



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Overcoming ruptures: Zande identity, governance, and tradition during cycles of war and displacement in South Sudan and Uganda (2014-2019)

Braak, B.J.

Citation

Braak, B. J. (2022, June 1). *Overcoming ruptures: Zande identity, governance, and tradition during cycles of war and displacement in South Sudan and Uganda (2014-2019)*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3304674>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3304674>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Overcoming Ruptures

Overcoming Ruptures

Zande identity, governance, and tradition during
cycles of war and displacement in South Sudan
and Uganda (2014-2019)

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 1 juni 2022
klokke 15.00 uur

door

Bruno Jim Braak

geboren te Utrecht
in 1987

Promotores: prof. dr. J.M. Otto
dr. ir. C.I.M. Jacobs and dr. C. Leonardi (University of Durham, UK)

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. L. Hammond (SOAS University of London, UK)
prof. dr. P. Shipton (Boston University, USA)
prof. dr. J.M. Ubink
dr. P.H. Justin
dr. L.A. de Vries (Wageningen University)

Parts of the research for this PhD thesis were funded by: 1) the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs through the Knowledge Platform Security & Rule of Law; 2) the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs through the Rift Valley Institute; and 3) the Rockefeller Foundation through the London School of Economics' Firoz Lalji Centre for Africa.

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest
Drukwerk: Ipskamp Printing – Enschede

© 2022 B.J. Braak

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprerecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprerecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

I owe a debt of gratitude to many people.

First, to the countless people in South Sudan who shared their time, knowledge, and ideas with me. Peter Minaida welcomed me in Yambio with warm hospitality, valuable insights, and a great sense of humour. Bishop Eduardo Hiiboro and the priests at the Catholic Diocese Tombura-Yambio opened their guesthouse, dining table, and conversations to me. I will never forget the joint learning, frustrated contingency planning, and joyful banter of my research team with Angelica, Donato, Evelyn, Faida, Felix, Gasport, Matondo, Rejoice, Veronica, and Amos. Our respondents were too many to thank, but I am especially grateful to paramount chief – now King! – Wilson Hasan Rikito Peni and judge William Kaya, and to Patrick Augustine, Charles Babiro, Mary Dawudi Biimo, Kuzee John Elia, Eduard Arminio Mombasa, Mathew Nvuru, and Tartisio Wandu. This part of my research would not have been possible without the partnership with Cordaid, funding by the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, and administration by NWO-WOTRO in collaboration with the Knowledge Platform on Security and Rule of Law.

Second, to the South Sudanese people in Uganda, who welcomed me even as they were recovering from the shocks of war and displacement. Much beyond the scope of my academic pursuit, I learned from them about fate and faith, about the limits of understanding, and about the many ways of being human in an absurd world. I have tried to capture some of it in this book, but apologise to them that (my) ink on paper inevitably does no justice to the lives they have lived. My debt is greatest to Lina Abangite, Charles Bangbe, Justin Banzim, Aluel Jok, Daniel Mbikoyezu, Albert Moudie, Simon Ngbidigi, Elizabeth Night, Mary Victor, James Waraga, Moses Zaza, and the Sisters of the Blessed Virgin Mary.

Third, to colleagues and friends in Uganda. In Uganda I had the privilege of working with John Kenyi, a seasoned field researcher with an exceptional gift of connecting with respondents. We were assisted by Aluel Jok, Bidal James, Mary Victor, and Paul Night. Our work was part of the 'South Sudan's Customary Authorities'-project by the Rift Valley Institute, funded by the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs. I am profoundly grateful to John Ryle and Anna Rowett for their enthusiasm, trust, and guidance. Later I met a most inspiring young man in Kiryandongo refugee settlement: Isaac Waanzi Hillary (see Portraits). We published a paper together, *When the World Turns Upside*

Down, Live Like a Bat! Idioms of Suffering, Coping, and Resilience among Elderly Female Zande Refugees in Kiryandongo Refugee Settlement, Uganda (2019-20) in Civil Wars. This research was part of the project 'Deconstructing Notions of Resilience: Diverse Post-Conflict Settings in Uganda' by Ryan O'Byrne and Julian Hopwood of London School of Economics' Firoz Lalji Centre for Africa. This work was funded by the Rockefeller Foundation.

Fourth, to the academics. First, my unrivaled team of supervisors: Jan Michiel Otto, Carolien Jacobs, and Cherry Leonardi. With wisdom and care they generously offered detailed edits, big ideas, and ample encouragement. They always remained humble and kind towards one another and to myself. I hope to one day teach like they taught. Second, to the bastion of academic curiosity and warmth that is the VVI: Janine and Adriaan, Kari and Kora, Annelien, Arshad, Bernardo, Elizabeth, Hoko, Neske, Santy, Suliman, Willem, and everyone else who made our rice lunches and research meetings so stimulating. Third, to the scattered scholars who helped me to organise my research, think about my material, find treasure troves of literature, and improve my writing: Severine Autesserre, Pritha Belle, Matthew Benson, Hazel Cameron, Wendy James, Douglas Johnson, Francis Gotto, Tarnjeet Kang, Nicki Kindersley, Louisa Lombard, Christian Lund, Sarah Marriott, Naomi Pendle, Mara Revkin, Anouk Rigterink, John Ryle, Mareike Schomerus, Parker Shipton, Liz Storer, Virginie Tallio, Lotje de Vries, and Catherina Wilson.

Last but essentially: my family and friends. I have not always been a good husband, son, brother, in-law, and friend. During birthdays, weddings, and hard times I was away. Your forgiveness and patience have meant the world. Mieke, Carel and Boris, I am blessed to be your son and brother. Josi, I am beyond grateful to be with you. The anticipation of Noa motivated the finalisation of this book, and deepened my solidarity with mothers, fathers, and children in hard places.

I write these acknowledgements to testify to my gratitude, and not to deflect responsibility. I wrote this book and take responsibility for any shortcomings and inaccuracies.

Table of contents

| | |
|--|------|
| ABBREVIATIONS | xi |
| ILLUSTRATIONS | xiii |
| 1 INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 Another beginning | 1 |
| 1.2 A multi-sited ethnography: Foci, sites, and methods | 2 |
| 1.2.1 'The Zande', reading Evans-Pritchard, and change overlooked | 7 |
| 1.2.2 Conflict, salvage anthropology, and constructivist/essentialist quagmires | 9 |
| 1.2.3 Constructed essences: Reaching across time | 11 |
| 1.3 Conceptual keys and contributions | 12 |
| 1.3.1 What kind of war? | 12 |
| 1.3.2 'Oto vura': Cyclical displacement along the voluntary-forced continuum | 14 |
| 1.3.3 Identifying 'ethnicity' | 17 |
| 1.3.4 Governing authorities | 20 |
| 1.3.4.1 An empirical view of the state and beyond | 20 |
| 1.3.4.2 Traditional authority: Rooted, invented, reconstructed | 21 |
| 1.4 Portraits: Introducing key respondents | 24 |
| 1.5 Outline and point of the book | 27 |
| 2 RUPTURES: TRADITIONAL AUTHORITIES, VIOLENCE, AND THE STATE IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (1500s-2014) | 31 |
| 2.1 Some notes on historiography and the works of Evans-Pritchard | 34 |
| 2.2 The origin of the Avungara and the formation of 'the Zande' (1500s-1856) | 37 |
| 2.3 A tale of two kings and the arrival of imperial powers (1856-1905) | 40 |
| 2.4 Anglo-Egyptian colonization and the position of chiefs (1905-1955) | 46 |
| 2.5 The Sudanese period: Civil wars (1956-2011) | 52 |
| 2.6 Violence and constructive crises in Western Equatoria (2005-2014) | 56 |
| 2.7 Conclusion | 62 |

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 3 | MOVEMENTS: IM/MOBILITY, VIOLENCE, AND STATE CONTROL IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (1500s-2014) | 65 |
| 3.1 | Pre-colonial movements (1500-1904) | 66 |
| 3.2 | Colonial movements (1905-1955): Sleeping sickness and the Zande Scheme | 68 |
| 3.3 | Sudanese movements (1956-2011) | 73 |
| 3.4 | Running and returning towards independence (2005-2013) | 76 |
| 3.5 | The meaning of return: Innovation and alienation | 78 |
| 3.6 | Conclusion | 81 |
| 4 | GROUNDING CONFLICTS: LAND AND FORMALISATION IN TIMES OF POST-CONFLICT RETURN IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (2011-2015) | 85 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 85 |
| 4.2 | Land dynamics in post-conflict Western Equatoria | 87 |
| 4.2.1 | Land tenure patchwork | 87 |
| 4.2.2 | Land disputes | 88 |
| 4.2.3 | The politics of land and belonging | 90 |
| 4.3 | State visions and street-level improvisations | 92 |
| 4.3.1 | The minister's vision and the formalisation of land | 93 |
| 4.3.2 | Street-level problems and improvisations | 96 |
| 4.4 | Subsequent disputes | 99 |
| 4.4.1 | Land dispute 1: A church vs LRA-displaced peoples | 99 |
| 4.4.2 | Land dispute 2: Politicized demarcation, ethnicity, and conflict in Maridi | 103 |
| 4.4.3 | A discussion | 105 |
| 4.5 | Land governance under fire | 107 |
| 4.6 | A conclusion | 108 |
| 5 | BEING TRADITIONAL IN MERCURIAL TIMES: CHIEFS IN WESTERN EQUATORIA (2005-2016) | 113 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 113 |
| 5.2 | Who are the chiefs? | 115 |
| 5.3 | <i>Zeitgeist</i> of self-determination and the reinstatement of a Zande kingdom | 118 |
| 5.3.1 | Self-determination and the revival of 'tradition' | 118 |
| 5.3.2 | Zande kingdom: Reinstatement efforts | 120 |
| 5.4 | Returnee chiefs and reconstructed traditions | 122 |
| 5.5 | Customary courts and chiefs' dispute resolution | 125 |
| 5.6 | Walking the tightrope: Gatekeeping and brokering in times of conflict | 130 |
| 5.7 | Conclusion | 133 |
| 6 | 'IT HAS STARTED AGAIN': THE ERUPTION OF CIVIL WAR AND PEOPLE'S DECISIONS TO STAY OR GO (2015-2017) | 137 |
| 6.1 | Introduction | 137 |

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 6.2 | How 'it' started again: Causes and consequences of violence (2015-2017) | 140 |
| 6.2.1 | First phase: strategic avoidance (December 2013 – summer 2015) | 141 |
| 6.2.2 | Second phase: Local clashes with cattle keepers and SPLA (summer 2015) | 141 |
| 6.2.3 | Third phase: Internal divisions (from August 2015) | 142 |
| 6.3 | Mashakil ketir: Violence seen from below | 144 |
| 6.4 | Structure: 'Drivers' and 'determinants' of movement | 148 |
| 6.5 | Agency, aspiration, and ability | 150 |
| 6.5.1 | Aspiration to stay/move: Intentions, personality, and experience | 152 |
| 6.5.2 | Aspiration to go to Uganda | 155 |
| 6.5.3 | Ability to stay or move: Assets and social networks | 157 |
| 6.6 | Moral frameworks and positionality | 160 |
| 6.7 | Pathways of displacement: Who stays and goes? | 162 |
| 6.8 | Conclusion | 165 |
| 7 | ENCOUNTERING THE STATE UPON ARRIVAL: AID, PAPERS, AND LAND IN UGANDA (2015-2019) | 169 |
| 7.1 | Introduction | 169 |
| 7.2 | Uganda's refugee policy and administration | 171 |
| 7.3 | Setting the scene: Kiryandongo RS and Bweyale | 177 |
| 7.3.1 | Refugee settlement and boom town | 177 |
| 7.3.2 | Host-refugee relations and the value of land | 181 |
| 7.4 | Arrival: Border tactics, getting paper, and contested mobility | 182 |
| 7.4.1 | Border tactics: Refugee or visitor? | 183 |
| 7.4.2 | Getting papers | 186 |
| 7.4.3 | Aid distribution, dynamics, and dilemmas: 'Those people with money can beg us for posho!' | 189 |
| 7.4.4 | Once in Uganda, people continue to move | 191 |
| 7.5 | Land allocation, resettlement, and the battle for permanence | 193 |
| 7.5.1 | Double allocations, the need to use land to claim it, and Good Samaritans | 196 |
| 7.5.2 | Informal land transactions | 198 |
| 7.5.3 | The battle for permanence: Building and bulldozing houses | 199 |
| 7.6 | Eating aid: the UNHCR and OPM corruption scandal | 202 |
| 7.6.1 | Corruption and fraud in the refugee response | 202 |
| 7.6.2 | The response: A biometric verification | 204 |
| 7.6.3 | Refugee perspectives on the corruption scandal and the verification | 205 |
| 7.7 | Conclusions: A hierarchy of place and displacement | 206 |
| 8 | DISPLACED TRADITIONAL AUTHORITY AND THE RECONSTRUCTION OF ORDER IN UGANDA (2016-2019) | 209 |
| 8.1 | Introduction | 209 |
| 8.2 | The second phase: 'Sitting around waiting to die' or 'looking for God's plan' | 211 |

| | | |
|---------|--|-----|
| 8.3 | Salatin ma fi: Why? | 215 |
| 8.3.1 | The remarkable absence of the chiefs | 215 |
| 8.3.2 | Dispute over drinking water, ethnic escalation, and resolution | 219 |
| 8.4 | Abundance of aspiring authorities in the settlements | 222 |
| 8.4.1 | Refugee Welfare Councils | 224 |
| 8.4.2 | Ethnic and regional community organizations, pursuing unity | 228 |
| 8.4.2.1 | Community organisations | 228 |
| 8.4.2.2 | Scattering and unity | 230 |
| 8.4.3 | Comparing the RWC, community organizations, and customary authorities | 234 |
| 8.4.4 | The politics of community: 'the battle for camp chairman' | 236 |
| 8.5 | Looking to the future: The enduring currency of tradition, the canvas of the past, and the Zande kingdom | 238 |
| 8.5.1 | The enduring currency of tradition: A future more like the past? | 239 |
| 8.5.2 | Debating the Zande kingdom, decentralisation, and belonging. | 242 |
| 8.5.2.1 | Zande voices favouring a kingdom | 242 |
| 8.5.2.2 | 'Going where you belong': Dissenting minorities and debates about belonging | 244 |
| 8.6 | Conclusions: The fertile soil of a burnt past | 246 |
| 9 | OVERCOMING RUPTURES: THE PURSUIT OF FUTURE | 251 |
| 9.1 | An ethnography of conflict, confusion, and the pursuit of continuity | 352 |
| 9.2 | Founding history | 253 |
| 9.3 | Returning to Western Equatoria, reconstructing past and future | 154 |
| 9.3.1 | Propelled governance ambitions: Returnees for a utopian future | 254 |
| 9.3.2 | Returnee chiefs, reconstructed traditions | 256 |
| 9.4 | 'It has started again': To stay or go? | 257 |
| 9.5 | Refugee settings | 258 |
| 9.5.1 | Despair, meaning, and continuity | 259 |
| 9.5.2 | Refugee authority | 260 |
| 9.6 | 'Scattering' and the reconstruction of identity, tradition, and futures | 261 |
| 9.7 | Future research | 265 |
| 9.8 | In closing | 267 |
| | SUMMARY | 269 |
| | SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY) | 275 |
| | BIBLIOGRAPHY | 281 |
| | ANNEX 1: FULL PORTRAITS | 313 |
| | ANNEX 2: POEM: IT HAS STARTED AGAIN | 343 |
| | ANNEX 3: METHODS AND MULTI-SITED DISPLACED ETHNOGRAPHY | 347 |
| | ANNEX 4: CUSTOMARY COURTS CASELOADS: METHODS AND FINDINGS | 365 |
| | CURRICULUM VITAE | 371 |

Abbreviations

| | |
|---------|--|
| ATA | Azande Traditional Association |
| BIMS | Biometric Information Management System |
| CAR | Central African Republic |
| CDTY | Catholic Diocese of Tombura-Yambio |
| CLA | County Land Authority |
| CPA | Comprehensive Peace Agreement |
| DRC | Democratic Republic of Congo |
| FAO | Food and Agriculture Organisation |
| GoSS | Government of South Sudan |
| IDP | Internally Displaced People |
| IOM | International Organisation for Migration |
| JPC | Justice and Peace Commission |
| LRA | Lord's Resistance Army |
| MAF | Missionary Aviation Foundation |
| MP | Member of Parliament |
| NGO | Non-Governmental Organisation |
| OIOS | Office of Internal Oversight Services |
| OPM | Office of the Prime Minister |
| RoSS | Republic of South Sudan |
| RRRC | Relief, Repatriation, and Rehabilitation Commission |
| RS | Refugee Settlement |
| RWC | Refugee Welfare Council |
| SAD | Sudan Archive Durham |
| SAF | Sudanese Armed Forces |
| SG | Secretary-General |
| SPLA | Sudan People's Liberation Army |
| SPLM | Sudan People's Liberation Movement |
| SPLM-IO | Sudan People's Liberation Movement-In Opposition |
| SSNLM | South Sudan National Liberation Movement |
| SSP | South Sudanese Pound |
| SSPDF | South Sudan People's Defence Forces |
| UGX | Ugandan Shilling |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| UNHCR | United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees |
| UNMIS | United Nations Mission in Sudan |
| UNMISS | United Nations Mission in South Sudan |
| UNOCHA | United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs |
| UPDF | Uganda People's Defence Force |
| USAID | United States Agency for International Development |

| | |
|-----|----------------------------|
| VTC | Vocational Training Centre |
| WES | Western Equatoria State |
| WFP | World Food Programme |

Illustrations

Figures

| | | |
|-------|---|---------|
| 1. | Colour Sergeant F. R. Boardman (Egyptian Army, Liverpool Regiment), pictured between 1900 and 1904 during a patrol against the Zande (the 'Nyam Nyam patrol') | 42 |
| 2. | Captain P. R. Wood pictured around 1900 with Maxim Battery and gun during the 'Niam Niam patrol' | 43 |
| 3. | Satellite photo of Yambio, Gangura, and Nabiapai | 100 |
| 4. | (S)election of traditional authorities | 116 |
| 5. | Aggregate customary court caseload | 127 |
| 6. | Estimated displaced and non-displaced populations in and outside South Sudan | 138 |
| 7. | Carling's aspiration-ability model | 151 |
| 8. | Conflict conjuncture and displacement pathways | 163 |
| 9. | Refugees in Uganda (2013-20) | 173 |
| 10. | UNHCR truck at the South Sudan – Uganda – DR Congo tripoint | 183 |
| 11. | Anonymized ration card | 187 |
| 12. | Interior of a single male refugee's house in Kiryandongo RS | 196 |
| 13. | Refugee house with 'permanent' materials in Kiryandongo RS | 200 |
| 14. | Painting by James: A triptych of war, flight and arrival | 212 |
| 15. | Slot machine in Rhino Camp refugee settlement | 214 |
| 16. | Painting by James: Dispute settlement in the refugee settlement | 223 |
| 17. | Painting by James: a future peaceful South Sudan | 239 |
| 18. | Painting by James: On his perspective on my research | 354 |
| 19. | Photo from Rift Valley Institute dissemination in Arua | 358 |
| 20a-e | Cases brought to five Western Equatorial customary courts | 366-367 |
| 21. | Aggregate customary court caseload | 368 |

Maps

| | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 1. | Western Equatoria State | 4 |
| 2. | Relevant areas of South Sudan, DR Congo, and Uganda | 6 |
| 3. | Refugees and Asylum-Seekers in Uganda, August 2020 | 175 |
| 4. | Kiryandongo, Bweyale, and Kiryandongo RS | 178 |
| 5. | Key sites in central and western part of Kiryandongo RS, January 2014 | 180 |
| 6. | Key sites in central and western part of Kiryandongo RS, December 2018 | 180 |

Tables

| | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 1. | History and ethnography of the Zande and Western Equatoria | 32 |
| 2. | Administrative units and levels of chieftaincy | 126 |
| 3. | South Sudan, estimated cereal surplus/deficit, 2015-9 | 146 |
| 4. | Lee's Theory on Migration | 148 |
| 5. | Uganda's refugee governance hierarchy | 176 |