

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/138671> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Klasing Chen, M.

Title: Memorable arts: The mnemonics of painting and calligraphy in Late Imperial China

Issue Date: 2020-12-16

Conclusion

Memorization played a central role in the transmission of practical knowledge in China. Throughout the imperial period, and especially during the Ming (1368-1644) and Qing (1644-1912) dynasties, mnemonic rhymes and techniques were used, transmitted and adapted. Even as practical knowledge was codified to circulate as text, rhymes and mnemonic allusions gained value instead of being replaced by detailed and objective descriptions in prose. The formal aspects of memory aids for calligraphy and painting were tightly connected to their reception and dissemination in late imperial China. The cases studied here, which deal with processes of remembering and forgetting, show that the transmission of practical and internalized knowledge was intimately connected to social and individual practices of memory. They provide insight into educational practices propagated through print, and into how Chinese mnemonics made use of collective memory to aid the individual memorization process.

Even though practitioners in different fields and social groups developed mnemonic aids that codified knowledge required for specific occupations, they drew on shared knowledge and tackled memorization practices in similar ways. Significant overlaps can be identified in the historical development of mnemonic aids in the fields of calligraphy and painting.

During the Ming dynasty, the development of mnemonics was characterized by acts of forgetting and the valorization of practices. While Gao Song, the author of mnemonic rhymes for both calligraphy and painting, was soon forgotten, the practical knowledge in his treatises continued to be disseminated long after his death. His efforts to codify practical knowledge for circulation in printed media rendered it easy to grasp and objective. Ming encyclopedias show how editors and compilers brought together practical knowledge codified in writing by both the elite and craftsmen. The gradual detachment from the author's identity through the objectification of knowledge in print and the expansion of the commercial printing market both contributed to the broad dissemination and normalization of practical knowledge. Ming authors and editors tapped into existing schemata to make knowledge accessible to broader audiences. It was through the efforts of these individuals to present practical knowledge as self-sustaining, and at the same time as interconnected among fields, that it became valorized and integrated into the broader organization of knowledge.

Between the late Ming and the mid Qing, authors challenged long-standing traditions and drew new parallels to other fields. In terms of presentation, their innovation was to describe coherent systems of knowledge that were easy to remember. The case of the *Hundred-Rhyme Song* shows how appropriations and adaptations of a rhyme for learning cursive script led an anonymous practice-oriented text to be accepted by the elite and by imperial households. The mnemonic rhyme became a new form of canon that relied more on syncretic standards instead of the perpetuation of masters' styles. This shift toward standards is also evident in the approaches to portraiture practices of the mid Qing. As practicing scholars who had become professionals in the field developed their individual approaches to portraiture, their practices were no longer limited to what had been transmitted from the past, such as typologies of facial features. These "new practitioners" adopted methods that relied on their previous experience in other fields. Embodied knowledge, or their "embodied way" acquired through a long course of incorporation that entailed remembrance "in the hands" and muscles,⁶⁴⁶ was translated from one field to the next, partly to facilitate communication of techniques to the prospective reader of the treatises. Both the anonymous rhyme and Qing portraiture treatises moved away from individual models and types toward coherent and intelligible standards.

From the mid to the late Qing, the most important development is the rise of the social value of mnemonics. The author's identity, especially shaped by scholarly and blood lineages, becomes a central concern in the transmission of practical knowledge and its mnemonic rendering. For Jiang He, the use and development of the "nine palaces" grid is directly tied to the figures and authority of his father and grandfather. Even Kang Youwei, a defender of educational reforms, makes reference to the nine-palaces grid in a book conceived as a response to the practice-oriented Bao Shichen, the student of the renowned scholar of "metal and stone," Deng Shiru, highlighting a lineage of evidential scholarship. In the case of Dai Yiheng, the practical training he received from his uncle and his memories of the period before the Taiping War are monumentalized in his lengthy rhymed treatise composed for his foreign students. His awareness of the gap between past and present shifts his attention to the historical quality of knowledge. Mnemonic treatises and tools become a means to transmit not only practical content, but also personal history and the author's identity.

⁶⁴⁶ Connerton. 2009. *How Societies Remember*, 93.

These cases show that although memorization remained important into the late Qing, the nature of its social value shifted over time. The similarities among these parallel cases are related to changes in society, such as the changing perception of embodied knowledge and oral practices, the dissemination of pedagogical text, and responses to commercialization and professionalization.

Engaging the Reader's Memory

The mnemonic techniques and aids discussed in this study show that memory played a central role in the textual transmission of knowledge for the crafts of calligraphy and painting. These mnemonics relied heavily on repetition, summaries, rhymes and graphs to help the student absorb the content and provided methods that prompted the reader to practice orally. The segmentation of visual elements as well as of movement, the serialization of actions via the creation of steps and the emphasis on standardization over style shaped the content of mnemonics in both fields. They often combined textual instructions with graphs and illustrations so the student could visualize and comprehend the standards that were to be internalized. Along with standards that aimed to produce one desired type of graphic result, visual aids that allowed for generalized use, such as the grid, established standards for both seeing and composing. Thus, mnemonics not only offered useful rules to achieve a specific esthetic output, but also served as guides for gestures and sight. Rhymes were retained in the mind through rote memorization and observation and their content was retained in the muscles through repeated action.

Authors grounded the content of their standards and rhymes in the past, making sure the student did not have to rely on rote memorization alone, but was also able to draw on their cultural background. Although the practices were meant to be repeated and enacted in the present, which can also be deduced from the heavy use of the imperative in the treatises, creators and recyclers of rhymes provided historical context for their memory aids.

Authors often made references to historical figures, such as creators of certain types of script or masters of specific painting motifs. They also discussed earlier versions of mnemonic rhymes or visual aids, anchoring their own instructions in the traditions of the past. By embedding new knowledge in the rhetoric of the past, authors provided familiar forms for readers to

access the new standards in their treatises without threatening cultural cohesion. Dai Yiheng anchored his treatise in his personal past to cope with tension between the demands of his students and his scholarly identity. As Sluiter has argued, references to the historical past were not constraints to innovation, but helped to accommodate new beliefs, concepts, values and ambitions.⁶⁴⁷ Through “anchoring,” it became possible to introduce innovative features and, at the same time, retain the aura of the past. The past thus functioned as a stable base to present contemporary agendas, as authors consciously took advantage of what the reader already regarded as his own past to engage him in the present.

Several cases discussed here, however, also provide another perspective on how innovation could be introduced to crafts and practices. Gao Song compared calligraphy to weaving, claiming that both practices shared the same constructive principle. Ming editors and scholars who followed him also believed in implicit connections that linked all practical fields. Qing painters continued to explore the mnemonic potential of these connections in their own theories. Gao Song’s analogy to weaving can be extended to explain how Chinese mnemonic treatises and rhymes conveyed practical knowledge. Instead of representing a vertical process, such as “anchoring,” the codification of knowledge constitutes a horizontal strategy, best described by the image of “weaving.” As a connective process that unites warp and weft into a pattern through repetitive movement, “weaving” can effectively describe innovations in practical and embodied knowledge.

“Weaving” facilitated the transfer of practical knowledge across fields. One straightforward example is the internalized process of hand-mnemonics, which spread across several fields. Hand mnemonics provided a basic segmentation of the parts of the hand that relied on the schematic sequence of earthly branches, which can be seen as warp threads. The basic movements of the sequence, once internalized, served as a guide for other practices. The sequence would thus become intertwined with the knowledge that was overlaid, whether this was medical, mathematical or musical knowledge. This constituted the weft, which tied together the two types of practice into a mnemonic pattern.

Qing authors of painting treatises took practical knowledge possessed by the student as a reference. This knowledge represents the warp threads in the loom’s harness, giving new theories structure and providing guiding

⁶⁴⁷ Sluiter. 2017. “Anchoring Innovation: A Classical Research Agenda,” 23; 36.

threads for the student. Innovative features and new practices that are introduced to the student constitute the weft. The weft travels in and out of the warps, connecting them and producing a new pattern. This pattern, which is analogous to the mnemonic treatises and instructions, is grasped and memorized by the student. The student can emulate these patterns and produce his own “cloth of knowledge” through repetitive action.

When authors wove innovative practices into existing practices, they invited students to extend the skills they already possessed to other fields. This approach went beyond engaging the reader’s memory in order to imprint rhymes or accommodate novelties in known narratives. The process of “weaving” is especially clear in portraiture treatises, where new practices were introduced by means of preexisting vocabulary and processes taken from other practices. Rules from landscape painting, physiognomy and calligraphy constituted the warp threads, while the new practices related to portraiture functioned as weft. Calligraphy rules to create balance within characters, for example, came to serve as the guiding rules to compose the features of the face. The resulting patterns were the coherent systems described in the treatises, in which practical knowledge of two fields merged.

“Weaving” functions very differently from metonymic reference, which, in Hutton’s words, is “an eidetic image of a detail that stands for a complete metaphorical topic.”⁶⁴⁸ The best-known example for such a reference is Proust’s madeleine. Proust’s flashback to his youth was triggered by the sight and odor of the cake. His memory came back to him unintended, and the cake functioned as a metonym to his childhood memory. Weaving also functions differently from collective memory formation, which commences with the memories of individuals that become broadly accepted by a group and are eventually formalized, generalized and even ritualized. In the cases discussed here, weaving functions in the context of practice-oriented pedagogy. It accepts parts of collective embodied memory as a premise, but it does not seek to merely trigger the recollection of events or repetition of actions, but rather uses the internalized knowledge as a springboard to introduce new action. “Weaving” is not about the creation of collective memory, but about the use of memory in practice.

Both acts of “weaving” and the creation of connections between specific crafts and broad cosmological schemata that shaped the collective perception of the world introduced new processes for the transmission of

⁶⁴⁸ Hutton. 1993. *History as an Art of Memory*, 34.

practical knowledge. Authors of mnemonic treatises presupposed practical knowledge in the reader and derived proper guidelines from it, which allowed them to discuss new approaches. Chinese mnemonics thus bridged the gap between the knowledge shared in the collective memory of certain groups and the new practical standards that still require memorization and internalization by the individual. They function as if Proust's madeleine had been intentionally placed there by his teacher, hoping that it would trigger the memories of his youth, but only so he could better talk about a different and new experience. Collective memory of specific groups and broadly accepted schemata were the basis for new practical procedures.

The Book as a Pedagogical Institution

The maintenance of collective memory is often discussed as taking place within ritualized contexts, such as religious events or national holidays. There is usually an institution behind the organization of such activities, and it designates a group of people to supervise them. This, however, requires the collective participation of individuals in a directed activity, which, at first glance, seems to differ greatly from an individual reading a text. This might, in fact, be true for an individual reading, for example, a newspaper. Even though a columnist might address the reader directly, there is no sense of participation, as the printed opinions presented by the writer will still remain as printed text on the page. Yet, when it comes to the practical manuals discussed here, they seem to retain qualities of personal interaction and of oral culture.

Printed texts are often regarded merely as objects that circulate in a society or among groups. The knowledge that is often said to be "contained" in them is perceived as a good that can be "transferred" between individuals. As Ong argues, however, this is a reduction of texts and knowledge. The printed text, as media, shapes the consciousness of those who make use of it. At the same time, knowledge is more than a commodity, requiring recollection and psychological engagement. Ong argues that all kinds of media are actually more significantly present within the mind than outside of it.⁶⁴⁹

In line with other sociologists, such as Goody, Ong believes that the distance created between the individual and the written text he produced allowed the emergence of new forms of cognition and noetic processes which

⁶⁴⁹ Ong. 1977. *Interfaces of the Word*, 45-46.

would not have been possible in oral cultures. Abstraction, such as in the creation of lists and graphs, was one of the most significant intellectual processes enabled by writing, while printed texts allowed knowledge to become sequential and fixed in physical ‘places’ inside a publication, providing standards for locating knowledge.⁶⁵⁰ Yet, Ong holds that while new media did not eliminate the use of earlier forms of communication, the intellectual processes introduced with the new media shaped these earlier forms of communication. His views are supported by the findings of this study of practical manuals. While the majority of materials are in textual and graphic form, the mnemonics target oral performance and vocalization, shaped by textual practices and cognitive processes.

The mnemonic rhymes discussed in the present study were the result of continuous rewriting and editing by various authors. The segmentation of steps they present, the amount of new information they expect the reader to grasp, their calculated structure and rhyming scheme, and even the visual elements they rely on, are not the result of oral composition, but rather of textual composition that aimed at oral recitation. The question then arises why authors sought to maintain residual orality as a feature in their works.

I argue that recitation and constant repetition were central to the establishment of printed manuals as institutions. The concept of institution, originally a noun that described an action or process, is defined by both Marshall and Newman as any arrangement that aims to define and condition future activities or practice. Such arrangements include texts such as those explored here. Institutions are thus not tied to a location, but rather embodied in the set of rules themselves. The concrete text, as an institution, is comprehended as an entity of its own, created to transmit these standards and regulations that transcend their moment of creation.⁶⁵¹ This is in agreement with the idea that texts create distance between the creators and what they describe, as defended by Ong.

As standards for action are established and enshrined in written form, the text itself becomes an institution detached from the author. From the mid Ming dynasty onwards, authors such as Gao Song defended knowledge as a means to develop skills, separated from the goal of self-cultivation, and commercial printers began to appropriate and disseminate practical texts. As

⁶⁵⁰ Ong. 1977. *Interfaces of the Word*, 88. See also Goody. 1987. *The Interface Between the Written and the Oral*.

⁶⁵¹ Marshall. 2010. *Vico and the Transformation of Rhetoric in Early Modern Europe*, 236. Newman. “Literary, Social, and Textual Functions,” 499-500.

a result, the relationship between teacher and student was no longer as important as the practice itself. What remained was a fictionalized author, which in the case of manuals was the figure of a teacher. Chinese authors were well aware of the power and authority that printed standards could exert. They introduced regulations that became timeless as the practices and bodily experiences were captured in verbal conventions and common allusions on the page. The texts target future action, and the imperative tone demands that the reader act according to the rules and follow the established procedures. The reader who accepts the role of student, fictionalized in the text, is able to internalize these standards by memorizing rhymes through repetitive reading. Thus, oral recitation or silent repetition of rhymes played a crucial role in the pedagogical plan promoted by practical manuals, creating a foundation for further action. Practices were reenacted, or renewed, based on what the student had gathered in his breast and retained through repetitive gestures.

Unlike physical institutions, the printed manuals do not allow for an external control process, as described by Foucault.⁶⁵² There is no teacher to correct the student's mistakes along the way. However, the manuals transport the authority of experience into the text, providing negative standards, such as listing what not to do and what kind of behavior to avoid. Upfront disapproval and admonition of behavior commonly observed by the author was elementary for the functioning of manuals as institutions in the absence of a physical person to embody the role of controller. The student is aware of the self-disciplining process and can monitor himself and evaluate his own practice by comparing his movements and practical output to what is prescribed by the text. This constant feedback loop connecting what is contained in one's memory to one's own practice closely resembles Ernst Gombrich's description of the creative act. According to Gombrich, the artist goes back and forth between the visual standards established in his mind and the drawing on the paper, fixing and adjusting as necessary.⁶⁵³ Yet, while Gombrich referred mainly to the adjustment of what is visible, Chinese mnemonics provided more extensive standards, also including rules for posture, regulated gestures and even state of mind for creative production. Through memorization and practice, they were slowly grasped and internalized.

⁶⁵² Foucault. 2019. *Surveiller et Punir*, "Les corps dociles."

⁶⁵³ Gombrich. 1972. *Art and Illusion*, chapter 2.

The prescriptive content actualized by the student who engages in a form of “self-surveillance,” however, is subjected to the student’s will. Once the standards are memorized, he is free to introduce changes and develop a personal style as he practices. Calligraphy and painting were, after all, regarded as creative and expressive arts. The case of the *Hundred-Rhyme Song* shows that mnemonics and the standards they promoted could actually be used to challenge existing canons that relied on masters and lineages, granting the student more freedom.

Authors codified the knowledge “contained” in manuals and mnemonic treatises to facilitate the learning process and allow students to learn independently. Manuals target an imaginary audience, which in some cases is based on actual students a teacher had in the past. The key point to understanding such pedagogical texts, however, is that they underwent conscious processes of revision and editing in preparation for print. These procedures affected not only the format in which the information was presented, but also the way in which the learning process was staged within the text. The framework around the information constituted a fictionalized teacher giving direct orders to a fictionalized student. Printed books thus provided new standards, yet the process of instituting them was to be completed as part of an individual, internal process by the reader who accepted the role of student.

Reception of Practical Knowledge and Identity

During the mid Ming, both commercial editors and scholars increasingly began to value texts describing practical knowledge, and it was not important to publishers whether their authors were known. By the mid Qing, however, as the number of learned individuals who turned to professional activities increased dramatically due to a saturated bureaucratic system, practical activities became associated with family traditions and individual identity. The members of the Dai, Jiang and Gao families all perceived their occupations as central to their identity. Concerns with authorship and lineage took center stage when addressing practical knowledge and publicizing one’s own skills and techniques.⁶⁵⁴

⁶⁵⁴ The importance of “family learning” among painters of the Ming elite, including the role of women in the process of knowledge transmission, has been addressed by Clunas. These sources Clunas discusses, however, do not address concrete practical procedures and specific techniques being transmitted. 2013. “The Family Style.” *The craftsmen’s biographies*

When discussing practical knowledge, authors of the Qing shifted away from framing their contributions as part of their identity as officials, coming to value the intimate sphere of casual bonds in the construction of individual and group identity instead. Educated men such as Bao Shichen and Kang Youwei relied on casual social networks that were not based on acquaintances derived from official activities to further their interests in practical skills. Through informal meetings and study groups they established bonds that became essential for Qing individuals in defining their place and sense of self.

The treatises studied here also show that the restructuring of identity during the second half of the Qing was marked by an inward turn toward the family and to blood lineages as anchors for defining the self. Authors of treatises publicly connected their craft and practices to family members in order to describe their social contributions and values. This trend, identified in Qing treatises and compilations, is confirmed by Bauer's study of autobiographical literature in China, reveals that Qing notions of self were often defined through relationships with family members. His analysis, which also included texts authored by commoners, has shown that the mid Qing was marked by an increase of self-reflective writing and concerns with defining the self. What had been a withdrawal and identification with nature in the past, as was advocated by groups as different as Daoists and loyalists, became a withdrawal into the family.⁶⁵⁵

Qing authors highlighted intimate scholarly and familial bonds in their manuals and tied these to the knowledge that was being transmitted. The transmission of practical skills within the context of the family or workshops surely took place much earlier in China, yet it was rarely recorded as something to be divulged as a source of pride. For example, in the well-known anecdote about the Tang official and painter Yan Liben 閻立本 (d. 673), he felt so embarrassed and humiliated by the position in which his fame as painter had put him that he urged his son to never develop similar skills.⁶⁵⁶ Dai Yiheng, Ding Yicheng, and Jiang He, on the other hand, made sure to connect their

Hofmann discusses also highlight the family, yet the transmission of skills is not the focus of the narratives. The writers of biographies usually described the quality of the craftsmen's products instead. Hofmann. 2011. "The Biographer's View of Craftsmanship," 289-290. Schäfer has studied status shifts within craftsmen's families during the Ming dynasty, also addressing the perception of the craft once it had been abandoned by one family. Schäfer. 2012a. "Silken Strands," 71.

⁶⁵⁵ Bauer. 1990. *Das Antlitz Chinas*, 495-519.

⁶⁵⁶ Acker. 1954. *Some T'ang and pre-T'ang Texts on Chinese Painting*, vol. 2, pt. 1, 214.

skills to their ancestors. Ding even recreated a dialogue between himself and his father, allowing the reader to partake in an intimate conversation.

Processes of internalization and memorization of standards also became increasingly relevant within this intimate context. By the eighteenth century, it had become common for well-educated individuals to engage in crafts as professional activities, and the skills and methods developed in these occupations were often transmitted within the family. As argued by Connerton, groups entrust the values and categories they anxiously hope to conserve to bodily remembering.⁶⁵⁷ These values and standards were, as seen in several Qing cases addressed here, not only embodied by the members of families, but also recorded in writing. Halbwachs has argued that family memories and practices can be sustained by bodily or oral transmission for three generations without the aid of text.⁶⁵⁸ With textual support, like in the cases of Ding Gao and Jiang He, the manuals show how texts and practices were not only transmitted from grandfather to father to son, but often re-written, expanded and re-conceptualized by consecutive generations.

The inertia of internalized practices should not be underestimated.⁶⁵⁹ Those who sought to reform practices and establish new models for calligraphy, such as Bao Shichen, took internalized practices that had been acquired during their youth to address new intellectual positions. Even the reformer Kang Youwei, who relied on scholarly networks instead of family ties to legitimize his views, advocated the use of pedagogical practices in order to bring about social change. Kang himself was most likely aware of the inertia of bodily remembering, and discussed pedagogical practice against the backdrop of a different agenda, adapting it to the new values and perceived needs of society and thus essentially breathing new life into an ancient practice. In the case of Dai Yiheng, the inertia of bodily remembering in combination with his conscious clinging to the figure of a deceased family member had the opposite effect. He rejected new trends on the conservative moral grounds that shaped his identity, and continued to reproduce an orthodox style. The way Dai related his skills to his bond with his family, a connection that was in fact expected by his students, defined his practice as painter. These cases all show that internalized practices and their transmission among members of a family

⁶⁵⁷ Connerton. 2009. *How Societies Remember*, 102.

⁶⁵⁸ Hutton. 1993. *History as an Art of Memory*, 93. The dynamics of remembering within families is discussed in Halbwachs and Coser. 1992. *On Collective Memory*, 54-83.

⁶⁵⁹ Hutton makes frequent use of the term to describe what other scholars define as “marks” left behind by previous generations “on ourselves by systems of ideas and beliefs.” Febvre. 1973. *A New Kind of History*, 40.

or group became entangled during a period in which relationships that had relied on officialdom and traditional scholarly circles slowly disintegrated. Mnemonic rhymes no longer transmitted only content, but also relationships and a lost past.

The Importance of Ruminating

Practical knowledge is stored in the human body, and can, to a certain extent, be codified and transmitted. Recipients of this knowledge can “regrow”⁶⁶⁰ it through internalization and repetition, a process of “ripening” or familiarization (shu 熟), and mnemonic techniques helped the practitioner through this process of establishing practical skills and reorganizing actions and habits. The role mnemonics played in keeping practical knowledge alive cannot be underestimated.

It is a common claim that knowledge fixed in textual form is “dead.” The cases presented here, however, allow us to conclude the opposite. The authors and editors discussed in this study often appropriated and adapted earlier mnemonic rhymes and schemata to address new audiences and contemporary needs. Over time, they reconsidered methods, techniques and values, leading to subtle transformations of how they codified practical knowledge and made it easy to retain. Formal elements of mnemonics that sought to en-skill a new generation were overhauled and reinvented in a process of cultural “rumination.” Because of this practice of chewing and re-chewing transmitted knowledge over time, mnemonic aids reflect social changes in imperial China.

Editors, driven by commercial motivations, appropriated rhymes and altered their format to engage new audiences. Authors consciously repeated and premasticated the content in their own manuals, first explaining practices and meanings in prose and then summarizing these in rhymes. This helped the student understand the context of practices and the meaning of actions, and to incorporate these through memorization, providing food for both mind and body. It was up to the student to incorporate this knowledge. The student’s cognitive exercise of internalizing mnemonic rhymes is the process that most resembles a cow regurgitating and re-swallowing a mass of grass.

Practices were taken up not only by those who composed treatises but also by many “silent” practitioners and readers of manuals. The residual

⁶⁶⁰ Flitsch. 2008. “Knowledge, Embodiment, Skill and Risk,” 268.

orality retained in many treatises, as well as the visual aids that prompted students to repeat processes for visualization, allowed students to internalize practices of perceiving and acting. Through vocalized or silent repetition of mnemonics combined with practice and concrete attempts, students could generate the feedback loop that took them back and forth between memorized standards and actualized practice. The process, which involves individual judgment, allowed them to internalize standards without, however, leading to regulated or homogeneous action. Once standards were internalized, a personal style could be developed and textual maxims shed, allowing acts of volition.

“Ruminating,” or the physical repetition of mnemonics and of reflexive procedures, is central to the regrowth of practice because the body is the center of action, and practice does not exist outside of performance. To comprehend embodied knowledge, one must understand how codified texts can reflect bodily practices. Bodily practices may be inconceivable to an outsider who does not comprehend how actions and concepts can be interconnected.⁶⁶¹ Historians should thus strive to engage practice-oriented texts beyond their superficial materiality and savor the seemingly repetitively dull nature of mnemonics, for this is, in fact, the feature that brings them closest to the practitioner’s body. Even if books constitute objects that circulate in society detached from their authors, with “dead” characters printed inside, their “content” should not be addressed without considering performance and the practices of appropriation that keep embodied knowledge alive.

This study concludes with a summarizing rhyme:

A Rhyme on the Stomach of the Chinese Mind

Relish the summary and delight in each verse;
allow modules and sections to join and converse.
A good “anchor,” the palate will please;
a fine “woven cloth,” the hunger appease.

⁶⁶¹ Flitsch. 2008. “Knowledge, Embodiment, Skill and Risk,” 285.

In the past, tastes have often changed;
standards are altered and rhymes rearranged.
Hungry minds make practices their own;
just remember to keep chewing on!