



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Sexual Orientation Discrimination in the European Union: National Laws and the Employment Equality Directive

Waalwijk, C.; Bonini-Baraldi, M.T.

Citation

Waalwijk, C., & Bonini-Baraldi, M. T. (2006). *Sexual Orientation Discrimination in the European Union: National Laws and the Employment Equality Directive*. The Hague: T.M.C. Asser Press.
Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/16528>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)
License: [Leiden University Non-exclusive license](#)
Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/16528>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Bibliography¹

REPORTS PER TITLE

After Amsterdam: Sexual Orientation and the European Union, edited by K. Krickler (Brussels: ILGA-Europe, 1999, online at www.ilga-europe.org).

Combating sexual orientation discrimination in employment: legislation in fifteen EU Member States – Report of the European Group of Experts on Combating Sexual Orientation Discrimination, about the implementation up to April 2004 of Directive 2000/78/EC establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation, edited by K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi (Leiden: Universiteit Leiden, 2004, published (in English and French) on the website of the European Commission, also available at www.emmeijers.nl/experts).*

Equality and non-discrimination – Annual report 2004, European Commission, Directorate-General for Employment and Social Affairs (Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2004).*

Equality and non-discrimination – Annual report 2005, European Commission, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities (Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2005).*

Equality, Diversity and Enlargement – Report on measures to combat discrimination in acceding and candidate countries (Utrecht/Brussels: MEDE European Consultancy & Migration Policy Group, 2003).*

Equality for Lesbians and Gay Men – A Relevant Issue in the EU Accession Process (Brussels: ILGA-Europe, 2001, online at www.ilga-europe.org).

Equal Rights in Practice – Key Voices 2005, European Commission, Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities (Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2005).*

‘European Policy and Legislative Process Update’, of Legal Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field, 1 *European Anti-Discrimination Law Review* (2005) 31-35.*

Going beyond the law: promoting equality in employment (Brussels: ILGA-Europe, 2005, online at www.ilga-europe.org).

Homosexuality: A European Community Issue. Essays on Lesbian and Gay Rights in European Law and Policy, edited by K. Waaldijk & A. Clapham (Dordrecht/Boston/London: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, 1993).

¹ Works marked with an * can be found online at one or more pages of the website of the European Commission, especially at www.stop-discrimination.info and/or www.eu.int/comm/antidiscrimination. For more literature on sexual orientation discrimination see the online database of the Center for Research and Comparative Legal Studies on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity (CERSGOSIG) at www.cersgosig.informagay.it.

- Lithuania – Handbook of National Laws*, EU Non-Discrimination Law Training for Trainers Programme (Warsaw: Helsinki Foundation for Human Rights & Interights, 2005, online at www.hfhrpol.waw.pl/en/index_pliki/dysk.html).
- Meeting the challenge of accession – Surveys on sexual orientation discrimination in countries joining the European Union* (Brussels: ILGA-Europe, 2004, online at www.ilga-europe.org).
- Methods and Indicators to Measure the Cost-Effectiveness of Diversity Policies in Enterprises*, Final report of a study by the Centre for Strategy & Evaluation Services (Brussels: European Commission, 2003).*
- More or less together: Levels of legal consequences of marriage, cohabitation and registered partnership for different-sex and same-sex partners – A comparative study of nine European countries*, edited by K. Waaldijk, Documents de travail n°125 (Paris: Institut National des Etudes Démographiques, 2005, online at http://www-same-sex.ined.fr/intro_pub.htm).
- 'News from the EU Member States', European Network of Legal Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field, 1 *European Anti-Discrimination Law Review* (2005) 39-71.*
- 'News from the EU Member States', European Network of Legal Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field, 2 *European Anti-Discrimination Law Review* (2005) 45-79.*
- Opinion on the situation of homosexuals in Slovenia*, EU Network of Independent Experts on Fundamental Rights, 2005, online at www.ilga-europe.org/europe/guide/country_by_country.
- Report on measures to combat discrimination, Directives 2000/43/EC and 2000/78/EC*, European Network of Legal Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field (Utrecht/Brussels: Human European Consultancy & Migration Policy Group, 2004/2005).*
- Report on measures to combat discrimination in the 13 candidate countries (vt/2002/47)*, Utrecht/Brussels: MEDE European Consultancy & Migration Policy Group, 2003, online at www.migpolgroup.com/reports.
- Specialised bodies to promote equality and/or discrimination* (Brussels: PMS Ramboll Management, 2002, online at http://europa.eu.int/comm/employment_social/fundamental_rights/public/arct_en.htm).
- Straight talk – Gays, lesbians and bisexuals at work*, coordinated by G. Svensson (Sweden: Ljunbergs Tryckeri, 2004, online at www.publiek.coc.nl/StraightTalk_eng.pdf).

LITERATURE PER AUTHOR

- Arai-Takahashi, Yutaka, *The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine and the Principle of Proportionality in the Jurisprudence of the ECHR* (Antwerp, Oxford, New York: Intersentia, 2002).
- Attard, Christian, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in Malta*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005 (see www.emmeijers.nl/experts).
- Baatrup, Søren, 'Denmark', chapter 5 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 145-158.*

- Baer, Susanne, 'Germany', chapter 8 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 209-228.*
- Baer, Susanne, 'Country Report – Germany', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Barnard, Catherine, 'The Principle of Equality in the Community Context: P, Grant, Kalanke and Marschall: Four Uneasy Bedfellows?', 57 *Cambridge Law Journal* (1998) 353-373.
- Barnard, Catherine, *EC Employment Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000).
- Battaglia, Elisa, "Sesso" e "orientamento sessuale" nell'interpretazione dell'art. 141 CE alla luce della sentenza K.B. c. Regno Unito', 3 *Diritto dell'unione europea* (2004) 599-618.
- Bell, Mark, 'The New art.13 EC Treaty: A Sound Basis for European Anti-Discrimination Law?', 6 *Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law* (1999) 5-23.
- Bell, Mark, 'Sexual Orientation Discrimination in Employment: An Evolving Role for the European Union', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 653-676.
- Bell, Mark, *Anti-Discrimination Law and the European Union* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
- Bell, Mark, & Waddington, Lisa, 'Reflecting on inequalities in European equality law', 28 *European Law Review* (2003) 349-369.
- Bell, Mark, 'Measures to combat discrimination in the candidate countries – An overview', in *Equality, Diversity and Enlargement* 2003(a) (see above under 'Reports per title'), 7-38.*
- Bell, Mark, 'The right to equality and non-discrimination', in T. Hervey & J. Kenner (eds.), *Economic and Social Rights under the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights* (Oxford: Hart, 2003(b)), 91-110.
- Bell, Mark, et al., *Critical review of academic literature relating to the EU Directives to combat discrimination* (Brussels: European Commission, 2004).*
- Bell, Mark, 'Ireland', chapter 10 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 247-276.*
- Blanpain, Roger, *European Labour Law* (The Hague/London/New York: Kluwer Law International, 2002).
- Bonini-Baraldi, Matteo, 'European law', chapter 2 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 7-48.*
- Borrillo, Daniel, 'La politique antidiscriminatoire de l'Union européenne', in D. Borrillo (ed.), *Lutter contre les discriminations* (Paris: La Découverte, 2003), 139-152.
- Borrillo, Daniel, 'France', chapter 7 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 183-207.*
- Boučková, Pavla, 'Country Report – Czech Republic', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Bukovská, Barbora, & Boučková, Pavla, 'Country report – Czech Republic', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination in the 13 candidate countries* 2003 (see above under 'Reports per title').

- Cachón, Lorenzo, 'Country Report – Spain', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination 2004/2005* (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Cârstocea, Sînziana, 'Between acceptance and rejection – Decriminalizing homosexuality in Romania', in A. Weyembergh & S. Cârstocea (eds.), *The gays' and lesbians' rights in an enlarged European Union* (Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 2006), 207-222.
- Cohen, Barbara, 'Country Report – United Kingdom', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination 2004/2005* (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Cormack, Janet, & Bell, Mark, *Developing Anti-Discrimination Law in Europe – The 25 EU Member States compared*, European Network of Independent Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field (Utrecht/Brussels: Human European Consultancy & Migration Policy Group, 2005).*
- Craig, Paul, & De Búrca, Gráinne, *EU Law – Text, Cases, and Materials* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003).
- Curry-Sumner, Ian, *All's well that ends registered? The substantive and private international law aspects of non-marital registered relationships in Europe* (Antwerp/Oxford: Intersentia, 2005).
- De Schutter, Olivier, 'Methods of Proof in the Context of Combating Discrimination', in *Proving Discrimination – The Dynamic Implementation of EU Anti-Discrimination Law: The Role of Specialised Bodies* (Brussels: Migration Policy Group, 2003), 23-37.*
- De Schutter, Olivier, 'Belgium', chapter 4 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination 2004* (see above under 'Reports per title'), 89-142.*
- De Schutter, Olivier, 'Country Report – Belgium', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination 2004/2005* (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- De Schutter, Olivier, *The Prohibition of Discrimination under European Human Rights Law – Relevance for EU Racial and Employment Equality Directives*, European Network of Legal Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field (Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2005).*
- Dijk, Pieter van, & Hoof, Fried van, *Theory and Practice of the European Convention on Human Rights* (The Hague/London/Boston: Kluwer Law International, 1998).
- Đlugosova, Zuzana, 'Country Report – Slovakia', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination 2004/2005* (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Driessen-Reilly, Miriam, & Driessen, Bart, 'Don't shoot the messenger: a look at Community law relating to harassment in the workplace', 28 *European Law Review* (2003) 493-507.
- Ellul, Tonio, 'Country Report – Malta', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination in the 13 candidate countries 2003* (see above under 'Reports per title').
- Ellul, Tonio, 'Country Report – Malta', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination 2004/2005* (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Fabeni, Stefano, 'Italy', chapter 11 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination 2004* (see above under 'Reports per title'), 277-310.*
- Fabeni, Stefano, & Toniollo, Maria Gigliola (eds.), *La discriminazione fondata sull'orientamento sessuale – L'attuazione della direttiva 2000/78/CE e la nuova disciplina per la protezione dei diritti delle persone omosessuali sul posto di lavoro* (Roma: Ediesse, 2005).

- Farkas, Lilla, 'Nice on Paper: The Aborted Liberalisation of Gay Rights in Hungary', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 563-574.
- Feldhune, Gita, 'Country Report – Latvia', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination in the 13 candidate countries* 2003 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Feldhune, Gita, 'Country Report – Latvia', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Filipek, Pawel, & Pamula, Maria, 'Country Report – Poland', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Flynn, Leo, 'The Implications of art. 13 EC – After Amsterdam Will Some Forms of Discrimination be more Equal than Others?', 36 *Common Market Law Review* (1999) 1127.
- Flynn, Leo, 'From Individual Protection to Recognition of Relationships? Same-Sex Couples and the Irish Experience of Sexual Orientation Law Reform', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 591-604.
- Fredman, Sandra, 'Equality: A New Generation?', 30 *Industrial Law Journal* (2001) 145-168.
- Fredman, Sandra, *Discrimination Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
- Freitas, Miguel, 'Portugal', chapter 14 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 377-406.*
- Gavalas, Nikos, 'Country Report – Greece', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Gijzen, Marianne, 'Country Report – Netherlands', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Graupner, Helmut, *Sexualitaet, Jugendschutz und Menschenrechte*, Teil 2 (Frankfurt: P Lang, 1997).
- Graupner, Helmut, 'Sexual Consent: The Criminal Law in Europe and Overseas', in 29 *Archives of Sexual Behaviour* (2000) 415-461.
- Graupner, Helmut, 'The first will be the last: Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships in Austria', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 549-561.
- Graupner, Helmut, 'Austria', chapter 3 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 49-88.*
- Greif, Tatjana, 'Slovenia', in *Equality for Lesbians and Gay Men* 2001 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 69-75.*
- Halman, Loek, *The European Values Study: A Third Wave*. Source book of the 1999/2000 European Values Study Surveys (Tilburg: WORC, Tilburg University, 2001, see www.europeanvalues.nl)
- Halman, Loek, Luijkx, Ruud, & Van Zundert, Marga, *Atlas of European Values* (Leiden: Brill, 2005).
- Hansen, Niels-Erik, 'Country Report – Denmark', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Harper, Mark, et al. *Civil Partnership – The new law* (Bristol, Family Law, 2005).

- Hiltunen, Rainer, 'Finland', chapter 6 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 161-182.*
- Ionescu, Iustina, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in Romania*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005 (see www.emmeijers.nl/experts).
- Janis, Mark, Kay, Richard, & Bradley, Anthony, *European Human Rights Law. Text and Materials* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000).
- Kádár, András, & Farkas, Lilla, 'Country Report – Hungary', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Kountouros, Haris, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in Cyprus*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005 (see www.emmeijers.nl/experts).
- Latraverse, Sophie, 'Country Report – France', *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Lavrikovs, Juris, 'First moral victory in Latvia', *ILGA-Euroletter* (1998) nr. 60, online at www.france.qrd.org/assocs/ilga/euroletter/60.html#LV.
- Lavrikovs, Juris, 'Latvia: Criminal law amended to clarify that age of consent is equal for all', *ILGA-Euroletter* (2001) nr. 91, online at www.france.qrd.org/assocs/ilga/euroletter/91.html#LV.
- Lavrikovs, Juris, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in Latvia*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005 (see www.emmeijers.nl/experts).
- Leroy-Forgeot, Flora, *Histoire juridique de l'homosexualité en Europe* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1997).
- Littler, Alan, 'Discriminatory Partner Benefits', in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 609-635.*
- Makkonen, Timo, 'Country Report – Finland', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Malheiros, Manuel, 'Country Report – Portugal', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Mancini, Federico, & O'Leary, Síofra, 'The new frontiers of sex equality law in the European Union', 24 *European Law Review* (1999) 331-353.
- Marsh, Alan, & Sahin-Dikmen, Melahat, *Discrimination in Europe* (Report A & Report B), Eurobarometer 57.0 (London: Policy Studies Institute, London, 2002; Report B is available at the website of the European Commission).*
- McCrudden, Christopher, 'Theorising European Equality Law', in C. Costello & E. Barry (eds.), *Equality in Diversity* (Dublin: Ashfield, 2003), 1-38.
- More, Gillian, 'The Principle of Equal Treatment: From Market Unifier to Fundamental Right?', in P. Craig & G. De Burca (eds.), *The Evolution of EU Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 517-553.
- Moyse, Francois, 'Country Report – Luxembourg', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Numhauser-Henning, Ann, 'Country Report – Sweden', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*

- Otáhalová, Lucie, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in the Czech Republic*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005 (see www.emmeijers.nl/experts).
- Otto, Jan Michiel, Stoter, Suzan, & Arnscheidt, Julia, 'Using legislative theory to improve law and development projects', *RegelMaat* (2004) 121-138.
- Ovey, Clare, & White, Robin, *Jacobs and White: The European Convention on Human Rights* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
- Peponas, Matthaïos, 'Greece', chapter 9 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 229-245.*
- Pérez Cánovas, Nicolás, 'Spain: The Heterosexual State Refuses to Disappear', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 493-504.
- Platovas, Eduardas, 'Lithuania', in *Equality for Lesbians and Gay Men* 2001 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 44-47.*
- Pogodzinska, Patrycja, 'Recognising Sexual Orientation in Polish Law – From Combating Discrimination to Claiming New Rights', in A. Weyembergh & S. Cârstocea (eds.), *The gays' and lesbians' rights in an enlarged European Union* (Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 2006), 169-184.
- Poleshchuk, Vadim, 'Country Report – Estonia', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Prechal, Sacha, *Directives in EC law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).
- Preslavska, Mihaela, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in Bulgaria*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005.
- Quinlivan, Shivaun, 'Country Report – Ireland', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Rubio-Marín, Ruth, 'Spain', chapter 15 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 407-437.*
- Sandor, Bea, 'Hungarian Constitution Court repeals anti-gay/lesbian legislation', *ILGA-Euroletter* (2002) nr. 101, online at www.france.qrd.org/assocs/ilga/euroletter/101.html.
- Schiek, Dagmar, 'A New Framework on Equal Treatment of Persons in EC Law? Directives 2000/43/EC, 2000/78/EC and 2002/???/EC changing Directive 76/207/EEC in context', 8 *European Law Journal* (2002) 290-314.
- Schindlauer, Dieter, 'Country Report – Austria', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Simoni, Alessandro, 'Country Report – Italy', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Skidmore, Paul, 'The EC Framework Directive on Equal Treatment in Employment: Towards a Comprehensive Community Anti-discrimination Policy?', 30 *Industrial Law Journal* (2001) 126.
- Smiszek, Krzysztof, *Summary of legislation implementing Directive 2000/78/EC with respect to sexual orientation in Poland*, written at the request of K. Waaldijk & M. Bonini-Baraldi, 2005 (see www.emmeijers.nl/experts).

- Snyder, Francis, 'The Community as Employer. Staff Regulations: An Aspect of European Community Law and its Relevance to Lesbians and Gay Men', in *Homosexuality: A European Community Issue* 1993 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 251-260.
- Tesauro, Giuseppe, *Diritto comunitario* (Padova: CEDAM, 2003).
- Tobler, Christa, *Remedies and Sanctions in EC Non-Discrimination Law*, European Network of Legal Experts in the Non-Discrimination Field (Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2005).*
- Tratar, Maja Katarina, et al., 'Country Report – Slovenia', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Trimikliniotis, Nicos, 'Country Report – Cyprus', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Vindrinskaite, Saule, 'Country Report – Lithuania', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination* 2004/2005 (see above under 'Reports per title').*
- Waldijk, Kees, 'Towards Equality in the Freedom of Movement of Persons', in *After Amsterdam* 1999 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 40-49.
- Waldijk, Kees, 'Towards the Recognition of Same-Sex Partners in European Union Law: Expectations Based on Trends in National Law', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 635-651.
- Waldijk, Kees, 'Taking same-sex partnerships seriously: European experiences as British perspectives', *International Family Law* (2003) 84-95, online at www.emmeijers.nl/waldijk.
- Waldijk, Kees, 'Netherlands', chapter 13 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 341-375.*
- Waddington, Lisa, 'Throwing Some Light on Article 13 EC Treaty', 6 *Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law* (1999) 1-4.
- Waddington, Lisa, & Bell, Mark, 'More Equal Than Others: Distinguishing European Union Equality Directives', 38 *Common Market Law Review* (2001) 587-611.
- Weber, Renate, 'Country Report – Romania', in *Report on measures to combat discrimination in the 13 candidate countries* 2003 (see above under 'Reports per title').
- Weyembergh, Anne, 'Luxembourg', chapter 12 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 311-339.*
- Weyembergh, Anne, & Cârstocea, Sînziana (eds.), *The gays' and lesbians' rights in an enlarged European Union* (Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 2006).
- Whittle, Richard, & Bell, Mark, 'Between social policy and Union citizenship: The Framework Directive on equal treatment in employment', 27 *European Law Review* (2002) 677-691.
- Wintemute, Robert, *Sexual Orientation and Human Rights – The United States Constitution, the European Convention, and the Canadian Charter* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997).
- Wintemute, Robert, & Andenaes, Mads (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships – A Study of National, European and International Law* (Oxford: Hart, 2001).
- Wintemute, Robert, 'Strasbourg to the Rescue? Same-Sex Partners and Parents Under the European Convention', in R. Wintemute & M. Andenaes (eds.), *Legal Recognition of Same-Sex Partnerships* (Oxford: Hart, 2001), 713-729.

- Wintemute, Robert, 'United Kingdom', chapter 17 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 479-518.*
- Ytterberg, Hans, 'Sweden', chapter 16 in *Combating sexual orientation discrimination* 2004 (see above under 'Reports per title'), 439-477.*
- Ytterberg, Hans, 'The rights of gays and lesbians in the European Union – the Swedish experience', in A. Weyembergh & S. Cârstocea (eds.), *The gays' and lesbians' rights in an enlarged European Union* (Brussels: Editions de l'Université de Bruxelles, 2006), 81-88.

European and international case law

COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES¹

ECJ 12 November 1969, Case 29/69, <i>Stauder v. Stadt Ulm</i> [1969] ECR 419.	10
ECJ 17 December 1970, Case 11/70, <i>Internationale Handelsgesellschaft mbH v. Einfuhr und Vorratstelle für Getreide und Futtermittel</i> [1970] ECR 1125.	10
ECJ 7 February 1973, Case 39/72, <i>Commission v. Italy</i> [1973] ECR 101.	30
ECJ 12 February 1974, Case 152/73, <i>Sotgiu v. Deutsche Bundespost</i> [1974] ECR 153.	13
ECJ 14 May 1974, Case C-4/73, <i>Nold KG v. Commission</i> [1974] ECR 491.	10
ECJ 28 October 1975, Case 36/75, <i>Rutili v. Ministre de l'intérieur</i> [1975] ECR 1219.	10
ECJ 8 April 1976, Case 43/75, <i>Defrenne v. Sabena II</i> [1976] ECR 455.	6
ECJ 19 October 1977, Case 117/76, <i>Ruckdeschel and others v. Hauptzollamt Hamburg-St. Annen</i> [1977] ECR 1753.	10-11
ECJ 15 June 1978, Case 149/77, <i>Defrenne v. Sabena</i> [1978] ECR 1365.	10
ECJ 15 December 1982, Case 160/82, <i>Commission v. Netherlands</i> [1982] ECR 4637.	30-31
ECJ 10 April 1984, Case 14/83, <i>Von Colson and Kamann v. Land Nordrhein-Westfalen</i> [1984] ECR 1891.	32, 52-53
ECJ 13 November 1984, 10 February 2000, Case 283/83, <i>Racke v. Hauptzollamt Mainz</i> [1984] ECR 3791.	13
ECJ 30 January 1985, Case 143/83, <i>Commission v. Denmark</i> [1985] ECR 427.	31
ECJ 13 May 1986, Case 170/84, <i>Bilka v. Weber von Hartz</i> [1986] ECR 1607.	13, 36, 43
ECJ 15 May 1986, Case 222/84, <i>Johnston v. Chief Constable of the Royal Ulster Constabulary</i> [1986] ECR 1651.	12, 52-53
ECJ 25 November 1986, Joined Cases 201/85 and 202/85, <i>Klensch v. Secrétaire d'État</i> [1986] ECR 3477.	11
ECJ 2 December 1986, Case 239/85, <i>Commission v. Belgium</i> [1986] ECR 3645.	30
ECJ 15 October 1987, Case 222/86 <i>UNETEF v. Heylens</i> [1987] ECR 4097.	53
ECJ 13 July 1989, Case 171/88, <i>Rinner-Kühn v. FWW Spezial-Gebäudereinigung</i> [1989] ECR 2743.	43
ECJ 8 May 1990, Case C-175/88, <i>Biehl v. Administration des contributions</i> [1990] ECR I-1779.	13
ECJ 17 May 1990, Case C-262/88, <i>Barber v. Guardian Royal Exchange Assurance Group</i> [1990] ECR I-1889.	36
ECJ 19 June 1990, Case C-213/89, <i>The Queen v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame</i> [1990] ECR I-2433.	52, 54

¹ Online at www.curia.eu.int.

ECJ 14 July 1990, Case C-32/93, <i>Webb v. EMO Air Cargo</i> [1994] ECR I-3567.	13
ECJ 8 November 1990, Case C-177/88, <i>Dekker v. Stichting Vormingscentrum voor Jong Volwassenen</i> [1990] ECR I-3941.	13, 53
ECJ 13 November 1990, Case C-106/89, <i>Marleasing v. La Comercial Internacional de Alimentación</i> [1990] ECR I-4135.	32
ECJ 13 March 1991, Case C-377/89, <i>Cotter and others v. Minister for Social Welfare</i> [1991] ECR I-1155.	52
ECJ 30 May 1991, Case C-59/89, <i>Commission v. Germany</i> [1991] ECR I-2607.	30
ECJ 11 July 1991, Joined Cases C-87/90, C-88/90 and C-89/90, <i>Verholen and others v. Sociale Verzekeringsbank Amsterdam</i> [1991] ECR I-3757.	53
ECJ 25 July 1991, Case C-208/90, <i>Emmott v. Minister for Social Welfare and Attorney General</i> [1991] ECR I-4269.	52
ECJ 19 November 1991, Joined Cases C-6/90 and C-9/90, <i>Francovich and Bonifaci v. Italy</i> [1991] ECR I-5357.	54
ECJ 2 August 1993, Case C-271/91, <i>Marshall v. Southampton and South West Hampshire Area Health Authority</i> [1993] ECR I-4367.	53
ECJ 5 October 1994, Case C-404/92, <i>X v. Commission</i> [1994] ECR I-4737.	46
ECJ 13 February 1996, Case C-342/93, <i>Gillespie and others</i> [1996] ECR I-475.	13
ECJ 5 March 1996, Joined Cases C-46/93 and C-48/93, <i>Brasserie du pêcheur v. Bundesrepublik Deutschland</i> , and <i>The Queen v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame and others</i> [1996] ECR I-1029.	54
ECJ 30 April 1996, Case C-13/94, <i>P. v. S and Cornwall County Council</i> [1996] ECR I-2143.	11, 29, 33, 72, 97, 206
ECJ 23 May 1996, Case C-237/94, <i>O'Flynn v. Adjudication Officer</i> [1996] ECR 2417.	34
ECJ 22 April 1997, Case C-180/95, <i>Draehmpaehl v. Urania Immobilienservice OHG</i> [1997] ECR I-2195.	53
ECJ 17 February 1998, Case C-249/96, <i>Grant v. South West Trains Ltd.</i> [1998] ECR I-621.	11, 21-22, 29, 33, 37, 39, 41, 77, 110, 113-114, 205, 213
ECJ 17 June 1998, Case C-243/95, <i>Hill and Stapleton v. The Revenue Commissioners and Department of Finance</i> [1998] ECR I-3739.	43
ECJ 22 September 1998, Case C-185/97, <i>Coote v. Granada Hospitality</i> [1998] ECR I-9285.	53
ECJ 19 May 1999, Case C-225/97, <i>Commission v. France</i> [1999] ECR I-3011.	30
ECJ 28 October 1999, Case C-187/98, <i>Commission v. Greece</i> [1999] ECR I-7713.	31
ECJ 11 November 1999, Case C-315/98, <i>Commission v. Italy</i> [1999] ECR I-8001.	30
ECJ 3 February 2000, Case C-207/98, <i>Mahlburg</i> [2000] ECR 3875.	13
ECJ 10 February 2000, Case C-50/96 <i>Schröder</i> [2000] ECR I-743.	13
ECJ 17 May 2001, Case C-159/99, <i>Commission v. Italy</i> [2001] ECR I-4007.	30
ECJ 31 May 2001, Joined Cases C-122/99 and C-125/99, <i>D and Sweden v. Council</i> [2001] ECR I-4319.	11, 21-22, 44, 78, 113
ECJ 4 October 2001, Case C-109/00, <i>Tele Danmark</i> [2001] ECR I-6993.	47
ECJ 16 January 2003, Case C-388/01, <i>Commission v. Italy</i> [2003] ECR I-721.	11, 31
ECJ 16 January 2003, Case C-29/02, <i>Commission v. Spain</i> [2003] ECR I-811.	31

ECJ 27 February 2003, Case C-415/01, <i>Commission v. Belgium</i> [2003] ECR I-2081.	30
ECJ 13 March 2003, Case C-436/01, <i>Commission v. Belgium</i> [2003] ECR I-2633.	31
ECJ 7 January 2004, Case C-117/01, <i>K.B. v. National Health Service Pensions Agency</i> [2004] ECR I-541.	28, 30, 115
ECJ 20 October 2005, Case C-70/05, <i>Commission v. Luxembourg</i> .	2, 22, 90, 191
ECJ 22 November 2005, Case C-144/04, <i>Mangold v. Helm</i> .	11-12, 22, 68, 217

Court of First Instance 24 June 1992, Case T-11/90, <i>H. S. v. Council</i> [1992] ECR II-1869.	46
Court of First Instance 18 September 1992, Joined Cases T-121/89 and T-13/90, <i>X v. Commission</i> [1992] ECR II-2195.	46
Court of First Instance 14 April 1994, Case T-10/93, <i>A v. Commission</i> [1994] ECR II-179.	46

EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS²

ECtHR 23 July 1968, <i>Belgian Linguistic Cases</i> , Series A, nr. 6.	14
ECtHR 22 October 1981, <i>Dudgeon v. UK</i> , appl. 7525/76, Series A, nr. 45.	17, 33, 38, 49, 70, 205
ECtHR 26 October 1988, <i>Norris v. Ireland</i> , appl. 10581/83, Series A, nr. 142.	70, 205
ECtHR 22 April 1993, <i>Modinos v. Cyprus</i> , appl. 15070/89, Series A, nr. 259.	70, 205
ECtHR 18 July 1994, <i>Karlheinz Schmidt v. Germany</i> , appl. 13580/88, Series A, nr. 291-B.	14
ECtHR 1 July 1997, <i>Kalaç v. Turkey</i> , appl. 20704/92, <i>Reports of Judgements and Decisions</i> 1997-IV.	38
ECtHR 27 September 1999, <i>Lustig-Prean and Beckett v. UK</i> , appl. 31417/96 and 32377/96.	23, 38-39, 46, 49, 70-71, 76, 205
ECtHR 27 September 1999, <i>Smith and Grady v. UK</i> , appl. 33985/96 and 33986/96, <i>Reports of Judgements and Decisions</i> 1999-VI.	17, 23, 49, 70-71, 76, 205
ECtHR 21 December 1999, <i>Salgueiro da Silva Mouta v. Portugal</i> , appl. 33290/96, <i>Reports of Judgements and Decisions</i> 1999-IX.	16-17, 70-71, 77, 110, 205, 213
ECtHR 6 April 2000, <i>Thlimmenos v. Greece</i> , appl. 34369/97, <i>Reports of Judgments and Decisions</i> 2000-IV.	14, 47, 119
ECtHR 12 May 2000, <i>Szivárvány társulás a melegek jogaiért v. Hungary</i> , appl. 35419/97 (admissibility decision, not available at www.echr.coe.int).	45
ECtHR 31 July 2000, <i>A.D.T. v. UK</i> , appl. 35765/97, <i>Reports of Judgements and Decisions</i> 2000-IX.	70
ECtHR 4 May 2001, <i>Hugh Jordan v. UK</i> , appl. 24746/94.	15
ECtHR 11 July 2002, <i>Christine Goodwin v. UK</i> , appl. 28957/95, <i>Reports of Judgements and Decisions</i> 2002-IV.	29-30

² Online at www.echr.coe.int.

- ECtHR 26 February 2002, *Fretté v. France*, appl. 36515/97, *Reports of Judgements and Decisions* 2002-I. 17, 70
- ECtHR 22 October 2002, *Beck, Copp and Bazeley v. UK*, appl. 48535/99, 48536/99 and 48537/99. 23, 49, 70-71, 205
- ECtHR 9 January 2003, *L. & V. v. Austria*, appl. 39392/98 and 39829/98, *Reports of Judgements and Decisions* 2003-I. 17, 33, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- ECtHR 9 January 2003, *S.L. v. Austria*, appl. 45330/99, *Reports of Judgements and Decisions* 2003-I. 17, 33, 39, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- ECtHR 24 July 2003, *Karner v. Austria*, appl. 40016/98, *Reports of Judgements and Decisions* 2003-IX. 16-17, 33, 41, 44, 70-72, 77, 102, 110, 114, 206, 213
- ECtHR 10 February 2004, *B.B. v. UK*, appl. 53760/00. 17, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- ECtHR 26 February 2004, *Nachova and others v. Bulgaria*, appl. 43577/98 and 43579/98 (replaced by the Grand Chamber judgement of 6 July 2005, see below). 15-16
- ECtHR 20 July 2004, *Balogh v. Hungary*, appl. 47940/99. 16
- ECtHR 9 November 2004, *Hasan Ilhan v. Turkey*, appl. 22494/93. 16
- ECtHR 6 January 2005, *Hoogendijk v. the Netherlands*, appl. 58641/00 (admissibility decision). 15-16
- ECtHR 3 February 2005, *Ladner v. Austria*, appl. 18297/03. 17, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- ECtHR 26 May 2005, *Wolfmeyer v. Austria*, appl. 5263/03. 17, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- ECtHR 2 June 2005, *H.G. and G.B. v. Austria*, appl. 11084/02 and 15306/02. 17, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- ECtHR 6 July 2005, *Nachova and others v. Bulgaria*, appl. 43577/98 and 43579/98 (Grand Chamber, replacing the Section judgement of 26 February 2004, see above). 15-16
- ECtHR 19 January 2006, *R.H. v. Austria*, appl. 7336/03. 17, 70-71, 77, 110, 206, 213
- European Commission of Human Rights, 3 May 1988, *Morissens v. Belgium*, appl. 11389/85, [1988] 56 *Decisions and Reports* 127. 41-47
- European Commission of Human Rights, 1 July 1997, *Sutherland v. UK*, appl. 25186/94. 16
- UNITED NATIONS HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE³
- UN Human Rights Committee, 31 March 1994, *Toonen v. Australia*, Communication 488/1992, [1994] *Interights International Human Rights Law* 27. 205
- UN Human Rights Committee, 29 August 2003, *Young v. Australia*, Communication 941/2000. 44, 114, 206, 213

³ Online at www.unhchr.ch/search.htm.

European Community legislation

EMPLOYMENT EQUALITY DIRECTIVE

Directive 2000/78/EC of 27 November 2000 establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation, *OJ L* 303, 2.12.2000, p. 16.

text of -, 221-231

travaux préparatoires, 7, 32, 34, 37, 42, 48, 96, 221

adoption of -, 1, 6, 12, 18, 61, 67, 74, 87, 189-190, 205, 221

implementation of -, 2, 28, 72-75, 87-94, 146-154, 186-201, 209-212

recital 1 (principles), 209, 221

recital 11 (objectives), II, 222

recital 13 (social security), 123, 222

recital 15 (evidence), 35, 43, 223

recital 18 (police and armed forces), 49, 223

recital 22 (marital status), 37, 42-43, 113-116, 194, 223

recital 24 (churches), 122, 126, 223

recital 29 (interest groups), 54, 140, 224

recital 31 (burden of proof), 55, 141, 224

article 1 (purpose and grounds), 32-33, 37, 56, 94-98, 103, 111-112, 148, 198, 194, 225-228

article 2 (concept of discrimination), 23, 33-40, 45-48, 56-57, 98-104, 114-117, 121-123,

140-145, 148, 154, 158-159, 164, 193-196, 211-212, 225-227

article 3 (scope), 36-38, 41, 45, 49, 54, 57, 79, 104-109, 123, 138, 148, 162-165, 195, 210-211, 226, 229

article 4 (occupational requirements), 23, 49, 50, 88, 122-128, 148, 165-170, 186-187, 196, 211-212, 226

article 5 (reasonable accommodation), 225, 227

article 6 (justification for age), 227

article 7 (positive action), 51, 88, 129, 228

article 8 (minimum requirements), 228

article 9 (defence of rights), 52-55, 132-134, 139-141, 148, 183-184, 197, 201, 228-229

article 10 (burden of proof), 55, 134, 141-142, 148, 179-182, 198, 228

article 11 (victimisation), 56, 142-143, 148, 179-182, 198, 210, 229

article 12 (information), 3, 229

article 13 (social dialogue), 3, 229

article 14 (dialogue with ngo's), 3, 229

article 15 (Northern Ireland), 230

article 16 (compliance), 56-58, 143-146, 230

- article 17 (sanctions), 52-54, 134-137, 148, 172-174, 198, 201, 211, 230
- article 18 (implementation), 148, 230
- article 19 (report), 217, 231
- article 20 (entry into force), 231
- article 21 (addressees), 231

OTHER DIRECTIVES

- Directive 75/117/EEC of 10 February 1975 on the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the application of the principle of equal pay for men and women, *OJ L* 45, 19.2.1975, p. 19. 23
- Directive 76/207/EEC of 9 February 1976 on the implementation of the principle of equal treatment for men and women as regards access to employment, vocational training and promotion, and working conditions, *OJ L* 39, 14.2.1976, p. 40. 23,53
- Directive 79/7/EEC of 19 December 1978 on the progressive implementation of the principle of equal treatment for men and women in matters of social security, *OJ L* 6, 10.2.1979, p. 24. 23
- Directive 86/378/EEC of 24 July 1986 on the implementation of the principle of equal treatment for men and women in occupational social security schemes, *OJ L* 45, 12.8.1986, p. 40. 23
- Directive 92/85/EEC of 19 October 1992 on the introduction of measures to encourage improvements in the safety and health at work of pregnant workers and workers who have recently given birth or are breastfeeding, *OJ L* 348, 28.11.1992, p. 1. 23
- Directive 96/97/EC of 20 December 1996 amending Directive 86/378/EEC on the implementation of the principle of equal treatment for men and women in occupational social security schemes, *OJ L* 46, 17.2.1997, p. 20; corrected by *OJ L* 151, 18.6.1999, p. 39. 23
- Directive 97/80/EC of 15 December 1997 on the burden of proof in cases of discrimination based on sex, *OJ L* 14, 20.1.1998, p. 6. 13, 23-24, 55
- Directive 2000/43/EC of 29 June 2000 implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of racial or ethnic origin, *OJ L* 180, 19.7.2000, p. 22 (*Racial Equality Directive*). 7, 12-13, 23, 28, 40, 52, 79, 89, 130, 175-178, 197, 208, 212, 215-217
- Directive 2002/73/EC of 23 September 2002 amending Council Directive 76/207/EEC on the implementation of the principle of equal treatment for men and women as regards access to employment, vocational training and promotion, and working conditions, *OJ L* 269, 5.10.2002, p. 15. 23, 35, 53
- Directive 2003/9/EC of 27 January 2003 laying down minimum standards for the reception of asylum seekers, *OJ L* 31, 6.2.2003, p. 18. 26
- Directive 2003/86/EC of 22 September 2003 on the right to family reunification, *OJ L* 251, 3.10.2003, p. 12. 27
- Directive 2003/109/EC of 25 November 2003 concerning the status of third-country nationals who are long-term residents, *OJ L* 16, 23.01.2004, p. 44. 27

- Directive 2004/38/EC of 29 April 2004 on the right of citizens of the Union and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States amending Regulation (EEC) No 1612/68 and repealing Directives 64/221/EEC, 68/360/EEC, 72/194/EEC, 73/148/EEC, 75/34/EEC, 75/35/EEC, 90/364/EEC, 90/365/EEC, and 93/96/EEC, *OJ L* 158, 30.4.2004, p. 77. 26
- Directive 2004/81/EC of 29 April 2004 on the residence permit issued to third-country nationals who are victims of trafficking in human beings or who have been the subject of an action to facilitate illegal immigration, who cooperate with the competent authorities, *OJ L* 261, 6.8.2004, p. 19. 27
- Directive 2004/83/EC, of 29 April 2004, on minimum standards for the qualification and status of third country nationals or stateless persons as refugees or as persons who otherwise need international protection and the content of the protection granted, *OJ L* 304, 30.9.2004, p. 12. 27

REGULATIONS

- Regulation (EEC, ECSC, Euratom) 259/68 of 29 February 1968 laying down the Staff Regulations of Officials and the Conditions of Employment of Other Servants of the European Communities and instituting special measures temporarily applicable to officials of the Commission, *OJ L* 56, 4.3.1968, p. 1. 18
- Regulation (EEC) 1612/68 of 15 October 1968 on freedom of movement for workers within the Community, *OJ L* 257, 19.10.1968, p. 2. 13, 25-26
- Regulation (EC, ECSC, Euratom) 781/98 of 7 April 1998 amending the Staff Regulations of Officials and Conditions of Employment of Other Servants of the European Communities in respect of equal treatment, *OJ L* 113, 15.4.1998, p. 4. 18
- Regulation (EC) 343/2003 of 18 February 2003 establishing the criteria and mechanisms for determining the Member State responsible for examining an asylum application lodged in one of the Member States by a third-country national, *OJ L* 50, 25.2.2003, p. 1. 26
- Regulation (EC, Euratom) 723/2004 of 22 March 2004 amending the Staff Regulations of Officials and Conditions of Employment of Other Servants of the European Communities, *OJ L* 124, 27.4.2004, p. 1. 19