



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Political ideas of B.G. Tilak: colonialism, self and Hindu nationalism
Oak, A.

Citation

Oak, A. (2022, April 12). *Political ideas of B.G. Tilak: colonialism, self and Hindu nationalism*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3283505>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3283505>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Political Ideas of B. G. Tilak:
Colonialism, Self and Hindu Nationalism

ALOK OAK

Political Ideas of B. G. Tilak: Colonialism, Self and Hindu Nationalism

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,

volgens besluit van het college voor promoties

te verdedigen op dinsdag 12 April 2022

klokke 10:00 uur

door

Alok Oak geboren te Mumbai, India

in 1989

Promotores:

Prof. dr. Pralay Kanungo

Prof. dr. Nira Wickramasinghe

Promotiecommissie:

Prof. dr. Henk te Velde

Prof. dr. Rosalind O'Hanlon (University of Oxford)

Prof. dr. Adriaan Bedner

Dr. Nicolas Blarel

Acknowledgements

I have incurred great many debts while writing this dissertation. I have benefitted from excellent and warm guidance from my two supervisors, Prof. dr. Pralay Kanungo and Prof. dr. Nira Wickramasinghe. Prof. Kanungo has been my constant pillar of strength and has supported me through all the ups and downs which most dissertations demand. I am most grateful to him. I would also like to extend my humble gratitude to the four Committee members who offered their helpful comments. Their keen insights were instrumental in refining my dissertation.

The idea for writing a dissertation on Tilak took shape during my post-graduate years spent at the Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi. I am most grateful to my teachers at the Centre for Political Studies, particularly to Prof. Gopal Guru who 'hooked' me onto Indian political theory and to Prof. Valerian Rodrigues who introduced me to Tilak's *Gītā Rahasya*. Over the years I have had the privilege of discussing my dissertation with Prof. Rodrigues on several occasions and have immensely benefitted from his comments, suggestions and insights.

I am grateful to a generous scholarship offered by the Erasmus Mundus Doctoral Training program and the Leiden University Fund which facilitated my sojourn at the South Asia Institute, University of Heidelberg. Prof. dr. Hans Harder took me under his wings and offered his utmost intellectual and personal generosity.

I have had the privilege of discussing my dissertation with many scholars spread across India and elsewhere. I am grateful to Rajeev Bhargava (CSDS), Manash Firaq Bhattacharjee, Rajarshi Dasgupta (JNU) and Makarand Paranjape (IIAS) at New Delhi; (late) S. M. Bhave, Rajeshwari Deshpande (SPPU), Ashok Chousalkar (Shivaji University) and Mrunal Patnekar at Pune. Kumar Ketkar and Bhalchandra Nemade in Mumbai and Jayant Lele (Queen's University) in Pune warmly invited me to their homes and spent many hours in debates and discussions. Janaki Bakhle (UC, Berkeley), Milinda Banerjee (University of St Andrews) and Anupama Rao (University of Columbia), were kind enough to meet me (virtually) on many occasions to discuss the dissertation. I sincerely thank all of them.

I thank my closest friends Yashraj Gandhi, Pawan Joglekar, Ajinkya Lele and Vinay Patil for their constant support and encouragement. Ajinkya and Yashraj have spent countless number of hours in brain-storming with me and have shaped my thesis in more ways than they could imagine. Hrushikesh Bapat, Raunak Deo and Akanksha Mansukhani have been my constant companions and a source of delight for many years. Numerous cafes dotting Pune are witness to our laughter and to our tears. I

thank them for their warm friendship. Special thanks to my colleague and friend Gayatri Chatterjee who was always ready to offer her guidance and wisdom when I was feeling particularly vulnerable.

I am grateful to the following institutions and their staff: Libraries at University of Leiden, University of Heidelberg; Indian Institute of Advanced Study (Shimla); the Central Library at Jawaharlal Nehru University and the National Archives (New Delhi); the Asiatic Society, Maharashtra State Archives, Mumbai Marathi Granth Sangrahalaya, and the library at Ruia College (Mumbai); Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Bharat Itihasa Sanshodhan Mandal, the Dhananjayrao Gadgil Library at Gokhale Institute of Politics and Economics, as well as libraries at the Deccan College, the Kesari-Wada, and Symbiosis School for Liberal Arts (Pune). I am particularly grateful to Ms. Bagaitwar and Ms. Smita Kadam, chief librarians at Bharat Itihasa Sanshodhan Mandal and SSLA respectively, for lending their unflinching support and patience.

While writing this dissertation I lost two people who were extremely dear to me. My grandmother-Vijaya Oak and my friend-philosopher-guide Swami Ananda Rishi (Keshav Hari Khare). Both of them had reached a ripe age. And yet their death, although expected, is in no way a consolation to the emptiness that they have left behind in my life. I would continue to cherish their fond memories.

My mother Shubhada Oak and my father Alhad Oak have sacrificed more than they can recount or willing to share. No words can describe the intensity of their love, pride and support. I thank them for all that they have given me and more. Four years ago, my family grew. My parent-in-laws Medha and Rajesh Behere, my brother-in-law Aditya and my grandmother-in-law (late) Pramila Behere, extended their love and support in all the possible ways. Their affection towards me is boundless.

Finally, the love of my life- Janhavi. She has literally lived and breathed this dissertation. She has spent innumerable days and nights discussing ideas and helping me flesh them out. She calmly faced my bouts of frustrations and anxieties and shared my excitement. But most of all, she makes it all worthwhile. As we embark on a new chapter of our lives, it is to her that I dedicate this dissertation.

Publication

Some sections of chapter 3 were previously published as:

Oak, Alok. "What Does the Shastra Have to Say? The Age of Consent Bill Controversy and the Reimagination of Hinduism in Modern Western India." In *Gender and Authority across Disciplines, Space and Time*. Edited by Adele Bardazzi and Alberica Bazzoni. Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020: 171-194.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	3
Publication.....	5
1. B. G. Tilak and Indian Political Thought	9
1.1 Introduction	9
1.2 Lokmanya Bal Gangadhar Tilak: Life and Legacy	12
1.3 Lokmanya Tilak: Liberal, Conservative and Nationalist Thinker	15
1.4 Thinking about Indian Political Thought: Nationalist, Vernacular and Communalist.....	23
1.5 Colonialism and an Indian ‘Self’	26
1.6 Community, Region and Nation.....	28
1.7 Sources, Methodology and Framework.....	32
2. Tilak, Kesari-Mahratta and the Birth of Indian National Congress: 1881-1891.....	38
2.1 Introduction	38
2.2 The Setting: Colonial Maharashtra during the 19th century.....	38
2.3 The Colonial state and Crisis in Western India: Agrarian Distress and Suppression of Vernacular Press, 1874-1880.....	42
2.4 Bombay Liberals’ Critique of the Colonial state: Naoroji, Ranade and Telang	43
2.5 <i>Kesari- Mahratta</i> and the Birth of Indian National Congress	47
2.6 Conclusion.....	51
3. Dharmaśāstra and Gender Reform in Maharashtra: The Socio-Religious Thought of Tilak.....	54
3.1 Gender Reform Over Caste Reform: Brahmin Intellectuals’ Ambiguity and Tilak’s Negligence.....	57
3.2 Dharmaśāstra and the Birth of Colonial Laws.....	61
3.3 Competing Sources of Authority: The Colonial state and the Dharmaśāstras	65
3.4 Gender and Colonial Laws: The ‘Widows’ Remarriage’ Controversy in Maharashtra (1870-73).....	67
3.5 Tilak and Gender Reform: The Early Years (1881-87)	69
3.6 Background to the Age of Consent Bill Controversy (1891): The Rakhmabai Case and Malabari’s Notes.....	72
3.7 The Hindu (Vedic) System of Marriage	74
3.8 The Intellectual Response to Colonialism and Hindu Religion: Aristocratic Liberal and Radical-Reformist.....	77
3.9 Tilak’s Response: Reform from Within the Hindu Community.....	82
3.10 Conclusion.....	87

4. Tilak and the Rise of Hindu Nationalism: Public Festivals and Mass Politics in Bombay Presidency, 1891-1899	90
4.1 The Communal Riots of 1893 in Bombay Presidency	92
4.2 Public Festivals and Hindu Mass Politics: Ganapati Utsav and Shivaji Jayanti.....	96
4.3 The Social Conference splits from the INC.....	100
4.4 Famine, Bubonic Plague and Tilak's First Seditious-Trial	102
4.5 Conclusion.....	109
5. History, Modern Indology and Nationalism: Tilak and the Search for Vedic Antiquity.....	111
5.1 Tilak's Indological Researches: Epistemological and Political Considerations.....	112
5.2 European Aryan race theory and its Reception in Maharashtra: The Pre-Tilak Phase.....	116
5.3 Dating Vedic Texts: Jyotiṣa as Historical Hermeneutics.....	123
5.4 In Search of a Homeland: Territorializing Supra-national Space	133
5.5 Responses to the 'Arctic Hypothesis'.....	139
5.6 Chaldean Vedas and Vedic Chronology	141
5.7 Conclusion.....	144
6. Tilak and the Swadeshi Movement: Extremist Challenge to Colonialism and Moderate Politics.....	145
6.1 Introduction	145
6.2 Rise of Congress-Extremists in Indian Nationalism.....	146
6.3 An Empire in Crisis: Curzon and the Partition of Bengal.....	147
6.4 Tilak and the Swadeshi Movement: Towards National Rejuvenation	152
6.5 Liberal or Radical Politics: Moderates and the Extremist Challenge (1905-08).....	158
6.7 Free Press and Democratic Dissent: Seditious Charges against Tilak.....	166
6.8 Conclusion.....	168
7. Religion for Political Action: Karma-yoga-śāstra in the <i>Bhagavad Gītā</i> ...	170
7.1 <i>Gītā Rahasya</i> : A Text on Philosophical Idealism or Political Normativity	173
7.2 <i>Bhagavad Gītā</i> and Moral Action: Tilak's Choice of the Text	176
7.3 <i>Gītā Rahasya</i> : A Short History of its Making	182
7.4 <i>Gītā Rahasya</i> : Methodological Considerations	184
7.5 Karma-yoga as Moral Action: <i>Gītā</i> 's Superiority over European Universal Ethics.....	186
7.6 Karma-Yoga: Pravṛtti and Nivṛtti.....	190
7.7 Karma-yoga for Lokasaṅgraha: Moral Theory for Mass Politics	193
7.8 The Sanātani Criticism of <i>Gītā Rahasya</i> : There is no Karmayoga!	197
7.9 The Liberal Defence of the <i>Gītā Rahasya</i> :	203

7.10 Conclusion:.....	206
8. Svarājya as Self-Government: Final Years of Tilak, 1914-1920	208
8.1 British Imperial Federation and India: ‘Greater Britain’ and Colonial Politics in Early 20th century	211
8.2 Conceptualizing Svarājya as Home-Rule: The Beginnings of the Home-Rule League.....	213
8.3 The Lucknow Pact or the Congress-League Scheme: Communal Representation and Self-government.....	219
8.4 Battle for Self-Government: The Montagu-Chelmsford Reforms and Constitutional Rearrangements.....	226
8.5 The British Labour Party and Efforts for International Mediation:.....	234
8.6 Cooperation, Responsive Cooperation and Non-Cooperation: Tilak’s Ambiguity towards the Khilafat Agitation	241
8.7 Conclusion: The Congress Democratic Party	244
Conclusion: Legacy of Lokmanya Tilak.....	248
Tilak and Gandhi: Passing the Baton.....	250
Tilak and Hindutva: A Case of Romanticised Misrepresentation?.....	251
Tilak and Social Democracy: An Unfinished Project	252
Bibliography	255
Primary Sources	255
Secondary Sources	265
Notes	
.....	296
Summary	314
Summary in Dutch.....	317
Propositions.....	320
Curriculum Vitae.....	322