



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Formalism, realism and conservatism in Russian law

Antonov, M.V.

Citation

Antonov, M. V. (2019, December 18). *Formalism, realism and conservatism in Russian law*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/81993>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/81993>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/81993> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Antonov, M.V.

Title: Formalism, realism and conservatism in Russian Law

Issue Date: 2019-12-18

Formalism, Realism and Conservatism in Russian Law

Formalism, Realism and Conservatism in Russian Law

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op woensdag 18 december 2019
klokke 15.00 uur

door

Mikhail Valerievich Antonov

geboren te Sint Petersburg, Rusland

in 1973

Promotores: prof. dr. W.B. Simons

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. K. Hendley (University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA)
prof. dr. R.A. Lawson
prof. dr. K. Malfliet (Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium)
dr. J. Oversloot
prof. dr. E. van der Zweerde (Radboud Universiteit, Nijmegen)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Bodegraven
Printwerk: Ipskamp Printing

© 2019 Mikhail Valerievich Antonov

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enig andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de auteur.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission of the author.

Table of Contents

AKNOWLEDGEMENTS	VII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	IX
INTRODUCTION	1
1 Background of the Study	1
2 Outline of the Research	9
3 Research Questions, Research Subject and Scope of the Study	15
1 FORMALISM AND DECISIONISM IN SOVIET AND RUSSIAN JURISPRUDENCE	19
Foreword	19
Introduction	20
1 Methodology	24
2 Historical Development	28
3 The Anti-formalist Element in Soviet Law	32
4 A Dual System of Law?	37
5 Legality, Decisionism and Formalism	40
6 Actual Implications	44
Conclusion	48
2 THE PHILOSOPHY BEHIND HUMAN RIGHTS: VALERII ZORKIN VS. THE WEST?	51
Foreword	51
Introduction	52
1 The Problem of Russian Exceptionality and Legal Education	55
2 Russia's Accession to the ECtHR: A Step toward Modernization?	63
3 Valerii Zorkin's Rejoinder to Disproportionate Westernization	68
4 Valerii Zorkin's Legal Philosophy	71
Conclusion	83
3 CONSERVATISM IN RUSSIA AND SOVEREIGNTY IN HUMAN RIGHTS	85
Foreword	85
Introduction	86
1 Russian Law Faces a Choice: International Principles or National Sovereignty	90
2 European Human-Rights Law from the Perspective of Russian Courts	95
3 The Nature of International Law in the Light of the Russian Constitution and Its Interpretations	100

4	The Philosophical Background of Discussions on Sovereign Democracy	105
5	The Roots of Exceptionalism in Russian Social Philosophy	114
	Conclusion	118
4	RELIGION, SEXUAL MINORITIES, AND THE RULE OF LAW IN RUSSIA: MUTUAL CHALLENGES	125
	Foreword	125
	Introduction	126
1	Contestation of Rights through Religion	130
2	Traditional Values versus Posited Legal Rules in Court	132
3	The Statutory-Law Framework	136
4	The Constitutional-Law Framework	139
5	Case Law of the RF Constitutional Court	141
6	Case Law of the Courts of General Jurisdiction	147
7	Russia and Europe: A Discordant Dialogue	150
	Conclusion	154
5	RELIGIOUS BELIEFS AND THE LIMITS OF THEIR ACCOMMODATION IN RUSSIA: SOME LANDMARK CASES FROM THE RUSSIAN SUPREME COURT	157
	Foreword	157
	Introduction	158
1	Constitutional Ambiguity	160
2	Methodology	164
3	The Russian Supreme Court on Religious Freedoms: A Selective Analysis	170
	Conclusion	176
6	CONCLUDING CHAPTER	179
	SAMENVATTING (DUTCH SUMMARY)	207
	CURRICULUM VITAE	209

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my Leiden supervisor, Professor William Simons, for his patience and guidance while I engaged in the research for this work. During the course of several years, he helped to foster an atmosphere which encouraged my engagement with the topic of the dissertation. I am convinced that our constant back-and-forth interactions greatly improved the quality of this manuscript. Also, I would like to thank my colleagues from Tartu University (Estonia)—especially Professor Lauri Mälksoo. Their support and the collegial atmosphere which characterized my time as a Research Fellow at this University—when I started working at the topic of this dissertation in the period 2013-2016—have been invaluable. Sincere thanks also go to Professor William Pomeranz. He offered me friendly guidance during my 2016 research scholarship at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars (Washington, DC) and, more recently, also generously gave of his time to read a preliminary version of this thesis and share with me his insightful comments. I have sought to take account of all the remarks given me throughout my work on this thesis by all who kindly have read it but, nevertheless, realize that I may not always have succeeded in doing so fully. Furthermore, any errors or omissions are the responsibility of the author; not of those who kindly helped to steer me along the way.

The agreement of Brill Academic Publishers, Cambridge University Press, and ISORECEA, for me to use my articles—first issued in their publications—in the present dissertation (in revised form) is something which I sincerely appreciate. To my colleagues from my home university—the Higher School of Economics (Russia)—I offer my heartfelt thanks for their generous help, manifest in numerous ways, in finalizing my work; particularly to the dean of the Law Faculty, Professor Anton Ilyin.

List of Abbreviations

CIS: Commonwealth of Independent States
CPSU: Communist Party of the Soviet Union
ECHR: European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR: European Court of Human Rights
EU: European Union
Foreign Agents Registration Act (22 U.S.C., §§611-621; FARA)—1938 US FARA
Levada Center: Yuri Levada Analytical Center
NATO: North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NKVD: People's Commissariat of Internal Affairs
PACE: Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe
PEGIDA: Patriotic Europeans against the Islamization of the Occident
RF CAO: Code of Administrative Offences of the Russian Federation
RF Constitutional Court: Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation
RF Supreme Court: Supreme Court of the Russian Federation
ROC: Russian Orthodox Church
RSFSR: Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic
SZRF: Collection of Legislation of the Russian Federation
UN: United Nations
Venice Commission: European Commission for Democracy through Law
WTO: World Trade Organization

All translations from Russian and other languages into English are made by the author unless otherwise indicated.

The author followed the rules of transliteration of Russian names set forth by the American Library Association and the Library of Congress except the cases when there are other generally accepted versions of transliteration.

