



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The restorations of the Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe in Egypt: "Conservation" or "reinvention" of monuments? = Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte: « conservations » ou « réinvention » des monuments?

Ishak Bakhoun, D.

Citation

Ishak Bakhoun, D. (2021, January 21). *The restorations of the Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe in Egypt: "Conservation" or "reinvention" of monuments? = Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte: « conservations » ou « réinvention » des monuments?*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134742>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134742>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/42713> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Ishak Bakhoun, D.

Title: The restorations of the Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe in Egypt: "Conservation" or "reinvention" of monuments? = Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte: « conservations » ou « réinvention » des monuments?

Issue Date: 2021-01-21

**The Restorations of the *Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe* in Egypt:
“Conservation” or “Reinvention” of Monuments?**

Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte :
« conservation » ou « réinvention » des monuments ?



DINA ISHAK BAKHOUM

Volume I

**The Restorations of the *Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe* in Egypt:
“Conservation” or “Reinvention” of Monuments?**

Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte :
« conservation » ou « réinvention » des monuments ?

**The Restorations of the *Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe* in Egypt:
“Conservation” or “Reinvention” of Monuments?**

Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte :
« conservation » ou « réinvention » des monuments ?

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van Rector Magnificus Prof. Mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op donderdag 21 januari 2021

klokke 11.15 uur

door

Dina Ishak Bakhoun

geboren te Caïro, Egypte

in 1975

Promotores:

Prof. dr. L.P.H.M. Buskens

Prof. dr. M. Volait (Centre national de la recherche scientifique CNRS [InVisu])

Promotiecommissie:

Prof. dr. C.A. van Eck (University of Cambridge)

Prof. dr. P.J. ter Keurs

Prof. dr. E. d'Orgeix (École Pratique des Hautes Études)

Dr. E.G. Paskaleva

Prof. dr. D. Poulot (Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne)

Prof. dr. J.P. van Staëvel (Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne)

Cover Photograph: The mosque of Qiğmās al-Ishāqī (884-887/1479-1482), Cairo, Egypt.

Unknown photographer, with manuscript mention at the back of the print: *Mosquée de Kidjmās el-Ishâki : façade ouest*, undated. Silver print, Creswell Photographic Collection, Rare Books and Special Collections Library, The American University in Cairo.

The research carried out through this PhD dissertation suggests that the photograph was taken during the early 1890s at the time when the minaret was being restored as we can see from the scaffolding surrounding it (see also fig. 4.34a & fig. 4.34b).



THESE DE DOCTORAT / PROEFSCHRIFT

**Préparée au sein de l'université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne
en cotutelle avec Universiteit Leiden**

**Pour l'obtention du titre de Docteur
Spécialité Histoire de l'art**

Présentée et soutenue publiquement à l'Université de Leyde le 21 janvier 2021
par

Dina Ishak BAKHOUM

**Les restaurations du Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe en Égypte :
« conservation » ou « réinvention » des monuments ?**

**The Restorations of the *Comité de Conservation des Monuments de l'Art Arabe* in Egypt:
"Conservation" or "Reinvention" of Monuments?**

Thèse dirigée par / Promotores

Mme Mercedes VOLAIT, Directrice de recherche, CNRS, Laboratoire InVisu (USR 3103)
M. Léon P.H.M. BUSKENS, Professeur, Universiteit Leiden

Membres du jury de soutenance / Promotiecommissie

Mme Caroline A. van ECK, Professeure, University of Cambridge
M. Pieter J. ter KEURS, Professeur, Universiteit Leiden
Mme Émilie d'ORGEIX, Directrice d'Études, École Pratique des Hautes Études
Mme Elena G. PASKALEVA, Docteure, Universiteit Leiden
M. Dominique POULOT, Professeur, Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne
M. Jean Pierre van STAËVEL, Professeur, Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne

Short Table of Contents

VOLUME I

1 INTRODUCTION	1
2 THE <i>COMITÉ</i> 'S WORK UNDER SCRUTINY	19
3 THE <i>COMITÉ</i> IN CONTEXT AND IN ACTION	37
4 THE <i>COMITÉ</i> 'S INTERVENTIONS ON MAMLUK MINARETS	77
5 THE <i>COMITÉ</i> 'S INTERVENTIONS ON MISSING DOMES	111
6 THE <i>COMITÉ</i> 'S INTERVENTIONS ON MAMLUK WOODEN <i>MINBARS</i>	161
7 CONCLUSION	209

VOLUME II: Illustrations

Table of Contents

VOLUME I

Acknowledgements	XIII
List of Abbreviations & Acronyms	XV
Editorial, bibliographical and transliteration notes	XVII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Overview of the PhD dissertation	1
1.2 Author's interest in the <i>Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe</i>	2
1.3 The theories of conservation and restoration of monuments in Europe during the nineteenth century	4
1.4 Each restoration intervention is a decision based on sets of values	5
1.5 In a nutshell: The <i>Comité</i> in context and in action	7
1.5.1 The <i>Comité</i> 's history and activities	8
1.5.2 The <i>Comité</i> in relation to the European context of monuments conservation and restoration	10
1.6 Framing this PhD dissertation	12
1.6.1 Overview of scholarly works linked to the <i>Comité</i>	12
1.6.2 Overview of the PhD's angle, sources, research questions, methodology and rationale	13
2 THE COMITÉ'S WORK UNDER SCRUTINY	19
2.1 The <i>Comité</i> through the lenses of different scholarly disciplines	19
2.1.1 The <i>Comité</i> and art history	20
2.1.2 The <i>Comité</i> as a conservation body	21
2.1.3 The <i>Comité</i> through the post-colonial lens	23
2.2 The <i>Comité</i> and Cairo's Islamic monuments in the context of this PhD dissertation	28
2.2.1 Research angle in relation to other scholarly works	28
2.2.2 Research methodology and rationale	29
2.2.3 Overview of the sources and archives	32
3 THE COMITÉ IN CONTEXT AND IN ACTION	37
3.1 The local, administrative and historic context	37
3.1.1 Cairo	37
3.1.2 The <i>waqf</i> system	38
3.1.3 The nineteenth century	41
3.2 The cultural context: Fascination with Cairo as manifested in the sources	46
3.3 The <i>Comité</i> 's history and activities	49
3.3.1 Towards establishing the <i>Comité</i>	49

3.3.2 The <i>Comité</i> for <i>la conservation et la restauration, ḥifẓ wa iṣlāh(?)</i> , preservation and restoration	52
3.3.3 The possible role of the Ministry of <i>Awqāf</i> in the establishment of the <i>Comité</i>	53
3.3.4 The <i>Comité</i> 's foundation and initial regulations	54
3.3.5 The evolution of the <i>Comité</i> and significant milestones during its lifetime	56
3.3.6 The <i>Comité</i> 's publications and collections	65
3.3.7 The <i>Comité</i> 's work procedures	72
3.3.8 The <i>Comité</i> 's work in relation to the diverse values of the monuments	73
3.4 Concluding remarks	75
4 THE <i>COMITÉ</i>'S INTERVENTIONS ON MAMLUK MINARETS	77
4.1 Introduction and rationale for the selection of minarets	77
4.2 The design of minarets and the classifications of interventions	79
4.3 Cairo, the City of a Thousand Minarets	80
4.3.1 Illustrations of damaged minarets	80
4.3.2 Al-Mu'ayyad mosque minarets: illustrations and interventions before and during the <i>Comité</i>	81
4.4 Remarks on pre-<i>Comité</i> interventions	83
4.5 The protection of lives and monuments	86
4.6 The <i>Comité</i> dismantling and reconstructing Mamluk pavilions	87
4.6.1 The twin minarets of the <i>ḥānqāh</i> of Farağ ibn Barqūq	87
4.6.2 The minaret of the mosque of Qiğmās al-Iṣḥāqī and the minaret of the mosque of Qāyitbāy at the Northern Cemetery	89
4.6.3 The minaret of the mosque of Qānībāy al-Šarkasī	90
4.6.4 The minaret of the mosque of Tamīm al-Raṣṣāfī	94
4.7 The <i>Comité</i> newly designing and reconstructing missing Mamluk pavilions	95
4.7.1 The minaret of the mosque of Qāḍī Yaḥyā Zayn al-Dīn	95
4.7.2 The minaret of the mosque of Maṅğak al-Yūsufī	96
4.8 The <i>Comité</i> restoring pavilions from Ottoman back to Mamluk	97
4.8.1 The minaret of the mosque of Ğānim al-Bahlawān	97
4.8.2 The minaret of the mosque of Qāḍī 'Abd al-Bāsiṭ	100
4.8.3 The minaret of the mosque of al-Ašraf Barsbāy and the minaret of the mosque of Tağrī Birdī	105
4.9 Financial and structural challenges during the 1930s and the 1931 minarets report	106
4.10 Concluding remarks on the <i>Comité</i>'s interventions on minarets	107
5 THE <i>COMITÉ</i>'S INTERVENTIONS ON MISSING DOMES	111
5.1 Introduction and rationale for the selection of domes	111
5.2 Cairo's domes	112
5.2.1 The dome on top of the mausoleum and the dome in the mosque	112
5.2.2 Missing domes in the nineteenth century	113
5.3 Reinforced concrete	114
5.3.1 The Hennebique system in Egypt	114

5.3.2 The use of reinforced concrete in monuments' restoration in Europe and the issuance of the 1931 Athens Charter	115
5.4 The <i>Comité</i> reconstructing domes	116
5.4.1 The dome of the mausoleum of Barqūq and short reference to the dome of al-Nāṣir Muḥammad (not reconstructed):	116
5.4.2 The dome of the mosque of al-Māridānī	120
5.4.3 The dome of the mausoleum of Qalāūn	128
5.4.4 The dome of the mausoleum of al-Ġūrī	131
5.4.5 The dome of the mosque of al-Nāṣir Muḥammad at the Citadel	136
5.4.6 The Nilometer's cover	139
5.4.7 The dome of the madrasa of Ṣarġatmiš	148
5.4.8 The northern dome of the Sulṭāniyya mausoleum	153
5.5 Concluding remarks on the <i>Comité</i>'s reconstruction of domes	156
6 THE <i>COMITÉ</i>'S INTERVENTIONS ON MAMLUK WOODEN <i>MINBARS</i>	161
6.1 Introduction and the rationale for the selection of <i>minbars</i>	161
6.2 Art historical scholarly works on Egyptian <i>minbars</i>	163
6.3 The <i>minbars</i>' shapes, elements and decoration	164
6.4 The conditions of <i>minbars</i> during the mid and late nineteenth century	167
6.5 The <i>Comité</i> recording its restorations of <i>minbars</i>	167
6.6 The <i>Comité</i> restoring Mamluk <i>minbars</i>	169
6.6.1 The <i>minbar</i> of the mosque of al-Mu'ayyad Ṣayḥ	169
6.6.2 The <i>minbar</i> of the mosque of al-Māridānī	185
6.6.3 The <i>minbar</i> of the mosque of al-Daṣṭūtī	192
6.6.4 The <i>minbar</i> of the mosque of Azbak al-Yūsufī	198
6.7 The manufacturing of a new <i>minbar</i> for the mosque of al-Nāṣir Muḥammad at the Citadel	202
6.8 Concluding remarks on the <i>Comité</i>'s interventions on Mamluk wooden <i>minbars</i>	204
7 CONCLUSION	209
7.1 Overview of the PhD, its aim and contributions	209
7.2 The <i>Comité</i> and Cairo's architectural palimpsests: between continuity and change	209
7.3 The <i>Comité</i>'s modern restorations: conservation or re-invention of monuments?	211
7.3.1. The <i>Comité</i> 's interventions: faithful to the original design -whenever possible- following three approaches	211
7.3.2 The <i>Comité</i> 's layer as viewed by the <i>Comité</i> members: an alteration transmitted faithfully to future generations	213
7.3.3 The analysis of the <i>Comité</i> 's modern layer: an indispensable endeavor for understanding the monuments	214
7.4 The <i>Comité</i>'s actors and actions	214
7.4.1 The Egyptian and European expertise, and the traditional and innovative actions	215
7.4.2 The <i>Comité</i> , part of an existing and established Egyptian system	216

7.4.3 The <i>Comité</i> , part of the international history of architectural conservation	216
7.5 Readdressing the post-colonial lens through which the <i>Comité</i> was viewed	216
7.5.1 The <i>Comité</i> under the <i>Awqāf</i> , and not independent of it	217
7.5.2 The impact of the 1936 move of the <i>Comité</i> to the Ministry of Public Instruction: a turning point in the relationship between the <i>Awqāf</i> and the endowed monuments	218
7.5.3 The constant use of the Arabic language amid a multi-lingual <i>Comité</i>	219
7.5.4 “Medievalizing” Cairo for the sake of foreign tourists? From mosques in ruins to mosques in use	219
7.5.5 Mirroring colonial attitudes on the <i>Comité</i> and overshadowing its ‘Egyptianness’	221
7.5.6 The response to the <i>Comité</i> ’s work as conveyed in contemporary sources	221
7.6 Final remark: the PhD dissertation beyond the Egyptian context	221
Bibliography	223
Index	245
Summary	251
Samenvatting	255
Résumé	259
Curriculum vitae	

VOLUME II: Illustrations

List of Abbreviations & Acronyms

ADAIK	Abhandlung des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts Kairo
<i>AnIsl</i>	Annales Islamologiques
ARCE	The American Research Centre in Egypt
AUC	The American University in Cairo
AKTC	The Aga Khan Trust for Culture
BC	The reports and minutes of meetings (Bulletins) of the <i>Comité de conservation des monuments de l'art arabe</i> The Bulletins of the <i>Comité</i> are shortened to BC followed by the volume number, the period the Bulletin covers, the title of the section of the respective report and/or meeting, and the page numbers. It must be noted that in some cases the year of publication is different from the year/years the Bulletin covers. The year of the publication will therefore be left out.
BINHA	Bibliothèque de l'Institut national d'histoire de l'art
<i>BIFAO</i>	Bulletin de l'institut français d'archéologie orientale
BMVR	Bibliothèque municipale à vocation régionale (Marseille)
BnF	Bibliothèque nationale de France
CEDEJ	Centre d'études et de documentation économique, juridique et sociale
CNMS	Center for Near and Middle Eastern Studies, Philipps-University Marburg
CNRS	Centre national de la recherche scientifique (Paris)
CSIC	Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas [The Spanish National Research Council]
DAIK	Deutsches Archäologisches Institut Kairo [The German Archaeological Institute Cairo]
EHES	École des hautes études en sciences sociales
<i>EI</i>	Encyclopedia of Islam
FMvB	Fondation Max van Berchem
GCI	Getty Conservation Institute
GIS	Groupement d'Intérêt Scientifique du CNRS
ICCROM	International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property
ICOMOS	International Council on Monuments and Sites
IFAO	Institut français d'archéologie orientale
IISMM	Institut d'études de l'Islam et des sociétés du monde musulman
IJMES	International Journal of Middle Eastern Studies
IMIQ	Idārat al-Maḥfūzāt al-Islāmiyya wa-l-Qibṭiyya [Department of the Islamic and Coptic Archives; Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, Egypt]

INHA	Institut national d'histoire de l'art
InVisu	Unité de service et de recherche de l'INHA et du CNRS; L'information visuelle et textuelle en histoire de l'art : nouveaux terrains, corpus, outils
JARCE	Journal of the American Research Centre in Egypt
LIAS	Leiden Institute for Area Studies
LUCIS	Leiden University Centre for the Study of Islam and Society
MoTA	Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, Egypt
MIFAO	Mémoires de l'Institut français d'archéologie orientale
MTAIQ	Markaz Tasğīl al-Āṭār al-Islāmiyya wa-l-Qibṭiyya [the Center for the Registration/Documentation of Islamic and Coptic Monuments, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, Egypt]
MDA	Markaz al-Dirāsāt al-Aṭariyya [The Center for Archaeological Studies (mainly for Islamic and Coptic Monuments); Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, Egypt]
MM	Markaz al-Ma'lūmāt [Information Center, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, Egypt]
MIT	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
NIMAR	Netherlands Institute Morocco
NISIS	Netherlands Interuniversity School for Islamic Studies
RBSCl	Rare Books and Special Collections Library
SCA	Supreme Council of Antiquities, Egypt
SMS	School of Mamluk Studies
UNESCO	The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
URHC	Urban Regeneration of Historic Cairo Project
V&A	Victoria and Albert Museum
WHC	World Heritage Centre

Editorial, bibliographical and transliteration notes

- The editorial, bibliographical and transliteration guidelines of IFAO were followed. <https://www.ifao.egnet.net/publications/publier/normes-ed/>
- Decree/superior order: When the *Comité* was established in December 1881 this was done through the issuance of a Khedival *décret* [decree]; in Arabic it was referred to as *amr 'ālī* [superior order]. Throughout this PhD, the translation of both terms from French and Arabic [decree/superior order] will be used when referring to this document.
- *Musée Arabe* [Museum of Arab Art; *dār al-āṭār al-'arabiyya* (which does not literally translate to Museum of Arab Art)]: This museum in Cairo was known in Egypt by its French and Arabic names. Therefore, in the text the French or Arabic name is used as per the documents consulted; otherwise it is referred to as the 'Museum of Arab Art'. In 1951 it was renamed to the Museum of Islamic Art [*mathaf a-fann al-islāmī*].
- Mehmed Ali (Egypt's Khedive; r. 1805-1848): In Egypt, his name is sometimes transliterated following the Arabic pronunciation, Muḥammad 'Alī. Here his name is transliterated following the Turkish pronunciation.
- Other personal Arabic names: the way a person has published her/his name was used; when the person in question is only known through the Arabic sources, the IFAO's guidelines for transliteration were followed.
- Different transliterations for the same name of a specific monument or a specific person were found in the Bulletins. For the names of buildings, the IFAO's guidelines for transliteration are the ones consistently followed. Nevertheless, when quoting or referencing a Bulletin, the transliteration -as published- is the one used. For personal names, sometimes the transliteration given in the Bulletin was also placed for reference.

