



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The application of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child by national courts

Couzens, M.M.

Citation

Couzens, M. M. (2019, December 3). *The application of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child by national courts*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/81090>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/81090>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The following handle holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation:
<http://hdl.handle.net/1887/81090>

Author: Couzens, M.M.

Title: The application of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child by national courts

Issue Date: 2019-12-03

The application of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child by national courts

De toepassing van het Verdrag inzake de Rechten van het Kind door nationale rechters

Meda-Mihaela Couzens

The application of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child by national courts

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 3 december 2019
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Meda-Mihaela Couzens

geboren te Ocna-Mureș, Roemenië

in 1975

Promotoren: prof. dr. T. Liefgaard
 prof. dr. J. J. Sloth-Nielsen

Promotiecommissie: prof. dr. R.A. Lawson
 prof. dr. M.L.P. Loenen
 prof. K. Sandberg (University of Oslo, Norway)
 dr. C. O'Mahony (University College Cork, Ireland)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements.....	1
List of acronyms.....	2
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	3
1.1 Introduction: Why the courts?.....	3
1.2 Problem statement and the rationale of the study.....	6
1.3 The aim of the study and the research questions	8
1.3.1 The aim	8
1.3.2 The research questions.....	8
1.4 Theoretical perspective.....	8
1.5 Methodology	12
1.6 The structure of the thesis	17
CHAPTER 2: THE CRC, THE COURTS, DIRECT AND INDIRECT APPLICATION	18
2.1 Introduction	18
2.2 The international perspective on the role of the courts in giving effect to the CRC	19
2.2.1 The CRC and the courts.....	19
2.2.2 The Committee and the courts.....	24
2.3 The domestic perspective on the role of the courts in giving effect to the CRC.....	28
2.3.1 The direct application or the self-execution of the CRC.....	29
2.3.1.1 Conceptual distinctions	30
2.3.1.2 Definition	32
2.3.1.3. Criteria for direct application	34
2.3.1.4 Direct application and the CRC.....	38
2.3.2 The indirect effect of the CRC	41
2.3.2.1 The indirect application of the CRC in dualist states.....	44
2.4 Conclusions	47

CHAPTER 3: FRANCE	48
3.1 Introduction	48
3.2 The direct application of international human rights treaties in France and the CRC	49
3.3 The direct application of the CRC by the Court of Cassation	53
3.3.1 The pre-2005 position	54
3.3.2 The 2005 decisions	58
3.3.3 After 2005	60
3.4 The direct application of the CRC by the Council of State.....	62
3.5 An assessment of the impact of the direct application of the CRC in France.....	68
3.5.1 Introduction	68
3.5.2 Scope.....	69
3.5.3 The legal consequences of the direct application of the CRC in France	70
3.5.3.1 The 'high-end' impact of direct application	70
3.5.3.2 The jurisprudential added value of the direct application of the CRC	73
3.6 Factors with impact on the direct application of the CRC	78
3.6.1 CRC-related factors.....	78
3.6.2 CRC-independent factors	79
3.7 Conclusion.....	87
CHAPTER 4: AUSTRALIA	89
4. 1 Introduction	89
4.2 The relationship between international treaties and Australian law	89
4.3 Australia and the CRC.....	96
4.4 The case law	98
4.4.1 Judicial consideration of the legal status of the CRC in Australian law	99
4.4.2 The CRC as a source of external affairs power	105
4.4.3 The CRC and statutory interpretation	107
4.4.3.1 High Court cases.....	107
4.4.3.2 Family Court cases appealed to the High Court	110
4.4.3.3 Family Court cases not appealed to the High Court	113
4.4.4 The CRC and the exercise of administrative discretion	116
4.4.5 The CRC and the principle of legality	120
4.4.6 The CRC and the exercise of judicial discretion	121

4.4.7 The CRC and human rights statutes: A Victoria case-study	122
4.4.7.1 Introduction	122
4.4.7.2 The CRC and the exercise of judicial powers under the Charter	124
4.4.7.3 The CRC and interpretation of the Charter	125
4.5 Analysis	128
4.5.1 The methods of engagement.....	128
4.5.2 Non-normative approaches.....	132
4.5.3 The impact of judicial engagement with the CRC.....	133
4.6 Conclusions	136
CHAPTER 5: SOUTH AFRICA	138
5.1 Introduction	138
5.2 The relationship between international treaties and the South African law	138
5.2.1 Section 231: The status of international agreements in the South African law	140
5.2.2 International treaties and the interpretation of domestic law.....	141
5.2.2.1 Section 39(1): International law and the interpretation of the Bill of Rights	141
5.2.2.2 Section 233: International law and the interpretation of legislation.....	144
5.2.3 Brief assessment of the impact of the constitutional framework.....	144
5.3 The CRC and the South African law	145
5.4 The CRC in the South African case law.....	148
5.4.1 Previous literature	148
5.4.2 The case law	150
5.4.2.1 The CRC and the interpretation of the Bill of Rights.....	152
5.4.2.2 The CRC and statutory interpretation	164
5.4.2.3 The CRC and the self-execution of international treaties.....	166
5.4.2.4 <i>Sui generis</i> forms of engagement.....	166
5.5 Analysis	171
5.5.1 The engagement of the courts with the CRC	171
5.5.2 The impact of the CRC on judicial reasoning.....	177
5.6 Conclusion.....	182
CHAPTER 6: ANALYSIS	184
6.1 Introduction.....	184
6.2 Direct and indirect application of the CRC: Monist <i>versus</i> dualist approaches?	185

6.3 The impact of the courts' engagement with the CRC	190
6.3.1 Article 3(1) of the CRC: A favourite of the courts.....	195
6.4 Factors that influence the courts' engagement with the CRC	198
6.4.1 CRC-related factors.....	199
6.4.2 Factors not related to the CRC.....	200
6.4.2.1 Structure of reception.....	200
6.4.2.2. Social and political context.....	201
6.4.2.3 Jurisdictional arrangements.....	202
6.4.2.4 The level of jurisprudential development of the CRC and the rights of children	203
6.5 Conclusion.....	204
CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	205
7.1 Concluding remarks	205
7.2 Conceptualising the role of the courts in giving effect to the CRC.....	207
7.3 Recommendations	211
Samenvatting (Dutch summary).....	215
Abstract.....	216
Curriculum Vitae	217
Bibliography	218
List of cases	249