Discrimination based on [...] sexual orientation may undermine the achievement of the objectives of the EC Treaty, in particular the attainment of a high level of employment and social protection, raising the standard of living and the quality of life, economic and social cohesion and solidarity, and the free movement of persons.

Employment Equality Directive, recital 11

by

Kees Waaldijk

and

Matteo Bonini-Baraldi
## Summary contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>VII</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>IX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>XIV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>XV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 The Employment Equality Directive and other aspects of European law</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 General situation with respect to sexual orientation discrimination at national level</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4 Comparative analysis of legislation implementing the Directive in the fifteen old Member States</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5 Implementation of the Directive in the ten new Member States and in the two acceding countries</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6 Overview of the state of implementation of the Directive</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7 Conclusions</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European and international case law</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Community legislation</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

For their help and support in the completion of this book we are deeply indebted to many. It is with a touch of pride that we say this, because we firmly believe in the benefits that collaborative research can offer to the advancement of our understanding of legal phenomena.

From Brussels, the European Commission provided funding for the establishment of the European Group of Experts on Combating Sexual Orientation Discrimination, which we have jointly coordinated at the Universiteit Leiden. Without this funding (under the Community Action Programme to Combat Discrimination 2001-2006) we would never have been able to pool together the wealth of expertise and dedication that enabled the group to produce its report, on which this book is based. The Commission’s Anti-Discrimination Unit supported the activities of the Group and, through Cécile Le Clercq and Álvaro Oliveira, closely followed the writing and editing of the report and helped us through the many intricacies of performing a contract with the Commission. It goes without saying that neither the report nor this book necessarily reflects the opinion or position of national authorities or of the European Commission.

We are grateful to the national experts that were part of the Group of Experts, that existed from 2002 to 2004: Helmut Graupner, Olivier De Schutter, Søren Baatrup, Rainer Hiltunen, Daniel Borrillo, Susanne Baer, Matthaios Peponas, Mark Bell, Stefano Fabeni, Anne Weyembergh, Miguel Freitas, Ruth Rubio-Marín, Hans Ytterberg and Robert Wintemute. We are equally indebted to those who joined our efforts at a later stage for all of their voluntary work. This informal network was composed of: Mihaela Preslavska, Haris Kountouros, Lucie Otáhalová, Juris Lavrikovs, Christian Attard, Krzysztof Smiszek and Iustina Ionescu. It is only thanks to the competence, passion and patience of all of them that we are now able to present this book.

At the Faculty of Law of the Universiteit Leiden, our comparative study of the implementation of the Employment Equality Directive was part of the research programme Securing the Rule of Law in a World of Multi-Level Jurisdiction of the E.M. Meijers Institute of Legal Studies.

In Leiden, staff of the Meijers Institute supported us in coordinating the activities of the Group and in overcoming the inevitable difficulties we faced. We would like to mention especially: Riekje Boumlak, secretary to the project, Alan Littler, researcher, Erik Kien, financial adviser, Wout Morra, Caroline
Koetsenruijter and Loes Amperse, research assistants, and Stephen Moran, research assistant and language editor. To all of them, to the T.M.C. Asser Press and to the many other people who helped us complete this book, we wish to express our deepest and sincerest gratitude.

Leiden/Bologna, January 2006

Kees Waaldijk, Matteo Bonini-Baraldi
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>VII</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>XIV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of abbreviations</td>
<td>XV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The Employment Equality Directive and other aspects of European law</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 General legal situation</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1 Constitutional protection against discrimination</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2 General principles and concepts of equality</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3 Provisions on sexual orientation discrimination in employment or occupation</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4 Important case law precedents on sexual orientation discrimination in employment or occupation</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.5 Provisions on discrimination in employment or occupation that do not (yet) cover sexual orientation</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.6 Provisions on sexual orientation discrimination in other fields than employment and occupation</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.7 Other aspects of the legal background</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The prohibition of discrimination required by the Directive</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Instrument(s) used to implement the Directive</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2 Concept of sexual orientation (article 1)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3 Direct discrimination (article 2(2)(a))</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.4 Indirect discrimination (article 2(2)(b))</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.5 Prohibition and concept of harassment (article 2(3))</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.6 Instruction to discriminate (article 2(4))</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.7 Material scope of the applicability of the prohibition (article 3)</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.8 Personal scope of applicability: natural and legal persons whose actions are the object of the prohibition</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 What forms of conduct in the field of employment are prohibited as sexual orientation discrimination?</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s actual or assumed heterosexual, homosexual or bisexual preference or behaviour</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s coming out with, or not hiding, his or her sexual orientation</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 Discrimination between same-sex partners and different-sex partners</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.3.4 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s association with LGB individuals, events or organisations

2.3.5 Discrimination against groups, organisations, events or information of/for/on LGB individuals

2.3.6 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s refusal to answer, or answering inaccurately, a question about sexual orientation

2.3.7 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s previous criminal record due to a conviction for a homosexual offence without heterosexual equivalent

2.3.8 Harassment

2.4 Exceptions to the prohibition of discrimination

2.4.1 Objectively justified indirect disadvantages (article 2(2)(b)(i))

2.4.2 Measures necessary for public security, for the protection of rights of others, etc. (article 2(5))

2.4.3 Social security and similar payments (article 3(3))

2.4.4 Occupational requirements (article 4(1))

2.4.5 Loyalty to the organisation’s ethos based on religion or belief (article 4(2))

2.4.6 Positive action (article 7(1))

2.5 Remedies and enforcement

2.5.1 Basic structure of enforcement of employment law

2.5.2 Specific and/or general enforcement bodies

2.5.3 Civil, penal, administrative, advisory and/or conciliatory procedures (article 9(1))

2.5.4 Civil, penal and/or administrative sanctions (article 17)

2.5.5 Natural and legal persons to whom sanctions may be applied

2.5.6 Awareness among law enforcers of sexual orientation issues

2.5.7 Standing for interest groups (article 9(2))

2.5.8 Burden of proof of discrimination (article 10)

2.5.9 Burden of proof of sexual orientation

2.5.10 Victimisation (article 11)

2.6 Reform of existing discriminatory laws and provisions

2.6.1 Abolition of discriminatory laws and administrative provisions (article 16(a))

2.6.2 Measures to ensure amendment or nullity of other discriminatory provisions (article 16(b))

2.7 Concluding remarks

3 General situation with respect to sexual orientation discrimination at national level

3.1 The social situation

3.2 Constitutional protection against discrimination

3.3 Provisions on sexual orientation discrimination in employment
3.4 Case law precedents on sexual orientation discrimination in employment 76
3.5 Provisions on discrimination in employment that do not cover sexual orientation 78
3.6 Provisions on sexual orientation discrimination in fields other than employment 79
3.7 Other aspects of the legal background 82

4 Comparative analysis of legislation implementing the Directive in the fifteen old Member States 87
4.1 Introduction 87
4.2 The prohibition of discrimination required by the Directive 91
  4.2.1 Instrument(s) used to implement the Directive 91
  4.2.2 Concept of sexual orientation (article 1) 94
  4.2.3 Direct discrimination (article 2(2)(a)) 98
  4.2.4 Indirect discrimination (article 2(2)(b)) 100
  4.2.5 Prohibition and concept of harassment (article 2(3)) 102
  4.2.6 Instruction to discriminate (article 2(4)) 104
  4.2.7 Material scope of the applicability of the prohibition (article 3) 104
  4.2.8 Personal scope of applicability: natural and legal persons whose actions are the object of the prohibition 108
4.3 What forms of conduct in the field of employment are prohibited as sexual orientation discrimination? 110
  4.3.1 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s actual or assumed heterosexual, homosexual or bisexual preference or behaviour 110
  4.3.2 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s coming out with, or not hiding, his or her sexual orientation 112
  4.3.3 Discrimination between same-sex partners and different-sex partners 113
  4.3.4 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s association with LGB individuals, events or organisations 117
  4.3.5 Discrimination against groups, organisations, events or information of/for/on LGB individuals 118
  4.3.6 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s refusal to answer, or answering inaccurately, a question about sexual orientation 118
  4.3.7 Discrimination on grounds of a person’s previous criminal record due to a conviction for a homosexual offence without heterosexual equivalent 119
  4.3.8 Harassment 120
4.4 Exceptions to the prohibition of discrimination 121
  4.4.1 Objectively justified indirect disadvantages (article 2(2)(b)(i)) 121
  4.4.2 Measures necessary for public security, for the protection of rights of others, etc. (article 2(5)) 121
  4.4.3 Social security and similar payments (article 3(3)) 123
4.4.4 Occupational requirements (article 4(1)) 124
4.4.5 Loyalty to the organisation’s ethos based on religion or belief (article 4(2)) 126
4.4.6 Positive action (article 7(1)) 129
4.4.7 Exceptions beyond the Directive 129
4.5 Remedies and enforcement 130
4.5.1 Basic structure of enforcement of employment law 130
4.5.2 Specific and/or general enforcement bodies 130
4.5.3 Civil, penal, administrative, advisory and/or conciliatory procedures (article 9(1)) 132
4.5.4 Civil, penal and/or administrative sanctions (article 17) 134
4.5.5 Natural and legal persons to whom sanctions may be applied 137
4.5.6 Awareness among law enforcers of sexual orientation issues 138
4.5.7 Standing for interest groups (article 9(2)) 139
4.5.8 Burden of proof of discrimination (article 10) 141
4.5.9 Burden of proof of sexual orientation 141
4.5.10 Victimisation (article 11) 142
4.6 Reform of existing discriminatory laws and provisions 143
4.6.1 Abolition of discriminatory laws and administrative provisions (article 16(a)) 143
4.6.2 Measures to ensure amendment or nullity of other discriminatory provisions (article 16(b)) 144
4.6.3 Discriminatory laws and provisions still in force 145
4.7 Concluding remarks 146

5 Implementation of the Directive in the ten new Member States and in the two acceding countries 149
5.1 Introduction 149
5.2 The prohibition of discrimination 152
5.2.1 Direct and indirect discrimination (article 2(2)) 154
5.2.2 Harassment (article 2(3)) and instruction to discriminate (article 2(4)) 159
5.2.3 Material scope (article 3) 162
5.3 Exceptions 164
5.3.1 Measures necessary for public security, for the protection of rights of others, etc. (article 2(5)) 164
5.3.2 Social security and similar payments (article 3(3)) 164
5.3.3 Occupational requirements (article 4(1)) and loyalty to the organisation’s ethos based on religion or belief (article 4(2)) 165
5.3.4 Positive action (article 7(1)) 170
5.4 Enforcement 171
5.4.1 Sanctions (article 17) 172
5.4.2 Enforcement bodies 175
5.4.3 Burden of proof (article 10) and victimisation (article 11) 179
5.4.4 Standing for interest groups (article 9(2)) 183
List of tables

| Table 1 | The non-acceptance of homosexual people according to the European Values Study Surveys | 62 |
| Table 2 | The acceptance of homosexuality according to the European Values Study Surveys | 63 |
| Table 3 | The level of opposition against (sexual orientation) discrimination according to the 2002 Eurobarometer | 64 |
| Table 4 | The extent of perceived sexual orientation discrimination according to the 2002 Eurobarometer | 66 |
| Table 5 | Provisions on sexual orientation discrimination in employment | 73 |
| Table 6 | Provisions on sexual orientation discrimination beyond employment | 80 |
| Table 7 | Decriminalisation of homosexuality and legislative recognition of same-sex partners | 83 |
| Table 8 | Major shortcomings in the implementation of the Directive | 148 |
Abbreviations

appl. application number(s)

COM documents of the Commission of the European Communities


EC European Community, European Communities, or Treaty Establishing the European Community


ECJ Court of Justice of the European Communities

ECR European Court Reports

ECSC European Coal and Steel Community

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EEC European Economic Community

EU Charter European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights

Euratom European Atomic Energy Community

ILGA International Lesbian and Gay Association

LGB lesbian, gay and/or bisexual

OJ L Official Journal of the European Communities (L Series)

OJ C Official Journal of the European Communities (C Series)

para. paragraph(s)