



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Flexing the slot regime: airport slot coordination in light of evolving market realities: a regulatory perspective

Houten, L.M. van

Citation

Houten, L. M. van. (2021, December 16). *Flexing the slot regime: airport slot coordination in light of evolving market realities: a regulatory perspective*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3247125>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3247125>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

FLEXING THE SLOT REGIME

Airport Slot Coordination In Light Of Evolving Market Realities: A Regulatory
Perspective



Universiteit
Leiden

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 16 december 2021
klokke 16.15 uur

door
Lisanne Marloes van Houten
geboren te Houten, Nederland
in 1992

Promotores: prof. dr. P.M.J. Mendes de Leon
 prof. L. Pierallini (LUISS University of Rome, Italy)

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. S.J. Truxal
 prof. dr. R. Dettling-Ott (University of Bern, Switzerland)
 prof. dr. V. Correia (University of Paris-Saclay, France)
 dr. G. Burghouwt (University of Bergamo, Italy)

Perseverance will get you anywhere.
NASA's Perseverance Mars Rover, 18 February 2021
3:55 pm EST landing on Mars

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are many people whom I would like to thank for their contributions, both directly and indirectly, to this dissertation. First and foremost, profound thanks go out to my supervisor Prof. Dr. Pablo Mendes de Leon for convincing me to undertake the PhD journey and for always standing by my side, both academically and personally. I am also hugely thankful for the everlasting and hands-on support provided by my co-supervisor Prof. Laura Pierallini.

Moreover, I would like to thank the entire staff of the International Institute of Air and Space Law, with special reference to Natascha Meewisse and Hilkje Wijnmaalen for their assistance in navigating the procedural aspects of writing the PhD and for always surrounding everyone with invaluable kindness. Also, to my fellow PhD candidate and dear friend Niall Buissing for always being there to listen to my many considerations.

I am also beyond thankful for all the great people I have had the pleasure to work with across the air transport industry in the past years, and particularly my Royal Schiphol Group family. With special reference to Martijn van der Meer and Richard Emmerink for encouraging me to embark on the academic journey and for facilitating the time and resources needed to swiftly bring it to an end. To Anne Hustinx, Dick Benschop and Birgit Otto for your leadership by example. To Guillaume Burghouwt, Martijn Rijke, Wilco Sweijen, Kevin Haagen, Michael Arntzen and Matthijs Lamberts for your contributions, both content-wise and on a personal level. You have all made it easy for each day to be an enjoyable one and always made sure I was filled with enough uplifting spirits to complete the PhD alongside my professional work.

There are also many people whose contributions I would like to acknowledge as they helped sharpen my thoughts, either by entering into direct conversations with me or by way of the many discussions we shared, whilst noting that the people mentioned may not necessarily share the views expressed in this dissertation. In particular, I would like to thank Jeroen Mauritz, Ozgur Ulutas, Elisabet Molenaar, Aurora Viergever, Roel Martens, Erik van Goor, Melchior Looijen, João Pita, Philippe Villard, Aidan Flanagan, Morgan Foulkes, Matt Cornelius, Hugo Thomassen, Bart van der Elst, Danny Verwer, Irene Gracia Lacarra, Gunter Heinrich, Alyson Playford, Robert Drew-Planning and Robert Whitehouse.

On a personal level, multiple life events coincided with my PhD journey. From the outbreak of the coronavirus pandemic early 2020 which left large parts of the world quarantined, a switch in my professional life from Royal Schiphol Group to joining law firm Allen & Overy fueled by the contagious enthusiasm of Pieter Huizing, and most importantly: the wonderful prospect of becoming a mother to my first child, ETA 20 January 2022, to keep within aviation terminology. It led me to live life according to the following motto: Perseverance will get you anywhere. With credentials to NASA's Perseverance Mars Rover for the inspiration.

I am immensely grateful to my multi-talented friends and paranympths, Lisa Engberts and Hêlin Okcuoglu, for sharing this journey and all its related elements with me and providing support on many levels. To my parents for being kind, loving people with the greatest hearts and who led the way to always aim higher, with health and happiness being the number one priority.

And finally, to my partner in life Bob, for being there, always, infinitely and unconditionally. Together with our furry friend Skye, everyday spent with you is a happy day. You will be the best dad to our daughter and I can't wait to start our new chapter in life as parents.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	5
TABLE OF CONTENTS	7
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	11
1 CHAPTER ONE.....	13
INTRODUCTION	13
1.1 MOMENTOUS DEVELOPMENTS RELEVANT TO SLOT COORDINATION FROM 1944 ONWARDS	13
1.2 SLOTS AS A MULTIFUNCTIONAL CONCEPT	16
1.2.1 Preliminary remarks on slots as a multifunctional concept.....	16
1.2.2 Slots as remedial commitments to alleviate competition concerns.....	16
1.2.3 Slots as safeguards for market access.....	17
1.2.4 Slots as collateral in insolvency and bankruptcy cases.....	17
1.2.5 Slots as instruments to attain policy objectives.....	18
1.2.6 Conclusions as to slots as a multifunctional concept.....	18
1.3 RESEARCH FOCUS, AIMS AND OBJECTIVES	19
1.4 DISSERTATION STRUCTURE, METHODOLOGY AND LIMITATIONS	23
2 CHAPTER TWO	27
THE CONNOTATION OF AIRPORT SLOTS IN CONTEMPORARY AIR TRANSPORT	27
2.1 THE CONCEPT AND OBJECTIVES OF SLOT COORDINATION.....	27
2.1.1 The definition of an airport slot in light of the arrangement of this dissertation	27
2.1.2 The inextricable link between airport slots and airport infrastructure	28
2.1.3 General and specific objectives of slot coordination	29
2.1.4 Concluding remarks.....	30
2.2 BASIC NOTIONS AND PRINCIPLES OF THE COORDINATION PROCESS.....	31
2.2.1 Airport levels and the designation of an airport as ‘slot coordinated’	31
2.2.2 The supply-side of slot coordination: capacity declaration.....	32
2.2.3 The demand-side of slot coordination: allocation process	34
2.2.4 Slot monitoring and slot enforcement.....	37
2.2.5 Concluding remarks.....	38
2.3 RENEWED IMPORTANCE OF AIRPORT SLOTS IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY	38
2.3.1 The impact of deregulation and liberalization on slot availability	38
2.3.2 The apparent mismatch between the functions of slot coordination and market conditions anno 2021.....	40
2.3.3 Airport planning and the promotion of environmental protection	42
2.3.4 Concluding remarks.....	45
2.4 THE DEEPENING OF THE ‘AIRPORT CAPACITY CRUNCH’	46
2.4.1 Growth trends exacerbating slot scarcity: facts and figures.....	46
2.4.2 The emergence of super-congested airports.....	47
2.4.3 Impacts of growing excess demand at super-congested airports on competition, connectivity and airport operations	48
2.4.4 Concluding remarks.....	49
2.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS	50
3 CHAPTER THREE.....	53
THE GLOBAL REGIME FOR ACCESS TO AIRPORTS.....	53
3.1 THE CHICAGO CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL CIVIL AVIATION OF 1944 AS THE MAGNA CARTA OF INTERNATIONAL AIR TRANSPORT	53
3.1.1 Preliminary remarks on the Chicago Convention of 1944	53
3.1.2 ICAO’s Aims and Objectives.....	54

3.1.3	<i>Principal components of the ‘Chicago Convention’ regime</i>	55
3.1.4	<i>Basic concepts of the ‘Chicago Convention’ regime relevant to slot coordination.....</i>	58
3.1.5	<i>An application of the national treatment and non-discrimination principle to slot coordination</i>	62
3.1.6	<i>The national treatment principle vis-à-vis the WTO’s Most Favored Nation clause</i>	63
3.1.7	<i>Policy guidance on slot coordination, as developed by ICAO</i>	64
3.1.8	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	67
3.2	TRAFFIC RIGHTS AT THE HEART OF THE BILATERAL REGIME.....	68
3.2.1	<i>Application and practice of Articles 5 and 6 of the Convention.....</i>	68
3.2.2	<i>The shift from bilateralism to liberal and plurilateral ‘Open Skies’ agreements</i>	70
3.2.3	<i>ICAO’s model clause on slots from the perspective of equality of opportunity</i>	72
3.2.4	<i>Slot provisions in specific ASAs.....</i>	73
3.2.5	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	75
3.3	SLOTS AND TRAFFIC RIGHTS: AN INTERTWINED CONCEPT?.....	76
3.3.1	<i>The formulation and practice of Article 15 of the Convention.....</i>	76
3.3.2	<i>The operational link between traffic rights and slots in the EU.....</i>	77
3.3.3	<i>The US approach to slots in relation to traffic rights.....</i>	77
3.3.4	<i>Inter-State disagreements on the matter of slots and traffic rights</i>	78
3.3.5	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	81
3.4	WASG AS DE FACTO AND DE IURE REFERENCE DOCUMENT FOR SLOT COORDINATION	82
3.4.1	<i>The legal status and global influence of the Worldwide Airport Slot Guidelines.....</i>	82
3.4.2	<i>The governance structure of the WASG pre- and post-2020.....</i>	83
3.4.3	<i>The roles and functions of IATA, ACI and WWACG</i>	83
3.4.4	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	85
3.5	CONCLUDING REMARKS	86
4	CHAPTER FOUR.....	89
	SLOT COORDINATION IN SELECTED JURISDICTIONS	89
4.1	OBJECTIVES AND APPLICATION OF EU REGULATION 95/93, AS VARIOUSLY AMENDED	89
4.1.1	<i>The specific background and raison d’être of the EU regime on slot coordination</i>	89
4.1.2	<i>The legal basis and application of EU Regulation 95/93</i>	90
4.1.3	<i>Aims and objectives of EU Regulation 95/93</i>	92
4.1.4	<i>The legislative history of EU Regulation 95/93 and perspectives for reform</i>	92
4.1.5	<i>The use and application of the non-discrimination principle ‘in general’ under EU Regulation 95/93</i>	95
4.1.6	<i>Case law referring to EU Regulation 95/93, as amended</i>	97
4.1.7	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	98
4.2	A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THE FORMULATION AND PRACTICE OF WASG PRINCIPLES VIS-À-VIS EU REGULATION 95/93	98
4.2.1	<i>Preliminary remarks</i>	98
4.2.2	<i>Exemplification of legal status</i>	99
4.2.3	<i>Level of detail of substantive provisions</i>	99
4.2.4	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	104
4.3	THE ADOPTION OF LOCAL GUIDELINES AND LOCAL PROCEDURES UNDER EU REGULATION 95/93	104
4.3.1	<i>Preliminary remarks</i>	104
4.3.2	<i>The distinction between local guidelines and local procedures</i>	104
4.3.3	<i>The application of local guidelines and local procedures.....</i>	105
4.3.4	<i>Conclusions as to the effective influence of local guidelines and local procedures on allocation decisions.....</i>	109
4.3.5	<i>An analysis of national measures in the context of the principles of supremacy, pre-emption and subsidiarity.....</i>	109
4.3.6	<i>Concluding remarks.....</i>	113
4.4	EU REGULATION 1008/2008, GOVERNING THE OPERATION OF INTRA-EU AIR SERVICES	113
4.4.1	<i>Legal basis and key principles of EU Regulation 1008/2008 relevant for slot coordination</i>	113
4.4.2	<i>The rationale for and the application of Traffic Distribution Rules</i>	114

4.4.3	<i>Requirements related to the public interest, proportionality and transparency applied to Traffic Distribution Rules</i>	115
4.4.4	<i>The imposition of Public Service Obligations</i>	121
4.4.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	123
4.5	CAPACITY MANAGEMENT WITHOUT EX ANTE SLOT COORDINATION IN THE US	123
4.5.1	<i>The first-come, first-served approach in the US</i>	123
4.5.2	<i>Exemptions to the first-come, first-served approach</i>	124
4.5.3	<i>The High-Density Rule of 1968 and the Air 21 Act of 2000</i>	125
4.5.4	<i>The use of market mechanisms for slot coordination</i>	127
4.5.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	128
4.6	THE COORDINATION OF SLOTS IN OTHER REGIONS OF THE WORLD	129
4.6.1	<i>Preliminary remarks on slot coordination in other world regions</i>	129
4.6.2	<i>Slot coordination at a selection of super-congested airports</i>	129
4.6.3	<i>Slot coordination at the Chinese hub airports of Beijing, Shanghai and Guangzhou</i>	132
4.6.4	<i>Slot coordination at Sydney Kingsford Smith Airport</i>	134
4.6.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	137
4.7	CONCLUDING REMARKS	138
5	CHAPTER FIVE	139
	SLOTS AS A CONCEPTUAL INSTRUMENT	139
5.1	PRELIMINARY REMARKS ON SLOTS AS A CONCEPTUAL INSTRUMENT	139
5.2	THE LEX LACUNAE WITH REGARD TO SLOT OWNERSHIP: GRANDFATHER RIGHTS IN THE CONTEXT OF PROPERTY LAW	139
5.2.1	<i>Why it is important to clarify who holds the legal title to a slot</i>	139
5.2.2	<i>Claims as to the legal title to a slot</i>	141
5.2.3	<i>Perspectives on slot ownership in the EU, the UK and the US</i>	142
5.2.4	<i>Grandfather rights and property law: de iure grounds for intervention with historic slots and protection thereto</i>	145
5.2.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	149
5.3	THE ROLE AND VALUATION OF SLOTS IN FINANCIAL PROCEEDINGS	150
5.3.1	<i>Preliminary remarks</i>	150
5.3.2	<i>Guidance provided by paragraphs 8.14 and 8.15 of the WASG</i>	151
5.3.3	<i>Case law and slot questions pertaining to bankruptcy proceedings</i>	153
5.3.4	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	155
5.4	THE ROLE OF THE FINANCIALLY AND FUNCTIONALLY INDEPENDENT SLOT COORDINATOR AND ITS DISCRETIONARY POWERS	156
5.4.1	<i>The coordinator's main tasks</i>	156
5.4.2	<i>De facto financial and functional independence of the coordinator</i>	157
5.4.3	<i>The discretion of the coordinator in allocation decisions</i>	158
5.4.4	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	159
5.5	THE NEW ENTRANT RULE: FIT FOR PURPOSE?	160
5.5.1	<i>The background of the new entrant rule</i>	160
5.5.2	<i>Shortcomings of the new entrant rule</i>	160
5.5.3	<i>Deliberations as to a broadening of the new entrant qualification</i>	162
5.5.4	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	163
5.6	SECONDARY SLOT TRADING AND SLOT LEASING AS A MEANS TO INCREASE SLOT MOBILITY: MULTIPLE SHADES OF GREY	163
5.6.1	<i>The terminology and economic theory behind secondary slot trading</i>	163
5.6.2	<i>The practice of slot babysitting</i>	165
5.6.3	<i>The legality and practice of secondary slot trading and slot leasing</i>	166
5.6.4	<i>Considerations for the implementation of secondary slot trading and slot leasing in a future slot regime from an airport access perspective</i>	169
5.6.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	170
5.7	THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SLOT ALLOCATION AND COMPETITION LAW IN THE EU	171
5.7.1	<i>Competition law provisions relevant to slot allocation</i>	171
5.7.2	<i>The applicability of Articles 101 and 102 TFEU to the allocation of slots</i>	172

5.7.3	<i>An assessment of large slot portfolios from the perspective of Article 102 TFEU</i>	173
5.7.4	<i>Slot commitments to alleviate competitive concerns in the EU</i>	174
5.7.5	<i>Competitive assessments of slot concentration at airport level vs. route level</i>	177
5.7.6	<i>Slots in the context of the ‘essential facilities’ doctrine</i>	180
5.7.7	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	181
5.8	CONCLUDING REMARKS	182
6	CHAPTER SIX	185
	GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	185
6.1	STRUCTURE OF THIS CHAPTER	185
6.1.1	<i>The principal research questions</i>	185
6.1.2	<i>Overview of the main findings</i>	186
6.1.3	<i>The need for a flexing of the slot regime</i>	188
6.2	GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AS TO FLEXING THE SLOT REGIME BASED ON THE GLOBAL REGIME FOR SLOT COORDINATION	190
6.2.1	<i>The Chicago Convention (1944)</i>	190
6.2.2	<i>ICAO guidance on slot coordination</i>	190
6.2.3	<i>Provisions of the Worldwide Airport Slot Guidelines</i>	190
6.2.4	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	191
6.3	GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AS TO FLEXING OF SLOT REGIME BASED ON THE SPECIFIC REGIMES FOR SLOT COORDINATION	192
6.3.1	<i>The application and implementation of the global slot regime in domestic jurisdictions</i>	192
6.3.2	<i>Slot coordination in the EU</i>	192
6.3.3	<i>Slot coordination in the US</i>	193
6.3.4	<i>Slot coordination in the selected jurisdictions of China, Mexico and Australia</i>	193
6.3.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	193
6.4	RECOMMENDATIONS	194
6.4.1	<i>Preliminary remarks</i>	194
6.4.2	<i>Recommendations as to an optimal declaration, allocation and use of slots as prime objective of slot coordination</i>	194
6.4.3	<i>Recommendations as to enhancing the use of existing capacity</i>	195
6.4.4	<i>Recommendations as to the inclusion of airport-specific strategic objectives in the allocation and use of slots</i>	196
6.4.5	<i>Recommendations as to measures to ease airport access</i>	197
6.4.6	<i>Recommendations as to the role of States vis-à-vis the role of the slot coordinator and air transport industry stakeholders in a ‘flexed’ slot regime</i>	198
6.4.7	<i>General recommendations</i>	199
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	201
	SUMMARY	221
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	225
	CURRICULUM VITAE	231

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACI	Airports Council International
ACL	Airport Coordination Limited
ACNL	Airport Coordination Netherlands
AOC	Air Operator Certificate
Art	Article
ASA	Air Services Agreement
AT	Air Transport
ATAA	Air Transport Association of America
ATC	Air Traffic Control
ATConf	Worldwide Air Transport Conference
CAA	Civil Aviation Authority
CAAC	Civil Aviation Administration of China
CEANS	Conference on the Economics of Airports and Air Navigation Services
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
COFECE	<i>Comisión Federal de Competencia Económica</i> (Mexico's Federal Economic Competition Commission)
COD	Ordinary legislative procedure
COM	European Commission
COMP	Competition
DG	Directorate-General
Doc	Document
DoT	Department of Transport
DUB	Dublin Airport
EC	European Community
ECA	European Competition Authorities
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECLI	European Case Law Identifier
edn	Edition
eds	Editors
EEC	European Economic Community
ENAC	<i>Ente Nazionale per l'Aviazione Civile</i> (Italian Civil Aviation Authority)
EU	European Union
EUACA	European Airport Coordinators Association
FAA	Federal Aviation Administration
FLUKO	<i>Flughafenkoordination Deutschland</i> (Airport Coordination Germany)
F.R.	Federal Regulations
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GBP	Great British Pound
GORMICA	General Operational Rules of Mexico City Benito Juárez Airport
HDR	High-Density Rule
IAG	International Airlines Group
IASTA	International Air Services Transit Agreement
IATA	International Air Transport Association
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organization
ICJ	International Court of Justice
I.L.M.	International Legal Materials

IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
KLM	<i>Koninklijke Luchtvaart Maatschappij</i> (Royal Dutch Airlines)
LCC	Low-Cost Carrier
LGW	London Gatwick Airport
LHR	London Heathrow Airport
LLP	Limited Liability Partnership
LOT	<i>Polskie Linie Lotnicze</i> (Polish Airlines)
Ltd	Limited
MFN	Most-Favored Nation
NERA	National Economic Research Associates
NEXTOR	National Center of Excellence for Aviation Operations Research
No	Number
O&D	Origin and Destination
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OFT	Office of Fair Trading
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union
PANS	Procedures for Air Navigation Services
P.L.	Public Law
Plc	Public Limited Company
PRSS	Permanent Regional Service Series
PSO	Public Service Obligation
SARPs	Standards and Recommended Practices
SAS	Scandinavian Airline System
S.D.N.Y.	Southern District of New York
SEO	<i>Stichting voor Economisch Onderzoek der Universiteit van Amsterdam</i> (Research Institute of the Economics and Business at the University of Amsterdam)
Stat	Statutory Law
Supp	Supplement
SWD	Staff Working Document
TAP	<i>Transportes Aéreos Portugueses</i> (Portuguese Air Transportations)
TDR	Traffic Distribution Rule
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
T.I.A.S.	Treaties and Other International Act Series
UK	United Kingdom
U.K.T.S.	United Kingdom Treaty Series
UN	United Nations
U.N.T.S.	United Nations Treaty Series
US	United States
U.S.C.	United States Code
USD	United States Dollar
WASB	Worldwide Airport Slot Board
WASG	Worldwide Airport Slot Guidelines
WSG	Worldwide Slot Guidelines
WTO	World Trade Organization
WWACG	World Wide Airport Coordinators Group