Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the ratione materiae Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory

Eftekhar, R.

Citation
Eftekhar, R. (2019, December 19). *The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the ratione materiae Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory*. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/82077

Version:	Publisher's Version
License:	Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden
Downloaded from:	https://hdl.handle.net/1887/82077

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page

Universiteit Leiden

The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/82077 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Eftekhar, R.
Title: The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the ratione materiae Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory
Issue Date: 2019-12-19

The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the *ratione materiae* Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op donderdag 19 December 2019

klokke 12.30 uur

door

Reza Eftekhar

geboren te Dezfool, Iran

in 1986

Promotor: prof. dr. E.C.P.D.C. de Brabandere

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. L.J. van den Herik
prof. dr. Tarcisio Gazzini (University of East Anglia, UK)
prof. dr. Yannick Radi (Université catholique de Louvain, Belgium)

To my wonderful wife: Mahnoush

Acknowledgments

I am truly indebted to my Ph.D. supervisor, Prof. dr. Eric de Brabandere, for his professional academic advice and support as well as his insightful comments on the various chapters and drafts of this Ph.D. Thesis in the course of the past four years. The preparation of this Thesis would not have been possible without his patience and persistence. Special thanks also go Judge Mir Hossein Abedian, my teacher at the Shahid Beheshti University and my supervisor at the Iran-United States Claims Tribunal. I owe him a lot in terms of constructing my legal analysis methods and developing my legal writing style. In preparing this Thesis, I was benefitted by his wise advice and constructive comments. I also wish to thank my dear colleague, Dr. Kamal Javadi, for his valuable comments on this piece of work at various stages and for his role in igniting my interest in this topic.

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations xiii

Introduction 1

I. The Relevance of the Host State Domestic Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations: Revival of the Classical 'Localisation' Theory? 1

II. Questions and Arguments 8

III. Structure 10

IV. Essential Concepts 13

A. Applicable Law 13

B. Domestic Law 17

V. Thesis Approach and Sources 17

A. General Approach 17

B. Interpretive Approach 18

C. Sources 19

Part I: The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the *ratione materiae* Jurisdiction of An Investment Treaty Tribunal 24

Chapter 1: The Role of Domestic Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations in General 26

Introduction 26

Section One: General Remarks with Regard to the Application of Domestic Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations 30

A. The Reason for the Importance of Host State Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations . 31

B. The Guise in Which Domestic Law Applies in Investment Treaty Arbitrations: As 'Fact' or as 'Law'? 33

C. The Legal Grounds for the Application of Domestic Law as 'Law' in Investment Treaty Arbitrations 35

a. The Parties Have Expressly or Impliedly Chosen Domestic Law to Govern a Particular Issue 35

b. The Nature of the Legal Issue 38

D. Irrelevance of the Applicable Law Provision in Investment Treaties and the ICSID Convention 40

Section Two: The Situations in Which an Investment Treaty Adjudicating Forum Needs to Refer to Domestic Laws 45

A. The Role of Domestic Law in Jurisdictional Issues 45

a. *Ratione Materiae* 46

i. The Legality Requirement 47
ii. Creation and Existence of Rights Constituting Investments 47
iii. Approval of investments 49
b. *Ratione Personae* 49
B. The Role of Domestic Law in Issues Concerning Merits 51
a. Domestic Law as 'Fact' in Issues Concerning Merits 53
b. Domestic Law as 'Law' in Issues Concerning Merits 54
i. Express Treaty Reference to the Application of Domestic Law as 'Law' 54
ii. Contractual Claims 56
Conclusion 58
Introduction to Chapters 2 & 3: The Role of Domestic Law in Determining the Jurisdiction *Ratione Materiae* of Investment Treaty Tribunals 61
Chapter 2: Application of Domestic Law to the Legality Requirement 64
Section One: The Legal Bases for Referring to the Laws of the Host State 64
A. Reference by the Contracting Parties in the Underlying Investment Treaty 65
a. Express Reference 67
i. Varying Formulations and Its Impact 68
ii. Varying Locations and Its Impact 69
1st. In 'Definitions' Clauses 69
2nd. In 'Scope of Application' Clauses 70
3rd. In Substantive Protection Clauses 71
b. Implicit Reference 72
B. The Nature of the Legal Issue 73
C. Relying on Principles of International Law for Dismissing Illegal Investments 75
Section Two: The Actual Application of Domestic Law to Particular Questions Regarding the Legality Requirement 80
A. The Scope of the Legality Requirement 80
a. The Formal Scope of the Legality Requirement 83
b. The Substantive Scope of the Legality Requirement 86
i. Approaches Adopted in Investment Treaty Arbitrations 87
1st. Subject-Matter Approach (Compliance only with Laws Relating to Foreign Investment) 87

2nd. Significance-Analysis Approach (Compliance only with Fundamental Laws of the Host State) 90

3rd. Combined-Effect Analysis (Double Analysis of the Significance of the Host State Law Violated Together with the Behaviour of the Investor) 92

ii. The Proposed Solution 100

1st. Violation of de minimis Laws of the Host State 107

2nd. Violation of Fundamental Laws of the Host State 112

3rd. Violation of Ordinary Laws of the Host State 119

c. Temporal Scope of the Legality Requirement 124

d. Conclusion 125

B. The Consequences of the Legality Requirement 127

a. General and Specific Consequences of the Legality Requirement 128

i. General Consequence of Illegality 128

ii. Specific Consequence of Illegality 129

iii. The Missing Jurisdiction Limb 132

b. Possible Defences by Investors 137

i. Object and Purpose of the Underlying Investment Treaty 138

ii. The Involvement of the Host State 139

1st. Knowledge of the State 139

2nd. Involvement of the Host State in the Corruption 141

3rd. Investor's Good Faith 143

Conclusion 146

Chapter 3: Application of Domestic Law to the Question Regarding the Creation/Existence of Rights/Interests Constituting Investments 149

Introduction 149

Section One: The Legal Bases for Referring to the Laws of the Host State 150

A. The Nature of the Legal Issue 151

a. Lack of a Response by General International Law in Principle 151

b. Conflict of Laws Rules 156

B. Reference by the Contracting Parties in the Underlying Investment Treaty 163

C. Conclusion 165

Section Two: The Actual Application of Domestic Law to Particular Questions Regarding the Creation and Existence of Rights/Interests underlying Investments 165

A. The General Function of the Host State Law in Determining the Creation and Existence of Rights/Interests Underlying Investments 166

B. The Specific Function of the Host State Law in Determining the Creation and Existence of Rights/Interests Underlying Investments 168

a. Definition of Property 170

b. Conditions for Transfer of Title 172

c. Conditions for Protection of Contractual Rights 175

Conclusion 180

Chapter 4: Ascertaining the Contents of the Host State Law 183

Conclusion 188

Part II: The Revival of the Localisation Theory in Light of the Developments in Investment Treaty Law 190

Chapter 5: The Localisation Theory: Roots, Contents, and Its Legal Destiny 193

Introduction 193

Section One: Classical Domestic-Centric Theories: The Calvo Doctrine and the Localisation Theory 193

Section Two: The Emergence of Bilateral Investment Treaties 201

Conclusion 205

Chapter 6: Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory in the Field of Investment Treaty Arbitration: The Current Role of Host State Law 207

Introduction 207

Section One: A Distillation of Chapters 1-3 Regarding the Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the Jurisdiction *ratione materiae* of An Investment Treaty Tribunal 207

Section Two: Developments in Investment Treaty Law Regarding the Role of Host State Law in the Resolution of Investment Treaty Arbitration Cases 208

Conclusion 211

Chapter 7: Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory in the Field of Investment Treaty Arbitration: The Current Role of Host State Courts 214

Introduction 214

A. The Requirement of Using Local Remedies for A Defined Period of Time As A Precondition of Filing the Case before International Investment Arbitration 217

B. Reference to Domestic Courts of the Host State As A Prerequisite of the Violation of Investment Treaty Standards 220

C. Recourse to the Courts of the Host State As A Point of Reference for Clarifying Preliminary Points of the Domestic Law 222

D. Recourse to the Courts of the Host State As Equal Dispute Settlement Venues 233
Conclusion 236
Final Conclusion **239**
Summary **245**
Samenvatting (Dutch Summary) **252**
Curriculum Vitae **259**
Sources **260**
Cases 260
Investment Arbitrations Cases 260
IUSCT Cases 272
Other Arbitral Cases 272
PCIJ and ICJ Cases (Judgments, Advisory Opinions, Concurring/Dissenting/Individual/Separate Declarations/Opinions) 273
WTO Cases 274
ECR & ECHR Cases 275
Municipal Courts Cases 275
Municipal Laws 276
Bibliography 277
Books 277
Book Chapters 280
Articles 282
Reports 287
International Conventions, Treaties, and International Instruments 288
Bilateral Investment Treaties 288
Model BITs 301
Treaties with Investment Provisions 301
International Conventions 302
UN General Assembly Documents 303
Other International Instruments 303

List of Abbreviations

General

ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
DSB	WTO Dispute Settlement Body
ECT	Energy Charter Treaty
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
FCN	Friendship, Commerce and Navigation (treaties)
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce
ICCA	International Council for Commercial Arbitration
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
IIA	International Investment Agreement
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
LCIA	London Court of International Arbitration
MFN	Most-Favoured-Nation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
SCC	Stockholm Chamber of Commerce
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UN	United Nations
UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNIDRIOT	International Institute for the Unification of Private Law
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WTO	World Trade Organization

Journals, Publications, Reports, and Treaty Series

AJIL	American Journal of International Law
Arb Int'l	Arbitration International
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law

CMLJ	Capital Markets Law Journal
CUP	Cambridge University Press
Eur. J. Int'l L.	European Journal of International Law
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly
ICSID Rep	ICSID Reports
ICSID Rev-FILJ	ICSID Review—Foreign Investment Law Journal
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILR	International Law Reports
Iran-USCTR	Iran-US Claims Tribunal Reports
J Int'l Arb	Journal of International Arbitration
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's Law Reports
OUP	Oxford University Press
RIAA	Reports of International Arbitral Awards
TDM	Transnational Dispute Management
YB ILC	Yearbook of the International Law Commission