



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Defaming the freedom of religion or belief: a historical and conceptual analysis of the United Nations

Schaik, B. van

Citation

Schaik, B. van. (2022, April 5). *Defaming the freedom of religion or belief: a historical and conceptual analysis of the United Nations*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3281796>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3281796>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Defaming the Freedom of Religion or Belief

A Historical and Conceptual Analysis of the United Nations

Belkis Mirjam van Schaik



Universiteit
Leiden

Defaming the Freedom of Religion or Belief

A Historical and Conceptual Analysis of the United Nations

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 5 april 2022
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Belkis van Schaik
geboren te Haarlem
in 1985

Promotor: prof. dr. P.B. Cliteur

Co-promotor: mr. dr. A.J. Kwak

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. A. Ellian

prof. dr. J.W. Sap, (Open Universiteit, Heerlen)

prof. dr. B.R. Rijpkema

mr. dr. G. Molier

dr. L. Tomoiaga (Technical University of Cluj-Napoca, Romania)

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
1 The History of Religious Freedom and Its Legal Framework.....	11
1.1 Introduction	11
1.2 The Pre-Twentieth Century Evolution of Religious Liberty	11
1.3 Ruffini's Historical Analysis.....	15
1.3.1 Juridical Religious Liberty.....	16
1.4 Religious Toleration	18
1.4.1 Tolerating Religious Differences.....	20
1.5 Believers and Beliefs	24
1.6 The Freedom of Thought and Conscience	25
1.7 Institutional Separation between Church and State	28
1.8 Freedom of Religion or Belief in UN Documents.....	29
1.9 Freedom of Religion or Belief in European Union Documents.....	33
1.10 Defining Religion and Belief.....	34
1.10.1 A Legal Definition of Religion and Belief.....	35
1.10.2 Concerns with Respect to Defining Religion or Belief.....	38
1.11 The Forum Internum and the Forum Externum	39
1.12 The Holistic Understanding.....	40
1.13 Conclusion.....	41
2 Freedom of Religion or Belief as a Universal Human Right	43
2.1 Introduction	43
2.2 The Call for Universal Human Rights.....	44
2.2.1 Roosevelt's Four Freedoms	45
2.2.2 Wells' Rights of Man Declaration	45
2.3 Plans for the Post-War World	47
2.3.1 The UN Charter.....	48
2.4 An International Bill of Human Rights.....	50
2.4.1 The Composition of the Drafting Committee	50
2.4.2 The Secretariat's Outline	54
2.4.3 Balancing Differences: a Draft Declaration.....	55
2.5 The Legal Conceptualisation of Religious Freedom	57
2.5.1 The Introduction of the Right to Apostasy	58
2.5.2 Every Individual.....	59

2.5.3	Deleting the Freedom of Thought?	61
2.6	The Third Committee: Questioning the Theoretical Underpinnings	62
2.6.1	The USSR Amendment: A Focus on the Freedom of Thought	63
2.6.2	The Saudi Arabian Amendment: Fear of Political Proselytism	64
2.6.3	A Plea for Atheism	66
2.6.4	Rejection of the Amendments	67
2.6.5	Islam as a Missionary Religion	67
2.6.6	The Final Vote	68
2.7	A Deity in the Universal Declaration	69
2.7.1	Acknowledging Religious Sentiment	70
2.7.2	Harmonising Religion and Politics	71
2.7.3	Fundamental Rights and Divine Authority	72
2.7.4	Religion as a Basis for Ethics	73
2.7.5	Man's Divine Origin in the Preamble	75
2.7.5.1	Ignoramus et Ignorabimus	77
2.8	Universalism in Article 18 UDHR	79
2.8.1	Textual Universalism	80
2.9	Criticising the Universal Declaration	81
2.9.1	A Cultural-Relativist View	81
2.9.2	Against Universal Moralism	82
2.9.3	Cultural and Ideological Critics	84
2.9.4	Human Rights as Fiction and Urges	86
2.9.5	The New Critics of Religious Freedom	87
2.10	Rethinking Cultural Relativism	89
2.10.1	A Common Denominator	90
2.10.2	Moral Infallibility	91
2.10.3	The Civilizational Perspective; the Consensus Approach	92
2.10.4	Rebutting Ethnocentrism: A Plurality of Voices	94
2.11	Conclusion	96
3	Freedom to Change Religion or Belief: a Right to Apostasy	99
3.1	Introduction	99
3.2	Apostasy at the UN	100
3.2.1	UN Reports: The Krishnaswami Study	103
3.2.2	The Odio Benito Report	104

3.2.3	General Comment 22.....	105
3.2.4	An implicit Recognition.....	105
3.3	Drafting Article 18 ICCPR	106
3.4	The Saudi Proposal: Delete ‘to Maintain or Change Religion’	108
3.4.1	An Implicit Reference to Apostasy	111
3.4.2	An Explicit Reference to Apostasy	111
3.4.3	Emphasising Religion.....	113
3.4.4	Freedom to Proselytise	115
3.4.5	The Freedom of Atheism	117
3.5	The Scope of Article 18 ICCPR: A Religious Connotation?	120
3.6	The Brazilian and Philippine Amendment: Religious Choice.....	121
3.6.1	Freedom to Have or to Adopt.....	123
3.6.1.1	A Spirit of Compromise.....	125
3.7	An Academic View.....	126
3.7.1	The Inclusive Stance	126
3.7.2	The Meaning of Choice	128
3.7.3	The Exclusive Stance	129
3.8	Diminishing the Normative Force.....	130
3.9	A Reconceptualisation of Article 18 ICCPR.....	131
3.10	Conclusion.....	132
4	Religious Freedom in a Global Context: The Concept of Religious Defamation.....	135
4.1	Introduction	135
4.2	The Organisation of Islamic Cooperation.....	135
4.3	Disputing Universality	136
4.3.1	The Ten-Year Programme of Action: A New Focus on Human Rights?	138
4.3.2	The 2008 Charter.....	139
4.4	The OIC’s motivations	140
4.4.1	The Image of Islam	140
4.4.2	A Blasphemous Novel	143
4.4.3	The Reprimands.....	143
4.5	The Introduction of Defamation of Religion	144
4.5.1	From Consensus to Majority Vote.....	146
4.5.2	The Expansion to the General Assembly	148
4.6	A Political Undermining.....	149

4.7	Resolution 16/18 Combatting Religious Intolerance	151
4.7.1	The Reactions to Resolution 16/18.....	153
4.7.2	The Aftermath Discussions: The Istanbul Process	153
4.8	A New Strategy	155
4.9	Conclusion.....	157
5	Realising the Freedom of Religion or Belief Equally: Blasphemy in the Netherlands.....	159
5.1	Introduction	159
5.2	The Legislative History of Blasphemy in the Netherlands.....	160
5.2.1	Van het Reve and God as a Donkey.....	161
5.2.2	Donner & Hirsch Ballin: Reviving the Law.....	163
5.3	Reasoning against Blasphemy.....	165
5.3.1	A <i>Status Aparte</i> for Believers.....	165
5.3.2	Protecting the Public Order	167
5.4	Legislative Initiatives during the Abolition.....	168
5.4.1	Directly Discriminatory?.....	169
5.5	A European Perspective on Blasphemy.....	172
5.6	Conclusion.....	173
	Conclusion.....	175
	Bibliography	183
	Case Law	206
	UN Documents	207
	Summary	213
	Samenvatting.....	215
	Curriculum Vitae	217

United Nations Reference System

A/	General Assembly
A/PV.	General Assembly, Plenary, Verbatim Record
A/C.3/	General Assembly, Third Committee
E/	Economic and Social Council
E/CN.4/	Commission on Human Rights
E/CN.4/AC.1	Commission on Human Rights, Drafting Committee 1947-1948
E/CN.4/AC.2	Commission on Human Rights, Working group on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1947-1947
E/CN.4/Sub. I	Sub-Commission on Freedom of Information and of the Press
E/CN.4/Sub. II	Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities
E/AC.7/	Economic and Social Council. Social Committee 1947-1977. Title changed in 1978 to Second Committee; symbol changed to E/(year)/C2/
S/	Security Council
T/	Trustee Council
SR.	Summary Record (minutes of meeting)
	* This can be the meetings of the Commission on Human Rights itself, in which case a document is referred to as 'E/CN.4/SR.*' The * being the number of the meeting.
	* When the meetings are those of the Drafting Committee set up by the Commission 'AC.1' is inserted, as in 'E/CN.4/AC.1/SR.*'.
	* When the meetings are those of the Working Group set up by the Second Session of the Commission 'AC.2' is inserted.
	* 'W' refers to a working paper distributed by Humphrey's Human Rights Division.
L.	Limited (distribution)

