



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Order and Crime: Criminal Groups' Political Legitimacy in Michoacán and Sicily

Pena Gonzalez, R.

Citation

Pena Gonzalez, R. (2020, February 20). *Order and Crime: Criminal Groups' Political Legitimacy in Michoacán and Sicily*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/85513>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/85513>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/85513> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Peña González R.

Title: Order and Crime: Criminal Groups' Political Legitimacy in Michoacán and Sicily

Issue Date: 2020-02-20

Table of Contents

Introduction	16
Chapter 1. Illegal but Legitimate? The Concept of Legitimacy and the Debate on Social (Dis)Order	22
1.1. What is Political Legitimacy? Understanding a Social and Political Concept.....	23
1.1.1. Normative Perspective of Legitimacy	25
1.1.2. Descriptive Perspective of Legitimacy.....	27
1.1.3. Max Weber’s Legitimacy: Review of a Fundamental Scholar.....	30
1.1.4. Towards an Operative Concept of Legitimacy.....	33
1.2. The Right to Rule: Social (Dis)order, the State and the Grounds for Legitimacy	35
1.2.1. What Social Order Is and What It Is For	36
1.2.2. Legitimate Power and Decisions: State and Sovereignty.....	39
1.2.3. The Audience for Legitimacy: Social Order, Legitimacy, and the Social Contract	42
1.3. Alternative People’s Legitimacy: Non-state Actors	44
1.3.1. What Is a Non-state Actor?	46
1.3.2. Why and When? Non-state Actors In Search of Legitimacy	48
1.3.3. Violence as Catalyst: Towards a Taxonomy of Non-State Actors.....	50
1.3.4. Criminal Groups: Characteristics of a Violent Non-state Actor Regarding Legitimacy	52
1.4. Closing Remarks and Summary of Chapter 1	55
Chapter 2. The Ghost of Robin Hood: Tracking Legitimate Crime.....	57
2.1. Crime and Illegality as Social Phenomena	58
2.1.1. Illegal Is Illegitimate: Limits of the Normative Perspective	58
2.1.2. Illegal But Legitimate: Towards Descriptive Grounds.....	60
2.1.3. From Illegal to Legal: Changes in Social Order.....	61
2.2. The Fiction of Counter-Society Actors	62
2.2.1. Blurred Boundaries: Crime and Illegality	63
2.2.2. The Myth of the Counter-Society: Circuits of Illegality	64
2.3. Criminal Agendas and the Performance of Legitimacy	65
2.3.1. Lessons from Diverse Scenarios.....	66

2.3.2. Legitimate Justification: Does Crime Always Need to Be Justified?	67
2.3.3. On the Importance of Criminal Agendas.....	69
2.4. Sources and Resources of Legitimacy.....	71
2.4.1. Anthropology of the State and Legitimacy for Research on Crime	72
2.4.2. The Audiences of Legitimacy: Four Types	75
2.4.3. Sources and Resources of Legitimacy: Where to Watch	77
2.4.4. The Michoacán-Sicily Connection: Towards Two Criminal Legitimation Processes.....	81
2.5. Closing Remarks: Chapter II Summary.....	82
Chapter 3. Tracking Local Robin Hoods: Criminal Groups and Legitimacy Attempts in Michoacán, Mexico.....	84
3.1. The Big Picture: The Mexican War on Drugs.....	86
3.1.1. War as Metaphor: From the Symbolic Dimension to Real Consequences.....	86
3.1.2. Michoacán: The First Battlefield.....	89
3.1.3. The Real Battles: The Size of Violence in Michoacán.....	94
3.1.4. An International Overview: Michoacán Between the Caribbean Basin and Asia Pacific	100
3.2. How to Understand Michoacán: Many Actors, Complex State	102
3.2.1. Michoacán: Geography Matters	103
3.2.2. Cartography of a Pre-supposed Sovereign: State-effect, Statehood, and Sovereign Practices.....	108
3.3. Closing Remarks: Chapter III Summary	116
Chapter 4. The Art of Dying Twice: Legitimacy Sources and Resources of La Familia and Los Caballeros Templarios.....	118
4.1. <i>La Familia</i> and <i>Los Templarios</i> : Sources and Resources of Legitimacy.....	119
4.1.1. Symbolic Sources	123
4.1.1.1. Proposed Social Contract.....	123
4.1.1.2. Agenda's Spread and/or Justification	124
4.1.1.3. Dissemination of Symbols.....	126
4.1.2. Performance-Centered Sources	129
4.1.2.1. Provision of Governing Institutions	130
4.1.2.2. Philanthropy and Coercion: Carrots and Sticks.....	133
4.1.3. Portrayals of Enemy Sources.....	136

4.1.3.1. Expressions Against Formal Authorities.....	137
4.1.3.2. Expressions Against Other (Informal) Authorities.....	137
4.1.3.3. Stances Towards the Current Law.....	138
4.2. Across Legitimacy Sources and Resources: The Forbidden Books of Michoacán.	139
4.2.1. “El más loco”: Nazario’s Memoirs.....	140
4.2.2. “Usted juzgue”: The Third Person Perspective	143
4.2.3. El código: Criminal Commandments	145
4.2.4. Palabra de Caballero: The (Independent?) Journalist’s Angle	146
4.2.5. “Pensamientos”: The Doctrine	147
4.3. Closing Remarks: Chapter IV Summary	150
Chapter 5. Cosa Nostra: Tracking Sicilian Mafia’s Political Legitimacy	152
5.1. The Big Picture: The Sicilian Mafia in Sicilian History	154
5.1.1. Mafia and the Italian State: Parallel Histories?	154
5.1.2. The Mafia and the Social Order in Sicily	157
5.1.3. Sicily and the Concept of the Mafia	157
5.2. The Sicilian Mafia: Sources and Resources of Legitimacy.....	159
5.2.1. Symbolic Sources	160
5.2.1.1. Proposed Social Contract.....	161
5.2.1.2. Agenda’s Spread and/or Justification	162
5.2.1.3. Dissemination of Symbols.....	164
5.2.2. Performance-Centered Sources	166
5.2.2.1. Provision of Governing Institutions	166
5.2.2.2. Philanthropy and Coercion: Carrots and Sticks.....	170
5.2.3. Portrayals of the Enemy	175
5.2.3.1. Expressions Against Formal Authorities.....	175
5.2.3.2. Expressions Against Other (Informal) Authorities.....	180
5.2.3.3. Stances Towards Current Law.....	182
5.3. Across Legitimacy Sources and Resources: <i>La Festa di Sant’Agata</i>	185
5.3.1. The Sicilian Mafia and Catholic Processions	186
5.3.2. Saint Agatha’s Procession: 2019 Edition	187
5.4. Closing Remarks: Chapter V Summary	189

Chapter 6. Reshaping Crime and (Dis)order: Towards a Comparison	191
6.1. Criminal Groups and Legitimacy: Pushing Conceptualization	192
6.1.1. Political Legitimacy, Criminal Groups, and the State	194
6.1.2. Political Legitimacy, Criminal Groups, and Sovereignty.....	195
6.1.3. Political Legitimacy, Criminal groups, and Social (Dis)Order	197
6.2. Michoacán-Sicily Connection: Comparing Sources of Legitimacy	198
6.2.1. Comparing Symbolic Sources	200
6.2.1.1. Proposed Social Contract.....	201
6.2.1.2. Agenda’s Spread and/or Justification	204
6.2.1.3. Dissemination of Symbols.....	205
6.2.2. Comparing Performance-centered Sources	209
6.2.2.1. Provision of Governing Institutions	210
6.2.2.2. Philanthropy and Coercion: Carrots and Sticks.....	212
6.2.3. Comparing Portrayals of Enemy Sources.....	214
6.2.3.1. Expressions Against Formal Authorities.....	215
6.2.3.2. Expressions Against Other (Informal) Authorities.....	217
6.2.3.3. Stances Towards Current Law.....	219
6.3. Closing Remarks: Chapter VI Summary	222
Conclusions.....	224
Appendix.....	233
Sources.....	240
Interviews Appendix.....	262
Other Inputs Related to Fieldwork.....	263