



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## Credit rating agency liability in Europe: Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress

Verheij, D.J.

### Citation

Verheij, D. J. (2021, January 28). *Credit rating agency liability in Europe: Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress*. Meijers-reeks. Eleven International Publishing, Den Haag. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134628>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134628>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3134628> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Verheij, D.J.

**Title:** Credit rating agency liability in Europe: Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress

**Issue Date:** 2021-01-28

*Credit rating agency liability in Europe*



# Credit rating agency liability in Europe

Rating the combination of EU and national law in rights of redress

## PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 28 januari 2021  
klokke 16.15 uur

*door*

Dorine Johanna Verheij

geboren te Leiden

in 1991

Promotoren: prof. mr. drs. M. Haentjens  
prof. mr. A.G. Castermans

Promotiecommissie: prof. mr. W.A.K. Rank  
mr. dr. L.M. van Bochove  
prof. mr. S.C.G. van den Bogaert  
prof. J. Cartwright (University of Oxford, Verenigd Koninkrijk)  
prof. dr. iur. U.G. Schroeter (Universität Basel, Zwitserland)

Omslagontwerp: Primo!Studio, Delft  
Opmaak binnenwerk: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

© 2021 D.J. Verheij | Eleven International Publishing

*Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnemen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.*

*Voor zover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, [www.reprorecht.nl](http://www.reprorecht.nl)). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiswerken (art. 16 Auteurswet) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, [www.stichting-pro.nl](http://www.stichting-pro.nl)).*

*No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.*

ISBN 978-94-6236-144-7  
ISBN 978-94-5454-923-9 (e-book)  
NUR 828

[www.elevenpub.com](http://www.elevenpub.com)

## Table of contents

|  |      |
|--|------|
| ABBREVIATIONS  | XIII |
| 1 INTRODUCTION   | 1    |
| 1.1 Context  | 1    |
| 1.2 Civil liability of credit rating agencies  | 2    |
| 1.3 Research questions   |      |
| 1.4 Methodology  | 6    |
| 1.5 Scope and demarcations   | 9    |
| 1.6 Relevance  | 10   |
| 1.7 Relationship to other research   | 11   |
| 1.8 Outline  | 14   |
| 2 INFLUENCE OF EU LAW ON CIVIL LIABILITY   | 17   |
| 2.1 Introductory remarks   | 17   |
| 2.2 Competence of the European Union   | 18   |
| 2.3 Effects of EU law in national legal orders   | 21   |
| 2.3.1 Direct effect  | 21   |
| 2.3.2 Regulations  | 23   |
| 2.3.2.1 Direct applicability does not entail direct effect                                     | 23   |
| 2.3.2.2 'Sufficiently clear, precise and unconditional'  | 24   |
| 2.3.2.3 Provisions requiring additional (national) measures                                    | 25   |
| 2.3.3 Directives   | 29   |
| 2.4 Enforcement of EU law  | 32   |
| 2.4.1 Rights, remedies and procedures  | 32   |
| 2.4.2 National procedural autonomy   | 33   |
| 2.4.3 Equivalence and effectiveness  | 33   |
| 2.5 Influence of EU law on civil liability   | 34   |
| 2.5.1 Categorisation   | 34   |
| 2.5.2 Situation 1: Absence of EU law provisions on civil liability                             | 36   |
| 2.5.2.1 Setting the scene  | 36   |
| 2.5.2.2 Regulations  | 37   |
| 2.5.2.3 Directives   | 41   |
| 2.5.3 Situation 2: EU law provisions on (the application of) national civil liability regimes  | 49   |
| 2.5.3.1 Setting the scene  | 49   |
| 2.5.3.2 EU law provisions (de facto) requiring application of national civil liability regimes | 50   |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 2.5.3.3 EU law provisions creating a right of redress under national law                              | 55  |
| 2.5.4 Situation 3: EU law provisions creating directly effective rights to compensation or damages    | 58  |
| 2.5.4.1 Setting the scene   | 58  |
| 2.5.4.2 A directly effective right to damages with reference to national law: Art. 35a CRA Regulation | 59  |
| 2.5.4.3 Autonomous right to compensation: Art. 82 GDPR  | 67  |
| 2.5.5 Overarching influence of effectiveness  | 68  |
| 2.6 Concluding remarks  | 71  |
| <br>3 CREDIT RATING INDUSTRY AND ITS REGULATION   | 75  |
| 3.1 Introductory remarks  | 75  |
| 3.2 Historical perspective credit rating industry and civil liability                                 | 76  |
| 3.2.1 Origins: credit reporting agencies, financial press and the first credit rating agencies        | 76  |
| 3.2.2 Expansion: regulatory purposes, issuer pays and structured finance                              | 78  |
| 3.2.3 Inaccurate credit ratings and (self-)regulation   | 80  |
| 3.2.4 Global financial crisis, regulatory frameworks and liability threats                            | 82  |
| 3.2.4.1 Financial crisis  | 82  |
| 3.2.4.2 Possible causes of inaccurate structured finance ratings                                      | 84  |
| 3.2.4.3 Aggravated effects due to overreliance  | 85  |
| 3.2.4.4 Legal developments  | 86  |
| 3.2.5 Recovery and settlements  | 91  |
| 3.3 Credit ratings  | 94  |
| 3.3.1 Character and types   | 94  |
| 3.3.2 Assignment of credit ratings  | 95  |
| 3.3.2.1 Formal proceedings  | 95  |
| 3.3.2.2 Rating methodologies  | 96  |
| 3.3.2.3 Structured finance products   | 98  |
| 3.3.3 Functions   | 100 |
| 3.3.4 Effects   | 102 |
| 3.3.4.1 Credit ratings, credit risk and investor compensation   | 102 |
| 3.3.4.2 Empirical evidence bond and structured finance markets  | 104 |
| 3.3.4.3 Empirical evidence from equity markets  | 106 |
| 3.4 EU regulatory framework   | 107 |
| 3.4.1 Objectives  | 107 |
| 3.4.2 Preliminary provisions  | 108 |
| 3.4.2.1 Scope of application  | 108 |
| 3.4.2.2 Reducing overreliance   | 110 |
| 3.4.3 Substantive rules   | 111 |
| 3.4.4 Public enforcement by ESMA  | 112 |
| 3.5 Private enforcement of Article 35a  | 114 |
| 3.5.1 Legislative history   | 114 |
| 3.5.1.1 Situation prior to Article 35a  | 114 |
| 3.5.1.2 Public Consultation on Article 35a  | 114 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 3.5.1.3 Impact Assessment   | 116 |
| 3.5.1.4 EC Proposal & amendments  | 117 |
| 3.5.2 Conditions for civil liability  | 118 |
| 3.5.3 Stakeholders defined and scope of application                         | 119 |
| 3.5.3.1 'Credit rating agency'  | 119 |
| 3.5.3.2 'Issuer'  | 121 |
| 3.5.3.3 'Investor'  | 121 |
| 3.6 Factual perspective on credit rating agency liability                   | 126 |
| 3.6.1 Four basic factual situations   | 126 |
| 3.6.2 Loss suffered by issuers  | 127 |
| 3.6.3 Loss suffered by investors  | 129 |
| 3.7 Concluding remarks  | 132 |
| <br>4 PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW ASPECTS                                     | 135 |
| 4.1 Introductory remarks  | 135 |
| 4.2 Characterisation  | 137 |
| 4.3 Jurisdiction  | 138 |
| 4.3.1 Legal framework   | 138 |
| 4.3.2 Formal, material and temporal scope of Brussels I Regulation (recast) | 139 |
| 4.3.3 Jurisdiction agreements   | 140 |
| 4.3.3.1 Remarks in advance  | 140 |
| 4.3.3.2 Jurisdiction agreements in favour of courts of Member States        | 141 |
| 4.3.3.3 Jurisdiction agreements in favour of courts of third countries      | 147 |
| 4.3.4 General ground for jurisdiction                                       | 153 |
| 4.3.5 Special ground for jurisdiction                                       | 154 |
| 4.3.5.1 Matters relating to tort  | 154 |
| 4.3.5.2 Handlungsort  | 156 |
| 4.3.5.3 Erfolgsort – financial loss   | 159 |
| 4.3.5.4 Erfolgsort – reputational loss                                      | 174 |
| 4.4 Applicable law – Rome II Regulation                                     | 177 |
| 4.4.1 Scope of application  | 177 |
| 4.4.2 Choice of law agreement   | 181 |
| 4.4.3 General rule  | 182 |
| 4.4.3.1 Financial loss  | 182 |
| 4.4.3.2 Reputational loss   | 186 |
| 4.4.4 Escape clause   | 187 |
| 4.5 Recognition and enforcement   | 187 |
| 4.5.1 A small sidestep to recognition and enforcement                       | 187 |
| 4.5.2 Enforcement within EU   | 188 |
| 4.5.3 Depletion of assets in the EU   | 188 |
| 4.6 Concluding remarks  | 191 |

|         |   |     |
|---------|---|-----|
| 5       | INTERPRETATION AND APPLICATION ARTICLE 35A UNDER DUTCH, FRENCH,<br>GERMAN AND ENGLISH LAW | 195 |
| 5.1     | Introductory remarks  | 195 |
| 5.2     | Methodology   | 196 |
| 5.2.1   | Approach  | 196 |
| 5.2.1.1 | Three parts   | 196 |
| 5.2.1.2 | Part 2: Comparison through functional method  | 196 |
| 5.2.1.3 | Part 3: Comparison through terms and subjects   | 198 |
| 5.2.1.4 | Presentation of the legal comparison  | 199 |
| 5.2.2   | Legal systems involved  | 200 |
| 5.2.3   | Challenges in the field of legal sources and language                                     | 202 |
| 5.3     | Terms and subjects of Article 35a   | 204 |
| 5.3.1   | Article 35a (1)   | 204 |
| 5.3.1.1 | Preliminary considerations  | 204 |
| 5.3.1.2 | 'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'  | 210 |
| 5.3.1.3 | 'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific<br>requirements                     | 211 |
| 5.3.1.4 | Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'   | 217 |
| 5.3.2   | Art. 35a (3) – Limitations of liability in advance  | 219 |
| 5.3.3   | Prescription  | 221 |
| 5.4     | Dutch law   | 222 |
| 5.4.1   | National private law context  | 222 |
| 5.4.2   | National rules on credit rating agency liability  | 224 |
| 5.4.2.1 | Little attention to credit rating agency liability  | 224 |
| 5.4.2.2 | In the presence of a contractual relationship – issuers &<br>investors                    | 225 |
| 5.4.2.3 | In the absence of a contractual relationship  | 226 |
| 5.4.3   | Article 35a (1)   | 236 |
| 5.4.3.1 | 'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'  | 236 |
| 5.4.3.2 | 'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific<br>requirements                     | 245 |
| 5.4.3.3 | Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'   | 256 |
| 5.4.4   | Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance                                       | 263 |
| 5.4.4.1 | General system  | 263 |
| 5.4.4.2 | Limitations of liability in relation to issuers and investors                             | 268 |
| 5.4.5   | Prescription of claims  | 269 |
| 5.4.6   | Concluding remarks  | 271 |
| 5.5     | French law  | 272 |
| 5.5.1   | National private law context  | 272 |
| 5.5.2   | National rules on credit rating agency liability  | 275 |
| 5.5.2.1 | Liability regime prior to 2018  | 275 |
| 5.5.2.2 | In the presence of a contractual relationship – investors &<br>issuers                    | 282 |
| 5.5.2.3 | In the absence of a contractual relationship – investors &<br>issuers                     | 283 |
| 5.5.3   | Article 35a (1)   | 284 |
| 5.5.3.1 | 'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'  | 284 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 5.5.3.2 'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements          | 287 |
| 5.5.3.3 Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'                                   | 294 |
| 5.5.4 Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance                           | 303 |
| 5.5.4.1 General system  | 303 |
| 5.5.4.2 Limitations of liability in relation to issuers and investors               | 305 |
| 5.5.5 Prescription  | 306 |
| 5.5.6 Concluding remarks  | 307 |
| 5.6 German law  | 308 |
| 5.6.1 National private law context  | 308 |
| 5.6.2 National rules on credit rating agency liability                              | 310 |
| 5.6.2.1 Much attention to credit rating agency liability                            | 310 |
| 5.6.2.2 In the presence of a contractual relationship                               | 311 |
| 5.6.2.3 In the absence of a contractual relationship                                | 312 |
| 5.6.3 Article 35a (1)   | 327 |
| 5.6.3.1 'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'                                  | 327 |
| 5.6.3.2 'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements          | 330 |
| 5.6.3.3 Suffering 'damages' and claiming 'damages'                                  | 343 |
| 5.6.4 Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance                           | 348 |
| 5.6.4.1 General system  | 348 |
| 5.6.4.2 Limitations of liability in relation to issuers                             | 351 |
| 5.6.4.3 Limitations of liability in relation to investors                           | 353 |
| 5.6.5 Prescription of claims  | 354 |
| 5.6.6 Concluding remarks  | 356 |
| 5.7 English law   | 358 |
| 5.7.1 National private law context  | 358 |
| 5.7.2 National rules on credit rating agency liability                              | 361 |
| 5.7.2.1 Approach UK Implementing Regulations  | 361 |
| 5.7.2.2 In the presence of a contractual relationship – issuers & investors         | 362 |
| 5.7.2.3 In the absence of a contractual relationship                                | 362 |
| 5.7.3 Article 35a (1)   | 374 |
| 5.7.3.1 'Intentionally' or 'with gross negligence'                                  | 374 |
| 5.7.3.2 'Impact' and 'caused to', including claimant-specific requirements          | 375 |
| 5.7.3.3 Suffering 'damage' and claiming 'damages'                                   | 390 |
| 5.7.4 Article 35a (3) Limitations of liability in advance                           | 398 |
| 5.7.4.1 Limitations of liability towards issuers – solicited ratings                | 398 |
| 5.7.4.2 Limitations of liability towards issuers – unsolicited ratings              | 398 |
| 5.7.4.3 Limitations of liability towards investors – with and without subscriptions | 399 |
| 5.7.5 Prescription of claims  | 401 |
| 5.7.6 Concluding remarks  | 401 |
| 5.8 Comparison  | 403 |
| 5.8.1 Remarks in advance  | 403 |
| 5.8.2 National bases for civil liability – comparison                               | 404 |
| 5.8.2.1 In the presence of a contractual relationship                               | 404 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 5.8.2.2 In the absence of a contractual relationship                                    | 405 |
| 5.8.3 Article 35a (1) CRA Regulation – comparison                                       | 407 |
| 5.8.3.1 ‘Intentionally’ or ‘with gross negligence’                                      | 407 |
| 5.8.3.2 ‘Impact’ and ‘caused to’, including claimant-specific requirements              | 410 |
| 5.8.3.3 Suffering ‘damage’ and claiming ‘damages’                                       | 419 |
| 5.8.4 Article 35a (3) CRA Regulation – Limitations of liability in advance – comparison | 424 |
| 5.8.5 Prescription of claims (comparison)   | 428 |
| 5.8.6 Conclusions related to the legal comparison                                       | 429 |
| 5.9 Concluding remarks  | 432 |
| <br>6 OBSERVATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS  | 435 |
| 6.1 Introductory remarks  | 435 |
| 6.2 Normative framework   | 436 |
| 6.3 Observations within the normative framework   | 440 |
| 6.3.1 Limited added value Article 35a   | 440 |
| 6.3.1.1 Added value in theory, limited added value in practice                          | 440 |
| 6.3.1.2 Narrow scope of application and stringent conditions                            | 442 |
| 6.3.1.3 Structure   | 444 |
| 6.3.1.4 Unintended effect: decreased issuer and investor protection under French law    | 449 |
| 6.3.2 Private International Law rules leave uncertainty                                 | 450 |
| 6.3.2.1 Focus on three main issues  | 450 |
| 6.3.2.2 Exclusive jurisdiction clauses in favour of third country courts                | 450 |
| 6.3.2.3 Erfolgsort of financial loss  | 453 |
| 6.3.2.4 Erfolgsort of reputational loss   | 457 |
| 6.3.3 Uncertainty relating to interpretation and application terms Article 35a          | 457 |
| 6.3.3.1 Sources of uncertainty  | 457 |
| 6.3.3.2 Imprecise drafting & unclear status terms                                       | 458 |
| 6.3.3.3 Friction  | 460 |
| 6.3.3.4 Uncertain application of national legal concepts                                | 462 |
| 6.3.4 Little convergence  | 463 |
| 6.3.4.1 Differences between four legal systems investigated                             | 463 |
| 6.3.4.2 Continuing risks of regulatory arbitrage  | 466 |
| 6.4 No adequate right of redress  | 467 |
| 6.5 Recommendations   | 468 |
| 6.5.1 Remarks in advance  | 468 |
| 6.5.2 Possible structures of EU provisions on civil liability                           | 469 |
| 6.5.2.1 Three options   | 469 |
| 6.5.2.2 Option (a) Requiring application of national civil liability regimes            | 470 |
| 6.5.2.3 Option (b) Imposing detailed obligations upon Member States                     | 471 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 6.5.2.4 Option (c) Extending Article 35a  | 472 |
| 6.5.2.5 Competence, subsidiarity and proportionality  | 473 |
| 6.5.3 Private International Law rules   | 475 |
| 6.5.3.1 Continuing importance PIL   | 475 |
| 6.5.3.2 Limit validity exclusive jurisdiction clauses third country courts                          | 475 |
| 6.5.3.3 Relevant connectors and location of financial loss  | 477 |
| 6.5.4 Further substantive guidance  | 487 |
| 6.5.4.1 More guidance, in a balanced manner   | 487 |
| 6.5.4.2 Reasoning from justification for civil liability and duty of care credit rating agencies    | 488 |
| 6.5.4.3 Defining standard of care and attribution (issuer claims and investor claims)               | 490 |
| 6.5.4.4 Amending requirement of reasonable reliance (investor claims)                               | 491 |
| 6.5.4.5 Linking credit rating agency's duty and the recoverable loss of investors (investor claims) | 492 |
| 6.5.4.6 Limitations of civil liability in advance (issuer claims and investor claims)               | 496 |
| 6.6 Rating the suitability of Article 35a's template for private enforcement                        | 497 |
| 6.7 Concluding remarks  | 499 |
| <br>SUMMARY   | 505 |
| SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)  | 513 |
| REFERENCES  | 523 |
| INDEX   | 571 |
| CURRICULUM VITAE  | 577 |



## Abbreviations

|                   |   |
|-------------------|---|
| AIFMD             | Directive 2011/61/EU on Alternative Investment Fund Managers  |
| BGB               | Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch (German Civil Code)   |
| BW                | Burgerlijk Wetboek (Dutch Civil Code)   |
| CC                | Code Civil (French Civil Code)  |
| CJEU              | Court of Justice of the European Union  |
| CPDO              | Constant proportion debt obligation   |
| CRA I             | Regulation (EG) no. 1060/2009 on credit rating agencies   |
| CRA II            | Regulation (EU) no. 513/2011 on credit rating agencies  |
| CRA III           | Regulation (EU) no. 462/2013 on credit rating agencies  |
| CRA Regulation    | Regulation on credit rating agencies (consolidated version)   |
| CRD IV            | Capital Requirements Directive (Directive 2013/36/EU)   |
| CRR               | Capital Requirements Regulation (Regulation (EU) no. 575/2013)  |
| ECJ               | European Court of Justice   |
| ESMA Regulation   | Regulation (EU) no. 1095/2010 establishing a European Supervisory Authority (European Securities and Markets Authority) |
| ESMA              | European Securities and Markets Authority   |
| GDPR              | General Data Protection Regulation (EU no. 2016/679)  |
| GG                | Grundgesetz   |
| IOSCO             | International Organization of Securities Commissions  |
| MiFID II          | Directive 2014/65/EU on markets in financial instruments II   |
| NN                | Nationale-Nederlanden   |
| NRSRO             | Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization   |
| PEPP-Regulation   | Regulation (EU) no. 2019/1238 on a pan-European Personal Pension Product  |
| PEPPs             | Pan-European Personal Pension Products  |
| PRIIPs Regulation | Regulation (EU) no. 1286/2014 on key information documents for packaged retail and insurance-based investment products  |
| PRIIPs            | Packaged Retail and Insurance-based Investment Products   |
| PSD II            | Payment Services Directive II (Directive (EU) 2015/2366)  |
| Rv                | Wetboek van Burgerlijke Rechtsvordering   |
| SPV               | Special purpose vehicle   |
| TEU               | Treaty on European Union  |
| TFEU              | Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union   |
| UCITS V           | Directive on Undertakings for Collective Investment in Transferable Securities (Directive 2014/91/EU)                   |
| UCTA 1977         | Unfair Contract Terms Act 1977  |

|      |  |
|------|--|
| Wft  | Wet op het Financieel Toezicht         |
| WpHG | Wertpapierhandelsgesetz                |
| WpÜG | Wertpapiererwerbs- und Übernahmegesetz |
| ZPO  | Zivilprozessordnung                    |