



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **The role of the United Nations General Assembly in advancing accountability for atrocity crimes: legal powers and effects**

Ramsden, M.P.

### **Citation**

Ramsden, M. P. (2021, October 20). *The role of the United Nations General Assembly in advancing accountability for atrocity crimes: legal powers and effects*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3217818>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3217818>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

THE ROLE OF THE  
UNITED NATIONS GENERAL ASSEMBLY IN  
ADVANCING ACCOUNTABILITY FOR ATROCITY  
CRIMES:  
LEGAL POWERS AND EFFECTS

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van rector magnificus prof.dr.ir. H. Bijl,

volgens besluit van het college voor promoties

te verdedigen op woensdag 20 oktober 2021

klokke 15.00 uur

door

Michael Phillip Ramsden

geboren te Liverpool, United Kingdom

Promotor: Prof. dr. N.M. Blokker

Copromotor: Dr. S.V. Vasiliev (University of Amsterdam)

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. C. Stahn  
Dr. G. Pinzauti  
Dr. C.M. Brölmann (University of Amsterdam)  
Prof. dr. G.K. Sluiter (University of Amsterdam)  
Prof. dr. N.D. White (University of Nottingham, UK)

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank a number of individuals who have contributed to this research in a variety of ways.

Above all, I express immense gratitude to my supervisors, Prof. dr. Niels Blokker and Dr Sergey Vasiliev, for their advice, direction and wisdom throughout the research process. Without their invaluable guidance this dissertation simply would not have been possible.

I warmly thank the members of the Doctorate Committee for giving their time so generously to evaluate my dissertation: Dr. Catherine Brölmann, Dr. Giulia Pinzauti, Prof. dr. Göran Sluiter, Prof. dr. Carsten Stahn and Prof. dr. Nigel White.

I am particularly grateful to several practitioners and scholars who directly or indirectly shaped my ideas through their work or discussions: Dr. Baron Serge Brammertz, Professor Gregory Gordon, Professor Nina Jørgensen, Dr. Tom Hamilton and Dr. Daley Birkett.

I completed this dissertation as an external PhD candidate of Leiden Law School, alongside my role as an academic in the Faculty of Law at The Chinese University of Hong Kong. Thanks are due to all at CUHK LAW for their unending support!

*Michael Ramsden  
Hong Kong, September 2021*

|                                                                                                                   |    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS                                                                                             | 9  |
| CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION                                                                                           | 10 |
| 1. Introduction to the Research                                                                                   | 10 |
| 2. Exercise of General Assembly Functions in Advancing Accountability for Atrocity Crimes:<br>Literature Overview | 11 |
| 2.1 ‘Quasi-Legislative’                                                                                           | 11 |
| 2.2 ‘Quasi-Judicial’                                                                                              | 13 |
| 2.3 ‘Recommendatory’                                                                                              | 15 |
| 2.4 ‘Empowering’                                                                                                  | 18 |
| 2.5 ‘Sanctioning’                                                                                                 | 19 |
| 3. Research Goals and Approaches                                                                                  | 21 |
| 4. Structure of the Dissertation                                                                                  | 26 |
| CHAPTER 2: THE ‘QUASI-LEGISLATIVE’ INFLUENCE OF LANDMARK GENERAL<br>ASSEMBLY RESOLUTIONS IN INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE | 28 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                                                   | 28 |
| 2. Resolution 95 (I) (1946): Affirmation of the Nuremberg Principles                                              | 30 |
| 3. Resolution 96 (I) (1946) Affirmation of the Crime of Genocide                                                  | 33 |
| 4. Resolution 217 (III) (1948): Universal Declaration of Human Rights                                             | 35 |
| 5. Resolutions 2444 (XXIII) (1968) and 2675 (XXV) (1970): Protection of Civilians in<br>Armed Conflict            | 40 |
| 6. Resolution 3074 (XXVIII) (1973): Cooperation Principles                                                        | 42 |
| 7. Resolution 3314 (XXIX) (1974): Definition of Aggression                                                        | 44 |
| 8. Resolution 3452 (XXX) (1975): Torture Declaration                                                              | 48 |
| 9. Resolution 47/133 (1992): Enforced Disappearance Declaration                                                   | 50 |
| 11. Resolution 60/147 (2005): Reparation Principles                                                               | 55 |
| 12. Conclusion                                                                                                    | 58 |
| CHAPTER 3: RELATION OF GENERAL ASSEMBLY RESOLUTIONS TO<br>INTERNATIONAL LAW                                       | 60 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                                                   | 60 |
| 2. Influence: Exhortatory Resolutions                                                                             | 61 |
| 3. Influences: Interpretation of Treaties                                                                         | 62 |

|                                                                                                                |         |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 3.1 Interpretive Resolutions: UN Charter                                                                       | 62      |
| 3.2 Interpretive Resolutions: Other Treaties                                                                   | 72      |
| 4. Influences: Identification and Formation of Customary International Law                                     | 74      |
| 4.1 Forms of Contribution to Customary International Law                                                       | 75      |
| 4.2 Contribution of Assembly resolutions to State Practice and <i>Opinio Juris</i>                             | 76      |
| 4.3 Customary Method in International Justice                                                                  | 80      |
| 5. Conclusion                                                                                                  | 83      |
| <br>CHAPTER 4: THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY AS A ‘QUASI-JUDICIAL’ ACTOR IN<br>ADVANCING ATROCITY CRIMES ACCOUNTABILITY | <br>85  |
| 1. Introduction                                                                                                | 85      |
| 2. Legal Foundations for Quasi-Judicial Powers                                                                 | 87      |
| 2.1 The Assembly as a Quasi-Judicial Actor: Legal Basis                                                        | 87      |
| 2.2 Limits Imposed by Article 2(7) of the UN Charter                                                           | 91      |
| 2.3 Compatibility with Standards of Procedural Fairness                                                        | 93      |
| 3. Quasi-Judicial Practice: Criminal Responsibility                                                            | 95      |
| 3.1 Genocide                                                                                                   | 96      |
| 3.2 Crimes Against Humanity                                                                                    | 102     |
| 3.3 War Crimes                                                                                                 | 105     |
| 3.4 Aggression                                                                                                 | 108     |
| 4. Quasi-Judicial Practice: State Responsibility                                                               | 111     |
| 4.1 Gross Human Rights Violations                                                                              | 111     |
| 4.2 Violations of the UN Charter                                                                               | 114     |
| 5. Quasi-Judicial Practice: ‘Recognition’ in International Affairs                                             | 117     |
| 6. Conclusion                                                                                                  | 120     |
| <br>CHAPTER 5: GENERAL ASSEMBLY RECOMMENDATIONS TO PROMOTE<br>ACCOUNTABILITY FOR ATROCITY CRIMES               | <br>123 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                                                | 123     |
| 2. Practice of Recommendations to Member States                                                                | 125     |
| 2.1 Investigate and Prosecute                                                                                  | 125     |
| 2.2 Cooperate                                                                                                  | 127     |
| 2.3 Explain or Account                                                                                         | 131     |
| 2.4 Reparations                                                                                                | 132     |
| 2.5 Effectiveness of Recommendations to Member States                                                          | 134     |
| 3. Recommendations to the Security Council                                                                     | 136     |
| 4. ‘Recommendations’ to Member States: A Minimum Legal Requirement?                                            | 138     |
| 4.1 Consider and Explain                                                                                       | 139     |
| 4.2 Cooperate                                                                                                  | 140     |

|                                                                                 |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 4.3 Legal Significance of Reference to Pre-Existing Obligations                 | 141 |
| 5. Conclusion                                                                   | 143 |
| CHAPTER 6: GENERAL ASSEMBLY EMPOWERMENT OF INQUIRIES AND COURTS                 | 145 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                 | 145 |
| 2. Commissions of Inquiry                                                       | 146 |
| 2.1 Legal Foundation of Assembly-established Commissions of Inquiry             | 146 |
| 2.2 Duty to Cooperate with Assembly-established Commissions of Inquiry          | 149 |
| 2.3 Context of Establishing Commissions of Inquiry                              | 151 |
| 3. Triggering the ICJ's Advisory Jurisdiction                                   | 153 |
| 4. Assembly Power to Establish an <i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunal                        | 157 |
| 5. Conclusion                                                                   | 165 |
| CHAPTER 7: THE POTENTIAL ROLE OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY IN COORDINATING SANCTIONS | 167 |
| 1. Introduction                                                                 | 167 |
| 2. Resolutions as constituting a 'fundamental change of circumstances'          | 170 |
| 3. Assembly Resolutions as Supporting Countermeasures                           | 172 |
| 4. Non-Recognition of Peremptory Norm Violations                                | 173 |
| 5. Sanctions Authorised within the Framework of the UN Charter                  | 176 |
| 6. Conclusion                                                                   | 183 |
| CHAPTER 8: CONCLUSION                                                           | 185 |
| SUMMARY                                                                         | 193 |
| SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)                                                 | 195 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY                                                                    | 198 |
| CURRICULUM VITAE                                                                | 230 |

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

|                                                                            |             |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| African Union                                                              | AU          |
| American Convention on Human Rights                                        | ACHR        |
| Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts | ARSIWA      |
| Control Council Law 10                                                     | CCL10       |
| Democratic People's Republic of Korea                                      | DPRK        |
| Democratic Republic of the Congo                                           | DRC         |
| European Court of Human Rights                                             | ECtHR       |
| European Union                                                             | EU          |
| Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia                           | ECCC        |
| Inter-American Convention on Forced Disappearance of Persons               | IACFDR      |
| Inter-American Court of Human Rights                                       | IACtHR      |
| International Committee of the Red Cross                                   | ICRC        |
| International Court of Justice                                             | ICJ         |
| International Criminal Court                                               | ICC         |
| International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia                  | ICTY        |
| International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda                                 | ICTR        |
| International, Impartial and Independent Mechanism for Syria               | IIIM-Syria  |
| International Law Commission                                               | ILC         |
| International Whaling Commission                                           | IWC         |
| Islamic State of Iraq and Syria                                            | ISIS        |
| Malaysia Airlines Flight 17                                                | MH17        |
| People's Republic of China                                                 | PRC         |
| Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court                           | ICC Statute |
| Special Court for Sierra Leone                                             | SCSL        |
| Special Tribunal for Lebanon                                               | STL         |
| United Kingdom                                                             | UK          |
| Union of Soviet Socialist Republics                                        | USSR        |
| United States                                                              | US          |
| Universal Declaration of Human Rights                                      | UDHR        |
| United Nations                                                             | UN          |
| United Nations Administrative Tribunal                                     | UNAT        |
| United Nations Human Rights Council                                        | UNHRC       |
| Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties                                   | VCLT        |
| World Health Organisation                                                  | WHO         |