



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the *ratione materiae* Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory

Eftekhar, R.

Citation

Eftekhar, R. (2019, December 19). *The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the *ratione materiae* Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/82077>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/82077>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/82077> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Eftekhar, R.

Title: The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the *ratione materiae* Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory

Issue Date: 2019-12-19

**The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the
ratione materiae Jurisdiction of Investment Treaty Tribunals: The
Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory**

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,

op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op donderdag 19 December 2019

klokke 12.30 uur

door

Reza Eftekhar

geboren te Dezfool, Iran

in 1986

Promotor: prof. dr. E.C.P.D.C. de Brabandere

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. L.J. van den Herik
prof. dr. Tarcisio Gazzini (University of East Anglia, UK)
prof. dr. Yannick Radi (Université catholique de Louvain, Belgium)

To my wonderful wife: Mahnoush

Acknowledgments

I am truly indebted to my Ph.D. supervisor, Prof. dr. Eric de Brabandere, for his professional academic advice and support as well as his insightful comments on the various chapters and drafts of this Ph.D. Thesis in the course of the past four years. The preparation of this Thesis would not have been possible without his patience and persistence. Special thanks also go Judge Mir Hossein Abedian, my teacher at the Shahid Beheshti University and my supervisor at the Iran-United States Claims Tribunal. I owe him a lot in terms of constructing my legal analysis methods and developing my legal writing style. In preparing this Thesis, I was benefitted by his wise advice and constructive comments. I also wish to thank my dear colleague, Dr. Kamal Javadi, for his valuable comments on this piece of work at various stages and for his role in igniting my interest in this topic.

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations	xiii
Introduction.....	1
I. The Relevance of the Host State Domestic Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations: Revival of the Classical ‘Localisation’ Theory?	1
II. Questions and Arguments	8
III. Structure	10
IV. Essential Concepts.....	13
A. Applicable Law	13
B. Domestic Law	17
V. Thesis Approach and Sources	17
A. General Approach	17
B. Interpretive Approach	18
C. Sources	19
Part I: The Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the <i>ratione materiae</i> Jurisdiction of An Investment Treaty Tribunal.....	24
Chapter 1: The Role of Domestic Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations in General	26
Introduction	26
Section One: General Remarks with Regard to the Application of Domestic Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations	30
A. The Reason for the Importance of Host State Law in Investment Treaty Arbitrations .	31
B. The Guise in Which Domestic Law Applies in Investment Treaty Arbitrations: As ‘Fact’ or as ‘Law’?	33
C. The Legal Grounds for the Application of Domestic Law as ‘Law’ in Investment Treaty Arbitrations	35
a. The Parties Have Expressly or Impliedly Chosen Domestic Law to Govern a Particular Issue	35
b. The Nature of the Legal Issue.....	38
D. Irrelevance of the Applicable Law Provision in Investment Treaties and the ICSID Convention.....	40
Section Two: The Situations in Which an Investment Treaty Adjudicating Forum Needs to Refer to Domestic Laws.....	45
A. The Role of Domestic Law in Jurisdictional Issues	45
a. <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	46

i. The Legality Requirement	47
ii. Creation and Existence of Rights Constituting Investments.....	47
iii. Approval of investments	49
b. <i>Ratione Personae</i>	49
B. The Role of Domestic Law in Issues Concerning Merits	51
a. Domestic Law as ‘Fact’ in Issues Concerning Merits.....	53
b. Domestic Law as ‘Law’ in Issues Concerning Merits.....	54
i. Express Treaty Reference to the Application of Domestic Law as ‘Law’	54
ii. Contractual Claims.....	56
Conclusion.....	58
Introduction to Chapters 2 & 3: The Role of Domestic Law in Determining the Jurisdiction <i>Ratione Materiae</i> of Investment Treaty Tribunals.....	61
Chapter 2: Application of Domestic Law to the Legality Requirement	64
Section One: The Legal Bases for Referring to the Laws of the Host State	64
A. Reference by the Contracting Parties in the Underlying Investment Treaty.....	65
a. Express Reference	67
i. Varying Formulations and Its Impact	68
ii. Varying Locations and Its Impact.....	69
1st. In ‘Definitions’ Clauses.....	69
2nd. In ‘Scope of Application’ Clauses.....	70
3rd. In Substantive Protection Clauses	71
b. Implicit Reference	72
B. The Nature of the Legal Issue	73
C. Relying on Principles of International Law for Dismissing Illegal Investments	75
Section Two: The Actual Application of Domestic Law to Particular Questions Regarding the Legality Requirement.....	80
A. The Scope of the Legality Requirement.....	80
a. The Formal Scope of the Legality Requirement	83
b. The Substantive Scope of the Legality Requirement	86
i. Approaches Adopted in Investment Treaty Arbitrations	87
1st. Subject-Matter Approach (Compliance only with Laws Relating to Foreign Investment)	87

2nd. Significance-Analysis Approach (Compliance only with Fundamental Laws of the Host State)	90
3rd. Combined-Effect Analysis (Double Analysis of the Significance of the Host State Law Violated Together with the Behaviour of the Investor).....	92
ii. The Proposed Solution.....	100
1st. Violation of de minimis Laws of the Host State	107
2nd. Violation of Fundamental Laws of the Host State	112
3rd. Violation of Ordinary Laws of the Host State	119
c. Temporal Scope of the Legality Requirement.....	124
d. Conclusion.....	125
B. The Consequences of the Legality Requirement.....	127
a. General and Specific Consequences of the Legality Requirement.....	128
i. General Consequence of Illegality.....	128
ii. Specific Consequence of Illegality	129
iii. The Missing Jurisdiction Limb	132
b. Possible Defences by Investors	137
i. Object and Purpose of the Underlying Investment Treaty.....	138
ii. The Involvement of the Host State	139
1st. Knowledge of the State.....	139
2nd. Involvement of the Host State in the Corruption.....	141
3rd. Investor's Good Faith	143
Conclusion.....	146
Chapter 3: Application of Domestic Law to the Question Regarding the Creation/Existence of Rights/Interests Constituting Investments	149
Introduction	149
Section One: The Legal Bases for Referring to the Laws of the Host State	150
A. The Nature of the Legal Issue	151
a. Lack of a Response by General International Law in Principle	151
b. Conflict of Laws Rules	156
B. Reference by the Contracting Parties in the Underlying Investment Treaty.....	163
C. Conclusion.....	165
Section Two: The Actual Application of Domestic Law to Particular Questions Regarding the Creation and Existence of Rights/Interests underlying Investments.....	165

A. The General Function of the Host State Law in Determining the Creation and Existence of Rights/Interests Underlying Investments	166
B. The Specific Function of the Host State Law in Determining the Creation and Existence of Rights/Interests Underlying Investments	168
a. Definition of Property	170
b. Conditions for Transfer of Title.....	172
c. Conditions for Protection of Contractual Rights	175
Conclusion.....	180
Chapter 4: Ascertaining the Contents of the Host State Law.....	183
Conclusion.....	188
Part II: The Revival of the Localisation Theory in Light of the Developments in Investment Treaty Law	190
Chapter 5: The Localisation Theory: Roots, Contents, and Its Legal Destiny	193
Introduction	193
Section One: Classical Domestic-Centric Theories: The Calvo Doctrine and the Localisation Theory	193
Section Two: The Emergence of Bilateral Investment Treaties	201
Conclusion.....	205
Chapter 6: Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory in the Field of Investment Treaty Arbitration: The Current Role of Host State Law	207
Introduction	207
Section One: A Distillation of Chapters 1-3 Regarding the Role of the Domestic Law of the Host State in Determining the Jurisdiction <i>ratione materiae</i> of An Investment Treaty Tribunal ...	207
Section Two: Developments in Investment Treaty Law Regarding the Role of Host State Law in the Resolution of Investment Treaty Arbitration Cases.....	208
Conclusion.....	211
Chapter 7: Partial Revival of the Localisation Theory in the Field of Investment Treaty Arbitration: The Current Role of Host State Courts	214
Introduction	214
A. The Requirement of Using Local Remedies for A Defined Period of Time As A Precondition of Filing the Case before International Investment Arbitration	217
B. Reference to Domestic Courts of the Host State As A Prerequisite of the Violation of Investment Treaty Standards	220
C. Recourse to the Courts of the Host State As A Point of Reference for Clarifying Preliminary Points of the Domestic Law.....	222

D. Recourse to the Courts of the Host State As Equal Dispute Settlement Venues	233
Conclusion	236
Final Conclusion.....	239
Summary.....	245
Samenvatting (Dutch Summary).....	252
Curriculum Vitae.....	259
Sources	260
Cases	260
Investment Arbitrations Cases	260
IUSCT Cases.....	272
Other Arbitral Cases.....	272
PCIJ and ICJ Cases (Judgments, Advisory Opinions, Concurring/Dissenting/Individual/Separate Declarations/Opinions).....	273
WTO Cases	274
ECR & ECHR Cases	275
Municipal Courts Cases	275
Municipal Laws	276
Bibliography	277
Books.....	277
Book Chapters.....	280
Articles	282
Reports	287
International Conventions, Treaties, and International Instruments.....	288
Bilateral Investment Treaties	288
Model BITs.....	301
Treaties with Investment Provisions	301
International Conventions	302
UN General Assembly Documents	303
Other International Instruments	303

List of Abbreviations

General

ASEAN	Association of South East Asian Nations
BIT	Bilateral Investment Treaty
DSB	WTO Dispute Settlement Body
ECT	Energy Charter Treaty
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
FCN	Friendship, Commerce and Navigation (treaties)
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FTA	Free Trade Agreement
ICC	International Chamber of Commerce
ICCA	International Council for Commercial Arbitration
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
IIA	International Investment Agreement
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission
LCIA	London Court of International Arbitration
MFN	Most-Favoured-Nation
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
SCC	Stockholm Chamber of Commerce
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UN	United Nations
UNCITRAL	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNIDRIOT	International Institute for the Unification of Private Law
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WTO	World Trade Organization

Journals, Publications, Reports, and Treaty Series

AJIL	American Journal of International Law
Arb Int'l	Arbitration International
BYIL	British Yearbook of International Law

CMLJ	Capital Markets Law Journal
CUP	Cambridge University Press
Eur. J. Int'l L.	European Journal of International Law
ICLQ	International and Comparative Law Quarterly
ICSID Rep	ICSID Reports
ICSID Rev- FILJ	ICSID Review—Foreign Investment Law Journal
ILM	International Legal Materials
ILR	International Law Reports
Iran-USCTR	Iran-US Claims Tribunal Reports
J Int'l Arb	Journal of International Arbitration
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's Law Reports
OUP	Oxford University Press
RIAA	Reports of International Arbitral Awards
TDM	Transnational Dispute Management
YB ILC	Yearbook of the International Law Commission