



**Universiteit  
Leiden**  
The Netherlands

## **Secular totalitarian and islamist legal-political philosophy**

Suurland, David-Arthur John

### **Citation**

Suurland, D. -A. J. (2012). Secular totalitarian and islamist legal-political philosophy.  
Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/19888>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License:

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/19888>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/19888> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Suurland, David-Arthur John

**Title:** Secular totalitarian and islamist legal-political philosophy

**Date:** 2012-09-27

SECULAR TOTALITARIAN  
AND ISLAMIST LEGAL-  
POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY

*A STUDY INTO THE APPLICABILITY OF THE  
TOTALITARIANISM PARADIGM TO  
ISLAMIST IDEOLOGIES AND MOVEMENTS*

# Secular Totalitarian and Islamist Legal-Political Philosophy

*A study into the applicability of the totalitarianism paradigm to  
Islamist ideologies and movements*

David Suurland

SECULAR TOTALITARIAN AND ISLAMIST LEGAL-  
POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY

*A STUDY INTO THE APPLICABILITY OF THE TOTALITARIANISM  
PARADIGM TO ISLAMIST IDEOLOGIES AND MOVEMENTS*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit  
Leiden, op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der  
Heijden, volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties te  
verdedigen op donderdag 27 september 2012 klokke 15:00 uur

*door*

David-Arthur John Suurland

geboren te Eindhoven

in 1975

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor:

prof. dr. A. Ellian

Overige leden:

prof. dr. B. Tibi (Universiteit van Göttingen, Duitsland)

prof. dr. C. Bärsch (Universiteit van Duisburg-Essen,  
Duitsland)

prof. dr. P.B. Cliteur

prof. dr. E.R. Muller

dr. E. van Ree (Universiteit van Amsterdam)

“Our participation in the parliament does not indicate a support, but rather an undermining of the parliamentary system. It does not indicate that we renounce our anti-parliamentarian attitude, but that we are fighting the enemy with his own weapons and that we are fighting for our National Socialist goal from the parliamentary platform [...] We enter parliament in order to supply ourselves, in the arsenal of democracy, with its own weapons. We become members of the Reichstag in order to paralyze the Weimar sentiment with its own assistance. If democracy is so stupid as to give us free tickets [...] that is its own affair. [...] We do not come as friend nor even as neutrals. We come as enemies: As the wolf bursts into the flock, so we come.”<sup>1</sup>

-Joseph Goebbels. 1928

---

<sup>1</sup> United States. Office of Chief of Counsel for the Prosecution of Axis

It is almost certain that we will fail. But [...] the assassination must be attempted at all costs. Even if it should not succeed, an attempt to seize power in Berlin must be made. What matters now is no longer the practical purpose of the coup, but to prove to the world and for the records of history that the men of the resistance dared to take the decisive step. Compared to this objective, nothing else is of consequence.

(20th of July 1944)

The whole world will vilify us now, but I am still totally convinced that we did the right thing. Hitler is the archenemy not only of Germany but of the world. When, in few hours' time, I go before God to account for what I have done and left undone, I know I will be able to justify what I did in the struggle against Hitler. [...] No-one among us can complain about his death, for whoever joined our ranks put on the shirt of Nessus. A man's moral worth is established only at the point where he is ready to give up his life in defense of his convictions.

(4 hours before his suicide, 21st of July 1944)

*-Herrmann von Tresckow (1901–1944). Major General in the German Wehrmacht and organizer of the July 20th failed 'Valkyrie' plot against Hitler.*



# CHAPTER INDEX

---

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS</b> .....  | <b>15</b> |
| <b>LIST OF ISLAMIC TERMINOLOGY</b> .....  | <b>16</b> |
| <b>GENERAL INTRODUCTION</b> .....   | <b>19</b> |
| WHAT IS THE TOTALITARIAN PARADIGM? .....  | 25        |
| A note on totalitarian ideologies and religious doctrine .....                        | 31        |
| What is the link between religion, modernity and<br>totalitarianism? .....            | 35        |
| Applying the totalitarianism paradigm to religious movements<br>.....                 | 47        |
| HOW TO APPLY THE TOTALITARIANISM PARADIGM TO ISLAMISM? .....                          | 49        |
| What is Islamism? .....   | 50        |
| Islam, Islamism and the politicization of Islamic law .....                           | 54        |
| Islamism as totalitarianism .....   | 60        |
| Changes in the concept of jihad and the confrontation with<br>modernity .....         | 63        |
| Applying Voegelin’s schematic to the main works of three<br>Islamist ideologues ..... | 63        |
| Conclusion .....  | 97        |

## **PART II:**

### **TOTALITARIAN LEGAL-POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY**

|                                      |            |
|--------------------------------------|------------|
| <b>CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION</b> ..... | <b>101</b> |
| 1.1 METHODOLOGY .....                | 105        |
| 1.1.1 Problems of taxonomy .....     | 105        |
| 1.1.2. Methodology employed .....    | 113        |
| 1.1.3 Choice of authors .....        | 115        |

**CHAPTER II: AUTHORITARIANISM..... 127**

2.1 POLITICAL PLURALISM AND THE LACK OF RESPONSIBILITY.....129

    Pluralism and authority in liberal democracies.....129

    Pluralism and authority in authoritarian regimes .....130

    Lack of responsibility .....135

2.2 THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A MENTALITY AND AN IDEOLOGY AS THE BASIS OF  
AUTHORITY.....138

2.3 POLITICAL MOBILIZATION .....141

2.4 LIMITS ON POWER AND SMALL LEADERSHIP CORE .....143

2.5 SUMMARY OF AUTHORITARIANISM: TRIBALISM, MONARCHY, TYRANNY, DICTATORSHIP  
.....145

**CHAPTER III: THE CHALLENGES OF MODERNITY ..... 150**

3.1 CLAUDE LEFORT AND THE SYMBOLIC PLACE OF POWER IN AUTHORITARIANISM,  
DEMOCRACY AND FASCISM .....151

3.2 ERIC VOEGELIN AND THE RISE OF GNOSTICISM.....158

    The new order of being: Individual freedom or the greater  
    good? .....159

    The loss of order and the rise of Gnosticism .....164

3.3 THE CONFRONTATION WITH MODERNITY: THE RISE OF THE MASSES, ANOMIE AND THE  
SEARCH FOR ORDER.....171

    3.3.1 Liberalism or the Gnostic’s *ersatz religion* as the new  
    order of being? .....173

    3.3.2 The rise of the masses and anomie .....177

3.4 SUMMARY.....181

**CHAPTER IV: FASCISM ..... 183**

4.1 SIGNPOSTS OF THE FASCIST MENTALITY .....188

*Anti-individualism, elitist-collectivism and state-ism* .....188

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <i>Palingenesis and the mythical representation of history or future</i> .....           | 193        |
| <i>Struggle and social Darwinism</i> .....   | 195        |
| <i>Anti-rationalism</i> .....  | 197        |
| <i>Creative violence and existential violence</i> .....                                  | 199        |
| <i>Mentality or ideology</i> .....   | 203        |
| <i>The leadership principle</i> .....  | 205        |
| <i>Mass mobilization</i> .....   | 206        |
| 4.2 FASCISM AND ITS RELATION TO AUTHORITARIAN CONCEPTS .....                             | 211        |
| 4.3. SUMMARY AND RELEVANCE TO ISLAMIST MOVEMENTS.....                                    | 212        |
| <b>CHAPTER V: TOTALITARINISM .....</b>   | <b>216</b> |
| 5.1. METHODOLOGY .....   | 216        |
| 5.2 WHAT IS TOTALITARINISM? AN OVERVIEW OF EXISTING THEORIES .....                       | 219        |
| 5.2.1 The Socio-religious Version .....  | 220        |
| 5.2.2 The Historical-Genetic Version .....   | 226        |
| 5.2.3 The Political Science-Structural Version .....                                     | 232        |
| 5.3 THE STATE-CENTRED EMPIRICAL APPROACH.....  | 234        |
| <b>FRIEDRICH MADE A VARIANT ON THIS DEFINITION IN 1969 .....</b>                         | <b>235</b> |
| 5.3.1 Linz' definition of totalitarianism .....  | 237        |
| 5.3.2 Summary.....   | 247        |
| 5.4 THE NORMATIVE POLITICAL-PHILOSOPHICAL APPROACH OF ARENDT .....                       | 249        |
| 5.4.1 Ideological thinking .....   | 253        |
| 5.4.2 The law of Nature or History, and the law of Movement:<br>Practical Examples ..... | 259        |
| 5.4.3. From fascism to totalitarianism .....   | 285        |
| 5.4.4 Ideology and terror .....  | 290        |
| 5.5 THE TRANSFORMATIVE NATURE OF TOTALITARINISM .....                                    | 324        |
| 5.6 SUMMARY.....   | 327        |

## PART II:

### ISLAMIST LEGAL-POLITICAL PHILOSOPHY

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>INTRODUCTION .....</b>  | <b>335</b> |
| FOUR REASONS FOR THE RELEVANCE OF THIS RESEARCH .....                                | 340        |
| The relevance to the field of totalitarianism studies .....                          | 340        |
| The relevance to the field of Islamic studies .....                                  | 342        |
| The relevance of the totalitarianism paradigm to counter-<br>terrorism policies..... | 351        |
| The relevance to the protection of human rights .....                                | 353        |
| ON THE GENERAL APPROACH OF THIS PART .....   | 361        |
| THREE FORMS OF ISLAMISM .....  | 362        |
| METHODOLOGY .....  | 364        |
| CHAPTER INDEX.....   | 370        |
| <b>CHAPTER I: DEFINING SOME FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPTS.....</b>                            | <b>378</b> |
| 1.1. THE QUESTION OF RELIGION, RELIGIOUS LAW AND RELIGIOSITY.....                    | 380        |
| 1.1.1 Some consideration on the relationship between Islam<br>and Shari’ah law ..... | 381        |
| 1.1.2 What about Muslims and Islamism? .....   | 393        |
| 1.2 WHAT IS ISLAMISM? .....  | 397        |
| 1.2.1 A note on hidden presumptions .....  | 407        |
| 1.3 THE BASIC VOCABULARY OF ISLAMIC JURISPRUDENCE .....                              | 412        |
| 1.3.1 Islam in relation to other religions .....                                     | 412        |
| 1.3.2 The Shari’ah, Set in stone or human labour? .....                              | 420        |
| 1.3.3 The Scriptural foundations of the Shari’ah .....                               | 423        |
| 1.3.4 Non-scriptural sources of the Shari’ah .....                                   | 436        |
| 1.3.5 from itjihad to the formation of the schools of law.....                       | 441        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 1.4 THE PUBLIC-POLITICAL NATURE OF ISLAMIC LAW: MASLAHA, HISBAH, TAKFIR AND FITNA .....               | 447        |
| 1.5 CONCLUSION .....  | 455        |
| <b>CHAPTER II THE DEVELOPMENT AND THEORIES OF JIHAD .....</b>   | <b>458</b> |
| 2.1 THE FOUNDATION OF OFFENSIVE JIHAD .....   | 461        |
| 2.1.1 The claim that there is no compulsion in religion .....   | 461        |
| 2.1.2. The claim that Jihad does not mean physical fighting but that it is a spiritual endeavour..... | 472        |
| 2.1.3 The model of Mecca and Medina .....   | 474        |
| 2.2 THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF JIHAD ACCORDING TO THE MEDIEVAL SCHOLARS .....                             | 476        |
| 2.2.1 Ibn Taymiyyah and his description of Jihad .....  | 477        |
| 2.2.2 Ibn Qayyim .....  | 481        |
| 2.3 SUMMARY.....  | 487        |
| 2.4 SOME HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENTS IN THE CONCEPT OF JIHAD.....   | 490        |
| 2.4.1. A historical setting .....   | 490        |
| 2.4.2 The confrontation with modernity .....  | 495        |
| <b>CHAPTER III SAYYID QUTB: MILESTONES .....</b>  | <b>506</b> |
| 3.1: THE NATURE OF ISLAM.....   | 510        |
| 3.1.1 Fitrah and Ubudiyah .....   | 515        |
| 3.1.2 Hakimiyyat .....  | 522        |
| 3.1.3 Jahiliyaah .....  | 530        |
| 3.1.4 Islam as an ideological movement of transformation ....   | 533        |
| 3.1.5 Doublespeak .....   | 541        |
| 3.1.6 Summary: is Qutb’s formula for self and world preservation totalitarian? .....                  | 545        |
| 3.2: EXILE: THE OBSERVATION OF DISORDER .....   | 549        |
| 3.2.1 Examples of <i>Jahiliyyah</i> societies.....  | 552        |
| 3.2.2 Takfir and Taghut .....   | 557        |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 3.2.3 Summary .....   | 561 |
| 3.3: THE CAUSES OF EXILE .....  | 562 |
| 3.3.1 The fall from Eden: three causes .....                          | 564 |
| 3.3.2 Palingenesis: internal and external enemies .....               | 570 |
| 3.3.3 Summary .....   | 578 |
| 3.4. THE BELIEF THAT SALVATION AND A RETURN TO EDEN IS POSSIBLE ..... | 579 |
| 3.5. THE AGENT OF SALVATION: THE REVOLUTIONARY VANGUARD .....         | 585 |
| 3.5.1 Forming the Vanguard .....                                      | 587 |
| 3.5.2 Practical examples of the Vanguard .....                        | 599 |
| 3.5.4 Summary .....   | 604 |
| 3.6. THE MECHANISM OF SALVATION: JIHAD.....                           | 608 |
| 3.6.1 What is jihad? .....  | 608 |
| 3.6.2 A new formulation of jihad .....                                | 611 |
| 3.6.3 Rebuking the 'imams of defeat' .....                            | 617 |
| 3.6.4 Qutb and the means of Jihad .....                               | 619 |
| 3.6.5 The prohibition on forced conversions revisited .....           | 621 |
| 3.7 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION .....                                      | 624 |

**CHAPTER IV KHOMEINI: VELAYAT-E FAQIH..... 629**

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 4.1 THE NATURE OF ISLAM.....   | 634 |
| 4.2 EXILE: THE OBSERVATION OF DISORDER .....                         | 638 |
| 4.3 THE CAUSES OF EXILE .....  | 641 |
| 4.3.1 Internal enemies .....   | 642 |
| 4.3.2 The external enemy .....                                       | 647 |
| 4.4 THE BELIEF THAT SALVATION AND A RETURN TO EDEN IS POSSIBLE ..... | 652 |
| 4.5 THE AGENT OF SALVATION: THE REVOLUTIONARY VANGUARD .....         | 656 |
| 4.5.1 Overthrowing the old order .....                               | 657 |
| 4.5.2 Fabricating a new order of being.....                          | 659 |
| 4.5.3 The professional revolutionary Vanguard .....                  | 661 |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 4.6 THE MECHANISM OF SALVATION: JIHAD.....  | 663        |
| 4.7 SUMMARY.....  | 666        |
| <b>CHAPTER V AL-ZAWAHIRI: KNIGHTS UNDER THE PROPHET’S BANNER ....</b>   | <b>673</b> |
| 5.1 KNIGHTS UNDER THE PROPHETS BANNER .....   | 675        |
| 5.1.1. The successes of the Qutbist Vanguard movements .....  | 676        |
| 5.1.2 The failures of the Qutbist Vanguard movements .....  | 678        |
| 5.1.3 The vanguard on the brink of extinction, rethinking the<br>strategy .....   | 682        |
| 5.2 THE TRANSITION TOWARDS ‘THE EXONERATION’ .....  | 685        |
| 5.2.1 The core issue of Sayyed Imam’s critique of Al-Qaeda ..   | 687        |
| <b>CHAPTER VI AL-ZAWAHIRI: THE EXONERATION .....</b>  | <b>692</b> |
| 6.1. THE NATURE OF ISLAM.....   | 692        |
| 6.1.1. The nature of Islamist jihad .....   | 692        |
| 6.2 EXILE: THE OBSERVATION OF DISORDER .....  | 706        |
| 6.3 THE CAUSES OF EXILE .....   | 707        |
| 6.3.1. Internal enemies .....   | 708        |
| 6.3.2 External enemies .....  | 719        |
| 6.3.3 Consequences for multicultural societies .....  | 729        |
| 6.3.4 Summary.....  | 737        |
| 6.4 THE BELIEF THAT SALVATION AND A RETURN TO EDEN IS POSSIBLE .....  | 738        |
| 6.5 THE AGENT OF SALVATION: THE REVOLUTIONARY VANGUARD .....  | 742        |
| 6.5.1 Manipulating the masses and taghut governments .....  | 743        |
| 6.5.2 The jihadist vanguard .....   | 746        |
| 6.5.3 The arena of jihad is the furnace of the Muslim nation, the<br>totalitarian attitude of the vanguard movement ..... | 749        |
| 6.6 THE MECHANISM OF SALVATION: JIHAD.....  | 754        |
| 6.6.1 The structure of Sayyed Imam’s accusations.....   | 756        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 6.6.2. Accusation 4: killing innocent people is prohibited in Islam .....                                     | 761        |
| 6.6.3. Accusation 5: killing Muslims is forbidden .....   | 770        |
| 6.6.3. Accusation 6: Multiculturalism, Muslims live safely in the land of unbelief .....                      | 774        |
| 6.6.4 Accusation 7: Multiculturalism, treaties , international law and citizenship are sacred covenants ..... | 779        |
| 6.6.5 Conclusion on Multiculturalism and citizenship .....  | 784        |
| 6.6.6 Accusation 8: jihadist operations do not benefit the ummah .....  | 788        |
| 6.6.7. Accusation 9: Warfare and Weapons of Mass Destruction .....  | 789        |
| 6.7 SUMMARY.....  | 792        |
| <b>CHAPTER VII: GENERAL CONCLUSION .....</b>  | <b>798</b> |
| ARE ISLAMIST IDEOLOGIES TOTALITARIAN? .....   | 801        |
| ARE ISLAMIST VANGUARD MOVEMENTS TOTALITARIAN?.....  | 836        |
| POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS .....  | 840        |
| Research recommendations .....  | 852        |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>   | <b>855</b> |
| <b>SUMMARY .....</b>  | <b>877</b> |
| <b>SAMENVATTING .....</b>   | <b>880</b> |
| <b>C.V.....</b>   | <b>884</b> |



# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

---

|       |   |
|-------|---|
| CDHRI | The Cairo Declaration on Human rights in Islam  |
| ECHR  | European Convention on Human Rights   |
| ECHR  | European Court of Human Rights  |
| ETA   | <i>Euskadi Ta Askatasuna</i> , Basque separatist movement.  |
| EU    | European Union  |
| HAMAS | <i>Harakat al-Muqāwamah al-Islāmiyyah</i> , literally: the "Islamic Resistance Movement"          |
| IRA   | Irish Republican Army   |
| MB    | Muslim Brotherhood, also referred to as the <i>ikhwan muslimeen</i>                               |
| OIC   | Organisation of Islamic Cooperation, formerly known as the Organisation of the Islamic Conference |
| UN    | United Nations  |
| UNHRC | United Nations Human Rights Council   |

# LIST OF ISLAMIC TERMINOLOGY

---

|            |  |
|------------|--|
| Bid'a      | an unlawful innovation to the corpus of Islam  |
| Dhimmi     | protected class of citizens of an Islamic state. Usually meant to indicate Jews, Christians and Zoroastrians. In Hanafi law also polytheists but not Arab polytheists                        |
| Faqih      | an expert on Islamic law and Jurisprudence   |
| Fiqh       | case law, or more abstract, Jurisprudence  |
| Fitna      | civil strife or religious and political infighting within the collective Muslim community  |
| Fitrah     | the equation of the essential nature of creation with Islam. Used to indicate that man is born Muslim and that it is in his nature to return to Islam. The negation of fitrah is jahiliyaah. |
| Hadith     | narrations of the life and examples of the prophet Muhammad, second source of canonical scripture next to the Quran  |
| Hakimiyyat | loosely; the oneness of Allah in all matters; his undisputed total authority   |
| Hisbah     | a concept by which the ordinances of Islam are translated into public policy. Derived from the Quranic injunction to 'enjoin what is right, forbid what is wrong'                            |
| Ijma       | scholarly consensus on a specific Islamic legal or religious issue, a source of Shari'ah law and fiqh  |

|                   |  |
|-------------------|--|
| Ikhwaan Muslimeen | the Muslim Brotherhood   |
| Itjihad           | the capacity to form legal opinions  |
| Jahiliyyaah       | literally: ignorance. Indicates a rejection or ignorance of Islam. In Islamist Islam: the cause of disorder and injustice    |
| Khawarij          | early Islamic sect that engaged in takfir and is seen by some to be the forerunner of modern day Islamists                   |
| Madhab            | a school of law, i.e. in Sunni Islam it usually refers to the four major schools of law: Hanafi, Shafi'i, Maliki, or Hanbali |
| Mujahedeen        | those who engage in Jihad  |
| Mutazaliyaah      | those who endorse a rationalistic approach to Shari'ah and fiqh  |
| Mujtahid          | someone who is capable of performing itjihad   |
| Munafiq           | a hypocrite  |
| Mushrik           | a polytheist   |
| Qiyas             | analogy, one of the means of usul al-fiqh  |
| Ubudiyyah         | loosely; exclusive obedience or submission to the laws of Allah  |
| Ulama             | the body of Islamic scholars, singular: <i>alim</i> .  |
| Ummah             | the collective body of Muslims worldwide   |
| Usul al-fiqh      | the methodology of fiqh  |
| Shari'ah          | the body of Islamic law, case law and jurisprudence  |

|          |  |
|----------|--|
| Shirk    | acts that entail the worshipping of Idols. In Islamism, any act that deviates from Tawheed and places someone outside the fold of Islam  |
| Sirah    | refers to biographies of the life of the prophet and his companions. Used to give context to canonical sources and the Shari'ah but not always accepted as a source of fiqh  |
| Sunna    | literally, 'the established path', can have various meanings but is most commonly used to refer to the hadith and the life of the prophet and his companions, i.e. the hadith and the Sirat. Used in conjunction with the Quran to refer to the sources of Shari'ah and fiqh |
| Takfir   | the, very controversial, act of branding another Muslim an apostate or heretic   |
| Taqiyyah | religious dissimulation. Originally a Shia concept used to hide one's faith in times of persecution or danger. In Islamism, a means of deceiving the opponents by being purposefully deceptive about one's true intentions.  |
| Taqlid   | imitating or blindly following scholarly opinions, the opposite of itjihad   |
| Tawheed  | the oneness of Allah and all of his creation. In Islamism, the idea that anything that contravenes Islam is an act of apostasy.  |