

The Anthropomorphic Hegemony of Subjectivity: Critical Reflections on Law and the Question of the Animal

Villiers, J. de

Citation

Villiers, J. de. (2019, December 16). The Anthropomorphic Hegemony of Subjectivity: Critical Reflections on Law and the Question of the Animal. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/82072

Version: Publisher's Version

License: License agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the

Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/82072

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/82072 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Villiers, J. de

Title: The Anthropomorphic Hegemony of Subjectivity: Critical Reflections on Law and

the Question of the Animal **Issue Date**: 2019-12-16



The Anthropomorphic Hegemony of Subjectivity

Critical Reflections on Law and the Question of the Animal

Jan-Harm de Villiers

The Anthropomorphic Hegemony of Subjectivity

Critical Reflections on Law and the Question of the Animal

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op maandag 16 december 2019
klokke 15:00 uur

door Jan-Harm de Villiers geboren te Pretoria, Zuid-Afrika in 1985 Promotor: prof. dr. P.B. Cliteur Copromotor: mr. dr. A.J. Kwak

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. A. Ellian

prof. dr. M. Labuschaigne (Universiteit van Zuid-Afrika)

mr. dr. L. Lauwaert (KU Leuven, België)

mr. dr. B.R. Rijpkema

The animal looks at us, and we are naked before it. Thinking perhaps begins there.

- Jacques Derrida, The Animal That Therefore I Am

Table of contents

1.	Introduction	1			
	Problem statement	1			
	Motivation and background	4			
	Towards an ethics of difference and singularity	7			
	Deconstruction and limitrophy	20			
	Approach and methodology	27			
	A note on terminology	28			
	Chapter overview	29			
2.	Towards an Ethical Relation to the Nonhuman Other:				
	Deconstruction, Veganism and the Law	37			
	Introduction	37			
	Deconstruction and the law	38			
	Conceptualising justice as aporia	40			
	Reconceiving deconstruction as the philosophy of the limit	42			
	Veganism and deconstruction	44			
	The (human) subject and sacrifice	45			
	Symbolic sacrifice as secondness	46			
	The anthropocentric predilection of vegetarianism	47			
	Conclusion	49			
3.	Animal Rights Theory, Animal Welfarism and the 'New Welfarist'				
	Amalgamation: A Critical Perspective	51			
	Introduction	51			
	The history of the animal advocacy movement	54			
	The shift from welfarism to rights	56			
	The amalgamation of welfarism and rights	58			
	The theoretical foundations and internal paradoxes of new welfarism	61			
	Utilitarianism	61			
	Moral rights	62			
	The need for a moment of slowness and reflection amidst chaotic				
	violence towards animals	64			
	Thou shalt not kill (the human)	68			
	Sacrificing the animal	70			
	Conclusion	77			

4.	Examining the Similarity Principle and Language of (Animal) Rights				
	as a Foundation for Animal Liberation	79			
	Introduction	79			
	The language of rights	81			
	Rights theory, the ethical relation and hierarchy	83			
	The animal as symmetrical Other	83			
	Hierarchical ordering	86			
	The same-as characteristic and animal experimentation	89			
	Conclusion	91			
5.	Metaphysical Anthropocentrism, Limitrophy, and Responsibility:				
	An Explication of the Subject of Animal Rights	93			
	Introduction	94			
	The anthropomorphic hegemony of subjectivity	96			
	Heidegger and metaphysical anthropocentrism	100			
	Heidegger and the question of world	101			
	Thinking at the limit of the subject	104			
	The post-deconstructive "who"	110			
	Towards a non-anthropocentric refiguration	115			
6.	Law and the Question of the Animal: A Critical Discussion of National				
Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals v Minister of Justice and					
	Constitutional Development	123			
	Introduction	123			
	Background	124			
	Litigation history	128			
	The high court's decision	128			
	The Supreme Court of Appeal's decision	129			
	The Constitutional Court's decision	130			
	Analysis	133			
	The dualistic private prosecution scheme in the CPA	133			
	The question of the animal	134			
	Conclusion	138			

7.	Prolegomenon on the Role of the Polyphonic Novel for (Animal) Law:				
	J.M. Coetzee's The Lives of Animals, the Voice of Refusal,				
	and the Subversive Performativity of the Novel	141			
	Introduction	142			
	The Lives of Animals as polyphonic novel, the animal's literary voice,				
	and the subversive capacity of literature	144			
	The Socratic model, carnival, and laughter	150			
	Elizabeth Costello as Socratic figure and voice of refusal	151			
	The politics of refusal and alternative spaces of thinking	152			
	Costello's refusals, the animal's finitude, and risking law	155			
	Conclusion	162			
8.	Conclusion	167			
9.	Summary	175			
10.	. Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch)	177			
11.	. Bibliography	179			
12.	. Curriculum Vitae	191			