



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Explanation and determination

Gijsbers, V.A.

Citation

Gijsbers, V. A. (2011, August 28). *Explanation and determination*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/17879>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/17879>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Explanation and Determination

PROEFSCHRIFT TER VERKRIJGING VAN
DE GRAAD VAN DOCTOR AAN DE UNIVERSITEIT LEIDEN,
OP GEZAG VAN RECTOR MAGNIFICUS
PROF. MR. P. F. VAN DER HEIJDEN,
VOLGENS BESLUIT VAN HET COLLEGE VOOR PROMOTIES
TE VERDEDIGEN OP 28 SEPTEMBER 2011
KLOKKE 15.00 UUR

DOOR VICTOR ALEXANDER GIJSBERS
GEBOREN TE LEIDEN IN 1982

Promotiecommissie

Promotor Prof. dr. B. G. Sundholm

Co-promotor Dr. J. W. McAllister

Overige leden Prof. C. R. Hitchcock, *California Institute of Technology*

Prof. dr. A. J. M. Peijnenburg, *Rijksuniversiteit Groningen*

Prof. S. Psillos, *University of Athens*

Dr. H. W. de Regt, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*

Prof. M. Strevens, *New York University*

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Introducing the introduction	1
1.2	Overview	2
1.3	Discourse on method	4
1.3.1	Analysis	4
1.3.2	Contemporary science	8
2	Why Unification Is Neither Necessary nor Sufficient	11
2.1	Introduction	11
2.2	Two types of unificationism	12
2.2.1	Kitcher's theory	12
2.2.2	The problem of spurious unification	13
2.2.3	Schurz & Lambert's theory	17
2.3	Causality and lawhood	18
2.3.1	Kitcher and causal asymmetry	19
2.3.2	Lawhood in Kitcher	22
2.3.3	Lawhood in Schurz & Lambert	25
2.4	Is unification necessary for explanation?	26
2.5	Conclusion	30
3	Against Inference to the Best Explanation	33
3.1	Introduction	33
3.2	IBE as an inference scheme	35
3.3	Loveliness and likeliness	36
3.4	The guiding thesis	38
3.5	First argument: virtues	40
3.6	Second argument: case study	45
3.7	Third argument: Bayesianism	50
3.8	Modest explanationism	53
3.9	Conclusion	55

4	A General Interventionist Theory of Explanation	57
4.1	Introduction	57
4.2	Causality and explanation	58
4.3	Woodward on causation and explanation	59
4.4	Is the interventionist theory circular?	62
4.5	Mathematical explanation introduced	66
4.6	Steiner's theory of mathematical explanation	67
4.7	An interventionist theory of mathematical explanation	69
4.8	Law explanations	73
4.9	A general interventionist theory of explanation	76
4.10	Conclusion	78
5	Explanation's Many Contrasts	81
5.1	Two types of contrast in explananda	81
5.2	The conjunctive theory	85
5.3	The double-contrast theory	91
5.4	Contrasts and irrelevance	95
5.5	Conclusion	98
6	The Determination Theory	99
6.1	Introduction	99
6.2	Explanation as determination	100
6.3	The determination theory	104
6.4	Capturing determination	106
7	Indeterministic Explanation I	111
7.1	The non-specific deductive model	111
7.2	Probability: the debate	114
7.3	Probability: answers	117
7.4	Totally unspecific explanation	121
7.5	Indeterminism: biting the bullet	122
7.6	Indeterminism: is it a bullet?	124
7.7	Conclusion	129
8	Indeterministic Explanation II	131
8.1	Introduction	131
8.2	Preliminary argument: Galápagos finches	132
8.3	Strevens's theory of explanation	134
8.4	Microconstancy and macroperiodicity	136
8.5	Three types of explanation	138
8.6	The statistical deterministic explanation does not exist	140

8.6.1	The problem	140
8.6.2	Attempts to define macroperiodicity	141
8.6.3	Further attempts	143
8.7	The low-level deterministic explanation is not irrelevant	145
8.8	Non-explanatory critical events	149
8.9	Deductive closure	151
8.10	Conclusion	155
9	Discussion and Implications of the Determination Theory	157
9.1	Introduction	157
9.2	Are explanations arguments?	158
9.3	Laws and regularities	160
9.3.1	Explanation without regularity?	160
9.3.2	Hidden regularity	162
9.3.3	The heart of the matter	163
9.3.4	Explanation through redescription	164
9.4	Ambiguity and pluralism	166
9.4.1	Ambiguity and combination	166
9.4.2	Explanatory pluralism	169
9.5	Explanation and understanding	173
9.5.1	Understanding: introduction	173
9.5.2	The feeling of understanding	174
9.5.3	Understanding versus explanation	176
9.5.4	Methodological problems?	181
9.5.5	<i>Erklären</i> and <i>Verstehen</i>	182
9.6	Explanatory power and objectivity	184
9.7	Conclusion	187
10	Conclusions	189
	Nederlandse samenvatting	193
	Curriculum Vitae	199
	Acknowledgements	201
	Bibliography	203
	Index	214

