



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Credit rating agency liability in Europe: Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress

Verheij, D.J.

Citation

Verheij, D. J. (2021, January 28). *Credit rating agency liability in Europe: Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress*. Meijers-reeks. Eleven International Publishing, Den Haag. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134628>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134628>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134628> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Verheij, D.J.

Title: Credit rating agency liability in Europe: Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress

Issue Date: 2021-01-28

Credit rating agency liability in Europe

Credit rating agency liability in Europe

Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 28 januari 2021
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Dorine Johanna Verheij

geboren te Leiden

in 1991

Promotoren: prof. mr. drs. M. Haentjens
prof. mr. A.G. Castermans

Promotiecommissie: prof. mr. W.A.K. Rank
mr. dr. L.M. van Bochove
prof. mr. S.C.G. van den Bogaert
prof. J. Cartwright (University of Oxford, Verenigd Koninkrijk)
prof. dr. iur. U.G. Schroeter (Universität Basel, Zwitserland)

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2021 D.J. Verheij | Eleven International Publishing

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.stichting-pro.nl).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

ISBN 978-94-6236-144-7
ISBN 978-94-5454-923-9 (e-book)
NUR 828

www.elevenpub.com

Table of contents

ABBREVIATIONS	XIII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Context	1
1.2 Civil liability of credit rating agencies	2
1.3 Research questions	
1.4 Methodology	6
1.5 Scope and demarcations	9
1.6 Relevance	10
1.7 Relationship to other research	11
1.8 Outline	14
2 INFLUENCE OF EU LAW ON CIVIL LIABILITY	17
2.1 Introductory remarks	17
2.2 Competence of the European Union	18
2.3 Effects of EU law in national legal orders	21
2.3.1 Direct effect	21
2.3.2 Regulations	23
2.3.2.1 Direct applicability does not entail direct effect	23
2.3.2.2 'Sufficiently clear, precise and unconditional'	24
2.3.2.3 Provisions requiring additional (national) measures	25
2.3.3 Directives	29
2.4 Enforcement of EU law	32
2.4.1 Rights, remedies and procedures	32
2.4.2 National procedural autonomy	33
2.4.3 Equivalence and effectiveness	33
2.5 Influence of EU law on civil liability	34
2.5.1 Categorisation	34
2.5.2 Situation 1: Absence of EU law provisions on civil liability	36
2.5.2.1 Setting the scene	36
2.5.2.2 Regulations	37
2.5.2.3 Directives	41
2.5.3 Situation 2: EU law provisions on (the application of) national civil liability regimes	49
2.5.3.1 Setting the scene	49
2.5.3.2 EU law provisions (de facto) requiring application of national civil liability regimes	50

2.5.3.3	EU law provisions creating a right of redress under national law	55
2.5.4	Situation 3: EU law provisions creating directly effective rights to compensation or damages	58
2.5.4.1	Setting the scene	58
2.5.4.2	A directly effective right to damages with reference to national law: Art. 35a CRA Regulation	59
2.5.4.3	Autonomous right to compensation: Art. 82 GDPR	67
2.5.5	Overarching influence of effectiveness	68
2.6	Concluding remarks	71
3	CREDIT RATING INDUSTRY AND ITS REGULATION	75
3.1	Introductory remarks	75
3.2	Historical perspective credit rating industry and civil liability	76
3.2.1	Origins: credit reporting agencies, financial press and the first credit rating agencies	76
3.2.2	Expansion: regulatory purposes, issuer pays and structured finance	78
3.2.3	Inaccurate credit ratings and (self-)regulation	80
3.2.4	Global financial crisis, regulatory frameworks and liability threats	82
3.2.4.1	Financial crisis	82
3.2.4.2	Possible causes of inaccurate structured finance ratings	84
3.2.4.3	Aggravated effects due to overreliance	85
3.2.4.4	Legal developments	86
3.2.5	Recovery and settlements	91
3.3	Credit ratings	94
3.3.1	Character and types	94
3.3.2	Assignment of credit ratings	95
3.3.2.1	Formal proceedings	95
3.3.2.2	Rating methodologies	96
3.3.2.3	Structured finance products	98
3.3.3	Functions	100
3.3.4	Effects	102
3.3.4.1	Credit ratings, credit risk and investor compensation	102
3.3.4.2	Empirical evidence bond and structured finance markets	104
3.3.4.3	Empirical evidence from equity markets	106
3.4	EU regulatory framework	107
3.4.1	Objectives	107
3.4.2	Preliminary provisions	108
3.4.2.1	Scope of application	108
3.4.2.2	Reducing overreliance	110
3.4.3	Substantive rules	111
3.4.4	Public enforcement by ESMA	112
3.5	Private enforcement of Article 35a	114
3.5.1	Legislative history	114
3.5.1.1	Situation prior to Article 35a	114
3.5.1.2	Public Consultation on Article 35a	114

3.5.1.3	Impact Assessment	116
3.5.1.4	EC Proposal & amendments	117
3.5.2	Conditions for civil liability	118
3.5.3	Stakeholders defined and scope of application	119
3.5.3.1	'Credit rating agency'	119
3.5.3.2	'Issuer'	121
3.5.3.3	'Investor'	121
3.6	Factual perspective on credit rating agency liability	126
3.6.1	Four basic factual situations	126
3.6.2	Loss suffered by issuers	127
3.6.3	Loss suffered by investors	129
3.7	Concluding remarks	132
4	PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW ASPECTS	135
4.1	Introductory remarks	135
4.2	Characterisation	137
4.3	Jurisdiction	138
4.3.1	Legal framework	138
4.3.2	Formal, material and temporal scope of Brussels I Regulation (recast)	139
4.3.3	Jurisdiction agreements	140
4.3.3.1	Remarks in advance	140
4.3.3.2	Jurisdiction agreements in favour of courts of Member States	141
4.3.3.3	Jurisdiction agreements in favour of courts of third countries	147
4.3.4	General ground for jurisdiction	153
4.3.5	Special ground for jurisdiction	154
4.3.5.1	Matters relating to tort	154
4.3.5.2	Handlungsort	156
4.3.5.3	Erfolgsort – financial loss	159
4.3.5.4	Erfolgsort – reputational loss	174
4.4	Applicable law – Rome II Regulation	177
4.4.1	Scope of application	177
4.4.2	Choice of law agreement	181
4.4.3	General rule	182
4.4.3.1	Financial loss	182
4.4.3.2	Reputational loss	186
4.4.4	Escape clause	187
4.5	Recognition and enforcement	187
4.5.1	A small sidestep to recognition and enforcement	187
4.5.2	Enforcement within EU	188
4.5.3	Depletion of assets in the EU	188
4.6	Concluding remarks	191

5	INTERPRETATION AND APPLICATION ARTICLE 35A UNDER DUTCH, FRENCH, GERMAN AND ENGLISH LAW	195
5.1	Introductory remarks	195
5.2	Methodology	196
5.2.1	Approach	196
5.2.1.1	Three parts	196
5.2.1.2	Part 2: Comparison through functional method	196
5.2.1.3	Part 3: Comparison through terms and subjects	198
5.2.1.4	Presentation of the legal comparison	199
5.2.2	Legal systems involved	200
5.2.3	Challenges in the field of legal sources and language	202
5.3	Terms and subjects of Article 35a	204
5.3.1	Article 35a (1)	204
5.3.1.1	Preliminary considerations	204
5.3.1.2	'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'	210
5.3.1.3	'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements	211
5.3.1.4	Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'	217
5.3.2	Art. 35a (3) – Limitations of liability in advance	219
5.3.3	Prescription	221
5.4	Dutch law	222
5.4.1	National private law context	222
5.4.2	National rules on credit rating agency liability	224
5.4.2.1	Little attention to credit rating agency liability	224
5.4.2.2	In the presence of a contractual relationship – issuers & investors	225
5.4.2.3	In the absence of a contractual relationship	226
5.4.3	Article 35a (1)	236
5.4.3.1	'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'	236
5.4.3.2	'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements	245
5.4.3.3	Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'	256
5.4.4	Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance	263
5.4.4.1	General system	263
5.4.4.2	Limitations of liability in relation to issuers and investors	268
5.4.5	Prescription of claims	269
5.4.6	Concluding remarks	271
5.5	French law	272
5.5.1	National private law context	272
5.5.2	National rules on credit rating agency liability	275
5.5.2.1	Liability regime prior to 2018	275
5.5.2.2	In the presence of a contractual relationship – investors & issuers	282
5.5.2.3	In the absence of a contractual relationship – investors & issuers	283
5.5.3	Article 35a (1)	284
5.5.3.1	'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'	284

5.5.3.2	'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements	287
5.5.3.3	Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'	294
5.5.4	Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance	303
5.5.4.1	General system	303
5.5.4.2	Limitations of liability in relation to issuers and investors	305
5.5.5	Prescription	306
5.5.6	Concluding remarks	307
5.6	German law	308
5.6.1	National private law context	308
5.6.2	National rules on credit rating agency liability	310
5.6.2.1	Much attention to credit rating agency liability	310
5.6.2.2	In the presence of a contractual relationship	311
5.6.2.3	In the absence of a contractual relationship	312
5.6.3	Article 35a (1)	327
5.6.3.1	'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'	327
5.6.3.2	'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements	330
5.6.3.3	Suffering 'damages' and claiming 'damages'	343
5.6.4	Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance	348
5.6.4.1	General system	348
5.6.4.2	Limitations of liability in relation to issuers	351
5.6.4.3	Limitations of liability in relation to investors	353
5.6.5	Prescription of claims	354
5.6.6	Concluding remarks	356
5.7	English law	358
5.7.1	National private law context	358
5.7.2	National rules on credit rating agency liability	361
5.7.2.1	Approach UK Implementing Regulations	361
5.7.2.2	In the presence of a contractual relationship – issuers & investors	362
5.7.2.3	In the absence of a contractual relationship	362
5.7.3	Article 35a (1)	374
5.7.3.1	'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'	374
5.7.3.2	'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements	375
5.7.3.3	Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'	390
5.7.4	Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance	398
5.7.4.1	Limitations of liability towards issuers – solicited ratings	398
5.7.4.2	Limitations of liability towards issuers – unsolicited ratings	398
5.7.4.3	Limitations of liability towards investors – with and without subscriptions	399
5.7.5	Prescription of claims	401
5.7.6	Concluding remarks	401
5.8	Comparison	403
5.8.1	Remarks in advance	403
5.8.2	National bases for civil liability – comparison	404
5.8.2.1	In the presence of a contractual relationship	404

5.8.2.2	In the absence of a contractual relationship	405
5.8.3	Article 35a (1) CRA Regulation – comparison	407
5.8.3.1	‘Intentionally’ or ‘with gross negligence’	407
5.8.3.2	‘Impact’ and ‘caused to’, including claimant-specific requirements	410
5.8.3.3	Suffering ‘damage’ and claiming ‘damages’	419
5.8.4	Article 35a (3) CRA Regulation – Limitations of liability in advance – comparison	424
5.8.5	Prescription of claims (comparison)	428
5.8.6	Conclusions related to the legal comparison	429
5.9	Concluding remarks	432
6	OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	435
6.1	Introductory remarks	435
6.2	Normative framework	436
6.3	Observations within the normative framework	440
6.3.1	Limited added value Article 35a	440
6.3.1.1	Added value in theory, limited added value in practice	440
6.3.1.2	Narrow scope of application and stringent conditions	442
6.3.1.3	Structure	444
6.3.1.4	Unintended effect: decreased issuer and investor protection under French law	449
6.3.2	Private International Law rules leave uncertainty	450
6.3.2.1	Focus on three main issues	450
6.3.2.2	Exclusive jurisdiction clauses in favour of third country courts	450
6.3.2.3	Erfolgsort of financial loss	453
6.3.2.4	Erfolgsort of reputational loss	457
6.3.3	Uncertainty relating to interpretation and application terms Article 35a	457
6.3.3.1	Sources of uncertainty	457
6.3.3.2	Imprecise drafting & unclear status terms	458
6.3.3.3	Friction	460
6.3.3.4	Uncertain application of national legal concepts	462
6.3.4	Little convergence	463
6.3.4.1	Differences between four legal systems investigated	463
6.3.4.2	Continuing risks of regulatory arbitrage	466
6.4	No adequate right of redress	467
6.5	Recommendations	468
6.5.1	Remarks in advance	468
6.5.2	Possible structures of EU provisions on civil liability	469
6.5.2.1	Three options	469
6.5.2.2	Option (a) Requiring application of national civil liability regimes	470
6.5.2.3	Option (b) Imposing detailed obligations upon Member States	471

6.5.2.4	Option (c) Extending Article 35a	472
6.5.2.5	Competence, subsidiarity and proportionality	473
6.5.3	Private International Law rules	475
6.5.3.1	Continuing importance PIL	475
6.5.3.2	Limit validity exclusive jurisdiction clauses third country courts	475
6.5.3.3	Relevant connectors and location of financial loss	477
6.5.4	Further substantive guidance	487
6.5.4.1	More guidance, in a balanced manner	487
6.5.4.2	Reasoning from justification for civil liability and duty of care credit rating agencies	488
6.5.4.3	Defining standard of care and attribution (issuer claims and investor claims)	490
6.5.4.4	Amending requirement of reasonable reliance (investor claims)	491
6.5.4.5	Linking credit rating agency's duty and the recoverable loss of investors (investor claims)	492
6.5.4.6	Limitations of civil liability in advance (issuer claims and investor claims)	496
6.6	Rating the suitability of Article 35a's template for private enforcement	497
6.7	Concluding remarks	499
	SUMMARY	505
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	513
	REFERENCES	523
	INDEX	571
	CURRICULUM VITAE	577

Abbreviations

AIFMD	Directive 2011/61/EU on Alternative Investment Fund Managers
BGB	Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (German Civil Code)
BW	Burgerlijk Wetboek (Dutch Civil Code)
CC	Code Civil (French Civil Code)
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
CPDO	Constant proportion debt obligation
CRA I	Regulation (EG) no. 1060/2009 on credit rating agencies
CRA II	Regulation (EU) no. 513/2011 on credit rating agencies
CRA III	Regulation (EU) no. 462/2013 on credit rating agencies
CRA Regulation	Regulation on credit rating agencies (consolidated version)
CRD IV	Capital Requirements Directive (Directive 2013/36/EU)
CRR	Capital Requirements Regulation (Regulation (EU) no. 575/2013)
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ESMA Regulation	Regulation (EU) no. 1095/2010 establishing a European Supervisory Authority (European Securities and Markets Authority)
ESMA	European Securities and Markets Authority
GDPR	General Data Protection Regulation (EU no. 2016/679)
GG	Grundgesetz
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
MiFID II	Directive 2014/65/EU on markets in financial instruments II
NN	Nationale-Nederlanden
NRSRO	Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization
PEPP-Regulation	Regulation (EU) no. 2019/1238 on a pan-European Personal Pension Product
PEPPs	Pan-European Personal Pension Products
PRIIPs Regulation	Regulation (EU) no. 1286/2014 on key information documents for packaged retail and insurance-based investment products
PRIIPs	Packaged Retail and Insurance-based Investment Products
PSD II	Payment Services Directive II (Directive (EU) 2015/2366)
Rv	Wetboek van Burgerlijke Rechtsvordering
SPV	Special purpose vehicle
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
UCITS V	Directive on Undertakings for Collective Investment in Transferable Securities (Directive 2014/91/EU)
UCTA 1977	Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977

Wft	Wet op het Financieel Toezicht
WpHG	Wertpapierhandelsgesetz
WpÜG	Wertpapiererwerbs- und Übernahmegesetz
ZPO	Zivilprozessordnung