of two kings and the arrival of imperial powers (1856-1905)	40
2.4 Anglo-Egyptian colonization and the position of chiefs (1905-1955)	46
2.5 The Sudanese period: Civil wars (1956-2011)	52
2.6 Violence and constructive crises in Western Equatoria (2005-2014)	56
2.7 Conclusion	62

3	MOVEMENTS: IM/MOBILITY, VIOLENCE, AND STATE CONTROL IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (1500s-2014)	65
3.1	Pre-colonial movements (1500-1904)	66
3.2	Colonial movements (1905-1955): Sleeping sickness and the Zande Scheme	68
3.3	Sudanese movements (1956-2011)	73
3.4	Running and returning towards independence (2005-2013)	76
3.5	The meaning of return: Innovation and alienation	78
3.6	Conclusion	81
4	GROUNDING CONFLICTS: LAND AND FORMALISATION IN TIMES OF POST-CONFLICT RETURN IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (2011-2015)	85
4.1	Introduction	85
4.2	Land dynamics in post-conflict Western Equatoria	87
4.2.1	Land tenure patchwork	87
4.2.2	Land disputes	88
4.2.3	The politics of land and belonging	90
4.3	State visions and street-level improvisations	92
4.3.1	The minister's vision and the formalisation of land	93
4.3.2	Street-level problems and improvisations	96
4.4	Subsequent disputes	99
4.4.1	Land dispute 1: A church vs LRA-displaced peoples	99
4.4.2	Land dispute 2: Politicized demarcation, ethnicity, and conflict in Maridi	103
4.4.3	A discussion	105
4.5	Land governance under fire	107
4.6	A conclusion	108
5	BEING TRADITIONAL IN MERCURIAL TIMES: CHIEFS IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (2005-2016)	113
5.1	Introduction	113
5.2	Who are the chiefs?	115
5.3	<i>Zeitgeist</i> of self-determination and the reinstatement of a Zande kingdom	118
5.3.1	Self-determination and the revival of 'tradition'	118
5.3.2	Zande kingdom: Reinstatement efforts	120
5.4	Returnee chiefs and reconstructed traditions	122
5.5	Customary courts and chiefs' dispute resolution	125
5.6	Walking the tightrope: Gatekeeping and brokering in times of conflict	130
5.7	Conclusion	133
6	'IT HAS STARTED AGAIN': THE ERUPTION OF CIVIL WAR AND PEOPLE'S DECISIONS TO STAY OR GO (2015-2017)	137
6.1	Introduction	137

6.2	How 'it' started again: Causes and consequences of violence (2015-2017)	140
6.2.1	First phase: strategic avoidance (December 2013 – summer 2015)	141
6.2.2	Second phase: Local clashes with cattle keepers and SPLA (summer 2015)	141
6.2.3	Third phase: Internal divisions (from August 2015)	142
6.3	Mashakil ketir: Violence seen from below	144
6.4	Structure: 'Drivers' and 'determinants' of movement	148
6.5	Agency, aspiration, and ability	150
6.5.1	Aspiration to stay/move: Intentions, personality, and experience	152
6.5.2	Aspiration to go to Uganda	155
6.5.3	Ability to stay or move: Assets and social networks	157
6.6	Moral frameworks and positionality	160
6.7	Pathways of displacement: Who stays and goes?	162
6.8	Conclusion	165
7	ENCOUNTERING THE STATE UPON ARRIVAL: AID, PAPERS, AND LAND IN UGANDA (2015-2019)	169
7.1	Introduction	169
7.2	Uganda's refugee policy and administration	171
7.3	Setting the scene: Kiryandongo RS and Bweyale	177
7.3.1	Refugee settlement and boom town	177
7.3.2	Host-refugee relations and the value of land	181
7.4	Arrival: Border tactics, getting paper, and contested mobility	182
7.4.1	Border tactics: Refugee or visitor?	183
7.4.2	Getting papers	186
7.4.3	Aid distribution, dynamics, and dilemmas: 'Those people with money can beg us for posho!'	189
7.4.4	Once in Uganda, people continue to move	191
7.5	Land allocation, resettlement, and the battle for permanence	193
7.5.1	Double allocations, the need to use land to claim it, and Good Samaritans	196
7.5.2	Informal land transactions	198
7.5.3	The battle for permanence: Building and bulldozing houses	199
7.6	Eating aid: the UNHCR and OPM corruption scandal	202
7.6.1	Corruption and fraud in the refugee response	202
7.6.2	The response: A biometric verification	204
7.6.3	Refugee perspectives on the corruption scandal and the verification	205
7.7	Conclusions: A hierarchy of place and displacement	206
8	DISPLACED TRADITIONAL AUTHORITY AND THE RECONSTRUCTION OF ORDER IN UGANDA (2016-2019)	209
8.1	Introduction	209
8.2	The second phase: 'Sitting around waiting to die' or 'looking for God's plan'	211

8.3	Salatin ma fi: Why?	215
8.3.1	The remarkable absence of the chiefs	215
8.3.2	Dispute over drinking water, ethnic escalation, and resolution	219
8.4	Abundance of aspiring authorities in the settlements	222
8.4.1	Refugee Welfare Councils	224
8.4.2	Ethnic and regional community organizations, pursuing unity	228
8.4.2.1	Community organisations	228
8.4.2.2	Scattering and unity	230
8.4.3	Comparing the RWC, community organizations, and customary authorities	234
8.4.4	The politics of community: 'the battle for camp chairman'	236
8.5	Looking to the future: The enduring currency of tradition, the canvas of the past, and the Zande kingdom	238
8.5.1	The enduring currency of tradition: A future more like the past?	239
8.5.2	Debating the Zande kingdom, decentralisation, and belonging.	242
8.5.2.1	Zande voices favouring a kingdom	242
8.5.2.2	'Going where you belong': Dissenting minorities and debates about belonging	244
8.6	Conclusions: The fertile soil of a burnt past	246
9	OVERCOMING RUPTURES: THE PURSUIT OF FUTURE	251
9.1	An ethnography of conflict, confusion, and the pursuit of continuity	352
9.2	Founding history	253
9.3	Returning to Western Equatoria, reconstructing past and future	154
9.3.1	Propelled governance ambitions: Returnees for a utopian future	254
9.3.2	Returnee chiefs, reconstructed traditions	256
9.4	'It has started again': To stay or go?	257
9.5	Refugee settings	258
9.5.1	Despair, meaning, and continuity	259
9.5.2	Refugee authority	260
9.6	'Scattering' and the reconstruction of identity, tradition, and futures	261
9.7	Future research	265
9.8	In closing	267
	SUMMARY	269
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	275
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	281
	ANNEX 1: FULL PORTRAITS	313
	ANNEX 2: POEM: IT HAS STARTED AGAIN	343
	ANNEX 3: METHODS AND MULTI-SITED DISPLACED ETHNOGRAPHY	347
	ANNEX 4: CUSTOMARY COURTS CASELOADS: METHODS AND FINDINGS	365
	CURRICULUM VITAE	371

Abbreviations

ATA	Azande Traditional Association
BIMS	Biometric Information Management System
CAR	Central African Republic
CDTY	Catholic Diocese of Tombura-Yambio
CLA	County Land Authority
CPA	Comprehensive Peace Agreement
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
GoSS	Government of South Sudan
IDP	Internally Displaced People
IOM	International Organisation for Migration
JPC	Justice and Peace Commission
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army
MAF	Missionary Aviation Foundation
MP	Member of Parliament
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
OIOS	Office of Internal Oversight Services
OPM	Office of the Prime Minister
RoSS	Republic of South Sudan
RRRC	Relief, Repatriation, and Rehabilitation Commission
RS	Refugee Settlement
RWC	Refugee Welfare Council
SAD	Sudan Archive Durham
SAF	Sudanese Armed Forces
SG	Secretary-General
SPLA	Sudan People's Liberation Army
SPLM	Sudan People's Liberation Movement
SPLM-IO	Sudan People's Liberation Movement-In Opposition
SSNLM	South Sudan National Liberation Movement
SSP	South Sudanese Pound
SSPDF	South Sudan People's Defence Forces
UGX	Ugandan Shilling
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNMIS	United Nations Mission in Sudan
UNMISS	United Nations Mission in South Sudan
UNOCHA	United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
UPDF	Uganda People's Defence Force
USAID	United States Agency for International Development

VTC	Vocational Training Centre
WES	Western Equatoria State
WFP	World Food Programme

Illustrations

Figures

1.	Colour Sergeant F. R. Boardman (Egyptian Army, Liverpool Regiment), pictured between 1900 and 1904 during a patrol against the Zande (the 'Nyam Nyam patrol')	42
2.	Captain P. R. Wood pictured around 1900 with Maxim Battery and gun during the 'Niam Niam patrol'	43
3.	Satellite photo of Yambio, Gangura, and Nabiapai	100
4.	(S)election of traditional authorities	116
5.	Aggregate customary court caseload	127
6.	Estimated displaced and non-displaced populations in and outside South Sudan	138
7.	Carling's aspiration-ability model	151
8.	Conflict conjuncture and displacement pathways	163
9.	Refugees in Uganda (2013-20)	173
10.	UNHCR truck at the South Sudan – Uganda – DR Congo tripoint	183
11.	Anonymized ration card	187
12.	Interior of a single male refugee's house in Kiryandongo RS	196
13.	Refugee house with 'permanent' materials in Kiryandongo RS	200
14.	Painting by James: A triptych of war, flight and arrival	212
15.	Slot machine in Rhino Camp refugee settlement	214
16.	Painting by James: Dispute settlement in the refugee settlement	223
17.	Painting by James: a future peaceful South Sudan	239
18.	Painting by James: On his perspective on my research	354
19.	Photo from Rift Valley Institute dissemination in Arua	358
20a-e	Cases brought to five Western Equatorial customary courts	366-367
21.	Aggregate customary court caseload	368

Maps

1.	Western Equatoria State	4
2.	Relevant areas of South Sudan, DR Congo, and Uganda	6
3.	Refugees and Asylum-Seekers in Uganda, August 2020	175
4.	Kiryandongo, Bweyale, and Kiryandongo RS	178
5.	Key sites in central and western part of Kiryandongo RS, January 2014	180
6.	Key sites in central and western part of Kiryandongo RS, December 2018	180

Tables

1.	History and ethnography of the Zande and Western Equatoria	32
2.	Administrative units and levels of chieftaincy	126
3.	South Sudan, estimated cereal surplus/deficit, 2015-9	146
4.	Lee's Theory on Migration	148
5.	Uganda's refugee governance hierarchy	176