



**Universiteit  
Leiden**  
The Netherlands

## **Peer feedback in teacher professional development**

Jin, X.

### **Citation**

Jin, X. (2021, September 21). *Peer feedback in teacher professional development*. ICLON PhD Dissertation Series. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3212967>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3212967>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

# **Peer Feedback in Teacher Professional Development**

Xinglin Jin



Universiteit  
Leiden  
ICLON

ICLON, Leiden University Graduate School of Teaching

# ico

The research was carried out in the context of the *Dutch Interuniversity Center for Educational Sciences*.

Title: Peer feedback in teacher professional development

Titel: Peer Feedback in de context van de professionele ontwikkeling van leraren

ICLON PhD Dissertation Series

Print: Printsupport4u, Steenwijk

Cover design: Xinglin Jin

Lay-out: Xinglin Jin

ISBN/EAN: 978-94-90383-35-0

© 2021, Xinglin Jin

All rights reserved. No part of this thesis may be reproduced, stored in retrieval systems, or transmitted in any form by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior written permission of the author.

# **Peer Feedback in Teacher Professional Development**

## **Proefschrift**

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van rector magnificus prof. dr. ir. H. Bijl,  
volgens besluit van het college voor promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 21 september 2021  
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Xinglin Jin  
geboren te Chongqing  
in 1990

*Promotor*

Prof. dr. W.F. Admiraal

*Copromotores*

Dr. D.E.H. Tigelaar

Dr. A.C. van der Want

*Promotiecommissie*

Prof. dr. P.F. Wouters

Prof. dr. ir. F.J.J.M. Janssen

Prof. dr. M.A.C.Th. Kuijpers, Open Universiteit Nederland

Dr. J.A. Meirink, Nationaal Regieorgaan Onderwijsonderzoek

Dr. M. Dam

# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 The problem	10
1.2 Context of this dissertation	11
1.2.1 <i>Novice teachers and their development in Chinese vocational education</i>	11
1.2.2 <i>The TPD programme in the current study</i>	12
1.3 Aims and research questions	13
1.4 Conceptual framework	13
1.4.1 <i>Teacher peer feedback</i>	13
1.4.2 <i>Novice-expert interaction</i>	14
1.5 Outline of the dissertation	14

## Chapter 2 Implementation Models of Teacher Peer Feedback: A Systematic Review

2.1 Introduction	21
2.2 Peer feedback in TPD programmes	21
2.3 Method	23
2.3.1 <i>Search terms and databases</i>	23
2.3.2 <i>Screening titles and abstracts</i>	24
2.3.3 <i>Full-text assessment</i>	25
2.3.4 <i>Analysis of included literature</i>	25
2.4 Results	26
2.4.1 <i>Implementation models</i>	26
2.4.2 <i>Factors that influence teachers' learning effects</i>	35
2.5 Discussion and conclusion	39
2.5.1 <i>Implications</i>	41
2.5.2 <i>Concluding remark</i>	42

## Chapter 3 Effects of a Teacher Professional Development Programme in Chinese Vocational Education on the Efficacy and Professional Engagement of Novice Teachers

3.1 Introduction	45
3.2 Theoretical background	46
3.2.1 <i>Novice teachers and teacher development in the Chinese VET context</i>	46

3.2.2	<i>Efficacy and professional engagement in teacher development</i>	47
3.3	Method	49
3.3.1	<i>Setting</i>	49
3.3.2	<i>Respondents and data collection</i>	50
3.3.3	<i>Instruments</i>	51
3.3.4	<i>Analysis</i>	52
3.4	Results	53
3.4.1	<i>Teachers' sense of efficacy</i>	53
3.4.2	<i>Teachers' professional engagement</i>	54
3.5	Discussion and Conclusion	54
3.5.1	<i>Effects on teachers' sense of efficacy</i>	55
3.5.2	<i>Effects on teachers' professional engagement</i>	56
3.5.3	<i>Limitations</i>	57
3.5.4	<i>Practical implications</i>	57
3.5.5	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	58

## **Chapter 4 Learning from Novice-expert Interaction in Teachers' Continuing Professional Development**

4.1	Introduction	61
4.2	Novice-teachers' learning	62
4.2.1	<i>Novice-teachers' problems in the context of Chinese vocational education</i>	62
4.2.2	<i>Novice-expert interaction as a support of teacher learning</i>	63
4.2.3	<i>The interconnected model of professional growth</i>	64
4.3	Method	66
4.3.1	<i>Context of the TPD project</i>	66
4.3.2	<i>Participants of the study</i>	67
4.3.3	<i>Data collection</i>	67
4.3.4	<i>Interview procedure</i>	68
4.3.5	<i>Data analysis</i>	69
4.4	Results	73
4.4.1	<i>Learning model</i>	74
4.4.2	<i>Expert-teachers' comments and advice</i>	75
4.4.3	<i>Learning outcomes</i>	78
4.5	Discussion and conclusion	81
4.5.1	<i>Implications for professional development of novice teachers</i>	81
4.5.2	<i>Limitations</i>	82
4.5.3	<i>Concluding remarks</i>	83

## **Chapter 5 Novice Teachers' Learning from Expert Feedback: 12 Appraisal Categories**

5.1 Introduction	87
5.2 Review of research on the appraisal of feedback	88
5.2.1 <i>Feedback content</i>	88
5.2.2 <i>Teachers' appraisal of expert feedback</i>	89
5.3 Method	91
5.3.1 <i>Setting</i>	91
5.3.2 <i>Participants</i>	91
5.3.3 <i>Data collection</i>	92
5.3.4 <i>Coding procedures and analysis</i>	95
5.4 Results	96
5.4.1 <i>Characteristics of feedback</i>	99
5.4.2 <i>Characteristics of teacher</i>	100
5.4.3 <i>Characteristics of VET</i>	101
5.4.4 <i>Professional development needs</i>	102
5.5 Discussion and conclusion	103
5.5.1 <i>The pragmatic demands of novice teachers</i>	103
5.5.2 <i>Different concerns of teachers in different school subjects</i>	104
5.5.3 <i>The generalization of the appraisal framework</i>	105
5.5.4 <i>Limitations and suggestions for further research</i>	106
5.5.5 <i>Practical Implications</i>	106

## **Chapter 6 Novice-expert interaction in continuous professional learning in China: An analysis of expert feedback**

6.1 Introduction	111
6.2 Theoretical background	111
6.2.1 <i>Feedback in teacher professional learning</i>	111
6.2.2 <i>Characteristics of feedback in novice-expert interaction</i>	113
6.3 Method	114
6.3.1 <i>Setting</i>	114
6.3.2 <i>Participants and data collection</i>	115
6.3.3 <i>Data analysis</i>	116
6.4 Results	121
6.4.1 <i>Characteristics of the feedback provided by expert teachers during novice-expert interaction</i>	121



6.4.2 <i>Feedback from expert teachers in general and vocational subjects</i>	122
6.4.3 <i>Feedback from expert teachers in matched and mixed groups</i>	124
6.5 Discussion and conclusion	126
6.5.1 <i>Limitations and suggestions for further research</i>	128
6.5.2 <i>Practical implications</i>	128
6.5.3 <i>Concluding remark</i>	129
<b>Chapter 7 General Discussion and Conclusion</b>	
7.1 Summary of findings in each study	132
7.2 General discussion	139
7.3 Limitations and suggestions for future research	141
7.4 Practical implications	141
7.5 Final conclusion	143
<b>References</b>	<b>145</b>
<b>Summary</b>	<b>159</b>
总结	171
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>181</b>