



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Populist polarization in Italian politics, 1994-2016 : an assessment from a Latin American analytical perspective**

Zanotti, L.

### **Citation**

Zanotti, L. (2019, September 26). *Populist polarization in Italian politics, 1994-2016 : an assessment from a Latin American analytical perspective*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/78561>

Version: Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/78561>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/78561> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

**Author:** Zanotti, L.

**Title:** Populist polarization in Italian politics, 1994-2016 : an assessment from a Latin American analytical perspective

**Issue Date:** 2019-09-26

# **Populist Polarization in Italian Politics, 1994-2016**

An Assessment from a Latin American Analytical Perspective

Lisa Zanotti



Populist Polarization in Italian Politics, 1994-2016  
An Assessment from a Latin American Analytical Perspective

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof.mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op donderdag 26 september 2019  
klokke 10.00 uur

door

Lisa Zanotti  
geboren te Verona (Italië)  
in 1982

**Promotores:** Prof.dr. P. Silva  
Prof.dr. C. Rovira Kaltwasser (Universidad Diego Portales, Chili)

**Promotiecommissie:**

Prof.dr. W.F.H. Adelaar  
Prof.dr. E. Amann  
Prof.dr. C. Kay (Erasmus University/ ISS)  
Dr. A. Zaslove (Radboud University Nijmegen)  
Mw.dr. S. Valdivia Rivera

## Table of Contents

<b>Index of Figures and Tables</b>	III
<b>Acronyms</b>	IV
<b>Acknowledgements</b>	V
<b>Introduction</b>	1
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>Populist Polarization</b>	
<b>Cleavages and the Transformation of the Party System</b>	18
1.1 <b>Polarization in Comparative Politics</b>	20
1.1.1 Sartori's conceptualization of partisan polarization	20
1.1.2 Analyzing Sartori's definition	23
1.1.3 Assessing Sartori's definition: a critical review	25
1.1.4 The two challenges in the study of polarization	29
1.2 <b>Populism and Populist Polarization</b>	33
1.2.1 The structuralist, the economic and the political-institutional definitions of populism	34
1.2.2 The ideational approach	39
1.3 <b>The populism/anti-populism cleavage</b>	44
1.3.1 Cleavages in Political Science	44
1.3.1.1 Sociological cleavages	45
1.3.1.2 Political cleavages	48
1.3.2 What is the populism/anti-populism cleavage?	52
1.4 <b>Party organization in comparative politics</b>	58
1.4.1 Types of party models	59
1.4.2 Party organization and populism	61
1.5 <b>Conclusion</b>	65
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>Programmatic Convergence, Massive Corruption Scandals and the Collapse of the Party System</b>	67
2.1 <b>Introduction</b>	67
2.2 <b>The Emergence of the Populism/Anti-Populism Cleavage</b>	71
2.2.1 Causes of Populism: A literature review	73
2.2.2 The Determinants of the Emergence of the Populism/Anti-Populism Cleavage	76
2.3 <b>The Political Opportunity Structure</b>	77
2.4 <b>Programmatic Convergence, Unresponsiveness of the Party System and the Emergence of the Populism/Anti/Populism Cleavage</b>	80
2.5 <b>Unresponsiveness, Massive Corruption Scandals and the Emergence of the Populism/Anti-Populism Cleavage</b>	84
2.5.1 The Programmatic Convergence of the Mainstream Parties in Italy (1948-1992)	87
2.5.2 Corruption Scandals in Italy: Tangentopoli and its consequences	95
2.6 <b>The role of the party system collapse in the emergence of the populism/anti-populism collapse</b>	97

2.6.1 The collapse of the Italian Party System and its relevance	100
2.7 <b>Conclusion</b>	104

## **Chapter 3**

### **The First Wave of Populism: Italy from 1994-2011 and the Emergence of the Populism Pole** 106

3.1 <b>Italian elections outlook: 1994-2011</b>	108
3.2 <b>The new actors in the political system: analysis of the ideology and organization</b>	118
3.2.1 The Lega Nord: from regionalist populism to populist radical right	119
3.2.2 Forza Italia/PdL: a case of neoliberal populism	123
3.2.3 Alleanza Nazionale (National Alliance)	126
3.2.4 The Italian Left: between Catholicism and Reformism	128
3.2.5 Italia dei Valori (IdV)	131
3.3 <b>The populist pole</b>	132
3.3.1 The populist in government	132
3.4 <b>The anti-populist pole: elitism, pluralism or neither of them?</b>	139
3.5 <b>Conclusion</b>	141

## **Chapter 4**

### **New Populism vs Old Populism and the Emergence of the Anti-Populist Pole** 143

4.1 <b>Overview 2011-2016: The Great Recession and its consequences for the Italian Party System</b>	146
4.2 <b>The new actors in the system: Discursive and Organizational Features</b>	156
4.2.1 The technocratic government and the formation of the Civic Choice	156
4.2.2 The Five Star Movement: a case of pure populism?	159
4.3 <b>The non-populist in power and the development of the anti-populist discourse</b>	167
4.4 <b>Conclusion</b>	172

<b>Conclusion</b>	174
-------------------	-----

<b>References</b>	183
-------------------	-----

<b>Annexes</b>	212
----------------	-----

<b>Samevatting</b>	214
--------------------	-----

<b>Curriculum Vitae</b>	223
-------------------------	-----



## Index of Figures and Tables

### Figures

Figure 1.1: Political space of competition in party systems with populism/anti-populism and left-right	55
Figure 2.1: Determinants of the emergence/polarization of the populism/anti-populism cleavage	69
Figure 4.1: Main parties in the Italian party system (2011- 2016)	167

### Graphs

Graph 2.1: DC vote share trend during Italy's First Republic (1948-1992)	90
Graph 2.2: Levels of programmatic polarization of the Italian party system compared to France and Germany between 1953 and 1994	94
Graph 2.3: Levels of programmatic polarization of the Italian party system compared to Spain and Portugal and Greece between 1975 and 1994	95
Graph 3.1: Percentage of the electoral coalition between 1994 and 2008	109
Graph 3.2: Seats in the Chamber of Deputies in the five national elections between 1994 and 2008	110
Graph 3.3: Seats in the Senate in the five national elections between 1994 and 2008	111
Graph 3.4: Number of the parties forming and externally supporting the governing coalitions	115
Graph 3.5: Percentage of public debt/GDP in Italy, Germany, France, UK and the mean of EU countries	137
Graph 4.1: Vote percentage in 2013 national election	152
Graph 4.2: Number of seats in 2013 national election (Chambers of Deputies)	153
Graph 4.3: Number of seats in 2013 national election (Senate)	154
Graph 4.4: Five Star Movement vote share in 2013 national election and 2014 European election	161

### Tables

Table 1.2: Party typology (organizational density and presence of populist ideology)	64
Table 3.2. Main parties in the Italian party system (1994-2008) considering populist ideology and organizational density	139

## Acronyms

AD: Acción Democrática (Venezuela 1941-present)  
AN: Alleanza Nazionale, National Alliance (Italy 1995-2009)  
AMLO: Andrés Manuel López Obrador (President of Mexico 2018-present)  
ANEL: Independent Greeks (Greece 2012-present)  
CCD: Centro Cristiano Democratico, Christian Democratic Centre (Italy 1994-2002)  
COPEI: Comité de Organización Política Electoral Independiente (Venezuela 1946-present)  
CPBT: Coalición por el Bien de Todos, Coalition for the Good of All (Mexico, 2005-2006)  
DC: Democrazia Cristiana, Christian Democrats (Italy 1943-1994)  
FI: Forza Italia, Go Italy! (Italy 1994-2009; 2013-present)  
FLI: Futuro e Libertà per l'Italia, Future and Freedom for Italy (Italy 2010-2014)  
IdV: Italia dei Valori (Italy 1998-present)  
LN: Lega Nord, Northern League (now the League) (Italy 1991-2017)  
M-15/Indignados: Movimiento 15 de mayo (Spain 2011-present)  
M5S: MoVimento Cinque Stelle, Five Star Movements (Italy 2009-present)  
MAS: Movimiento al Socialismo, Movement toward Socialism (Bolivia 1987-present)  
MSI: Movimento Sociale Italiano, Italian Social Movement (Italy 1948-1995)  
ND: Néa Dimokratía, New Democracy (Greece 1974-present)  
PASOK: Panellínio Sosialistikó Kínima, Panhellenic Socialist Movement (Greece 1974-present)  
PCI: Partito Comunista Italiano, Italian Communist Party (Italy 1921/1943-1991)  
PD: Partito Democratico, Democratic Party (2007-present)  
PdCI: Comunisti Italiani; Party of the Italian Communists (Italy 1998-2016)  
PdL: Popolo della Libertà (Italy 2009-2013)  
PDS: Partito dei Democratici della Sinistra, Democratic Party of the Left (Italy 1991- 1998)  
PP: Partido Popular, Popular Party (Spain 1977/1989-present)  
PRC: Rifondazione Comunista, Communist Refoundation (Italy 1991-present)  
PRD: Partido de la Revolución Democrática, Party of the Democratic Revolution (Mexico 1989-present)  
PSI: Partito Socialista Italiano, Italian Socialist Party (Italy 1892-1994)  
PSOE: Partido Socialista Obrero Español (Spain 1879-present)  
PUP: Palmer United Party (Australia 2013-2017)  
PVV: Partij voor de Vrijheid, Party of Freedom (The Netherlands 2006-present)

SA: Sinistra Arcobaleno, Rainbow Left (Italy 2007-2008)

SYRIZA: Synaspismós Rizospastikis Aristerás, Coalition of the Radical Left (Greece 2004-present)

UdC: Unione di Centro, Union of Christian and Centre Democrats (Italy, 2002-present)

UDEUR: Union of Democrats for Europe (Italy 1999-2013)

UKIP: United Kingdom Independence Party (UK 1993-present)

## Acknowledgements

This thesis is certainly not only the result of my own effort. Many other people have contributed so much with their support and patience, having helped me at several times and in different ways.

In particular, I would like to thank Sarah de Lange, Matthijs Rooduijn, Hanspeter Kriesi and Carlos Meléndez for contributing to improve this manuscript when it was only a project and Laura Gamboa, and Jana Morgan for the comments of the latest version.

I want also to express my gratitude to Prof. Patricio Silva, my supervisor, for his good academic orientation, for his interest and confidence in this thesis and for his always precise and detailed comments. I also want to thank all the professors of the School of Political Science of the Diego Portales University (UDP) in particular, Prof. Cristóbal Rovira, my co-supervisor, who dedicated much more time and energy to this work than was due. It is his achievement if I have learned to be patient e and to know how to deal in a better manner with frustration.

I have shared many hours per day with my fellow doctoral students at UDP over the last year. A special thanks to Pamela Niemann, Sebastián Koch, Germán Campos and Talita Tanscheit, each of you knows why.

Luciana Salinas and Silvana Summa are the two people have always been for me regardless of the time or part of the world where we are. They are two very special people who share at least two qualities: knowing how to listen and never judge.

Roberto has been with me every day for a good part of these five years. Thank you for having loved me and supported me even when I did not love myself that much.

Finally, the biggest thanks are for my sister and my parents for not making me feel bad for living that far away from home; for supporting me, and for giving me anything I need and for being so proud of me.